

REQUEST:

Review by the Historic Preservation Board to provide a recommendation to the City Commission for the following Resolution:

- Adopting the Sailboat Bend Historic District Architectural Resource Survey Update Report; and
- Assigning "Contributing" or "Non-Contributing" status to all properties within the SBHD.

Case Number	UDP-HPD20001
Applicant	City of Fort Lauderdale
Landmark/Historic District	Sailboat Bend Historic District
Authored By	Trisha Logan, Historic Preservation Planner

Resolution Background:

A resolution to adopt the Sailboat Bend Historic District (SBHD) Architectural Resource Survey Update Report (SBHD Report) and assign a "Contributing" or "Non-Contributing" status to all properties within the SBHD has been prepared for the consideration of the Historic Preservation Board (HPB) as part of the public input process.

On July 10, 2018, the City Commission asked for recommendations regarding potential amendments to the City's historic preservation ordinance. In response, staff outlined a three-phased approach to amend the historic preservation ordinance and identify potential incentives to enhance historic preservation efforts.

As part of Phase Three of the above effort, an updated Architectural Resource Survey of the SBHD was conducted by subject matter experts whom meet the Secretary of the Interior's qualifications for professionals in historic preservation to identify any changes that have occurred within the district since the previous survey was performed in 2009 as well as the original SBHD Study was conducted in 1991. The SBHD was designated as a Historic District by the City Commission in 1992 under Ordinance No. C-92-49. In approving the SBHD, the City Commission found that the application and documentation submitted, which included the SBHD Study, met the criteria for its designation as a historic district.

As part of the updated survey, a total of 458 properties were surveyed with 175 identified as contributing, 275 identified as non-contributing, 35 as either vacant lots or parking lots, and 16 as park parcels. It is typical to reassess historic districts periodically, usually every ten years, to maintain an inventory of designated historic resources. A periodic reassessment is a requirement through the designation of the City as a Certified Local Government (CLG) by the State of Florida.

To implement the findings of this resurvey, the following objectives were initially set forth:

- Adjust the boundaries of the existing historic district to exclude properties fronting Broward Boulevard and a portion of the Planned Unit Development (PUD) for the Village of Sailboat Bend with the exception of the West Side School and surrounding park space;
- Assign a "Contributing" or "Non-Contributing" status to all structures within the SBHD; and
- Amend Section 47-17, SBHD, of the Unified Land Development Regulations (ULDR) so that it is consistent with the changes to the "Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness" review process set forth in Section 47-24.11, of the ULDR; and
- To update the "Material and design guidelines" in Section 47-17, SBHD, of the ULDR.

A proposal for the modifications to the existing boundary lines of the SBHD was heard by the Historic Preservation Board (HPB) on January 6, 2020, for their recommendation to the City



Commission. A Communication to the City Commission from the HPB was heard at the January 21, 2020, City Commission Conference Meeting. At that meeting, the City Commission gave direction to staff to not move forward with the modification to the boundary of the SBHD and the item did not move forward to the Planning and Zoning Board.

<u>Proposed Resolution Adopting Architectural Resource Survey and Assigning Contributing and</u> <u>Non-Contributing Status to Properties</u>

The following proposal is now being presented for consideration of the HPB:

- Adoption of the Sailboat Bend Historic District Architectural Resource Survey Update Report (SBHD Report); and
- Assignment of a "Contributing" or "Non-Contributing" status to all properties within the SBHD.

The HPB will hear public comment on the proposal and its recommendations will be forwarded to the City Commission for its consideration. Consideration of the proposed amendments to the ULDR will be scheduled for a separate meeting at a later date.

A resolution adopting the SBHD Report and identifying properties as either Contributing or Non-Contributing within a historic district is necessary in order for the city to have the following:

- An accurate record of properties that are intended to be recognized for their historic character and architectural integrity; and
- Ability for properties identified as Contributing to utilize Historic Preservation Incentives enacted by the City of Fort Lauderdale; and
- A historic context statement that describes the neighborhood's history and development within the City of Fort Lauderdale; and
- Clearly defined periods of significance that represent important milestones in the developmental history of the SBHD; and
- A summary of the original and subsequent actions taken to designate the SBHD.

The SBHD Report provides a background of the district, a historic context, defined Periods of Significance, a description of the methodology used to conduct the survey, and criteria used in evaluating properties as either Contributing or Non-Contributing. Properties identified as Vacant Lots or Parking Lots are considered Non-Contributing. A complete list of Contributing and Non-Contributing Properties is provided as Exhibit 4.

Within the SBHD Report, specific Periods of Significance are outlined which align with the properties identified as Contributing. As per the 1992 designation of the Sailboat Bend Historic District, structures built prior to 1940 were identified as the most significant to the district. A caveat was included stating that if a structure was built later, (specifically in the 1940s and 1950s) it could be considered "significant" if it had "appearance" of those in the previous decade. Three Periods of Significance identified in the SBHD Report that are represented by architecture and physical features in the district are:

Pre-Development (Prior to the 19th Century)

Minimal physical evidence of this area prior to development exists, however it can be seen through divisions of the streets created by early plats. This area is also an Archaeologically Significant Zone and through prior Archaeological Surveys there is evidence of pre-historic periods.



Pioneer Settlement (1910-1944)

Records indicate the earliest structure in the district, the property located at 409 SW 9th Avenue, was constructed in 1910. Within this period of significance, architecture style represented include Bungalow, Frame Vernacular, Masonry Vernacular, Mediterranean Revival, Minimal Traditional and Mission Revival.

Post War (1945-1961)

Within this Period of Significance, architectural styles represented include Minimal Traditional, Ranch, and Mid-Century Modern.

