

# City of Fort Lauderdale, FL

# 2018 TOTAL COMPENSATION SURVEY RESULTS – GENERAL EMPLOYEES – DEFINED CONTRIBUTION

September 2018

**Final Report** 

## Table of Contents

# 2018 Total Compensation Survey Results – General Employees – Defined Contribution

September 2018

Executive Summary	
Background1	
Summary of Findings8	
Methodology12	
Peer Employers	
Published Data Sources	
Data Adjustments	
Geographic Adjustments14	
Workweek Adjustments	
Study Findings – Base Pay16	
Pay Ranges - Overall16	
Study Findings – Pay Practices	
Pay Schedule Design & Increases	
Study Findings – Health Benefits	
Total Health52	
Medical54	
Dental 61	
Vision	
Study Findings - Retirement Benefits	
Study Findings – Total Compensation	
Conclusions 82	
Pay Range Competitiveness82	
Total Compensation Competitiveness	
Appendix A – Benchmark Summaries	
Appendix B – Detailed Market Data179	)

## **Executive Summary**

#### **Background**

The City of Fort Lauderdale engaged Segal Waters Consulting to evaluate the competitiveness of both pay and benefits for general employee positions. To gather this information, Segal Waters, in consultation with the City's Human Resources team, developed a customized survey instrument that was distributed to public sector employers found to be representative of its competitive labor market. Additionally, Segal Waters referenced published market data to represent the private sector. All data is effective as of February 1, 2017 and has been aged to April 1, 2018. Data is shown at the 75<sup>th</sup> percentile of market per the request of the City of Fort Lauderdale.

The thirty (30) peer employers selected for participation in the study are shown in **Table 1**. Of the thirty (30) surveyed employers, eleven (11) employers submitted both the pay and benefits sections of the survey, one (1) employer responded only to the benefits portion of the survey, and two (2) employers responded only to the pay portion of the survey. Segal Waters completed the pay portion of the survey for five (5) additional comparables, including the comparable mentioned previously who only submitted the benefits portion of the survey, based on job descriptions and pay data provided on the comparables' websites. As a result, Broward County, the City of Boca Raton, the City of Coral Springs, the City of Sunrise, the City of West Palm Beach, and Miami-Dade County will not be included in **Table 12** through **Table 49** as they did not complete the benefits portion of the survey. Overall, eighteen (18) employers participated in at least one portion of the survey providing a 60% response rate.

#### TABLE 1 **SURVEYED EMPLOYERS**

Peer Employers Surveyed				
Cities				
City of Boca Raton	√ (Segal matched pay data)			
City of Coral Springs	√ (Submitted pay portion only)			
City of Delray Beach	$\sqrt{\text{(Segal matched pay data, comparable submitted}}$ only benefit data)			
City of Hialeah				
City of Hollywood	$\sqrt{}$			
City of Miami	$\sqrt{}$			
City of Miami Beach	$\sqrt{}$			
City of Miami Gardens				
City of Miramar	√			
City of Pembroke Pines				
City of Pompano Beach	V			
City of Sunrise	√ (Segal matched pay data)			
City of West Palm Beach	√ (Segal matched pay data)			
Counties				
Broward County	√ (Segal matched pay data)			
Miami-Dade County	√ (Submitted pay portion only)			
Palm Beach County				
School Districts				
Broward County School District				
Miami-Dade County School District				
Palm Beach County School District	V			
Transportation				
Florida Department of Transportation				
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority	√			
Miami Executive Airport	√			
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	$\checkmark$			
Universities				
Barry University				
Florida International University				
Miami-Dade College	√			
University of Miami				
Utilities				
South Florida Water Management District				
Orange County Utilities				
Toho Water Authority	$\checkmark$			

 $\sqrt{=\text{Responded to Survey}}$ 

The study covers ninety-two (92) benchmark jobs, representing approximately 50%<sup>1</sup> of the City of Fort Lauderdale's workforce shown in **Table 2**. The benchmark jobs are listed by department in **Table 3** and by occupational category in **Table 5**. To assist survey respondents in making job matches based on duties and qualifications rather than title, the survey instrument contained job summaries. The job summaries for each benchmark job are detailed in **Appendix A**.

TABLE 2
BENCHMARK JOB TITLES BY DEPARTMENT – COMPOSITION OF WORKFORCE

		BENCHMARK TITLES				
Department	Benchmark Titles Being Evaluated in Study	Number of Employees within Benchmark Titles Being Evaluated	Employees in Benchmark Titles Evaluated As a Percent of the Total Workforce	Percentage of Workforce by Department		
City Attorney's Office	2	16	0.5%	0.9%		
City Auditor's Office	1	1	0.0%	0.1%		
City Clerk's Office	1	6	0.2%	0.3%		
City Commission's Office	1	4	0.1%	0.2%		
City Manager's Office	7	19	0.6%	1.7%		
Finance	12	42	1.4%	2.1%		
Fire Rescue	9	183	6.1%	18.5%		
Human Resources Department	8	17	0.6%	1.2%		
Information Technology Services	14	36	1.2%	2.4%		
Public Works / Building Services	24	202	6.7%	13.1%		
Parks and Recreation	24	675	22.3%	26.2%		
Police	13	110	3.6%	23.0%		
Sustainable Development	16	107	3.5%	5.4%		
Transportation and Mobility	17	86	2.8%	4.6%		
Other <sup>1</sup>	0 <sup>2</sup>	0	0.0%	0.3%		
Total:	92³	1,504	49.7%4	100%		

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> 'Other' includes positions in Pension and Community Redevelopment Agency departments as noted in the 12.09.17 census file.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> No benchmark titles were selected from the Pension and Community Redevelopment Agency departments.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The column 'Titles Being Evaluated' does not add to the 92 benchmark positions as 18 positions cross multiple departments, encompassing 467 employees.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The percentage of total workforce value is based upon the 12.09.16 census provided by the client, which included a total of 3,024 job incumbents. These values are subject to change with workforce fluctuations.

# TABLE 3 BENCHMARK JOB TITLES BY DEPARTMENT

	City Attorney's Office (2)				
>					
	City Clerk's Office (1)				
	-	k's Office (1)			
>	Assistant City Clerk II				
		ssion's Office (1)			
<u>&gt;</u>	Commission Assistant IV				
	City Manag	ger's Office (3)			
>	Assistant City Manager	> Senior Financial Management Analyst			
>	Construction Review Specialist				
		iple Departments (19)			
>	Accounting Clerk	> Heavy Equipment Operator			
>	Administrative Aide	Municipal Maintenance Worker II			
<b> </b>	Administrative Assistant II Clerk III	> Planner III			
>		> Principal Planner			
<b>&gt;</b>	Code Compliance Officer Construction Worker II	<ul><li>Project Manager II</li><li>Secretary I</li></ul>			
>	Customer Service Representative I	> Serior Accounting Clerk			
>	Deputy Director	Senior Project Manager			
<b>&gt;</b>	Electrician	> Service Clerk			
>	Event Worker	Z GOLVING GIGHK			
		ance (6)			
>	Accountant II	> Senior Accountant			
>	Manager - Procurement & Contracts	> Senior Procurement Specialist			
>	Procurement Specialist II	> Treasurer			
	Fire Rescue (3)				
>	Battalion Chief	> Beach Patrol Lieutenant			
	> Beach Lifeguard				
		ces Department (5)			
>	Claims Adjuster Human Resources Assistant	<ul><li>Risk Manager</li><li>Senior Claims Adjuster</li></ul>			
<b>&gt;</b>	Insurance Benefits Specialist	Senior Claims Adjuster			
		chnology Services (10)			
>	Application Developer	> Network Support Analyst			
>	Assistant Database Administrator	> Senior Tech Support Analyst			
>	Computer Operator II	> Systems Administrator			
>	Data Warehouse Analyst	> Technical Support Analyst			
>	Geographic Information System Analyst	> Technology Strategist			
	Parks and	d Recreation (12)			
>	Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker	> Pool Equipment Mechanic			
>	Community Program Supervisor	> Pool Lifeguard I			
>	Field Operating Technician (Level IV)	> Recreation Instructor II			
>	Head Groundskeeper	> Recreation Program Coordinator			
	Municipal Maintenance Worker III				
>	•	_			
	(Parks/Facilities)	> Recreation Worker			
>	Parks Foreman				

# TABLE 3 BENCHMARK JOB TITLES BY DEPARTMENT

	Police (6)				
>	Accident Investigator II	>	Police Records Clerk		
>	Crime Analyst II	> Public Safety Aide			
>	Police Aide II	> Senior Police Records Clerk			
	Public Works / Building Services (12)				
>	Distribution & Collection Chief	>	Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Public Services)		
>	Electro Technician	>	Public Service Maintenance Chief		
>	Engineering Aide II	>	Utilities Mechanic I		
>	Engineering Technician II	> Utilities Service Worker			
>	Environmental Lab Technician	> Utility Field Representative			
>	Industrial Electrician	>	Water Treatment Plant Operator II		
	Sustainable Development (7)				
>	Building Inspector	>	Plumbing Inspector		
>	Chief Building Inspector	>	Senior Code Compliance Officer		
>	Economic and Business Development Manager	>	Structural Plans Examiner		
>	Electrical Inspector				
	Transportatio	n an	d Mobility (5)		
>	Airport Operations Aide	>	Parking Meter Technician		
>	Parking Enforcement Shift Coordinator	>	Parking Operations Supervisor		
>	Parking Enforcement Specialist				

**TABLE 4** BENCHMARK JOB TITLES BY OCCUPATIONAL CATEGORY - COMPOSITION OF WORKFORCE

Occupational Category	Benchmark Titles Being Evaluated in Study	Number of Employees within Benchmark Titles Being Evaluated	Employees in Benchmark Titles Evaluated As a Percent of the Total Workforce
Administrative & Support Services	11	201	6.6%
Managerial & Supervisory	6	19	0.6%
Paraprofessional	8	92	3.0%
Professional	31	274	9.1%
Service Maintenance	13	646	21.4%
Skilled Crafts	10	189	6.3%
Technical	13	83	2.7%
Total:	92	1,504	49.7%5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The percentage of total workforce value is based upon the 12-09-16 census provided by the client, which included a total of 3,024 job incumbents. These values are subject to change with workforce fluctuations.

