



CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE
City Commission Agenda Memo
REGULAR MEETING

#19-0492

TO: Honorable Mayor & Members of the
Fort Lauderdale City Commission

FROM: Chris Lagerbloom, ICMA-CM, City Manager

DATE: May 21, 2019

TITLE: Quasi-Judicial Resolution Denying a Historic Landmark Designation of the Building Commonly Known as the "Buccaneer Motel" Located at 3008 Bayshore Drive, HPB Case No. H19009, Owner: Bayshore Hotel LLC, Applicant: Paula Yukna - **(Commission District 2)**

Recommendation

It is recommended the City Commission deny the request to designate the Buccaneer Motel located at 3008 Bayshore Drive, Fort Lauderdale, Florida, as more specifically described in the legal description in Exhibit 4, as a historic landmark building in accordance with the criteria in Sections 47-24.11.B.6(a), 47-24.11.B.6(f), 47-24.11.B.6(g), and 47-24.11.B.6(h) of the Unified Land Development Regulations (ULDR).

Background

An application for the historic designation of the building known as the Buccaneer Motel located at 3008 Bayshore Drive, Fort Lauderdale, Florida was filed on April 4, 2019, by Paula Yukna (Exhibit 1). The owner of the property is Bayshore Hotel LLC. On May 6, 2019, the Historic Preservation Board (HPB) reviewed the application and recommended by a vote of 9-1 that the City Commission deny the application for a historic landmark designation.

The HPB considered the staff report prepared by Trisha Logan, Urban Planner III, HPB Liaison (Exhibit 2). The staff report concludes that the Buccaneer Motel does not meet the criteria for designation that the applicant applied for under Section 47-24.11.B.6 of the ULDR.

As part of the discussion of this item, Ms. Paula Yukna summarized her request for designation and voiced support to preserve the Buccaneer Motel. Several members of the public also provided comments with remarks concerning the character of the area with a mixture of those who were in support and those who were not in support of the designation.

Ms. Courtney Crush, representing the owner of the subject property, Bayshore Hotel LLC, responded to the request for designation and stated that she concurred with staff's recommendation. Ms. Crush also provided an overview of a proposed new development for this site called the Bayshore Hotel under Development Review Committee (DRC) Case Number R18058. The proposed project will encompass four lots at the corner of Bayshore Drive and North Birch Road, including Lot 7, the site of the Buccaneer Motel. The proposed development consists of a seventeen-story mixed-use multifamily residential building. The Development Review Committee (DRC) reviewed the proposal on August 28, 2018. On February 20, 2019, the Planning and Zoning Board (PZB) recommended approval of the development by a vote of 5-4 with conditions and this item will appear on a future City Commission Regular Meeting Agenda.

Following Ms. Crush's overview of the proposed new development, she introduced an expert witness, Mr. Thorn Grafton of Zyscovich Architects. Mr. Grafton stated that he also concurred with staff's recommendation, as well as with the findings of Archaeological and Historical Conservancy, Inc. who assessed the property as part of a recent Phase I Cultural Resource Assessment.

The HPB discussed the request and concluded that the property does not meet the criteria for designation and voted to recommend denial of the request of historic landmark designation.

Please see draft minutes from the May 6, 2019, HPB Meeting attached as Exhibit 3.

Summary of Staff Report

Originally named the Buccaneer Motel, this building is in the Modern Vernacular Style and was constructed in 1966 as noted by the Broward County Property Appraiser's Office and within the City of Fort Lauderdale's permits records. Also, within the permit records, Joseph Phillips is listed as the architect of record, however in addition to Phillips prior surveys also referenced Donald F. Castner as a second architect associated with the project. Originally, the address for this property was shown as 350 North Birch Road and is located in the Birch Estates plat. The structure has undergone several name changes since the original "Buccaneer Motel" – names previously included the Seaside and Sandy Shores Motel and most recently, the Fortuna Hotel. This site is also located within an Archaeologically Significant Zone.

Building Description:

The Buccaneer Motel is a two-story, L-Shaped structure designed in the Modern Vernacular Style. The exterior of the structure is stucco, with key defining elements including a decorative railing with balusters along a second story catwalk, a cantilevered staircase leading to the second floor, and is topped by a barrel tile roof with a wide eave overhang. Site features include a kidney shaped swimming pool, a wall and fence surrounding the perimeter of the pool area, and planters at the base of the structure.

