Draft

CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE
SUSTAINABILITY ADVISORY BOARD
VIRTUAL MEETING
February 22, 2020 - 6:00 PM

Cumulative Attendance					
1/2021 through 2/2021					
	Members	**Appt by**	**Attendance**	**Present**	**Absent**
1	Elizabeth Adler, Chair	M	P	2	0
2	Muge Nurgun, Vice Chair	II	A	1	1
3	John Bonavita-Goldman	II	P	1	1
4	Kelly Charles	IV	P	2	0
5	Lawrence Clark	I	P	2	0
6	Owen Cylke	C	P	2	0
7	Whitney Dutton	IV	P	2	0
8	Carolann Mazza	III	P	2	0
9	Douglas Meade	I	P	2	0
10	Carol Tamburry	III	P	2	0
11	Vacant Position	M			

Staff Present
Stephanie Wilk, Sustainability Specialist, Staff Liaison
Kimberly Pearson, Sustainability Coordinator
Glen Hadwen, Sustainability Manager
Jason Bocchinfuso, Sustainability Administrator
Melissa Doyle, Program Manager - Solid Waste and Recycling
Dr. Nancy Gassman, Assistant Director Public Works – Sustainability
Estevan Baza, Sustainability Analyst

Guests
None.

Call to Order/Roll Call
The meeting was called to order by Ms. Wilk at 6:00 p.m. An announcement was made to explain the videoconferencing process. The roll was called, and a quorum was present. Mr. Cylke arrived 6:09 p.m. Ms. Mazza arrive at 6:10 p.m.

Communication to the City Commission

The Sustainability Advisory Board (SAB) provides the following Communication to the City Commission:

The Sustainability Advisory Board strongly recommends that the City adopt policies to reduce the City's carbon footprint consistent with achieving the goals and objectives of the Advance Fort Lauderdale Comprehensive Plan. Reducing greenhouse gas emissions both locally and as part of a global effort is essential to limiting sea level rise and other climate change impacts and to ensuring the best long-term future of Fort Lauderdale and South Florida. The policies were presented to the SAB by the Public Works Sustainability Division on January 25, 2021.

We believe these policies will help the City achieve meaningful reductions in greenhouse gas emissions.

Advance Fort Lauderdale Comprehensive Plan	**Proposed Policy for Commission Consideration**
Reduce GHG emissions from City Operations by 80% by 2050 (EVALUATION MEASURE CC 1.1.1)	Achieve government operations net zero emissions by 2040 and community net zero emissions by 2050 (Ready for 100)
Source 20% of electricity from renewable energy by 2030. (EM CC 1.1.6:)	Require City Operations sourcing of 20% of electricity from renewable energy by 2030 through • Addition of solar with all roof replacements on existing facilities; • Requiring at least a 20% renewable energy contribution on all new facilities; and • Purchases of renewable energy credits
Consider GHG emissions in decision making (Policy CC 1.1.2)	Realize 10% reduction in electricity usage in City Operations from 2020 to 2030 by investing in energy efficiency retrofits, energy management programs, and energy battery storage
Ensure multimodal options of transportation exist along key corridors (Policy CC 1.2.7)	Prioritize advocacy for and investment in multimodal transportation
Reduce City vehicle fossil fuel use by 20% below 2015 levels by 2025 (EM CC 1.2.5)	Replace 50% of the fleet with low emission, electric, and hybrid vehicles for all non-emergency vehicles with available alternative fuel models by 2030
Reduce community GHG emissions (not specified in the Comp Plan)	Adopting ordinances, policies and programs to reduce emissions in the community such as requirements for: • Cool roof and cool hardscapes; • Solar ready buildings and electric charger ready parking; • Green building certification and/or features; and • Energy disclosure and efficiency upgrades.

Motion

A motion was made by Ms. Adler and seconded by Ms. Mazza to advance the above Communication to the City Commission with the condition that staff submit the Communication for the same date that the *City's Carbon Footprint Policy Recommendation* CAM reaches the Commission. Motion passed unanimously.