# TABLE 5 BENCHMARK JOB TITLES BY OCCUPATIONAL CATEGORY

	Administrative and Support Services (11)				
>	Administrative Aide	<b>&gt;</b>	Police Aide II		
<b>\</b>	Administrative Assistant II	<b>\</b>	Police Records Clerk		
	Assistant City Clerk II		Secretary I		
>	•	<b>&gt;</b>	Senior Police Records Clerk		
>	Clerk III	>			
>	Customer Service Representative I	>	Service Clerk		
>	Parking Enforcement Specialist				
	Managerial and Supervisory (6)				
>	Beach Patrol Lieutenant	>	Manager - Procurement & Contracts		
>	Deputy Director	>	Risk Manager		
>	Economic and Business Development Manager	>	Treasurer		
	<del>_</del>	fess	sional (8)		
>	Accident Investigator II	>	Legal Assistant III		
>	Accounting Clerk	>	Public Safety Aide		
<b> </b>	Airport Operations Aide	>	Recreation Programmer I		
>	Insurance Benefits Specialist	>	Senior Accounting Clerk		
	Profess				
>	Accountant II	) 	Planner III		
1.	Application Developer				
>	··	>	Principal Planner		
<b> </b> >	Assistant City Attorney III	>	Procurement Specialist II		
>	Assistant City Manager	>	Project Manager II		
>	Assistant Database Administrator	>	Recreation Instructor II		
>	Battalion Chief	>	Recreation Program Coordinator		
>	Claims Adjuster	>	Senior Accountant		
>	Commission Assistant IV	>	Senior Claims Adjuster		
>	Community Program Supervisor	>	Senior Financial Management Analyst		
>	Crime Analyst II	>	Senior Procurement Specialist		
>	Data Warehouse Analyst	>	Senior Project Manager		
>	Environmental Lab Technician	>	Senior Tech Support Analyst		
>	Geographic Information System Analyst	>	Systems Administrator		
>	Human Resources Assistant	>	Technical Support Analyst		
>	Network Support Analyst	>	Technology Strategist		
<b>&gt;</b>	Parking Operations Supervisor		realmology endlegier		
	r anning operations capervisor				
	Service Maii	nten	ance (13)		
>	Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker		Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Public Services)		
>	Construction Worker II	>	Pool Equipment Mechanic		
>	Event Worker	>	Pool Lifeguard I		
<b>\</b>	Field Operating Technician (Level IV)	>	Recreation Worker		
>	Head Groundskeeper	<b>&gt;</b>	Utilities Service Worker		
>	Municipal Maintenance Worker II	<b>\</b>	Utility Field Representative		
>	Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)	_	Curry Field Representative		
	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	4 C=	off (40)		
			aft (10)		
>	Beach Lifeguard	>	Parking Meter Technician		
>	Distribution & Collection Chief	>	Parks Foreman		
>	Electrician	>	Public Service Maintenance Chief		
>	Heavy Equipment Operator	>	Utilities Mechanic I		
>	Industrial Electrician	>	Water Treatment Plant Operator II		

#### TABLE 5 BENCHMARK JOB TITLES BY OCCUPATIONAL CATEGORY

Technical (13)				
> Building Inspector	<ul> <li>Engineering Aide II</li> </ul>			
<ul> <li>Chief Building Inspector</li> </ul>	Engineering Technician II			
> Code Compliance Officer	Parking Enforcement Specialist			
<ul><li>Computer Operator II</li></ul>	> Plumbing Inspector			
<ul> <li>Construction Review Specialist</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Senior Code Compliance Officer</li> </ul>			
> Electrical Inspector	Structural Plans Examiner			
> Electro Technician				

#### **Summary of Findings**

This analysis is based on market data covering both the public sector, encompassing cities, counties, school districts, transportation entities, universities, and utilities, and the private sector. Public sector information was gathered through a custom market survey. Private sector information was derived from published data sources. The City of Fort Lauderdale's overall market position is based on an equal weighting of the two market sector averages and is relative to the 75<sup>th</sup> percentile of market.

Based on overall market data, including custom survey peer employers and published data representative of the private sector, the City of Fort Lauderdale's pay structure is at the market average at the pay range midpoint and maximum and below market at the pay range minimum. The City of Fort Lauderdale's market position is shown below in **Table 6A** as an overall to market, in Table 6B by department, and in Table 6C by occupational group.

We define market competitiveness as being between 95% and 105% of the market average at the minimum, midpoint, and maximum. Market comparisons that fall within this competitive corridor are noted in black, below 95% are noted in red, and above 105% are noted in blue.

#### **TABLE 6A** CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE, FL MARKET POSITION AT THE 75TH PERCENTILE OVERALL - PAY ONLY

	City of Fort Lauderdale as a Percent of the 75th Percentile of the Market Average				
	Pay Range Minimum Pay Range Midpoint Pay Range Maximum				
Overall	100% 96% 93%				

Figures shown in red are below market (less than 95% of the market average) Figures shown in **black** within the market range (95% to 105% of the market average) Figures shown in **blue** are above market (more than 105% of the market average)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Base pay rates have been adjusted for geographic differences in the cost-of-labor



# **TABLE 6B** CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE, FL MARKET POSITION AT THE $75^{\text{TH}}$ PERCENTILE BY DEPARTMENT – PAY ONLY<sup>7</sup>

	City of Fort Lauderdale as a Percent of the 75 <sup>th</sup> Percentile of the Market Average		
	Pay Range Minimum	Pay Range Midpoint	Pay Range Maximum
City Attorney's Office	108%	106%	106%
City Clerk's Office	113%	121%	110%
City Commission's Office	116%	112%	110%
City Manager's Office	90%	89%	87%
Crosses Multiple Departments	100%	96%	93%
Finance Department	111%	104%	100%
Fire Department	95%	97%	95%
Human Resources Department	97%	96%	95%
Information Technology Department	103%	96%	90%
Parks and Recreation Department	97%	95%	93%
Police	93%	86%	81%
Public Works / Building Services Department	99%	94%	90%
Sustainable Development Department	90%	87%	86%
Transportation and Mobility Department	108%	100%	94%
Overall	100%	96%	93%

Figures shown in **red** are below market (less than 95% of the market average) Figures shown in **black** within the market range (95% to 105% of the market average) Figures shown in **blue** are above market (more than 105% of the market average)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Base pay rates have been adjusted for geographic differences in the cost-of-labor

# TABLE 6C CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE, FL MARKET POSITION AT THE $75^{\text{TH}}$ PERCENTILE BY OCCUPATIONAL GROUP— PAY ONLY8

		City of Fort Lauderdale as a Percent of the 75 <sup>th</sup> Percentile of the Market Average		
	Pay Range Minimum	Pay Range Midpoint	Pay Range Maximum	
Administrative & Support Services	105%	98%	93%	
Managerial & Supervisory	101%	98%	95%	
Paraprofessional	97%	91%	87%	
Professional	102%	99%	96%	
Service Maintenance	95%	95%	94%	
Skilled Crafts	103%	97%	93%	
Technical	91%	86%	82%	
Overall	100%	96%	93%	

Figures shown in **red** are below market (less than 95% of the market average)
Figures shown in **black** within the market range (95% to 105% of the market average)

Figures shown in **blue** are above market (more than 105% of the market average)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Base pay rates have been adjusted for geographic differences in the cost-of-labor

We did find variation in the competitiveness of individual benchmark job titles (see **Table 11**). Overall, at the midpoint of the pay range:

- > 39 benchmark job titles are below market (less than 95% at the midpoint)
- > 34 benchmark job titles are at market (between 95% and 105% at the midpoint)
- > 17 benchmark job titles are above market (above 105% at the midpoint)
- > 2 benchmark job titles did not garner sufficient matches to be statistically significant

On a total compensation basis, taking into consideration base pay, employer health benefit costs, and retirement plan contributions, the City's market position relative to the base pay lowers slightly from 96% to 95%, as shown below in **Table 7**.

Overall, a total compensation analysis indicates:

- > 47 benchmark job titles are below market (less than 95% at the midpoint)
- > 33 benchmark job titles are at market (between 95% and 105% at the midpoint)
- > 10 benchmark job titles are above market (above 105% at the midpoint)
- > 2 benchmark job titles did not garner sufficient matches to be statistically significant

Health and retirement benefits used in the total compensation analysis reflect the Public Sector peer employers only.

TABLE 7 CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE, FL 75TH PERCENTILE MARKET POSITION ACROSS ALL BENCHMARKS AND PEER **EMPLOYERS - TOTAL COMPENSATION** 

		Employer Co		
	<b>Base Pay<sup>9</sup></b> (Range Midpoint)	Weighted Total Health Costs (Medical, Dental, & Vision)	Total Retirement Benefits (Defined Contribution & Deferred Compensation)	Employer Total Compensation Costs (Pay and Benefits)
Overall Average	96%	71%	115%	95%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Base pay rates have been adjusted for geographic differences in the cost-of-labor

# Methodology

#### **Peer Employers**

**Table 8** shows the demographic characteristics of the 18 comparable employers participating in the study, a combination of cities, counties, school districts, transportation entities, universities, and utilities identified by the City as representative of its competitive labor market.

TABLE 8
PEER EMPLOYER CHARACTERISTICS

Peer Employers	Population Change Since 2010	Median Household Income as of 2014
Cities		
City of Boca Raton	10.5%	\$354,800
City of Coral Springs	6.9%	\$269,600
City of Delray Beach	9.5%	\$176,900
City of Hollywood	6.4%	\$172,800
City of Miami	10.4%	\$211,400
City of Miami Beach	5.2%	\$341,000
City of Miramar	12.4%	\$194,000
City of Pompano Beach	7.9%	\$154,900
City of Sunrise	9.8%	\$137,300
City of West Palm Beach	6.9%	\$173,000
Counties		
Broward County	8.5%	\$177,300
Miami-Dade County	7.9%	\$194,100
School Districts		
Palm Beach County School District	7.8%	\$194,600
Transportation		
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	13.7%	\$158,600
Miami Executive Airport	10.4%	\$211,400
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	8.0%	\$188,666 <sup>10</sup>
Universities		
Miami-Dade College	10.4%	\$30,858
Utilities		
Toho Water Authority	20.6%	\$44,551
City of Fort Lauderdale	7.9%	\$243,600

 $<sup>^{10}</sup>$  Average of Broward, Miami-Dade and Palm Beach Counties 2014 Median Household Value data.

#### **Published Data Sources**

Additionally, Segal Waters referenced three (3) published data sources to reflect private sector pay levels. The sources are:

#### **Economic Research Institute (ERI)**

The ERI Salary Assessor compiles pay data from hundreds of published data sources for thousands of job titles. The database is updated quarterly and provides salary information for nearly any geographic area in the United States. The information in this database reflects base salaries at the 10th and 90th percentiles, applicable to data sources and locations near Fort Lauderdale, Florida. The midpoint was calculated from the 10th and 90th percentiles. The geographic data cut used was Fort Lauderdale, Florida and the data was effective as of July 1. 2016.

#### **Towers Watson Data Services, Compensation Surveys**

Towers Watson Data Services publishes multiple compensation surveys throughout the year. We compiled data from Towers Watson's General Industry compensation surveys. This report reflects the 10<sup>th</sup> and 90<sup>th</sup> percentiles of base salaries and the midpoint was calculated from these percentiles. The geographic cut used was the Southeast Region. Due to general proximity, data was not geographically adjusted. The data was effective as of February 1, 2015.

#### **Mercer US Benchmark Database Survey 2015**

The 2015 Mercer Compensation Survey Report complies pay data from over 3,000 organizations across a variety of industries throughout the United States. The information in this report reflects base salary and pay range data for all responding organizations in the Southeast region. This report reflects the 25<sup>th</sup> and 75<sup>th</sup> percentiles of base salaries and the midpoint was calculated from these percentiles. The data was effective as of March 1, 2015.

Data from the three published data sources above were aged to the data effective date of April 1, 2018.

#### **Data Adjustments**

#### **Geographic Adjustments**

To adjust for geographic difference in the cost-of-labor between the City of Fort Lauderdale and peer locations, we used the cost-of-labor differentials report by the Economic Research Institute (ERI) for each peer location.

It is important to note that the cost-of-labor differentials do not necessarily reflect cost-of-living differences. ERI has found that cost-of-living differences (which reflect the supply and demand for goods and services) are not a good predictor of salary levels. In other words, while the cost of housing (or other goods and services) in the City of Fort Lauderdale may differ from the cost of housing in another peer location by a certain percentage, the prevailing salaries may not differ by the same percentage. ERI emphasizes that – for adjusting salaries in a market study such as this one – the cost-of-labor differentials provide a more accurate method of determining whether employers are paying a competitive wage appropriate to a given geographic area.

The geographic adjustments applied are shown in **Table 9**. A **negative** adjustment means that the cost-of-labor in a comparator location is higher than in the City of Fort Lauderdale. For example, the cost of labor in the City of Boca Raton is higher than in the City of Fort Lauderdale, shown as -1.1%. Conversely, a **positive** adjustment means that the cost-of-labor in a comparator location is lower than in the City of Fort Lauderdale. For example, the cost of labor in the City of Miami is lower than in the City of Fort Lauderdale, shown as an adjustment of 0.1%.