In 2015 the structure was renovated with changes that included window replacement, alterations to the façade including the removal of a brick wall feature, and addition of wall and fencing around the perimeter.

Criteria for Historic Designation

Pursuant to ULDR, Section 47-24.11.B.6 in approving or denying applications for historic landmark designation the HPB shall use the following general criteria:

ULDR, Section 47-24.11.B.6
<i>a. Its value as a significant reminder of the Cultural or archeological heritage of the city, state, or nation;</i>
Applicant Response Its value is a significant reminder of the cultural heritage of the City of Fort Lauderdale. The Central Beach area of Fort Lauderdale’s history brings to mind the famous movie “Where the Boys Are” starring a resident by the name of Ms. Connie Francis (<i>sic</i>), this helped to put Fort Lauderdale on the map as a tourist attraction and continues to this day.
Staff Response As part of a Phase I Cultural Resource Assessment conducted by Archaeological and Historical Conservancy, Inc completed a Historic Structures Form (BD6783) for the Florida Master Site File of 3008 Bayshore Drive (Lot 7). Within this form, the recorder stated that the structure does not appear to meet the criteria for National Register listing individually, but does appear to meet the criteria for National Register listing as part of a district with the following explanation: “Insufficiently distinguished for individual listing. Interior and superficial exterior alterations do not diminish overall historical architectural integrity. Contributes in style and scale to NR-eligible Birch Estates Historic District (BD4462).” Also noted in the form are categories for significance of the area as a potential historic district which include architecture, community planning and development, and tourism. This structure has also been included in previous Architectural Resource Surveys of Central Beach which have been conducted in 1988, 2008, and 2017. As part of the two most recent Architectural Resource Surveys, sub-survey areas were identified within Central Beach and the Buccaneer Motel is located in the sub-survey area named Birch Estates. In the most recent survey conducted, the structure was identified in the Modern Vernacular Style and this structure but did identify the structure as contributing to a potential historic district. As part of previous survey efforts, select structures were also identified as potential individual landmarks; however the Buccaneer Motel was not identified as a structure that may potentially meet the criteria as an individually designated historic landmark. “Where the Boys Are”, which was released in 1960, is a significant contribution to the history of Fort Lauderdale Beach and its “Spring Break” past. This structure alone does not distinguish itself as a primary example that can relay that history in its own merit nor is there a direct correlation between itself, which was constructed in 1966, and the filming

of the movie. The structure does however add collectively to the group of structures that are still extant from the 1940s through the 1960s and would qualify for designation as a historic district.

f. Its distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style valuable for the study of a period, method of construction, or use of indigenous materials;

Applicant Response

Building BD6782 is the focus for historic designation designed by the esteemed architect Mr. Castner J. Phillips (*sic*) in 1966. His design work is evidence of the many significant structures that fall into the category of 'Mid-Century Modern.' There are numerous examples in the Central Beach area of this style of architecture.

Staff Response

In the most recent Architectural Resource Survey of Central Beach, this structure is identified as contributing to a potential historic district – Birch Estates. Joseph Phillips, who is listed as the architect of record, and Donald F. Caster, who is also referenced as a project architect, both maintained architectural practices in Fort Lauderdale. Phillips practiced in Fort Lauderdale from the 1950s until his retirement, designing a number of structures throughout South Florida including schools, churches, businesses, as well as single and multi-family residences. Castner also maintained an architecture practice in Fort Lauderdale for 17 years.

Within the Birch Estates survey area 151 structures were surveyed, of which 117 were considered to be contributing with (23) constructed in the 1940s; (85) constructed in the 1950s; and (9) constructed in the 1960s. Of the contributing structures, several different architectural styles were represented including Art Deco, Neoclassical Revival, Art Moderne, Modern Vernacular, Masonry Vernacular, and Mid-Century Modern. The style with the most numerous representations is Modern Vernacular, which is of the Modern style with design features that are specific to Fort Lauderdale and South Florida, but do not exhibit key character designing features that are evocative of the Mid-Century Modern Style. This structure architecturally does not merit individual historic landmark designation, however it does add collectively to the group of structures that are still extant from the 1940s through the 1960s and would qualify for designation as a historic district.

