



Florida Department of Transportation

RON DESANTIS
GOVERNOR

3400 West Commercial Boulevard
Fort Lauderdale, FL 33309

KEVIN J. THIBAUT, P.E.
SECRETARY

May 27, 2020

Dr. Timothy Parsons, Director and
State Historic Preservation Officer
Division of Historical Resources
500 South Bronough Street
Tallahassee, Florida 32301

Subject: **Request for Review**
Agreement regarding the adverse effect to the Kinney Tunnel
Financial Management #: 439714-1-32-01
Broward County, Florida

Attention: Adrienne Daggett

Dear Dr. Daggett;

In March 2020, FDOT, District Four submitted the *Effects Evaluation Case Study Report for the Henry E. Kinney Tunnel Pedestrian Plaza Project*, Fort Lauderdale, Broward County, Florida. The project is being proposed by the City of Fort Lauderdale and constructed by FDOT concurrently with the Henry E. Kinney Tunnel rehabilitation project. Direct affects to the Henry E. Kinney tunnel include the removal of original materials (retaining walls), and a change in its engineering design (addition of a new center wall). There will also be alterations to the aesthetics of the tunnel with the removal of some of the Art Deco treatments. Therefore, the proposed pedestrian plaza will have an adverse effect on the Henry E. Kinney Tunnel. On March 30, 2020, your office concurred with this determination (see attached letter).

FDOT has developed the enclosed Agreement document as mitigation for the adverse effect. The Agreement stipulations will be the responsibility of the City of Fort Lauderdale, with assistance from FDOT and in coordination with the historic Stranahan House. FDOT requests your input and comments on the stipulations in the attached Agreement. If there are any questions, please feel free to contact me at (954) 777-4324 or Lynn Kelley at (954) 777-4334.

Sincerely,

DocuSigned by:

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Ann Broadwell". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

19425E83B10D4E7
Ann Broadwell

Environmental Administrator
FDOT - District 4

Enclosures
cc. file



Florida Department of Transportation

RON DESANTIS
GOVERNOR

3400 West Commercial Boulevard
Fort Lauderdale, FL 33309

KEVIN J. THIBAUT, P.E.
SECRETARY

March 9, 2020

Received by DHR
March 13 2020

Dr. Timothy Parsons, Director and
State Historic Preservation Officer
Division of Historical Resources
500 South Bronough Street
Tallahassee, Florida 32301

Subject: **Request for Review**
Effects Evaluation Case Study Report
Henry E. Kinney Tunnel Pedestrian Plaza
Financial Management #: 439714-1-32-02
Broward County, Florida

Attention: Adrienne Daggett

Dear Dr. Daggett;

At the request of the City of Fort Lauderdale, Janus Research, in conjunction with Gannett Fleming, Inc., prepared an *Effects Evaluation Case Study Report for the Henry E. Kinney Tunnel Pedestrian Plaza Project*, Fort Lauderdale, Broward County, Florida. This assessment complies with the provisions of the revised Chapter 267, *Florida Statutes (F.S.)*; and standards embodied in the Florida Division of Historical Resource's (FDHR) *Cultural Resource Management Standards and Operational Manual* (February 2003), and Chapter 1A-46 (*Archaeological and Historical Report Standards and Guidelines*), *Florida Administrative Code*. In addition, this report was prepared in conformity with standards set forth in Part 2, Chapter 8 (*Archaeological and Historical Resources*) of the Florida Department of Transportation (FDOT) *Project Development and Environment (PD&E) Manual* (effective January 17, 2019). All work also conforms to professional guidelines set forth in the *Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Archaeology and Historic Preservation* (48 FR 44716, as amended and annotated).

This report presents the improvements that are being proposed as part of the Henry E. Kinney Tunnel Pedestrian Plaza Project and the potential effects that the project may have on the National Register of Historic Places (National Register) eligible Henry E. Kinney Tunnel (8BD4504) and the National Register listed Stranahan House (8BD64). As Chapter 267, *Florida Statutes (F.S.)* does not specifically outline criteria to assess effects to significant properties, the Criteria of Effects established by Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act (NHPA) in 36 CFR 800.5 will be applied to the project. The Criteria of Adverse Effect, as defined in 36 CFR Part 800.5, were applied to the significant historic resources and the subsequent analysis of effects is also discussed in this report. Based on the project information available and the application of the Criteria, the proposed pedestrian plaza project will have an adverse effect to the Henry E. Kinney Tunnel (8BD4504) and no adverse effect to the Stranahan

*Effects Evaluation Cast Study Report
Henry E. Kinney Tunnel Pedestrian Plaza
FM 439714.1*

House (8BD64). The proposed project will impact some of the essential physical features or historical associations that qualify the Henry E. Kinney Tunnel for inclusion in the National Register.