TABLE 9
GEOGRAPHIC ADJUSTMENTS

Peer Employer	Geographic Adjustment
Broward County	0.0%
City of Boca Raton	-1.1%
City of Coral Springs	0.3%
City of Delray Beach	-0.8%
City of Hollywood	0.2%
City of Miami	0.1%
City of Miami Beach	-0.3%
City of Miramar	0.3%
City of Pompano Beach	0.4%
City of Sunrise	1.1%
City of West Palm Beach	-1.4%
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	5.0%
Miami Executive Airport	0.1%
Miami-Dade College	0.1%
Miami-Dade County	0.1%
Palm Beach County School District	-1.4%
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	0.1%
Toho Water Authority	5.4%

Since workweeks sometimes vary across peer employers, we typically adjust Non-Exempt positions based on the reported pay ranges to be consistent with the City of Fort Lauderdale's standard workweeks for employees; as shown below in **Table 10**, there were some differences in workweeks for the peer employers.

# TABLE 10 WORKWEEK ADJUSTMENTS

	40 HOUR	40 HOUR WORKWEEK	48 HOU	48 HOUR WORKWEEK
Peer Employer	Hours Worked by Employees in Comparable Positions	Workweek Adjustment by Employees in Comparable Positions	Hours Worked by Employees in Comparable Positions	Workweek Adjustment by Employees in Comparable Positions
Broward County	40.0	0.0%	48.0	0.0%
City of Boca Raton	40.0	%0.0	40.0	20.0%
City of Coral Springs	40.0	%0.0	48.0	0.0%
City of Delray Beach	40.0	%0.0	40.0	20.0%
City of Hollywood	40.0	%0.0	40.0	20.0%
City of Miami	40.0 29.5	0.0% 35.6%	40.0	20.0%
City of Miami Beach	40.0	%0.0	40.0	20.0%
City of Miramar	40.0	%0.0	40.0	20.0%
City of Pompano Beach	40.0	%0.0	48.0	0.0%
City of Sunrise	40.0	%0.0	40.0	20.0%
City of West Palm Beach	40.0	%0.0	48.0	0.0%
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	40.0	0.0%	40.0	20.0%
Miami Executive Airport	40.0	0.0%	40.0	20.0%
Miami-Dade College	37.5 25.0	6.7% 60.0%	40.0	20.0%
Miami-Dade County	40.0	%0.0	40.0	20.0%
Palm Beach County School District	40.0	0.0%	40.0	20.0%
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	40.0	%0.0	40.0	20.0%
Toho Water Authority	40.0	%0.0	40.0	20.0%
City of Fort Lauderdale	40.0	0.0%	48.0	%0.0

## Study Findings – Base Pay

#### Pay Ranges - Overall

Based on overall market data the City of Fort Lauderdale's pay structure is at the market average midpoint. We define market competitiveness as being between 95% and 105% of the market average. We did find variation in the competitiveness of individual benchmark job titles.

#### Specifically:

- 39 benchmark job titles are below market (less than 95% at the midpoint)
- > 34 benchmark job titles are at market (between 95% and 105% at the midpoint)
- > 17 benchmark job titles are above market (above 105% at the midpoint)
- 2 benchmark job titles did not garner sufficient matches to be statistically significant

Table 11 shows all benchmark jobs and their respective pay range market competitiveness based on the market data. "Insufficient Data" indicates that a specific benchmark job did not have three or more matches, as noted in the second column of the table. Segal Waters requires three or more matches for the data to be statistically significant; if a benchmark job does not garner enough matches Segal Waters will remove the position from analysis.

# **TABLE 11** CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE, FL OVERALL MARKET POSITION – $75^{TH}$ PERCENTILE – PAY ONLY BY DEPARTMENT

OVERALL MARKET POSITION - 75	" PERCENT	City of Fort Lauderdale Pay Ranges as a			
		Percent of the 75 <sup>th</sup> Percentile			
Benchmark Title	# of Matches	Pay Range Minimum	Pay Range Midpoint	Pay Range Maximum	
City A	ttorney's Offic	e (2)	-		
Assistant City Attorney III	10	112%	107%	105%	
Legal Assistant III	10	99%	105%	106%	
City Attorney's Office Average	<u> </u>	108%	106%	106%	
City	Clerk's Office	(1)			
Assistant City Clerk II	6	113%	121%	110%	
City Clerk's Office Average		113%	121%	110%	
City Cor	nmission's Of	fice (1)	1		
Commission Assistant IV	5	116%	112%	110%	
City Commission's Office Average		116%	112%	110%	
	lanager's Offic	e (3)	ı	ı	
Assistant City Manager	11	87%	90%	88%	
Construction Review Specialist	4	103%	95%	89%	
Senior Financial Management Analyst	12	88%	85%	86%	
City Manager's Office Average		90%	89%	87%	
	ultiple Departn	nents (19)	<u>I</u>	<u> </u>	
Accounting Clerk	16	100%	90%	86%	
Administrative Aide	13	105%	95%	89%	
Administrative Assistant II	9	104%	100%	95%	
Clerk III	12	119%	113%	110%	
Code Compliance Officer	11	97%	92%	87%	
Construction Worker II	12	110%	106%	101%	
Customer Service Representative I	13	97%	88%	82%	
Deputy Director	12	96%	97%	94%	
Electrician	18	102%	97%	94%	
Event Worker	3	64%	118%	154%	
Heavy Equipment Operator	14	101%	95%	92%	
Municipal Maintenance Worker II	15	100%	95%	93%	
Planner III	11	100%	95%	90%	
Principal Planner	9	102%	97%	94%	
Project Manager II	12	92%	89%	84%	
Secretary I	12	104%	94%	89%	
Senior Accounting Clerk	9	96%	92%	89%	
Senior Project Manager	9	99%	97%	94%	
Service Clerk	5	105%	97%	93%	
Crosses Multiple Departments Average		100%	96%	93%	
	ce Departmen		2370	22,0	
	<del>-</del>		108%	102%	
Accountant II  Manager, Procurement And Contracts	17 13	117%	108% 97%	102% 92%	

# **TABLE 11** CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE, FL OVERALL MARKET POSITION – 75<sup>TH</sup> PERCENTILE – PAY ONLY BY DEPARTMENT

OVERALL MARKET POSITION = 75	FERCENT	City of Fort Lauderdale Pay Ranges as a				
			Percent of the 75 <sup>th</sup> Percentile			
Benchmark Title	# of Matches	Pay Range Minimum	Pay Range Midpoint	Pay Range Maximum		
Procurement Specialist II	13	123%	112%	105%		
Senior Accountant	17	118%	110%	109%		
Senior Procurement Specialist	10	122%	117%	112%		
Treasurer	10	94%	90%	87%		
Finance Department Average		111%	104%	100%		
Fire	e Department (	3)				
Battalion Chief	12	85%	98%	102%		
Beach Lifeguard	7	98%	90%	85%		
Beach Patrol Lieutenant	7	113%	101%	92%		
Fire Department Average		95%	97%	95%		
Human Re	sources Depai	rtment (5)				
Claims Adjuster	11	87%	89%	87%		
Human Resources Assistant	6	112%	109%	111%		
Insurance Benefits Specialist	8	99%	92%	88%		
Risk Manager	8	100%	100%	100%		
Senior Claims Adjuster	10	92%	93%	91%		
Human Resources Department Average		97%	96%	95%		
Information To	echnology Dep	partment (10)	<u> </u>	<u> </u>		
Application Developer	10	108%	107%	102%		
Assistant Database Administrator	10	100%	96%	90%		
Computer Operator II	6	94%	80%	71%		
Data Warehouse Analyst	4	104%	102%	95%		
Geographic Information Systems Analyst	6	111%	101%	93%		
Network Support Analyst	9	100%	96%	90%		
Senior Tech Support Analyst	9	111%	101%	97%		
Systems Administrator	13	112%	103%	97%		
Technical Support Analyst	11	103%	96%	91%		
Technology Strategist	6	87%	80%	75%		
Information Technology Department Average	ge	103%	96%	90%		
Parks and Ro	ecreation Depa	artment (12)				
Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker	9	90%	83%	80%		
Community Program Supervisor	7	92%	94%	95%		
Field Operations Technician - Level IV	4	108%	98%	91%		
Head Groundskeeper	4	98%	94%	91%		
Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)	10	92%	89%	85%		
Parks Foreman	7	112%	105%	102%		
Pool Equipment Mechanic	4	110%	108%	107%		
Pool Lifeguard I	11	98%	91%	85%		
Recreation Instructor II	5	64%	82%	94%		

# TABLE 11 CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE, FL OVERALL MARKET POSITION – 75<sup>TH</sup> PERCENTILE – PAY ONLY BY DEPARTMENT

OVERALL MARKET POSITION = 75	LKOLIVI	City of Fort Lauderdale Pay Ranges as a Percent of the 75 <sup>th</sup> Percentile				
Benchmark Title	# of Matches	Pay Range Minimum	Pay Range Midpoint	Pay Range Maximum		
Recreation Program Coordinator	7	116%	113%	108%		
Recreation Programmer I	7	96%	87%	81%		
Recreation Worker	7	62%	75%	84%		
Parks and Recreation Department Average		97%	95%	93%		
	e Department	(6)	ı	ı		
Accident Investigator II	2	1	Insufficient Dat	a		
Crime Analyst II	8	103%	93%	86%		
Police Aide II	1		a			
Police Records Clerk	8	98%	91%	86%		
Public Safety Aide	6	86%	84%	78%		
Senior Police Records Clerk	4	91%	82%	76%		
Police Department Average	_	93%	86%	81%		
Public Works / Buil	ding Services					
Distribution And Collection Chief	6	97%	94%	92%		
Electro Technician	7	101%	96%	92%		
Engineering Aide II	6	85%	83%	75%		
Engineering Technician II	6	106%	100%	93%		
Environmental Laboratory Technician	6	99%	95%	93%		
Industrial Electrician	18	102%	97%	93%		
Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Public Services)	4	95%	88%	83%		
Public Service Maintenance Chief	9	100%	96%	92%		
Utilities Mechanic I	10	105%	98%	90%		
Utilities Service Worker	8	83%	88%	91%		
Utility Field Representative	3	105%	99%	94%		
Water Treatment Plant Operator II	8	103%	95%	90%		
Public Works / Building Services Departmen	nt Average	99%	94%	90%		
Sustainable De	velopment De	epartment (7)				
Building Inspector	10	80%	82%	85%		
Chief Building Inspector	10	87%	85%	86%		
Economic And Business Development Manager	10	106%	106%	106%		
Electrical Inspector	8	87%	83%	80%		
Plumbing Inspector	9	88%	83%	80%		
Senior Code Compliance Officer	10	88%	80%	75%		
Structural Plans Examiner	8	89%	83%	80%		
Sustainable Development Department Avera	ige	90%	87%	86%		
Transportation a	_	epartment (5)				
Airport Operations Aide	3	100%	88%	81%		
Parking Enforcement Shift Coordinator	3	114%	106%	99%		

# TABLE 11 CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE, FL OVERALL MARKET POSITION – 75<sup>TH</sup> PERCENTILE – PAY ONLY BY DEPARTMENT

City of Fort Lauderdale Pay Ranges as a Percent of the 75<sup>th</sup> Percentile # of Pay Range **Pay Range** Pay Range **Benchmark Title** Minimum Midpoint Maximum **Matches** Parking Enforcement Specialist 5 95% 80% 85% Parking Meter Technician 5 107% 100% 95% Parking Operations Supervisor 120% 118% 117% **Transportation and Mobility Department Average** 108% 100% 94% 100% 93% 96%

CAM 18-1199

Exhibit 11 Page 25 of 91

Figures shown in **red** are below market (less than 95% of the market average)

Figures shown in **black** within the market range (95% to 105% of the market average)

Figures shown in **blue** are above market (more than 105% of the market average)

# **Study Findings – Pay Practices**

#### Pay Schedule Design & Increases

Tables 12 through 49 detail characteristics of peer employer pay plans for general employee positions including:

- > Pay Schedule Design
- > Pay Progression
- > Pay Increase Amounts
- > Type of Base Pay Increases
- > Pay Progression and Pay Increase Policies

Questions to which a comparable employer provided no response display an 'NR' in the associated field, and questions where an answer was not applicable display an 'NA' in the associated field.

