

#18-0989

TO: Honorable Mayor & Members of the

Fort Lauderdale City Commission

FROM: Lee R. Feldman, ICMA-CM, City Manager

DATE: November 20, 2018

TITLE: Quasi-Judicial Resolution Denying the Rescission of a Historic Landmark

Designation of the Buildings Commonly Known as the "Mary Cutler

House" Located at 1500 NE 4th Place, HPB Case No. H18014, Applicant:

M. Elaine Wilson

Recommendation

It is recommended the City Commission consider the request to rescind the historic designation of the Mary Cutler House as described in the legal description as a historic landmark per Section 47-24.11.B.6 of the Unified Land Development Regulations (ULDR) under criterion (e) located at 1500 NE 4th Place.

Background

An incomplete application for the rescission of historic designation of the structures located at 1500 NE 4th Place, Fort Lauderdale, Florida was filed on July 25, 2018, by M. Elaine Wilson and a complete application was received on August 16, 2018 (Exhibit 1). The application was originally scheduled for the October 1, 2018, Historic Preservation Board (HPB) meeting, but was deferred to the next meeting since the meeting was not held due to lack of quorum. On November 5, 2018, the HPB reviewed the application and recommended by a vote of 9-0 that the City Commission deny the request for rescission of landmark designation.

Due to the rescheduling of this item on a subsequent HPB agenda and the brief period of time between the HPB Meeting and the City Commission Meeting, draft minutes are not currently available.

The HPB considered the staff memorandum prepared by Trisha Logan, Planner III, HPB Liaison (Exhibit 3). The staff report concludes that the Mary Cutler House does not meet the criteria for designation rescission under Section 47-24.11.B.6 of the ULDR.

Following the presentation of the staff report, the property owner and applicant, Ms. Elaine Wilson, summarized the request along with background information related to her personal situation, describing a financial hardship. Board members asked several

11/20/2018 CAM No. 18-0989 Page 1 of 4

questions of Ms. Wilson, as well as of her realtor, Cady Watson, to better understand the request related to the criteria and process outlined within the ULDR. The HPB concluded that the property still meets the criteria for designation and voted to recommend denial of the request to rescind the historic landmark designation.

Summary of Staff Memorandum

This application proposes to rescind the historic designation of 1500 NE 4th Place, a property which was designated as a historic landmark in the City of Fort Lauderdale on December 20, 2005 under Resolution No. 05-214. At that time, the Historic Preservation Board and the City Commission found that the property met Criterion in Section 47-24.11.B.6(e) of the ULDR for historic designation.

Building Description

As stated in the consultant memorandum from the October 7, 2005, HPB Meeting: This frame vernacular/folk house is one-story side gabled and of an irregular plan. It has a small centered gabled entry porch with columns and with an arched cutout in the gable. The front door is arched, reflecting the arched cutout in the entry porch gable. The house has a gabled under roof porch on the right front elevation. Double hung sash windows are gaged together in pairs on the front elevation and have four over four lights. The front windows have decorative shutters.

This handsome folk style house was built with day labor and without a general contractor. Permits were pulled for this house in 1941. It is possible, given the sophistication of the design, that the owner/builder purchased plans from one of the many architectural services of that time.

A second building on the property is a two-story wood frame building, front facing gabled garage apartment built in the Bahamian (folk) style with a simple rectangular footprint. The second story overhangs the first; this overhang was an open porch at one time, which has been enclosed with metal louvers. The original garage doors have been replaced with French doors.

Criteria for Historic Designation

ULDR, Section 47-24.11.B.6	Applicant Response	Staff Response
a. Its value as a significant reminder of the Cultural or archeological heritage of the city,	There is no value because most people see many like	N/A
state, or nation;	it in the area.	
b. Its location as a site of a significant local, state or national event;	Site is not special.	N/A
c. Its identification with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the development of the city, state, or nation;	Original builder not special.	N/A
d. Its identification as the work of a master builder, designer, or architect whose individual work has influenced the development of the city, state, or nation:	No builder special.	N/A

e. Its value as a building recognized for the quality of its architecture, and sufficient elements showing its architectural significance;	Several in area.	As stated within the original historic landmark designation application, it is one of the best examples of the Vernacular/Folk style of architecture in Fort Lauderdale and south Florida
f. Its distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style valuable for the study of a period, method of construction, or use of indigenous materials;	Cottage.	N/A
g. Its character as a geographically definable area possessing a significant concentration, or continuity of sites, buildings, objects or structures united in past events or aesthetically by plan or physical development; or	None.	N/A
h. Its character as an established and geographically definable neighborhood, united in culture, architectural style or physical plan and development.	No special design.	N/A

Required Designation Rescission Process

As per ULDR Section 47-24.11.B.9. Amendments and Rescissions. The designation of any landmark and landmark site, historic building or historic district may be amended or rescinded through the same procedure utilized for the original designation. As such, for a structure to qualify for a rescission of a designation, it must no longer meet the criteria in which it was designated. In this case, 1500 NE 4th Place was designated under Section 47-24.11.B.6.(e) of the ULDR. In response to whether or not the structure met Criterion (e), the applicant stated "several in area," however as outlined in the original designation application, the site qualified because it is "one of the best examples of the Vernacular/Folk style of architecture in Fort Lauderdale and south Florida." Since its designation, there have not been any alterations to the exterior of the structure that detract from its significance in which it was designated and therefore it still qualifies under Section 47-24.11.B.6. (e) of the ULDR.

Resource Impact

There is no fiscal impact associated with this action.

Strategic Connections

This item is a *Press Play Fort Lauderdale Strategic Plan 2018* initiative, included within the Neighborhood Enhancement Cylinder of Excellence, specifically advancing:

 Goal 6: Be an inclusive community made up of distinct, complementary, and diverse neighborhoods.

This item advances the Fast Forward Fort Lauderdale Vision Plan 2035: We Are Community.

Attachments

Exhibit 1 – HPB Application

Exhibit 2 – HPB Staff Memorandum

Exhibit 3 – 13-H-05 Designation Application

Exhibit 4 – Commission Memo 18-156

Exhibit 5 – Waiver of 30-Day Mail Notice Requirement

Exhibit 6 – Letter from Ms. Wilson

Exhibit 7 – Resolution Landmark Designation - Approving

Exhibit 8 - Resolution Landmark Designation - Denying

Prepared by: Trisha Logan, Planner III

Department Director: Anthony Greg Fajardo, Sustainable Development

11/20/2018 Page 4 of 4