The full Architectural Resource Survey Update Report is provided as Exhibit 1 and the Appendices are provided as Exhibits 2 through 8.

Prior Reviews

Staff introduced the proposed updates to the SBHD included in this item for consideration at the October 5, 2020, HPB meeting. At its November 2, 2020, meeting the HPB made a motion to schedule a special meeting related to the SBHD Report. The intent of this discussion item was to provide the HPB members with an overview and discussion of the survey prior to scheduling it for a public hearing and prior to providing public notice. The HPB voted in favor of scheduling a special meeting for further discussion.

A special meeting was held on December 21, 2020, and at its January 4, 2021, the HPB requested that the item be scheduled under "For the Good of the City" on its February 1, 2021, agenda for addition board discussion. At its February 1, 2020, meeting the HPB spoke in favor of the SBHD Report and proposed amendments and voted on a motion commending staff for their efforts in developing the updates.

Public Outreach

Staff provided an overview of the updates to the Sailboat Bend Civic Association (SBCA) general membership on October 16, 2019, and provided attendees with a document containing Frequently Asked Questions (FAQs) concerning the project. Comments voiced as part of this presentation included those from community members who were dissatisfied with the historic district stating that the designation negatively impacted their property values as well as those from community members who are interested in pursuing improvements to the current composition of the district. Ultimately, a motion was made to ask the Board of Directors of the SBCA to contact the City Commission to request removal of the historic district. On October 28, 2019, the Board of Directors of the SBCA sent an email to the Mayor and City Commissioners outlining their request for the City to abolish the SBHD.

Commissioner Glassman arranged a meeting with the Board of Directors of the SBCA and staff from the Department of Sustainable Development on November 14, 2019, to discuss this project further. As part of this meeting, an overview of the updates to the Historic Preservation Ordinance that have recently been passed as well as the proposed updates to the SBHD were discussed. Much of the discussion was related to the Architectural Resource Survey and how it was conducted, the availability of a draft report, and the timeline for the review and approval process. Based on this meeting it was agreed that Commissioner Glassman and City staff would attend the following month's SBCA meeting on December 11, 2019.

At the December 11, 2019, SBCA meeting Commissioner Glassman provided an introduction and City staff made a presentation to further outline the proposal for the boundary modification and the overall updates of the SBHD. At the meeting, questions were asked concerning the updates to the historic preservation ordinance that have already occurred or are in the



approval process, specifically incentives; areas identified for the removal of the properties along Broward Boulevard and the PUD; the decision to adopt the boundary update prior to completing the draft report for the Architectural Resource Survey; and questions related to treatment of contributing and non-contributing properties – specifically concerning demolition and alterations. Sentiments were again expressed regarding removal of the district and a request was made for an outside consultant to complete a new study of the historic district to provide an independent recommendation for the district.

An email regarding the proposed updates to the SBHD was sent to the Council on Fort Lauderdale Civic Associations on November 6, 2019, which provided an overview of the proposed updates to the SBHD, provided as Exhibit 9.

On August 28, 2020, a letter was mailed to all property owners to advise them that a draft of the SBHD Report was complete and invited them submit comments. The letter provided an overview of the survey and its findings as well as a link to a website to view related materials including a list of FAQs and a link to submit comments. This letter is provided as Exhibit 10 and the list of FAQs is provided as Exhibit 11. Following the distribution of this letter, staff presented an overview of the survey, its findings, and the intent of the proposed ordinance updates to the Sailboat Bend Civic Association on Wednesday, September 9, 2020.

As part of the presentation to the Sailboat Bend Civic Association on September 9, 2020, several topics were discussed including current incentives and the potential for new incentives including grants; a request to not require a Certificate of Appropriateness from the HPB for the demolition of Non-Contributing structures; and the increased number of "Contributing" properties identified in the survey compared to the number of properties constructed prior to 1940.

Included on the website was a link to a form that may be completed and submitted to staff. Staff received five requests that were submitted either via email or through the form to adjust the status of their property from Contributing to Non-Contributing. In three instances, evidence was provided of substantial alterations that affected the architectural integrity of the structure and their status was changed from Contributing to Non-Contributing. All comments that were submitted either via email or through the form between August 2020 through December 2020 are Provided as Exhibit 12.

Staff met with the Sailboat Bend Civic Association President on January 27, 2021, and with the Sailboat Bend Civic Association Board on February 3, 2021, to discuss the proposed updates. From these meetings a small working group has been formed from the Sailboat Bend Civic Association Board Members to specifically discuss proposed updates to the ordinance and to date, staff and the working group have met (4) times.

Public Notice

A mail notice for this public hearing was sent to all property owners on March 5, 2021. In addition, a newspaper notification for this public hearing was in the Sun-Sentinel on March 25, 2021.

Historic Preservation Board Review Options:

The Historic Preservation Board shall determine by motion whether the Historic Preservation Board recommends approval of the resolution to the City Commission.



<u>Exhibits</u>

Exhibit 1: Architectural Resource Survey Update Report Exhibit 2: Appendix A – Key Maps Exhibit 3: Appendix B – SBHD Contributing and Non-Contributing Map Exhibit 4: Appendix C – SBHD List of Contributing and Non-Contributing Properties Exhibit 5: Appendix D – SBHD Photo List Exhibit 6: Appendix E – Contributing Property Forms Exhibit 7: Appendix F – Existing Incentives Exhibit 8: Appendix G – Police Station Exhibit 9: Memorandum to the Council on Fort Lauderdale Civic Associations Exhibit 10: Letter to SBHD Property Owners Exhibit 11: Frequently Asked Questions

Exhibit 12: Public Comments

Page 5 of 5