This current project is being constructed concurrently with the Henry E. Kinney Tunnel rehabilitation project being sponsored and constructed by FDOT. The case study report for the tunnel rehabilitation project was submitted to the FDHR on December 18, 2019 and the FDHR concurred with the finding of no adverse effect on December 30, 2019. The current project is sponsored by the City of Fort Lauderdale and will be constructed by FDOT. The design of the pedestrian plaza project is progressing at a different schedule than the rehabilitation project, therefore, the effects of the City project on the Henry E. Kinney Tunnel (8BD4504) and the Stranahan House (8BD64) are being presented separately in the current report. Staff from the FDOT District 4, FDOT Office of Environmental Management (OEM), and Janus Research met with FDHR staff member, Alyssa McManus, on July 31, 2019 to discuss the timing of these two undertakings. At that meeting, it was decided to phase the effects consultation on these projects separately, to avoid any delays in the FDOT rehabilitation project. Therefore, the current report is limited to discussing the effects of the pedestrian plaza improvements

Direct affects to the Henry E. Kinney tunnel include the removal of original materials (retaining walls), and a change in its engineering design (addition of a new center wall). There will also be alterations to the aesthetics of the tunnel with the removal of some of the Art Deco treatments. Therefore, the proposed pedestrian plaza will have an adverse effect on the Henry E. Kinney Tunnel.

Based on the provided project information, the proposed improvements will not directly or indirectly affect the characteristics that make the Stranahan House eligible for the National Register. The setting will remain essentially the same with some minor alterations to at-grade paving and landscaping. However, there will remain landscaping on the west side of the parcel to provide a delineation of the plaza and the Stranahan House. FDOT has committed to placing ceramic interpretive panels adjacent to the four walls of the existing ventilation building. These panels would interpret the importance of the New River to the development of the City of Fort Lauderdale through historic photos and would avoid any visual impacts to the Stranahan House. There may be temporary visual or noise effects to the resource during the construction of the improvements, but the effects will not be so great that it will compromise the eligibility of the resource or lead to long-term adverse effects. The City of Fort Lauderdale, FDOT, and the Stranahan House have committed to working together to avoid any adverse temporary impacts to the resource during construction.

The City of Fort Lauderdale and FDOT have engaged with the Stranahan House and the City Historic Preservation Board to determine appropriate mitigation and avoidance activities. In addition, during the teleconference on October 23, 2019, Alyssa McManus from the FDHR office participated in discussions on potential mitigation actions with FDOT, the City of Fort Lauderdale, Janus Research, and Gannett Fleming, Inc. As a result of these discussion, the City proposes the following mitigative actions: HAER documentation of both portals (north and south) of the Henry E. Kinney Tunnel, photodocumentation of the tunnel, and the placement of four ceramic interpretive panels in the plaza adjacent to the Stranahan House that have an electronic component. These panels, as requested by the Stranahan House, will provide historic context on the significance of the Stranahan House, the Henry E. Kinney Tunnel, and the New River on the development of Fort Lauderdale. The City of Fort Lauderdale Historic Preservation Board also requested that the reconstructed tunnel walls maintain some distinguishing

*Effects Evaluation Cast Study Report
Henry E. Kinney Tunnel Pedestrian Plaza
FM 439714.1*

differences from the original per the Secretary of Interiors Standards regarding reconstruction of historic detailing.

Due to the urbanized nature of the project area and lack of proposed ground disturbance, no archaeological testing took place as part of this effort.

If there are any questions, please feel free to contact me at (954) 777-4324 or Lynn Kelley at (954) 777-4334.

Sincerely,



Ann Broadwell
Environmental Administrator
FDOT - District 4

Enclosures
cc. file

Effects Evaluation Cast Study Report
Henry E. Kinney Tunnel Pedestrian Plaza
FM 439714.1

The Florida State Historic Preservation Officer finds the attached Effects Evaluation Case Study Report complete and sufficient and concurs with the recommendations and findings provided in this cover letter for SHPO/DHR Project File Number 2018-58790.

SHPO Comments:

<hr/> <hr/> <hr/> <hr/>

Jason Aldridge DSHPO
Timothy A. Parsons
State Historic Preservation Officer
Florida Division of Historical Resources

March 30, 2020

Date