DRAFT

CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE
SUSTAINABILITY ADVISORY BOARD
Virtual Meeting
February 22, 2021 - 6:00 PM

Cumulative Attendance					
1/2021 through 2/2021					
	Members	**Appt by**	**Attendance**	**Present**	**Absent**
1	Elizabeth Adler, Chair	M	P	2	0
2	Muge Nurgun, Vice Chair	II	A	1	1
3	John Bonavita-Goldman	II	P	1	1
4	Kelly Charles	IV	P	2	0
5	Lawrence Clark	I	P	2	0
6	Owen Cylke	C	P	2	0
7	Whitney Dutton	IV	P	2	0
8	Carolann Mazza	III	P	2	0
9	Douglas Meade	I	P	2	0
10	Carol Tamburry	III	P	2	0
11	Vacant Position	M			

Staff Present

Public Works Department

Stephanie Wilk, Sustainability Specialist, Staff Liaison
Kimberly Pearson, Sustainability Coordinator
Glen Hadwen, Sustainability Manager
Jason Bocchinfuso, Sustainability Administrator
Melissa Doyle, Program Manager - Solid Waste and Recycling
Dr. Nancy Gassman, Assistant Director Public Works – Sustainability
Estevan Baza, Sustainability Analyst

Guests Present

None.

Call to Order/Roll Call

The meeting was called to order by Ms. Wilk at 6:00 p.m. An announcement was made to explain the videoconferencing process. The roll was called, and a quorum was present. Mr. Cylke arrived 6:09 p.m. Ms. Mazza arrive at 6:10 p.m.

Approval of the Meeting Minutes

The meeting minutes for January 25, 2021 were introduced. A motion was made to approve the minutes by Ms. Tamburry and seconded by Mr. Meade. The motion passed unanimously.

Staff Liaison Report

Ms. Wilk announced that this is Lawrence Clark's last meeting as he has completed six years with Board and therefore has reached the City's term limit. The Sustainability Division presented a plaque and thanked him time and dedication to the Board.

Presentations

Energy Management Program Update {Jason Bocchinfuso, Sustainability Administrator}

Mr. Bocchinfuso began by highlighting the two goals in the City's Strategic Plan relative to energy management.

- Goal 1: Build a sustainable and resilient community.
    - Objective: Promote energy efficiency and the expansion of renewable energy sources
- Goal 8: Build a leading government organization that managers all resources wisely and sustainably.
    - Objective: Intergrade Sustainability and resiliency into daily operations

He then highlighted the City's Comprehensive Plan Energy Goals relative to energy and pointed out the challenges that would possibly hinder success of reaching those goals.

- Goal: 80% reduction in City operations Greenhouse Gas (GHG) emissions by 2050
    - Challenge: Population growth -> services growth -> Emissions Increase
- Goal: 20% renewable energy for City operations by 2030
    - Challenge: Budgetary impacts due to COVID-19 and other priorities

Mr. Bocchinfuso reminded the Board of past success stories within the Energy Management program including programable thermostats which lead to an annual energy cost savings of about $33,000 per year for City Hall. Additionally, the energy team has upgraded their data reporting capabilities from static PDFs to an analytics program called *Tableau*.

Mr. Bocchinfuso shared that the team finalized the first *Renewable Energy Feasibility Study* for City operations. The study evaluates thirty-five facilities, focuses on solar photovoltaics, and examines market mechanisms and supplemental opportunities. Mr. Bocchinfuso shared that the average annual electricity consumption for City operations is 98M kWh. As a result, 20% renewable energy would require 19.6M kWh/annually produced to reach the goal. He explained that in Florida, the primary energy market is mainly electricity and only utilities are able to sell electricity. Mr. Bocchinfuso reviewed some common renewable energy procurement options. He shared an example of one of the studies of a facility and variables include:

