



CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE
City Commission Agenda Memo
REGULAR MEETING

#18-1176

12-4-18
OFR-1
REVISED
CAM AND
EXHIBIT 4

TO: Honorable Mayor & Members of the
Fort Lauderdale City Commission

FROM: Lee R. Feldman, ICMA-CM, City Manager

DATE: December 4, 2018

TITLE: **REVISED OFR-1** Ordinance Creating a Standard Parking Requirement for Affordable Housing Units, Permit Parking Reductions for Affordable Housing Developments, and Provide a Review Process for Parking Reductions for Affordable Housing Projects

Recommendation

It is recommended the City Commission adopt an ordinance amending the City of Fort Lauderdale, Unified Land Development Regulations (ULDR) to create a standard parking requirement for affordable housing units, permit parking reductions for affordable housing developments, and provide a review process for parking reductions for affordable housing projects.

Background

Limited supply and high demand for affordable housing options have been identified as priority issues by the City Commission as part of the City's Annual Action Plan for Fiscal Year 2019. In recognizing that there are various components that contribute to this significant issue, staff has started to look at various approaches to help address the concern. As an initial and practical step, staff looked at parking demands for affordable housing and recognized there is supporting evidence to indicate that parking requirements can be a significant financial burden to lower-income housing projects where the need for parking does not meet the same generation rates as market rate housing projects.

The amendments were presented to the Planning and Zoning Board (PZB) on October 17, 2018 and were recommended for approval (8-0) to the City Commission. The staff reports and minutes from the October 17, 2018, meeting are attached as Exhibit 1 and Exhibit 2, respectively.

The current parking ratios specified in the City's Unified Land Development Regulations (ULDR) do not take into consideration the parking generation needs of affordable housing projects and assumes the same generation rates as a market rate project. Recognizing separate parking provisions for affordable housing projects based on context and supporting calculations for a given development scenario has been recognized as an appropriate solution to address parking for affordable housing projects. Staff looked at prior variances and parking reduction studies to support the revised ratios finding several

examples. This proposed revision to parking requirements for these types of housing projects, along with the ability to request additional reductions, will replace the variance process.

A standard parking reduction, as established in Section 47-20.3 of the ULDR, Parking Reductions and Exemptions, requires Site Plan Level III review and approval, but this is only permitted in association with commercial development unless it is located in the Regional Actively Center zoning district designations. Due to this restriction, several affordable housing projects have sought parking reduction variances. As an example, the Dixie Court affordable housing project (Case Number 148-R-06) obtained a parking reduction in 2007. The associated Parking Reduction Study is attached on page 7 of Exhibit 1. The Dr. Kennedy Home's affordable housing project (Case Number 41-R09 and BOA Case Number 10-09) obtained a variance in 2010. The associated Parking Reduction Study is attached on page 15 of Exhibit 2. The Sailboat Bend II affordable housing project (DRC Case Number R17043) was able to seek a parking reduction since it's located in the RAC.

As detailed in the table below, the studies indicate that several affordable housing developments approved in the City did not require the amount of parking that is typical of ULDR requirements. The table below summarizes the number of dwelling units and the observed maximum parking rate based on parking reduction data associated with each project.

Development	Number of Units	Maximum Parking Ratio
Dr. Kennedy Homes	132	0.41/unit
Sailboat Bend	104	0.37/unit
Sunnyreach Acres	100	0.26/unit
Sunnyreach Family Units	29	1.34/unit

In performing the research that led to this proposed amendment, staff also obtained data from the Planning Advisory Services (PAS) of the American Planning Association, which revealed that various municipalities across the nation have generally reduced minimum parking requirements for affordable housing development below what is otherwise required for market-rate housing. Research also showed that there is very strong evidence that lower-income households purchase and own cars at much lower rates than higher-income households. Research including the following reports, "Myths and Facts About Affordable Housing and High Density Housing," by California Department of Housing and Community Development published in 2002 and "Socioeconomic Differences in Households Automobile Ownership Rates: Implication for Evacuation Policy" written by Berube, et al in 2006 and "Parking Requirements Impacts on Housing Affordability" by Todd Litman published in 2016 demonstrates the disparity between car-ownership and socioeconomic groups. All of the aforementioned reports included data that demonstrated how residents of lower-income and affordable housing projects have a lower demand for parking spaces as a result of the socioeconomic differences.