> Exhibit 11 Page 27 of 91

**Survey Question:** What type of pay schedule design(s) covers employees?

**TABLE 12 PAY SCHEDULE DESIGN – GENERAL EMPLOYEES** 

Peer Employer	Grade and Step	Open Ranges	Flat Rates	Other
City of Delray Beach	No	Yes	No	No
City of Hollywood	No	Yes	No	No
City of Miami	Yes	Yes	No	No
City of Miami Beach	No	Yes	No	No
City of Miramar	No	Yes	No	No
City of Pompano Beach	No	Yes	No	No
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	Yes	No	No
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	Yes	No	No
Miami-Dade College	NR	Yes	NR	No
Palm Beach County School District	No	Yes	No	No
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	No	Yes	No	No
Toho Water Authority	Yes	No	No	No
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	No	No	No

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

CAM 18-1199

Exhibit 11 Page 28 of 91

Survey Question: What determines how employees progress though the pay range (that is, moves from the minimum to the maximum of the range)?

**TABLE 13 PAY PROGRESSION - GENERAL EMPLOYEES** 

Peer Employer	Steps (Time in Position)	Individual Performance	Other
City of Delray Beach	No	Yes	NA
City of Hollywood	No	Yes	No
City of Miami	Yes	Yes	No
City of Miami Beach	No	Yes	NA
City of Miramar	No	Yes	No
City of Pompano Beach	No	Yes	No
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	No	No	Yes – General Increase
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	Yes	NA
Miami-Dade College	Yes	NR	NA
Palm Beach County School District	No	No	Yes
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	No	Yes	Yes
Toho Water Authority	Yes	No	NA
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	Yes	NA

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable Survey Question: What type(s) / amount of base pay increases were applied in FY 2017 for employees? If other, please explain.

**TABLE 14** FY 2017 TYPE OF BASE PAY INCREASES – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	COLA	Amount (\$ or %)	Merit/ Performance	Amount (\$ or %)	Other	Amount (\$ or %)	If other, please explain:
City of Delray Beach	No	NA	Yes	0.0% - 5.0%	NA	NA	NA
City of Hollywood	Yes	2.5%	Yes	1.5%	No	NA	NA
City of Miami	No	NA	Yes	5.0%	Yes	5.0%	Contract Step Increases
City of Miami Beach	Yes	3.0%	Yes	TBD	NA	NA	Merit/Performance percentage is pending Commission approval
City of Miramar	Yes	2.5%	No	NA	No	NA	NA
City of Pompano Beach	Yes	3.0%	Yes	1.0% - 3.0%	No	NA	NA
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	No	NA	No	NA	Yes	3.5%	General Increase
Miami Executive Airport			Pe	ending Labor	Agreemen	t Negotiations	
Miami-Dade College	No	NA	No	NA	Yes	2.0%	As approved by the Board of Trustees, for FY 2016/2017
Palm Beach County School District	No	NA	Yes	See Comment	Yes	See Comment	PBCSD has 6 bargaining units and 6 non-bargaining units. Union negotiations determine increases.
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	No	NA	No	NA	Yes	3.0%	Across the board increase
Toho Water Authority	Yes	1.5%	Yes	2.5%	NA	NA	NA
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	0.5%	Yes	1.5% - 3.0%	NA	NA	NA

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

#### **Survey Questions:**

- (A) Do adjustments to the pay schedule automatically result in increases to employees' base pay?
- (B) Do you have a minimum guaranteed pay increase for promotions?
- (C) Do you have a policy on hiring practices? If yes, please provide any relevant detail.

TABLE 15
PAY PROGRESSION AND PAY INCREASE POLICIES – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	Question A	Question B	Question C	If Yes, please detail any relevant information.
City of Delray Beach	No	Yes	Yes	NR
City of Hollywood	Yes	Yes	Yes	Minimum of 5% for promotion
City of Miami	Yes	Yes	Yes	NR
City of Miami Beach	No	Yes	Yes	NR
City of Miramar	Yes	No	Yes	Varies by department, HR has a blanket policy on hiring polices
City of Pompano Beach	No	Yes	Yes	All newly appointed employees should be appointed at the minimum entrance salary. A department head may hire above salary with the City Manager's approval. An employee who is promoted salary will be increased to the minimum of the new pay grade or 15% of their base pay, whichever is the greater.
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	No	Yes	Yes	NR
Miami Executive Airport	No	Yes	Yes	Minimum guaranteed pay increase is approximately 5% or to the minimum of the pay grade, greater of amount.
Miami-Dade College	NR	NR	NR	NR
Palm Beach County School District	No	Yes	Yes	Previous identical experience may apply for purposes of initial salary appointment, depending on the bargaining or non-bargaining unit of assignment.
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	No	No	Yes	It is the policy of SFRTA to be an Equal Opportunity employer.
Toho Water Authority	Yes	Yes	Yes	Question B: Yes – A promotion to a higher salary grade is 7% or the minimum of the new pay grade. A promotion from non-supervisor to a supervisor position is 10%.  Question C: Yes – We have a policy on recruitment and appointment, transfers, promotions and demotions, and pay for performance.
City of Fort Lauderdale	No	Yes	Yes	For exam positions: Must be a job posting (Teamsters requires a two week post), examination process that will make up half of the candidates' overall score. Candidates must be ranked and placed on an eligibility list and the top 5 scores are sent to the hiring department for interviews and selection.  Non-exam positions: Must be a job posting and the overall score is based on the interview panel.

#### **Survey Question:**

(D) Do you have a minimum guaranteed pay increases for reclassification to a higher grade?

**TABLE 16** PAY PROGRESSION AND PAY INCREASE POLICIES CONTINUED - GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	Question D	If Yes, please describe below.
City of Delray Beach	Yes	4.0% per grade
City of Hollywood	Yes	Minimum of 5.0% for reclassification
City of Miami	Yes	Minimum 10.0% increase
City of Miami Beach	Yes	5.0%
City of Miramar	No	NA
City of Pompano Beach	Yes	5.0%
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	6.0%
Miami Executive Airport	No	NA
Miami-Dade College	Yes	NR
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	5.0%
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Yes	Employees transferred to a job in a higher salary range will be paid at least the minimum of the new range and no greater than 10.0% above the minimum range.
Toho Water Authority	Yes	A promotion to a higher salary grade is 7.0% or the minimum of the new pay grade. A promotion from non-supervisory to supervisor is 10.0%.
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	5.0% increase or the minimum of the pay grade, whichever is higher.

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

**TABLE 17A PAY SUPPLEMENTS OFFERED - GENERAL EMPLOYEES** 

Peer Employer	Evening Shift	Amount (\$ or %)	Overnight Shift Differential	Amount (\$ or %)	Weekend Differential	Amount (\$ or %)
City of Delray Beach	Yes	NR	Yes	NR	No	NA
City of Hollywood	Yes	\$0.60/hr	Yes	\$1.00/hr	No	NA
City of Miami	No	NA	Yes	\$0.60/hr	No	NA
City of Miami Beach	Yes	Varies	Yes	Varies	No	NA
City of Miramar	Yes	NR	Yes	NR	No	NA
City of Pompano Beach	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	\$0.60/hr	Yes	\$0.85/hr	No	NA
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	5.0%	Yes	5.0%	No	NA
Miami-Dade College	Yes	5.0%	Yes	10.0%	No	NA
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	\$0.25/hr	No	NA	No	NA
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	No	NA	Yes	\$1.00/hr	No	NA
Toho Water Authority	Yes	1.5x for Non- Exempt Employees	Yes	1.5x for Non- Exempt Employees	No	NA
City of Fort Lauderdale	No	NA	Yes	2.5% or 5.0% above pay range depending on the position.	Yes	2.5% or 5.0% above pay range depending on the position.

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

Page 33 of 91

**TABLE 17B PAY SUPPLEMENTS OFFERED - GENERAL EMPLOYEES** 

Peer Employer	On-Call or Stand- Amount		Call-Back	Amount	
r eer Employer	By Pay	(\$ or %)	Pay	(\$ or %)	
City of Delray Beach	Yes	NR	Yes	NR	
City of Hollywood	No	NA	Yes	NR	
City of Miami	Yes	Receive a 7.5% pay supplement added to their base rate of pay should they be continually assigned to on-call rotation.	Yes	If recalled to duty during off-duty hours, receive a minimum of three (3) hours plus one (1) hour travel time, paid at the overtime rate	
City of Miami Beach	Yes	2 Hours	Yes	4 Hours Minimum	
City of Miramar	No	NA	Yes	NR	
City of Pompano Beach	Yes	Additional \$1.00/hr	Yes	\$100 monthly only for Zoning Techs	
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	2/10 of one hour	Yes	4 Hrs Min	
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	Amount dependent on employee's individual pay rate	Yes	Min. 4 Hrs Pay	
Miami-Dade College	No	NA	No	NA	
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	NR	No	NA	
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	No	NA	No	NA	
Toho Water Authority	Yes	Paid overtime for the actual hours called out and a flat \$140 for serving standby duty	Yes	Minimum 2 hrs. and a minimum of 15 minutes of work for responses from a remote location, at the applicable rate of pay	
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	Non-duty day employee receives 2 hr straight time, on duty day is 1 hr	Yes	Call back pay is time and one-half with a minimum of 3 hours	

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

Page 34 of 91

**TABLE 17C PAY SUPPLEMENTS OFFERED - GENERAL EMPLOYEES** 

Peer Employer	Holiday Pay	Amount (\$ or %)			
City of Delray Beach	Yes	NR			
City of Hollywood	Yes	NR			
City of Miami	Yes	1.5x the Hourly Rate			
City of Miami Beach	Yes	NR			
City of Miramar	Yes	NR			
City of Pompano Beach	No	NA			
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando	Yes	Holiday + Regular			
Executive Airport	162	Tibliday + Regulai			
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	One day of pay, amount dependent on employee's individual pay rate			
Miami-Dade College	No	NA			
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	NR			
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Yes	8/4 hr FT/PT			
Toho Water Authority	NR	NR			
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	Employees not scheduled receive 8 hours pay at straight time. scheduled on a holiday, employee receive holiday compensato time off calculated at 1-1/2 times the hours worked			

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

CAM 18-1199 Exhibit 11 Page 35 of 91

**TABLE 17D PAY SUPPLEMENTS OFFERED - GENERAL EMPLOYEES** 

Peer Employer	Bi-Lingual Pay	Amount (\$ or %)	Special Skills	Amount (\$ or %)	Sign-On Bonus	Amount (\$ or %)
City of Delray Beach	Yes	NR	No	NA	No	NA
City of Hollywood	No	NA	NR	NR	No	NA
City of Miami	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
City of Miami Beach	No	NR	Yes	NR	No	NR
City of Miramar	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
City of Pompano Beach	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
Miami Executive Airport	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
Miami-Dade College	NR	NR	NR	NR	NR	NR
Palm Beach County School District	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
Toho Water Authority	No	NA	NR	NR	No	NA
City of Fort Lauderdale	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

Page 36 of 91

**Survey Question:** What types of pay supplements are offered to any employees (e.g. \$0.10/hour for trades workers)? If you do not offer one or more of the following pay supplements, enter "Not Applicable."