- Design layout

- Energy and power production
- Facility impact
- 20% Goal impact
- Emissions reductions
- Local Considerations
- Financial Metrics

Ultimately, the analyses results concluded that:

- 11 City facilities are capable of "net-zero"
- Cost of solar construction materials for the facilities reviewed are estimated to be: $6.2M
- Achieves 4% of the 20% goal

Mr. Bocchinfuso stated that they are looking at other options in addition to solar installations on City properties in order to achieve the 20% renewable energy goal. Florida Power and Light (FPL) has a program that provides customers with renewable derived power. The program requires a monthly subscription premium which is offset to some degree by credits received. For the City to reach 20% renewable energy would likely require participation in the FPL or similar programs. Mr. Bocchinfuso shared a table outlining the cost and savings. Mr. Bocchinfuso shared a suggested path forward that includes:

1. Determine the strategy balance
2. Engage FPL and establish a working group
3. Finalize project siting and conduct assessments
4. Qualify market providers and begin projects
5. Outreach campaign to the community

A question and answer segment ensued.
The full presentation is attached.

New Business

None.

Old Business

Insurance Rates and Climate Change Speaker

Mr. Cylke shared that he found literature that explains the linkage between climate, sea rise, real property, insurance, property values, and city tax base. McKinsey Global Institute has completed studies on how insurance can aide the agenda on climate. Mr. Cylke had spoken to the head of the FARE Foundation, an insurance association in Florida. However, while they have some literature on this topic, he didn't feel that their studies were detailed enough for the what the Board intends to investigate. He will share these studies with Ms. Wilk to circulate in the Friday weekly Information Exchange email. Mr. Cylke added that he will continue his search to find speakers to present to the Board on this topic and hopes to bring more information next month.

DRAFT

Dr. Gassman added that over the past 10 years, reinsurers are most interested in climate impacts. She explained that reinsurers are companies that insure the insurance companies. The local insurance companies have low risk in any market because they write one-year contracts. Dr. Gassman concluded that reinsurers are conducting research on climate impact risks because they bear the biggest potential concern in doing reinsurance.

City Green Purchasing

Mr. Hadwen shared that late last year, the City passed a ban on polystyrene on City property and in City facilities. In effort to spread awareness of this new Ordinance, Ms. Wilk and Mr. Hadwen are hosting a meeting with internal stakeholders to discuss the ban and find out how it will impact their operations. The purpose of this meeting is to identify how and when they purchase polystyrene products, and what the Sustainability Division can do to assist them in increasing knowledge and awareness.

Mr. Hadwen suggested that the Board revisit office supplies. He added that staff can request an updated list of the top office supplies that are purchased from Office Depot. Mr. Hadwen said that most contracts have language that vendors must comply with all City, State, and Federal laws. Ms. Adler asked if it would be helpful for the Board to send a Communication to the City Commission. Mr. Hadwen responded that the City has a sustainable purchasing policy that just encourages the City to consider sustainable and environmentally friendly materials in its procurement. He added that there could be an opportunity for the Board to ask the City Commission to incorporate sustainability in a more standardized way. It would be difficult because of the diversity of City contracts. He suggested that it may be easier to sort these contracts into smaller categories. Mr. Meade suggested that the City add some language on BidSync, so when contractors bid for a project, they see a disclaimer on purchasing requirements. This way City staff could avoid rewriting all of the contracts.

Ms. Nurgun asked Mr. Hadwen if the Board could ask the Commission to consider more standardized requirements that vendors and contractors must follow. Mr. Hadwen responded that the Board would be able to and asked if the Board would like staff to present on the current sustainable purchasing policy. He added that currently, the only products that are mandated in terms of sustainability are plastic straws and polystyrene. Mr. Hadwen added that staff could investigate what other city's have done in terms of green procurement and identify other opportunities. Ms. Nurgun said she would like that, and Ms. Adler agreed.