Several examples of cities that have reduced the minimum parking requirements include:

Municipality	Affordable Housing Parking Standard
Anaheim, California	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1.5 spaces per unit, 2 Bedroom Unit • 2 spaces per unit, 3-4+ Bedroom units
Baltimore, Maryland	1 space per 2 dwelling units: For affordable housing with units leased to residents with incomes at or below 60% AMI and 15-year minimum affordability restriction
Charleston, South Carolina	1 space per 4 dwelling units
Denver, Colorado	20% reduction of standard parking requirement for affordable housing
Emeryville, California	1 space per unit: certified affordable housing units
Eugene, Oregon	0.67 spaces per dwelling: multifamily subsidized low-income housing, 10-year affordability restriction
Gulfport, Mississippi	<p>1 space per unit: certified affordable housing units</p> <p>Waiver of parking minimums: certified affordable housing units, T5 (Sub-Urban Zone) and T6(General Urban Zone)</p>
Los Angeles, California	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1 space per 0-1B unit, 2 spaces per 2-3B unit, 2.5 spaces per 4+B unit: affordable housing • 1 space per dwelling unit: incentive for single-family dwelling units, affordable housing projects with 100% of the units set-aside for very low or lower income households and within a 1,500 ft. radius of a fully funded mass transit station or bus stop along a major bus route • 0.75 space per 0-1B unit, 1.5 spaces per 2+B unit: incentive for multifamily dwelling units, affordable housing projects with 100% of the units set-aside for very low or lower income households and within a 1,500 ft. radius of a fully funded mass transit station or bus stop along a major bus route

Milwaukee, Wisconsin	1 space per 2 units: low-income public housing or elderly housing projects
Newberg, Oregon	10 percent reduction in requirements for affordable housing projects with connection to regular transit service within 1,500 ft.
Newton, Massachusetts	1 space per 2 units: state or federal program low-income/elderly housing
Salem, Oregon	1 space per 4 units: low income elderly housing
San Diego, California	0.5-1.75 spaces per unit: affordable housing, various types, studio-3B units, based on parking demand index (calculates walkability and transit indexes)
Santa Monica, California	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 0.5 spaces per unit: deed-restricted affordable units, studios • 0.75 spaces per unit: deed-restricted affordable units, 1B units • 1 space per unit: deed-restricted affordable units, 2+B units
Seattle, Washington	No minimum requirement: dwelling units rent- and income-restricted at or below 80% AMI

Requiring more parking spaces than are needed unnecessarily raises the costs of affordable housing developments and could make the housing itself less affordable for low-income residents. As an example, the cost to construct 32 surface parking spaces for the previously approved Northwest Gardens I project (DRC Case Number 37R09) was approximately \$194,000, which is significant for a development that does not need to utilize all the parking spaces required.

Accordingly, the proposed amendment recommends a reduction in parking requirements for low and moderate income housing development as defined further below. In some cases, additional conditions must be met such as the neighbors being at or below an income threshold (usually a percentage of an area's gross or median income), or the housing must be within a certain distance of public transportation.

During the presentation to the PZB, the Board questioned how the Citywide Parking Study that was presented at the City Commission Conference Meeting on October 9, 2018 addresses affordable housing parking demands. The objectives of the Citywide Parking Study were to evaluate parking demand, supply, parking requirements and existing utilization of the City's various parking facilities. The Study analyzed public parking, on-street parking, parking lots and garages. The Study did not include parking provisions for affordable housing or for residential use in general. To review the Citywide Parking Study City Commission Agenda Memorandum (CAM), please refer to Exhibit 3.

Amendment Summary:

Section 47-20.2. – Parking and Loading Zone Requirements:

The proposed amendment will provide a standard parking ratio for affordable housing units. The parking ratio will be one (1) parking space per dwelling unit. The parking ratio can only be applied to affordable housing units. If a development provides both affordable housing units and market rate units, the one (1) space per dwelling unit requirement will only apply to the affordable housing units.

Section 47-20.3.A.4 – Parking Reduction and Exemptions Review Process:

The proposed amendment will permit an affordable housing development parking reduction request to be reviewed as a Site Plan Level I (Administrative Staff Review) process in any zoning districts where residential development is permitted. The intent of this amendment is to allow for affordable housing developments to request a parking reduction in any zoning district that permits residential development and to simplify the parking reduction process for affordable housing developments. The parking reduction application will still be subject to scrutiny and will still require an applicant to demonstrate justification and ability to address technical parking reduction ULDR criteria, but through a simplified review process.

Section 47-20.3.I – NW-Progresso-Flagler Heights Community Redevelopment Area:

Lastly, the proposed amendment will allow for affordable housing development to count on-street parking, directly in front of parcel to count toward its parking requirements, which is consistent with the regulations already set forth in the ULDR for both the Central City and the Northwest-Progresso-Flagler Heights CRAs. The regulations intent is to ensure that the on-street parking is an asset to the surrounding community by providing improved parking and pedestrian conditions.

Public Outreach

Staff provided communication outlining the proposed amendment to the Council of Fort Lauderdale Civic Associations (CFLCA). To review the communication, please refer to Exhibit 4.

Resource Impact

There is no fiscal impact associated with this action.

Strategic Connections

This item is a *Press Play Fort Lauderdale Strategic Plan 2018* initiative, included within the Neighborhood Enhancement Cylinder of Excellence, specifically advancing:

- Goal 6: Be an inclusive community made up of distinct, complementary, and diverse neighborhoods.
- Objective 1: Evolve and update the land development code to balance neighborhood quality, character, and livability through sustainable development.