### TABLE 17E PAY SUPPLEMENTS OFFERED- GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	Referral Bonus	Amount (\$ or %)	Profess. Edu. Diff.	Amount (\$ or %)	Educational Stipend	Amount (\$ or %)
City of Delray Beach	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
City of Hollywood	No	NA	No	NA	NR	NR
City of Miami	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
City of Miami Beach	No	NR	NR	NR	Yes	UNDERGRADUATE COURSES:  80% for courses where employee earns an A 60% for courses where employee earns a B 40% for courses where employee earns a C GRADUATE COURSES:  80% for courses where employee earns an A 60% for courses where employee earns a B
City of Miramar	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
City of Pompano Beach	No	NA	Yes	Only for Zoning Technician	No	NA
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
Miami Executive Airport	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
Miami-Dade College	NR	NR	NR	NR	NR	NR
Palm Beach County School District	No	NA	Yes	NR	No	NA
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
Toho Water Authority	No	NA	No	NA	Yes	\$4,690 per fiscal year, reimbursement of courses associated with attaining a degree in a field related to the employee's role at TWA
City of Fort Lauderdale	No	NA	No	NA	Yes	Differs based on bargaining group and classification

Survey Question: What types of pay supplements are offered to any employees (e.g. \$0.10/hour for trades workers)? If you do not offer one or more of the following pay supplements, enter "Not Applicable."

**TABLE 17F1** PAY SUPPLEMENTS OFFERED- GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	Other	Amount (\$ or %)	Comments
City of Delray Beach	NR	NR	NR
City of Hollywood	NR	NR	NR
			•Emergency Dispatchers who are actively assigned the duty of training new Emergency Dispatchers shall be entitled to receive a five percent (5%) per pay period pay supplement for the actual full pay period they are assigned in a training capacity by their supervisor.
City of Miami	Yes	See	•All Police Emergency Dispatchers, Emergency Dispatcher Supervisors, and Police and Emergency Dispatch Assistants assigned to Police Communications shall receive a five percent (5%) pay supplement if the employee holds and maintains the Quality Assurance Proficiency (QAP) rating in accordance with Police Standards after a period of three (3) months.
Only of Milanni	100	Comment	•Fire Garage Mechanics and Supervisors who obtain Emergency Vehicle Technicians certificates, shall receive a one percent (1%) pay supplement for every two (2) licenses that mechanics and supervisors obtain and maintain, up to a maximum of five percent (5%) for holding a minimum of ten (10) approved licenses.
			•All fleet employees and supervisors in the Department of General Services Administration who obtain Automotive Service Excellence (ASE) certification, shall receive a one percent (1%) pay supplement for every two (2) licenses obtained and maintained, up to a maximum of five percent (5%) for holding a minimum of ten (10) approved licenses.
City of Miami Beach	NR	NR	NR
City of Miramar	No	NA	NR
City of Pompano Beach	No	NA	NR
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	No	NA	NR

CAM 18-1199 Exhibit 11 Page 38 of 91

### **TABLE 17F2** PAY SUPPLEMENTS OFFERED- GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	Other	Amount (\$ or %)	Comments
Miami Executive Airport	No	NA	Lead worker is a pay supplement provided to employees that are determined to be performing extraordinary duties within their classification, such as providing direction, issuing work assignments to other employees within their same classification, performing added duties outside their classification, etc. For employees in the Purchasing or Contracting Profession there is a certification available to employees in the purchasing & contract procurement area such as Certified Public Procurement Officer (CPPO); the supplement is for attaining the certification.
Miami-Dade College	Yes	3%	Lead workers are provided a pay supplement of 3% of their base pay.
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	NR	NR
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	No	NA	Pay differential of \$1.00 per hour for hours between 10 pm and 6 am. Holiday pay is paid at rate of 8 hours for full time employees and 4 hours for part time employees.
Toho Water Authority	Yes	7%	Field Services has a Skill Based Pay program that incentivizes progression of skills and knowledge. The employee's job title advances and their pay grade increases by meeting the requirements.
City of Fort Lauderdale	No	NA	NR

- (A) Do you offer longevity pay to any employees?
- (B) If Yes, which employee groups receive longevity pay?

### TABLE 18 LONGEVITY PAY – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	Offered?	Employee Groups which Receive Longevity Pay
City of Delray Beach	No	NA
City of Hollywood	Yes	General, Professional, Supervisory, and Non-Represented
City of Miami	No	NA
City of Miami Beach	No	NA
City of Miramar	Yes	Employees with 15 Years of Full-time Service or More
City of Pompano Beach	No	NA
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	All Employee Groups
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	All Employee Groups
Miami-Dade College	No	NA
Palm Beach County School District	No	NA
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	No	NA
Toho Water Authority	Yes	All Full-time and Permanent Employees
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	Employees hired before 10/1/2004

Survey Question: How much longevity pay do general employees receive for each year of service?

TABLE 19A
AMOUNT OF LONGEVITY PAY BY YEARS OF SERVICE – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	1 < 5 Years	5 < 10 Years	10 < 15 Years	15 < 20 Years	20 < 25 Years	25 < 30 Years	30+ Years
		Anr	nual Amount (\$/ho	ur or % of pay)			
City of Delray Beach	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
City of Hollywood	0.0%	0.0%	5.0%	3.0%	2.0%	2.0%	2.0%
City of Miami	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
City of Miami Beach	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
City of Miramar	NR	NR	NR	NR	NR	NR	NR
City of Pompano Beach	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	\$0.00	\$425.00	\$825.00	\$1,200.00	\$1,600.00	\$1,600.00	\$1,600.00
Miami Executive Airport	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	15 Yrs – 1.5% 16 Yrs – 1.6% 17 Yrs – 1.7% 18 Yrs – 1.8% 19 Yrs – 1.9%	20 Yrs – 2.0% 21 Yrs – 2.1% 22 Yrs – 2.2% 23 Yrs – 2.3% 24 Yrs – 2.4%	25 Yrs – 2.5% 26 Yrs – 2.6% 27 Yrs – 2.7% 28 Yrs – 2.8% 29 Yrs – 2.9%	30 Yr Cap at 3.0%
Miami-Dade College	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Palm Beach County School District	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Toho Water Authority	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$300.00 - \$450.00	\$450.00 - \$600.00	\$600.00 - \$750.00	\$750.00 - \$900.00	\$900.00 - \$1,020.00
City of Fort Lauderdale	NA	2.5%	5.0%	7.5%	10.0%	12.5%	12.5%

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

Page 41 of 91

Survey Question: How much longevity pay do management employees receive for each year of service?

**TABLE 19B** AMOUNT OF LONGEVITY PAY BY YEARS OF SERVICE - MANAGEMENT - GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	1 < 5 Years	5 < 10 Years	10 < 15 Years	15 < 20 Years	20 < 25 Years	25 < 30 Years	30+ Years
		Annual	Amount (\$/hour	or % of pay)			
City of Delray Beach	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
City of Hollywood	0.0%	0.0%	5.0%	3.0%	2.0%	2.0%	2.0%
City of Miami	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
City of Miami Beach	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
City of Miramar	NR	NR	NR	NR	NR	NR	NR
City of Pompano Beach	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	\$0.00	\$425.00	\$825.00	\$1,200.00	\$1,600.00	\$1,600.00	\$1,600.00
Miami Executive Airport	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	15 Yrs – 1.5% 16 Yrs – 1.6% 17 Yrs – 1.7% 18 Yrs – 1.8% 19 Yrs – 1.9%	20 Yrs – 2.0% 21 Yrs – 2.1% 22 Yrs – 2.2% 23 Yrs – 2.3% 24 Yrs – 2.4%	25 Yrs – 2.5% 26 Yrs – 2.6% 27 Yrs – 2.7% 28 Yrs – 2.8% 29 Yrs – 2.9%	30 Yr Cap at 3.0%
Miami-Dade College	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Palm Beach County School District	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Toho Water Authority	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$300.00 - \$450.00	\$450.00 - \$600.00	\$600.00 - \$750.00	\$750.00 - \$900.00	\$900.00 - \$1,020.00
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$0.00	Starting at 5	years of service	employees will	earn \$264 for eac	ch year of continu	uous service

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

Page 42 of 91

**Survey Questions:** What is the maximum amount of longevity pay an employee can receive? Is longevity pay included in pension calculations?

TABLE 20
MAXIMUM AMOUNT OF LONGEVITY PAY – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	Maximum Amount	Included in Pension Benefit Calculations?	Use this space below for additional comments regarding longevity pay.
City of Delray Beach	NA	NA	NA
City of Hollywood	Capped at 2.0% of Pay at 20 years of Service	Yes	NR
City of Miami	NA	NA	NA
City of Miami Beach	NA	NA	NA
City of Miramar	NR	NR	NR
City of Pompano Beach	NA	NA	NA
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Capped at \$1,600.00	No	The years are slightly off compared to Greater Orlando Aviation  Authority
Miami Executive Airport	Capped at 3.0% of Pay	NR	NR
Miami-Dade College	No	NA	NA
Palm Beach County School District	NA	NA	NA
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	NA	NA	NA
Toho Water Authority	Capped at \$1,020.00	Yes	NR
City of Fort Lauderdale	12.5%	NR	Annual dollar amount for Longevity pay differs based on bargaining group. Annual rates listed for general employees are from Teamsters bargaining union.  Employees must be hired prior to April 10, 1983 and must have served continuous for 5 years. For Federation employees: must be employed on or before Feb. 28, 1987. For management: must be employed on or before March 1, 1987 and 5 years of continuous serves.

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

Page 43 of 91

- (A) Do you offer performance-based rewards?
- (B) If yes, what types of performance-based rewards do you offer to any employees?

TABLE 21
PERFORMANCE-BASED REWARDS – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	Offered?	Organization Wide Pay Increases	Organization Wide Lump Sum Bonuses	Department/ Team Pay Increases	Department/ Team Lump Sum Bonuses	Individual Pay Increases	Individual Lump Sum Bonuses
City of Delray Beach	Yes	No	No	No	No	Yes	Yes
City of Hollywood	No	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
City of Miami	No	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
City of Miami Beach	No	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
City of Miramar	No	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
City of Pompano Beach	Yes	No	No	No	No	Yes	No
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	No	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	No	No	No	No	Yes	Yes
Miami-Dade College	No	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	No	No	No	No	Yes	No
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Yes	No	No	No	No	Yes	No
Toho Water Authority	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	No	No	No	No	Yes	No

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

CAM 18-1199 Exhibit 11 Page 44 of 91 **Survey Question:** Which employee groups are eligible for any performance-based rewards?

TABLE 22
PERFORMANCE-BASED REWARDS – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	Eligible Employee Groups
City of Delray Beach	All
City of Hollywood	Only general employees currently, management just received a COLA
City of Miami	NA
City of Miami Beach	NA
City of Miramar	NR
City of Pompano Beach	Full-time employees only
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	NA
Miami Executive Airport	All non-bargaining unit employees.
Miami-Dade College	NA
Palm Beach County School District	Teachers, Principals, Assistant Principals
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	NR
Toho Water Authority	All permanent full-time and part time employees
City of Fort Lauderdale	NR

8782033v1/14397.004

Survey Question: Do you reimburse employees for expense associated with education, such as getting a college degree, continuing education, or certifications?