Mr. Hadwen shared that another opportunity for green procurement in the City is to reduce its paper usage. He stated that building permitting has gone paperless but there are still a lot of opportunities to reduce paper usage throughout the City. Mr. Hadwen added that Ms. Wilk had mentioned that there is opportunity the reduce paper usage within the Procurement Division and Attorneys Office. Ms. Wilk added that Procurement often prints our multiple copies of large contracts that are usually hundreds of pages long. In addition, Ms. Wilk proposed that the Board suggest to the Commission that the City Attorney's office accept digital signatures. This would eliminate the need to print contracts and other lengthy legal documents.

Joint Meeting with Other Cities Planning

Ms. Wilk suggested that the Board create an agenda for the event or workshop. Ms. Adler stated that it may be difficult to create an agenda without knowing who the possible partners would be. Ms. Wilk responded that not every City has a sustainability advisory board or environmental board. She found that there are four local possibilities including City of Hollywood, City of West Palm Beach, City of Miami Beach, and the City of Key West. Although, she was not sure if the Board in Key West was currently active because their minutes on their webpage were not up to date.

Mr. Cylke asked the Board if they wanted to have a focus on environmental issues and see how other cities are handling the same kinds of issues. Alternatively, he asked if the Board would be interested in finding out what other Boards or Committees are experiencing like:

- What is their experience as a Board or Committee?
- How do they work?
- How do they operate?
- How effective are they?
- What do they need to improve upon?
- What is their relationship to City Management and the City Commission?
- What is their relationship to the Community?

Mr. Cylke added that the Board needed to decide on the structure of the meeting before Ms. Wilk initiates any invitations.

Dr. Gassman suggested the Board have two different panels. One including City staff or liaisons and the other panel would include Chairs from these Boards or Committees. She added that the agenda should list a few simple questions for each panel, but they could certainly expand upon that if they wanted to.

Mr. Cylke noted that he likes the idea of a Board workshop and would like to see how effective other Boards feel they are. He added that he votes for the Board workshop. Ms. Adler and Ms. Charles agreed. Ms. Charles added that time is precious, so whatever the Board decides to do, it must be effective. She said that the Boards should discuss any challenges they run into and how they can work collectively to make progress and make each other stronger.

Ms. Nurgun agreed to start with a workshop with the other Boards and Committees where they discuss challenges and possible opportunities. From that discussion, it may spark new ideas and success factors.

Mr. Hadwen informed the Board that these guest Boards or Committees from other municipalities may have a different role or authority than the Fort Lauderdale Sustainability Advisory Board. He added that roles and authority is something that they can discuss in this workshop. This may help each other understand why some Boards have been more successful than others. Mr. Cylke added that it could give them some insight on some reforms that the Board may want to propose to the Commission.

DRAFT

Mr. Meade said it sounds like a good idea, but it is not realistic. He said that they are an advisory board, not a non-profit. Their role is to advise the Commission and not educate the public. Mr. Cylke said that education is in the Board's mandate.

Ms. Adler added that the point is the get feedback on what the other boards are doing. She stated that even if it is not the SAB's role to educate the public, it is in their mandate to think of ways to advise the City of what can be done to engage the public. She used the public forum event last January as an example where the SAB has provided public education. Ms. Adler suggested that if the scope of other boards is different and they are able to be more successful, than maybe it is time to suggest to the Commission that the SAB have a different role. She added that the SAB is a critical component to operations and should be given more authority. Ms. Adler also suggested that the Board conduct a monthly or quarterly report. She added that this workshop is a great opportunity to hear different ideas and help make the SAB a more well-rounded and effective Board.

Ms. Adler concluded that it seems that the Board wants to focus on a workshop. She asked Mr. Hadwen if that would require them to ask the Commission for additional help from staff. Mr. Hadwen said that he believes the workshop sounds manageable as it doesn't involve additional advertising and/or outreach. Ms. Wilk agreed and suggested that one of the Board members volunteer to draft the agenda and bring it to the March meeting for the Board to revise and finalize.