This item advances the *Fast Forward Fort Lauderdale 2035 Vision Plan: We Are Community*.

Attachments

Exhibit 1 – October 17, 2018, PZB Staff Report

Exhibit 2 – October 17, 2018, PZB Minutes

Exhibit 3 – October 9, 2018 Citywide Parking Study

Exhibit 4 – **October 9, 2018 Communication to CFLCA** ~~September 10, 2018~~

~~Communication to CFLCA~~

Exhibit 5 – Ordinance

Prepared by: Karlanne Grant, Planner III

Department Director: Anthony Gregory Fajardo, Sustainable Development

Karlanne Grant

From: Karlanne Grant
Sent: Tuesday, October 09, 2018 1:34 PM
To: 'Ronald Centamore'
Subject: Proposed Affordable Housing Parking Provisions Text Amendment

Good afternoon, Ron.

This memo intends to provide an update to the Council of Fort Lauderdale Civic Associations on current initiatives being undertaken by the City of Fort Lauderdale Department of Sustainable Development. The City welcomes any comments or suggestions you may have. In addition, staff is available to meet to answer any questions.

Item

Proposed Text Amendment - Amend City of Fort Lauderdale Unified Land Development Regulations (ULDR) to create a standard parking requirement for affordable housing units, permit parking reductions for affordable housing developments, and provide a review process for parking reductions for affordable housing applications

Background

Limited supply and high demand for affordable housing options have been identified as priority issues by the City Commission as part of the City's Annual Action Plan for Fiscal Year 2019. In recognizing that there are various components that contribute to this significant issue, staff has started to look at various approaches to help address the concern. As an initial small and practical step, staff looked at parking demands for affordable housing and recognized that there is supporting evidence to indicate that parking requirements can be a significant burden on lower-income households.

The proposed amendment is intended to allow for more realistic parking accommodations for affordable housing development. The need to recognize separate parking provisions for affordable housing projects based on the context and supporting calculations on a given development scenario, which may differ from ULDR requirements, has been recognized as an appropriate solution to address parking for affordable housing projects. Staff looked at prior variances and parking reduction studies that indicate several prior examples of affordable housing developments that did not require the standard parking requirements as provided in the City's ULDR and that the variance process can be a costly and time consuming effort for affordable housing projects to undergo.

A standard parking reduction, as established in ULDR Section 47-20.3, Parking Reductions and Exemptions, requires Site Plan Level III (Planning and Zoning Board) review and approval, however currently the ULDR only allows parking reductions for residential development in the Regional Actively Center zoning district designations. Due to this restriction, several affordable housing projects have sought parking reduction variances, where parking reductions are not allowed in the zoning district the projects were developed. The proposed amendment intends to establish a standard parking ratio for affordable housing units, permit parking reductions for affordable housing developments and provide a review process for affordable housing development parking reductions.

Amendment Summary

Section 47-20.2. – Parking and Loading Zone Requirements:

The proposed amendment will provide a standard parking ratio for affordable housing units. The parking ratio will be one (1) parking space per dwelling unit. The parking ratio can only be applied to

affordable housing units. If a development provides both affordable housing units and market rate units, the one (1) space per dwelling unit requirement will only apply to the affordable housing units.

Section 47-20.3.A.4 – Parking Reduction and Exemptions Review Process:

The proposed amendment will permit an affordable housing development parking reduction request to be reviewed as a Site Plan Level I (Administrative Staff Review) process in any zoning districts where residential development is permitted. The intent of this amendment is to allow for affordable housing developments to request a parking reduction in any zoning district that permits residential development and to simplify the parking reduction process for affordable housing developments. The parking reduction application will still be subject to scrutiny and will still require an applicant to demonstrate justification and ability to address technical parking reduction ULDR criteria, but through a simplified review process.

Section 47-20.3.1 – NW-Progresso-Flagler Heights Community Redevelopment Area:

Lastly, the proposed amendment will allow for affordable housing development to count on-street parking, directly in front of parcel to count toward its parking requirements, which is consistent with the regulations already set forth in the ULDR for both the Central City and the Northwest-Progresso-Flagler Heights CRAs. The regulations intent is to ensure that the on-street parking is an asset to the surrounding community by providing improved parking and pedestrian conditions.

Kind regards,

Karlanne Grant, Planner III

City of Fort Lauderdale | Urban Design and Planning Division

700 NW 19th Avenue | Fort Lauderdale FL 33311

P: (954) 828-6162 | E: kgrant@fortlauderdale.gov



**DEPARTMENT OF
Sustainable
Development**

Under Florida law, most e-mail messages to or from City of Fort Lauderdale employees or officials are public records and may be subject to public disclosure. Please consider the environment before printing this e-mail. Thank you.