**TABLE 23** 

graduate. Annual max \$7,000 Grade of "B" or higher = 100% reimbursement. Grade of "C" Grade A = 100%; Grade B = 75%; Grade C = 50%, D or \$200 credit hour for undergraduate. \$590 credit hour for Less than a "C" = 0% reimbursement **Additional Comments** = 75% reimbursement below = None ۷ Z % of tuition cost up to a max of 24 sem hrs annually Tuition assistance shall be based upon and not exceed the established credit hour tuition rate in the State university system at the time of enrollment Additional Policy Information Grade "C" or Better Required Grade "C" or Better Required SUPPLEMENTAL PAY - TUITION ASSISTANCE - GENERAL EMPLOYEES Annual Max \$7,000 12 Credits per Year Z Z N N Z Z Z Z ₹ Limited to 6 credit hours (Annual or One Time) per semester Frequency Annual Annual Annual Annual Annual Annual Annual Annual Annual Z R Ä ۲ Graduate: Up to \$7,000.00 (% of base or \$ per hour) Grade A: 80% reimburse. Grade B: 60% reimburse. Grade C: 40% reimburse. <u>Undergraduate:</u> Up to % Based on Grade \$4,000 Maximum \$200 / credit hr for \$590 / credit hr for undergraduate State Rate graduate \$4,690.00 \$2,500.00 \$5,000.00 Amount 100% 20% K K Ź Offered? Yes Z R Yes ž Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive South Florida Regional Transportation Authority Palm Beach County School District City of Fort Lauderdale Miami Executive Airport City of Pompano Beach Toho Water Authority Miami-Dade College City of Delray Beach City of Miami Beach City of Hollywood Peer Employer City of Miramar City of Miami Airport

**Survey Question:** Do you have a traditional leave or paid time off (PTO) program?

**TABLE 24** PTO PROGRAM OFFERING - GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	Type of Program
City of Delray Beach	Traditional Leave
City of Hollywood	Traditional Leave
City of Miami	Paid Time Off (PTO)
City of Miami Beach	Traditional Leave
City of Miramar	NR
City of Pompano Beach	Traditional Leave
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Traditional Leave
Miami Executive Airport	Paid Time Off (PTO)
Miami-Dade College	Traditional Leave
Palm Beach County School District	Traditional Leave
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Traditional Leave
Toho Water Authority	Traditional Leave
City of Fort Lauderdale	Traditional Leave

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

CAM 18-1199

Exhibit 11 Page 47 of 91

Survey Question: How many Vacation OR Paid Time Off (PTO) leave days do full-time employees accrue in a year? If you have PTO days instead of vacation days, enter the number of PTO days.

TABLE 25A FULL-TIME EMPLOYEES VACATION / PAID TIME OFF DAYS OFFERED – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

	0-1	-	2	က	4	2																		24	25+
Employer	YOS	YOS	YOS	YOS	YOS	YOS YOS	SOY S	SOY S	SOY SOS	s Yos	S YOS	YOS	YOS	YOS											
City of Delray Beach	0	12	12	12	14	14		14																18	18
City of Hollywood	0	10	10	10	10	10		10																25	22
City of Miami (PTO) <sup>11</sup>	0	12	12	12	12	12		4																22	22
City of Miami Beach	12	12	12	12	12	12		12																22	22
City of Miramar	10	10	10	10	15	15		15																25	22
City of Pompano Beach	0	10	10	10	10	10		15																20	20
Greater Orlando Aviation																									
Authority / Orlando	9	10	10	10	10	12	12	12	12	12	15	15	15 1	15 1	5	15 1	15 15	5 15	5 15	5 20	20	20	20	20	52
Executive Airport																									
Miami Executive Airport (PTO) <sup>11</sup>	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10 1	10 1	10 1	0	10 10	10 10	) 10	) 10	) 10	10	10	10	10	10
Miami-Dade College	12	12	12	12	12	12	15	15	15	15	15	18 1	18 1	18 1	8	18 18	18 18	3 18	3 18	3 18	18	18	18	18	18
Palm Beach County School District	0	12	12	12	12	12	15	15	15	15	15	18	18		8 -	18	18 18				18	18	4	18	8
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	10	10	10	10	10	15	15	15	15	15	20	20 2	20 2	20 2	20 2	20   20	20 20	) 20	) 20		20		20	20	20
Toho Water Authority	10	10	10	10	10	12	12	12	12	12													20	20	20
Market Average	9	11	11	11	11	12	13	13	14	14	16	17 1	17 1	17 1	17 1	17 18	18 18	3 18	8 18	8 20	) 20	20	20	20	20
City of Fort Lauderdale	15	15	15	15	15	16	17	18	19	20													25	25	22
Difference between Fort																									
Lauderdale and the	6	4	4	4	4	4	4	ۍ	S.	9	2	2	9		<del>∞</del> ∞	8			_	. 2	5		2	2	2
										-		-			-	-		-	-	-	-				

11 The City of Miami and Miami Executive Airport offer a paid time off (PTO) program while all other comparable surveyed offer Traditional Leave.

8782033v1/14397.004

43

Survey Question: How many Vacation OR Paid Time Off (PTO) leave days do part-time employees accrue in a year? If you have PTO days instead of vacation days, enter the number of PTO days.

# TABLE 25B PART-TIME EMPLOYEES VACATION / PAID TIME OFF DAYS OFFERED – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Employer	0-1 YOS	1 YOS	2 Y0S	3 YOS	4 Y0S	5 YOS	sox Yos	7 Y0S	8 Y0S	80X	10 YOS	11 Y0S	12 Y0S	13 YOS	14 YOS	15 YOS	16 YOS	17 Y0S	18 YOS	19 YOS	20 YOS	21 YOS	22 Y0S	23 YOS	24 YOS	25+ YOS
City of Delray Beach									Part-	Time Em	ployees	Do Not A	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days	cation /	Paid Tim	e (PTO)	Leave D.	3ys		_		-	-	_		
City of Hollywood	0	5	2	2	5	2	5	5	7	7	6	6	ဝ	6	6	10	10	10	10	10	13	13	13	13	13	13
City of Miami									Part-	Time Em	ployees	Do Not +	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days	cation /	Paid Tim	e (PTO)	Leave D.	ays								
City of Miami Beach	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	6	6	6	6	<b>ဂ</b>	6	6	6	6	6	22	22	22	22	22	22
City of Miramar									Part-	Time Em	ployees	Do Not A	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days	cation /	Paid Tin.	e (PTO)	Leave D.	эуs								
City of Pompano Beach									Part-	Time Em	ployees	Do Not +	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days	cation /	Paid Tim	e (PTO)	Leave D.	эуг								
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	2	2	2	2	2	9	9	9	9	9	80	80	80	80	80	8	8	80	80	80	10	10	10	10	10	13
Miami Executive Airport									Part-	Time Em	ployees	Do Not ≠	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days	cation /	Paid Tim	e (PTO)	Leave D	ays								
Miami-Dade College									Part-	Time Em	ployees	Do Not ≠	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days	cation /	Paid Tim	e (PTO)	Leave D.	эуг								
Palm Beach County School District	0	12	12	12	12	12	15	15	15	15	15	18	18	18	18	8	8	18	18	18	18	8	18	18	18	8
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	5	2	5	2	5	80	80	80	∞	∞	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
Toho Water Authority	2	2	2	2	2	9	9	9	9	9	8	∞	∞	∞	∞	6	6	6	6	6	10	10	10	10	10	10
Market Average	2	3	ဇာ	ဗ	ဗ	4	4	4	4	4	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	2	7	7	7	7	7	7
City of Fort Lauderdale									Part-Ti	me Emp	loyees L	Do Not A	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days	cation,	Paid Til	ne (PTO	) Leave	Days								
Difference between Fort Lauderdale and the Market Average	?	ဗှ	ဗု	6-	ဗှ	4	4	4	4-	4-	٠Ç.	-5	5-	-5	-5	-5	-5	-5	-5	-5	2-	2-	2-	2-	2-	

8782033v1/14397.004

Survey Question: How many of the following paid leave days are employees allowed each year? Please provide any relevant notes or comments on other paid leave days.

**TABLE 26A** 

PAID LEAVE DAYS - GENERAL EMPLOYEES

	PAID LEA	LEAVE DATO - GENERAL	GENERAL EMPLOTEEN	OT EED		
	显	<b>FULL-TIME EMPLOYEES</b>	LOYEES	PA	<b>PART-TIME EMPLOYEES</b>	LOYEES
Employer	Sick Leave	Holidays	Personal/Floating	Sick Leave	Holidays	Personal/Floating
City of Delray Beach	12	11	_	0	0	0
City of Hollywood	12	∞	0	9	5	0
City of Miami	12	11	0	0	0	0
City of Miami Beach	0	17	က	0	17	3
City of Miramar	15	10	2	0	0	0
City of Pompano Beach	12	12	2	0	0	0
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	13	6	2	9	6	2
Miami Executive Airport	12	13	2	0	0	0
Miami-Dade College	12	တ	4	0	0	0
Palm Beach County School District	12	9	9	12	9	9
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	12	10	2	9	10	2
Toho Water Authority	12	11	4	9	11	0
City of Fort Lauderdale	12	6	0	0	0	0

Survey Question: Please provide any relevant notes or comments on other paid leave days.

### **TABLE 26B** PAID LEAVE DAYS - GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	Notes
City of Delray Beach	None
City of Hollywood	Sick accruals are the same as vacation accruals either 50% or 75% based on hours worked.  Holidays are 8 for employees working 30 + hours or 5 for employees working 15 - 29 hours.
City of Miami	None
City of Miami Beach	None
City of Miramar	None
City of Pompano Beach	None
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	None
Miami Executive Airport	None
Miami-Dade College	Twelve days per year are earned. Personal days are taken from sick leave. No limit on sick leave; use when needed. Sick leave at retirement is based on a percentage; an employee must have at least 10 years of service at which point eligible for 50%. For each year above 10 years, 1.5% is added to a maximum of 100% of the average final compensation for the 3 highest years salary.
Palm Beach County School District	None
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Sick leave accrual is 3.69 hours per pay period for full time and 1.845 hours per pay period for part time.
Toho Water Authority	None
City of Fort Lauderdale	None

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

CAM 18-1199

Exhibit 11 Page 51 of 91

The table below details the total paid time off days allotted to full-time employees encompassing vacation days / paid time off (PTO) days, sick leave, holidays, and personal/floating days.

TABLE 27A
FULL-TIME EMPLOYEES
AL VACATION / PAID TIME OFF AND PAID LEAVE DAYS ACCRUED / ALLOTTED – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

				POTAL	VACA	I / NOIL	PAID TI	ME OF	F AND	PAID L	EAVE	DAYS A	TOTAL VACATION / PAID TIME OFF AND PAID LEAVE DAYS ACCRUED / ALLOTTED - GENERAL EMPLOYEES	D / AL	LOTTE	O - GEN	IERAL I	EMPLO	YEES						
	0-1	•	2	က	4	r.	9	7	<b>∞</b>	o.		7	12						19	20	21	22	23		25+
Employer	YOS	YOS	YOS	YOS	YOS	YOS	YOS	YOS	Yos	YOS	YOS	YOS	··	YOS	YOS	YOS YOS	SOY S	YOS	YOS	YOS	YOS	YOS	YOS	YOS	Yos
City of Delray Beach	24	36	36	36	38	38	38	38	40	40	40	40							42	42	42	42	42		42
City of Hollywood	20	30	30	30	30	30	30	30	34	34	38	38	38		38 4			40	40	45	45	45	45	45	45
City of Miami	23	35	35	35	35	35	37	37	37	37	37	40					45	45	45	45	45	45	45	45	45
City of Miami Beach	56	56	56	56	26	56	56	26	56	56	31	31	31			31 31		31	31	36	36	36	36	36	36
City of Miramar	37	37	37	37	42	42	42	42	42	42	47	47	47 ,	47		47 47	47	47	47	25	52	25	52	25	52
City of Pompano Beach	26	36	36	36	36	36	41	41	41	41	41	41	41			46 46	46	46	46	46	46	46	46	46	46
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando	34	34	34	34	34	36	36	36	36	36	39	39	39	39	39 3	39 39	39	39	39	4	44	4	44	44	49
Executive Airport	ļ	ļ	ļ	ļ	ļ	į	ļ	-	ļ	ļ		ļ		$\dashv$	$\dashv$		$\dashv$	ļ			;	ļ	ļ		ļ
Miami Executive Airport	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37 3	37	37 3	37 37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37
Miami-Dade College	37	37	37	37	37	37	40	40	40	40	40	43	43 4	43	43 4	43 43	43	43	43	43	43	43	43	43	43
Palm Beach County School District	24	36	36	36	36	36	39	36	39	39	39	42	42	42	42 4	42 42	42	42	42	42	42	42	42	42	42
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	34	34	34	34	34	36	39	36	39	39	44	44	44	44	44	44 44	44	44	44	4	44	44	44	44	44
Toho Water Authority	37	37	37	37	37	33	39	39	39	39	42	42	42 4	42	42 4	44 44	44	44	44	47	47	47	47	47	47
Market Average	30	35	35	35	35	36	37	37	38	38	40	40	40	40		41 42	42	42	42	44	44	44	44	44	44
City of Fort Lauderdale	36	36	36	36	36	37	38	39	40	41	42	43	44	45	46 4	46 46	46	46	46	46	46	46	46	46	46
Difference between Fort Lauderdale and the Market Average	9	1	1	1	1	1	1	7	7	က	2	က	4	5	ro.	5 4	4	4	4	2	7	2	7	7	2

47

The table below details the total paid time off days allotted to part-time employees encompassing vacation days / paid time off (PTO) days, sick leave, holidays, and personal/floating days.