Proposed Communications

Carbon Goals

The Board drafted the following communication to the City Commission:

"*The Sustainability Advisory Board strongly recommends that the City adopt policies to reduce the City's carbon footprint consistent with achieving the goals and objectives of the Advance Fort Lauderdale Comprehensive Plan. Reducing greenhouse gas emissions both locally and as part of a global effort is essential to limiting sea level rise and other climate change impacts and to ensuring the best long-term future of Fort Lauderdale and South Florida. The policies were presented to the SAB by the Public Works Sustainability Division on January 25, 2021.*

We believe these policies will help the City achieve meaningful reductions in greenhouse gas emissions.

Advance Fort Lauderdale Comprehensive Plan	***Proposed Policy for Commission Consideration***
Reduce GHG emissions from City Operations by 80% by 2050 (EVALUATION MEASURE CC 1.1.1)	*Achieve government operations net zero emissions by 2040 and community net zero emissions by 2050 (Ready for 100)*
Source 20% of electricity from renewable energy by 2030. (EM CC 1.1.6:)	*Require City Operations sourcing of 20% of electricity from renewable energy by 2030 through* • *Addition of solar with all roof replacements on existing facilities;*

	• *Requiring at least a 20% renewable energy contribution on all new facilities; and* • *Purchases of renewable energy credits*
Consider GHG emissions in decision making (Policy CC 1.1.2)	*Realize 10% reduction in electricity usage in City Operations from 2020 to 2030 by investing in energy efficiency retrofits, energy management programs, and energy battery storage*
Ensure multimodal options of transportation exist along key corridors (Policy CC 1.2.7)	*Prioritize advocacy for and investment in multimodal transportation*
Reduce City vehicle fossil fuel use by 20% below 2015 levels by 2025 (EM CC 1.2.5)	*Replace 50% of the fleet with low emission, electric, and hybrid vehicles for all non-emergency vehicles with available alternative fuel models by 2030*
Reduce community GHG emissions (not specified in the Comp Plan)	*Adopting ordinances, policies and programs to reduce emissions in the community such as requirements for:* • *Cool roof and cool hardscapes;* • *Solar ready buildings and electric charger ready parking;* • *Green building certification and/or features; and* • *Energy disclosure and efficiency upgrades.*

"

A motion to advance the above Communication to Commission made by Ms. Adler, seconded by Ms. Mazza. Motion passed unanimously.

Staff Support Request for Joint Meeting with Other Cities

The Board decided to table this as it may not be necessary depending on the structure of the meeting.

Comments

Ms. Mazza suggested that the Board plan a discussion about the Bahia Mar lease extension at the next meeting. She noted that the lease is getting ready to expire and there is concern about the developer building condominiums and high rises. Mr. Meade agreed and asked if the Board could draft a Communication to the Commission on the topic. The Board agreed. Ms. Adler noted that the Law Firm she works for is involved with this project and so there may be a conflict of interest. Dr. Gassman said that staff will check with the City Clerk's and City Attorney's office to confirm what the protocol is for that and bring the answer to the next meeting in March.

Items for Next Meeting

Presentation:

- Waterway Quality Testing Updates
- Waterway Advocates

New Business:

- Bahia Mar Lease Extension

Old Business:

- Insurance Rates and Climate Change Speaker
- Planning for Joint Meeting with Other Cities

Proposed Communications:

- Staff Support Request for Joint Meeting with Other Cities
- Proposed Legislation
- City Contracts Including Green Language
- Bahia Mar Lease Extension

Adjournment

A motion was made by Ms. Adler and seconded by Ms. Mazza to advance the above Communication to the City Commission with the condition that staff submit the Communication for the same date that the *City's Carbon Footprint Policy Recommendation* CAM reaches the Commission. Motion passed unanimously.

DRAFT