One other structure in the Birch Estates area is noted as being designed as the same architect as the Buccaneer Motel - the Waterfront Inn. The Waterfront Inn is no longer extant and was located at 3100 Windamar Street. As part of the 2008 Architectural Resource Survey, the structure was also identified as Contributing to the district but did not identify an architectural style.

According to the National Register Bulletin 15, under Criterion C for significance under design and construction, in order to meet this criterion the property must “embody distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction”; or “represent the work of a master”; or “possess high artistic value”; or “represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction.” Resources "that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack

individual distinction" are called "districts." This structure falls into the category of those "that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction" and would be more suitable as a contributing structure in a historic district.

g. Its character as a geographically definable area possessing a significant concentration, or continuity of sites, buildings, objects or structures united in past events or aesthetically by plan or physical development; or

Applicant Response

This area brings with it many memories which remind us of the days when families and tourists flocked to the beaches of Fort Lauderdale for its beautiful sunny days, tropical evenings and family-friendly accommodations. Being severely threatened by the numerous new hotels and condominium buildings recently added to the area, the Central Beach area is beginning to lose its historic character and significant architectural structures that contribute to the Birch Estates Historic District.

Staff Response

The request for designation is for an individual historic landmark, and this criterion is typically only applicable for the designation of a historic district.

h. Its character as an established and geographically definable neighborhood, united in culture, architectural style or physical plan and development.

Applicant Response

Building BD6782 is the focus for historic designation designed by the esteemed architect Mr. Castner J. Phillips (*sic*) in 1966. His design work is evidence of the many significant structures that fall into the category of 'Mid-Century Modern.' There are numerous examples in the Central Beach area of this style of architecture.

Staff Response

The request for designation is for an individual historic landmark, and this criterion is typically only applicable for the designation of a historic district.

Required Designation Process

Pursuant to Section 47-24.11.B.5 of the ULDR, the City Commission shall hold a Public Hearing to consider the application, the record and recommendation of the HPB review, and shall hear public comment and determine whether the proposed application meets criteria found in Section 47-24.11.B of the ULDR. If the City Commission determines the proposed designation meets the criteria, the City Commission shall approve the landmark designation by adopting a resolution accordingly. If the City Commission determines that the proposed designation does not meet criteria for designation, the City Commission shall deny designation.

The landmark designation shall automatically include the designation of the site upon which the landmark exists as a landmark site. As a result, once the City Commission

approves the landmark designation, the property will be subject to the provisions set forth in the Section 47-24.11 of the ULDR. This includes the requirement that the property owner or designee shall obtain a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) from the HPB prior to undertaking any of the following actions:

- Alteration of an archeological site, new construction, demolition, or relocation.
- Alteration of the exterior part of a building or a structure or designated interior or portion thereof of a building or structure, however, ordinary repairs and maintenance that are otherwise permitted by law may be undertaken without a Certificate of Appropriateness, provided this work on a designated landmark, a designated landmark site, or a property in a designated historic district does not alter the exterior appearance of the building, structure or archeological site, or alter elements significant to its architectural or historic integrity.

Additionally, any future proposed impacts to the historic resource such as development of adjacent properties may require said properties to report to the HPB for review and comment.

Resource Impact

There is no fiscal impact associated with this action.

Strategic Connections

This item is a *Press Play Fort Lauderdale Strategic Plan 2018* initiative, included within the Neighborhood Enhancement Cylinder of Excellence, specifically advancing:

- Goal 6: Be an inclusive community made up of distinct, complementary, and diverse neighborhoods.
- Objective 1: Evolve and update the land development code to balance neighborhood quality, character, and livability through sustainable development.
- Strategic Initiative 2: Examine and update draft historic surveys.

This item advances the *Fast Forward Fort Lauderdale Vision Plan 2035: We Are Community*.

Attachments

Exhibit 1 – HPB Application

Exhibit 2 – HPB Staff Report

Exhibit 3 – May 6, 2019, HPB Meeting Draft Minutes

Exhibit 4 – Survey

Exhibit 5 – Resolution Landmark Designation – Approving

Exhibit 6 – Resolution Landmark Designation – Denying

Prepared by: Trisha Logan, Department of Sustainable Development

Department Director: Anthony Greg Fajardo, Sustainable Development