TABLE 27B
PART-TIME EMPLOYEES
TOTAL VACATION / PAID TIME OFF AND PAID LEAVE DAYS ACCRUED / ALLOTTED – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Employer	0-1 YOS	1 Y0S	2 Y0S	3 YOS	4 YOS	5 YOS	e YOS	7 Y0S	8 YOS	sox	10 YOS	11 Y0S	12 Y0S	13 Y0S	14 Y0S	15 YOS	16 YOS	17 Y0S	18 Y0S	19 YOS	20 YOS	21 Y0S	722 Y0S	23 Y0S	24 Y0S	25+ YOS
City of Delray Beach					P.	art-Time	Employe	es Do Nc	t Accrue	Vacation	/ Paid 7	'ime (PT	О) Leave	Days or	· Offered .	Sick Lea	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days or Offered Sick Leave, Holidays, and/or Personal/Floating Days	ys, and/k	or Perso	nal/Floati	ing Days					
City of Hollywood	1	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	18	18	20	20	20	20	20	21	21	21	21	21	24	24	24	24	24	24
City of Miami					ğ	art-Time	Employe	es Do Nc	t Accrue	Vacation	/ Paid 7	'ime (PT	О) Leave	Days or	. Offered .	Sick Lea	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days or Offered Sick Leave, Holidays, and/or Personal/Floating Days	ys, and/k	or Perso	nal/Floati	ing Days					
City of Miami Beach	20	20	20	50	20	20	20	20	20	20	23	23	23	23	23	23	23	23	23	23	36	36	36	36	36	36
City of Miramar					P	art-Time	Employe	es Do Nc	t Accrue	Vacation	/ Paid 7	'ime (PT	О) Leave	Days or	· Offered .	Sick Lea	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days or Offered Sick Leave, Holidays, and/or Personal/Floating Days	ys, and/k	or Perso	nal/Floati	ing Days					
City of Pompano Beach					Ä	art-Time	Employe	es Do Nc	t Accrue	Vacation	/ Paid 7	'ime (PT	O) Leave	Days or	· Offered .	Sick Lea	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days or Offered Sick Leave, Holidays, and/or Personal/Floating Days	ys, and/k	or Perso	nal/Floati	ing Days					
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	22	52	22	22	22	23	23	23	23	23	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	27	27	27	27	27	30
Miami Executive Airport					ď	art-Time	Employe	es Do Nc	t Accrue	Vacation	/ Paid 7	'ime (PT	О) Leave	Days or	· Offered .	Sick Lea	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days or Offered Sick Leave, Holidays, and/or Personal/Floating Days	ys, and/	or Perso	nal/Floati	ing Days					
Miami-Dade College					g	art-Time	Employe	es Do Nc	t Accrue	Vacation	/ Paid 7	'ime (PT	О) Leave	Days or	. Offered .	Sick Lea	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days or Offered Sick Leave, Holidays, and/or Personal/Floating Days	ys, and/	or Perso	nal/Floati	ing Days					
Palm Beach County School District	24	36	36	36	36	36	39	36	36	36	39	42	42	42	42	42	42	42	42	42	42	42	42	42	42	42
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	23	23	23	23	23	26	26	26	26	26	28	28	28	28	28	28	78	28	28	28	28	28	28	28	28	28
Toho Water Authority	22	22	22	22	22	23	23	23	23	23	25	25	25	25	25	56	56	26	26	26	27	27	27	27	27	27
Market Average	10	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	13	13	13	13	13	14	14	14	14	14	15	15	15	15	15	16
City of Fort Lauderdale					Part-1	Time Em	oloyees	Do Not A	ccrue V	acation ,	Paid Ti	me (PTC	) Leave	Days or	Offered	Sick Le	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days or Offered Sick Leave, Holidays, and/or Personal/Floating Days	lays, an	d/or Per	sonal/Fl	oating L	ays				
Difference between Fort Lauderdale and the Market Average	-10	-12	-12	-12	-12	-12	-12	-12	-12	-12	-13	-13	-13	-13	-13	-14	-14	-14	-14	-14	-15	-15	-15	-15	-15	-16

- (A) Can employees carry-over unused vacation/PTO days?
- (B) If "Yes," enter the maximum number of days per year that an employee can "bank" into the space below. If there is no limit, please write "unlimited."

TABLE 28
VACATION/ PTO CARRY-OVER POLICIES – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	Question A	Question B
City of Delray Beach	Yes	36 Days
City of Hollywood	Yes	Must be used in the following 15 months
City of Miami	Yes	500 Hours / Year
City of Miami Beach	No	NA
City of Miramar	Yes	Same as Accrued
City of Pompano Beach	Yes	40 Days
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	440 Hours / Year 220 Hours / Year
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	500 Hours
Miami-Dade College	Yes	44 Days
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	Rolls over to max 60 days
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Yes	480 Hours
Toho Water Authority	Yes	Up to three times their annual accrual rate
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	Varies based on years of service, 5 years max is 240

- (A) Can employees cash-out unused vacation/PTO leave days?
- (B) If "Yes," enter the maximum number of days an employee can cash out at the events listed below. If there is no limit, please write "unlimited."

TABLE 29
VACATION / PTO CASH-OUT RATES – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

	Question A		Question B	
Peer Employer	Yes / No	At Year End	At Termination	At Retirement
City of Delray Beach	Yes	0 Days	36 Days	36 Days
City of Hollywood	Yes	0 Days	All	All
City of Miami	Yes	5 Days	All	All
City of Miami Beach	Yes	62.5 Days	77.5 Days	77.5 Days
City of Miramar	No	NA	NA	NA
City of Pompano Beach	Yes	0 Days	20 Days	40 Days
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	NR	NR	NR
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	0 Days	All	All
Miami-Dade College	Yes	0 Days	30 Days	62 Days
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	NR	60 Days	60 Days
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Yes	50% of Days	Unlimited	Unlimited
Toho Water Authority	Yes	Balance over three times their annual accrual rate	NR	NR
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	NR	All Unused	All Unused

- (A) Can employees carry-over unused sick leave days?
- (B) If "Yes," enter the maximum number of days per year that an employee can "bank" into the space below. If there is no limit, please write "unlimited."

**TABLE 30 UNUSED SICK LEAVE CARRY OVER - GENERAL EMPLOYEES** 

Peer Employer	Question A	Question B
City of Delray Beach	Yes	Unlimited
City of Hollywood	Yes	Unlimited
City of Miami	Yes	93.75 Days
City of Miami Beach	Yes	Varies
City of Miramar	Yes	NR
City of Pompano Beach	Yes	Unlimited
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	Unlimited
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	Unlimited
Miami-Dade College	No	NA
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	Unlimited
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Yes	Unlimited
Toho Water Authority	Yes	240 Days
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	816 Days

(A) Can employees cash-out unused sick leave days?
(B) If "Yes," enter the maximum number of days an employee can cash out at the events listed below. If there is no limit, please write "unlimited."

UNUSED SICK LEAVE CASH-OUT - GENERAL EMPLOYEES **TABLE 31** 

	Question A		Succition R	
Peer Employer	Yes / No	At Year End	At Termination	At Retirement
City of Delray Beach	Yes	5	140 Days	140 Days
City of Hollywood	Yes		A Percentage based on years of service at retirement or termination	ement or termination
City of Miami	oN	Ϋ́	NA	NA
City of Miami Beach	Yes	Ϋ́Ν	75 Days	75 Days
City of Miramar	X X	N N	NR	N. R.
City of Pompano Beach	Yes	None	62.5 Days	125 Days
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	NR	NR	One Third the Number Accrued each calendar year
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	None	After 15 years a percentage of sick hours will be paid at termination or retirement.	After 15 years a percentage of sick hours will be paid at termination or retirement.
Miami-Dade College	Yes	None	0 Days	% of Days
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	None	A pro-rated share of the accumulated sick is paid based on service, with 10 YOS equaling 100% pay out.	Unlimited
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Yes	None	Balance Less 10 Days Prorated	Balance Less 10 Days Prorated
Toho Water Authority	Yes	NR	Unused leave above 240 Days	NR
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	X X	28% of unused if in good standing	28% of unused if in good standing
NR = No Response				

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

8782033v1/14397.004

# Study Findings – Health Benefits

### **Total Health**

The City's total monthly costs for all health-related benefits (medical, prescription drugs, dental, and vision plans) are higher than the survey average, as shown in Tables 32, however the City contributes a smaller percentage in regard to cost sharing arrangements than the survey average, as shown in Table 33.

(AVERAGE OF PPO, HMO, AND HDHP MEDICAL PLAN, RX, DENTAL, AND VISION) TOTAL MONTHLY HEALTH COST **TABLE 32** 

		Employe	Employer Cost (\$)			Employe	Employee Cost (\$)	
Peer Employer	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family
City of Delray Beach	\$719.68	\$719.68	\$719.68	\$719.68	\$38.73	\$179.99	\$261.73	\$395.27
City of Hollywood	\$653.14	\$2,074.70	\$1,292.42	\$2,074.70	\$75.95	\$232.91	\$156.67	\$232.91
City of Miami	\$638.45	\$1,181.16	\$1,404.59	\$1,819.63	\$121.23	\$230.64	\$262.02	\$371.89
City of Miami Beach	\$522.35	\$1,093.15	\$1,093.15	\$1,344.99	\$362.93	\$758.36	\$758.36	\$986.48
City of Miramar		Healt	Health / Benefits Information Provided was Unable to be Validated	rmation Prov	iided was Un	able to be Val	idated	
City of Pompano Beach	\$766.29	\$1,333.62	\$1,333.62	\$1,333.62	\$0.00	\$566.98	\$566.98	\$566.98
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	\$747.05	\$1,161.02	\$1,242.51	\$1,798.54	\$83.87	\$292.28	\$312.34	\$454.90
Miami Executive Airport	\$699.29	\$699.29	\$699.29	\$699.29	\$4.14	\$344.33	\$398.50	\$594.88
Miami-Dade College	\$795.03	\$795.03	\$795.03	\$795.03	\$193.82	\$945.36	\$1,066.72	\$1,328.16
Palm Beach County School District	\$400.00	\$680.00	\$716.50	\$870.50	\$76.18	\$193.36	\$229.48	\$377.18
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	\$656.85	\$1,393.61	\$1,393.61	\$1,393.61	\$70.33	\$248.75	\$239.79	\$271.44
Toho Water Authority	\$651.82	\$1,223.10	\$1,223.10	\$1,223.10	\$6.57	\$411.77	\$405.89	\$411.77
Market Average	\$659.09	\$1,123.12	\$1,083.04	\$1,279.34	\$93.98	\$400.43	\$423.50	\$544.71
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$148.13	\$288.58	\$322.39	\$453.70

CAM 18-1199 Exhibit 11 Page 59 of 91

### **TABLE 33 TOTAL HEALTH COST SHARING** (AVERAGE OF PPO, HMO, AND HDHP MEDICAL PLAN, RX, DENTAL, AND VISION)

		Employe	r Cost (\$)			Employee	e Cost (\$)	
Peer Employer	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family
City of Delray Beach	95%	80%	73%	65%	5%	20%	27%	35%
City of Hollywood	90%	90%	89%	90%	10%	10%	11%	10%
City of Miami	84%	84%	84%	83%	16%	16%	16%	17%
City of Miami Beach	59%	59%	59%	58%	41%	41%	41%	42%
City of Miramar		Healt	h / Benefits Info	rmation Prov	vided was Un	able to be Vali	idated	
City of Pompano Beach	100%	70%	70%	70%	0%	30%	30%	30%
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	90%	80%	80%	80%	10%	20%	20%	20%
Miami Executive Airport	99%	67%	64%	54%	1%	33%	36%	46%
Miami-Dade College	80%	46%	43%	37%	20%	54%	57%	63%
Palm Beach County School District	84%	78%	76%	70%	16%	22%	24%	30%
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	90%	85%	85%	84%	10%	15%	15%	16%
Toho Water Authority	99%	75%	75%	75%	1%	25%	25%	25%
Market Average	88%	74%	72%	70%	12%	26%	28%	30%
City of Fort Lauderdale	82%	70%	68%	60%	18%	30%	32%	40%

We collected data regarding most populous medical plan coverage, as well as prescription drug, dental, and vision benefits. Most of the peer employers offer a PPO medical plan. While all peers also offer other health-related benefits, the dental and vision programs are typically provided as a separate benefit election.

Survey Question: Please provide the following information for your most populous HMO, PPO, and HDHP health plan.

### Medical

### TABLE 34 MOST POPULOUS PPO MEDICAL PLAN MONTHLY COST

		Employe	r Cost (\$)			Employe	e Cost (\$)	
Peer Employer	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family
City of Delray Beach		The	e City of Delray	Beach Does	Not Have a	PPO Plan Offe	ering	
City of Hollywood	\$612.86	\$2,158.29	\$1,301.55	\$2,158.29	\$119.17	\$184.17	\$162.50	\$184.17
City of Miami	\$638.45	\$1,181.16	\$1,404.59	\$1,819.63	\$87.86	\$162.52	\$193.29	\$250.38
City of Miami Beach	\$534.28	\$1,122.00	\$1,122.00	\$1,311.18	\$534.28	\$1,122.00	\$1,122.00	\$1,311.18
City of Miramar		Healt	h / Benefits Info	ormation Pro	vided was Un	able to be Val	idated	
City of Pompano Beach	\$906.30	\$1,506.11	\$1,506.11	\$1,506.11	\$0.00	\$599.82	\$599.82	\$599.82
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport		Greater	Orlando Aviatio	on Authority I	Does Not Hav	/e a PPO Plan	Offering	
Miami Executive Airport	Miami Executive Airport Does Not Have a PPO Plan Offering							
Miami-Dade College	\$766.21	\$766.21	\$766.21	\$766.21	\$348.16	\$1,156.34	\$1,300.25	\$1,610.25
Palm Beach County School District		Palm Be	each County Sc	hool District I	Does Not Ha	ve a PPO Plan	Offering	
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	\$642.84	\$1,379.60	\$1,379.60	\$1,379.60	\$50.00	\$180.00	\$180.00	\$180.00
Toho Water Authority		T	oho Water Autl	nority Does N	lot Have a Pl	PO Plan Offerii	ng	
Market Average	\$683.49	\$1,352.23	\$1,246.68	\$1,490.17	\$189.91	\$567.48	\$592.98	\$689.30
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$154.37	\$300.54	\$337.08	\$476.40

**TABLE 35** MOST POPULOUS PPO MEDICAL PLAN MONTHLY COST - COST SHARING

		Employe	r Cost (\$)			Employee	e Cost (\$)	
Peer Employer	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family
City of Delray Beach		The	City of Delray	Beach Does	Not Have a F	PPO Plan Offe	ring	
City of Hollywood	84%	92%	89%	92%	16%	8%	11%	8%
City of Miami	88%	88%	88%	88%	12%	12%	12%	12%
City of Miami Beach	50%	50%	50%	50%	50%	50%	50%	50%
City of Miramar		Healt	h / Benefits Info	rmation Prov	vided was Un	able to be Vali	dated	
City of Pompano Beach	100%	72%	72%	72%	0%	28%	28%	28%
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport		Greater	Orlando Aviatio	n Authority L	Does Not Hav	e a PPO Plan	Offering	
Miami Executive Airport	Miami Executive Airport Does Not Have a PPO Plan Offering							
Miami-Dade College	69%	40%	37%	32%	31%	60%	63%	68%
Palm Beach County School District		Palm Be	ach County Scl	nool District I	Does Not Hav	e a PPO Plan	Offering	
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	93%	88%	88%	88%	7%	12%	12%	12%
Toho Water Authority		T	oho Water Auth	ority Does N	lot Have a PF	O Plan Offerin	ng	
Market Average	78%	70%	68%	68%	22%	30%	32%	32%
City of Fort Lauderdale	76%	63%	61%	53%	24%	37%	39%	47%

CAM 18-1199

Exhibit 11 Page 62 of 91

**TABLE 36** MOST POPULOUS HMO MEDICAL PLAN MONTHLY COST

	Employer Cost (\$)				Employee Cost (\$)			
Peer Employer	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family
City of Delray Beach	\$719.68	\$719.68	\$719.68	\$719.68	\$0.00	\$166.01	\$207.31	\$351.74
City of Hollywood	\$655.41	\$1,953.11	\$1,245.28	\$1,953.11	\$0.00	\$144.19	\$65.54	\$144.19
City of Miami			City of Miami	Does Not H	lave a HMO F	Plan Offering		
City of Miami Beach	\$466.54	\$979.74	\$979.74	\$1,249.16	\$147.70	\$310.16	\$310.16	\$532.14
City of Miramar		Healt	h / Benefits Info	rmation Prov	vided was Un	able to be Vali	dated	
City of Pompano Beach	\$626.27	\$1,161.12	\$1,161.12	\$1,161.12	\$0.00	\$534.14	\$534.14	\$534.14
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	\$796.41	\$1,233.44	\$1,325.82	\$1,915.62	\$88.49	\$308.36	\$331.45	\$478.91
Miami Executive Airport	\$668.07	\$668.07	\$668.07	\$668.07	\$0.00	\$305.50	\$359.67	\$511.33
Miami-Dade College	\$766.21	\$766.21	\$766.21	\$766.21	\$0.00	\$554.75	\$653.56	\$866.45
Palm Beach County School District	\$430.00	\$730.00	\$763.00	\$931.00	\$50.00	\$136.00	\$178.00	\$308.00
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	\$642.84	\$1,379.60	\$1,379.60	\$1,379.60	\$50.00	\$180.00	\$180.00	\$180.00
Toho Water Authority	\$625.12	\$1,191.53	\$1,191.53	\$1,191.53	\$0.00	\$340.00	\$340.00	\$340.00
Market Average	\$639.66	\$1,078.25	\$1,020.01	\$1,193.51	\$33.62	\$297.91	\$315.98	\$424.69
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$204.17	\$390.40	\$434.62	\$611.55

**TABLE 37** MOST POPULOUS HMO MEDICAL PLAN MONTHLY COST - COST SHARING

	Employer Cost (\$)				Employee Cost (\$)			
Peer Employer	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family
City of Delray Beach	100%	81%	78%	67%	0%	19%	22%	33%
City of Hollywood	100%	93%	95%	93%	0%	7%	5%	7%
City of Miami			City of Miami	Does Not H	lave a HMO F	Plan Offering		
City of Miami Beach	76%	76%	76%	70%	24%	24%	24%	30%
City of Miramar		Healt	h / Benefits Info	rmation Prov	vided was Un	able to be Vali	dated	
City of Pompano Beach	100%	68%	68%	68%	0%	32%	32%	32%
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	90%	80%	80%	80%	10%	20%	20%	20%
Miami Executive Airport	100%	69%	65%	57%	0%	31%	35%	43%
Miami-Dade College	100%	58%	54%	47%	0%	42%	46%	53%
Palm Beach County School District	90%	84%	81%	75%	10%	16%	19%	25%
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	93%	88%	88%	88%	7%	12%	12%	12%
Toho Water Authority	100%	78%	78%	78%	0%	22%	22%	22%
Market Average	95%	78%	76%	74%	5%	22%	24%	26%
City of Fort Lauderdale	72%	58%	56%	48%	28%	42%	44%	52%

### **TABLE 38** MOST POPULOUS HDHP MEDICAL PLAN MONTHLY COST

	Employer Cost (\$)				Employee Cost (\$)			
Peer Employer	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family
City of Delray Beach	\$719.68	\$719.68	\$719.68	\$719.68	\$0.00	\$26.04	\$154.98	\$195.82
City of Hollywood		(	City of Hollywoo	od Does Not	Have a HDHI	Plan Offering	7	
City of Miami			City of Miami	Does Not Ha	ave a HDHP I	Plan Offering		
City of Miami Beach		C	ity of Miami Bea	ach Does No	t Have a HDF	HP Plan Offerir	ng	
City of Miramar		Healt	h / Benefits Info	rmation Prov	vided was Un	able to be Vali	dated	
City of Pompano Beach		City	of Pompano B	each Does N	lot Have a HL	DHP Plan Offe	ring	
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	\$671.44	\$1,039.87	\$1,117.77	\$1,615.00	\$74.60	\$259.97	\$279.44	\$408.75
Miami Executive Airport		Mia	mi Executive A	irport Does ∧	lot Have a HL	DHP Plan Offe	ring	
Miami-Dade College		М	iami-Dade Colle	ege Does No	t Have a HDF	HP Plan Offerii	ng	
Palm Beach County School District	\$370.00	\$630.00	\$670.00	\$810.00	\$60.00	\$156.00	\$198.00	\$332.00
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	S	outh Florida R	egional Transp	ortation Auth	ority Does No	ot Have a HDH	IP Plan Offering	7
Toho Water Authority	Toho Water Authority Does Not Have a HDHP Plan Offering							
Market Average	\$587.04	\$796.52	\$835.82	\$1,048.23	\$44.87	\$147.34	\$210.81	\$312.19
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$154.37	\$300.54	\$337.08	\$476.40

### **TABLE 39** MOST POPULOUS HDHP MEDICAL PLAN MONTHLY COST - COST SHARING

		Employe	Employer Cost (\$) Employee Cost (\$)					
Peer Employer	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family
City of Delray Beach	100%	97%	82%	79%	0%	3%	18%	21%
City of Hollywood		(	City of Hollywoo	od Does Not	Have a HDHI	P Plan Offering	7	
City of Miami			City of Miami	Does Not Ha	ave a HDHP I	Plan Offering		
City of Miami Beach		С	ity of Miami Bea	ach Does No	t Have a HDF	HP Plan Offerir	ng	
City of Miramar		Healt	h / Benefits Info	rmation Prov	vided was Un	able to be Vali	dated	
City of Pompano Beach		City	of Pompano B	each Does N	lot Have a HL	DHP Plan Offe	ring	
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	90%	80%	80%	80%	10%	20%	20%	20%
Miami Executive Airport		Mia	mi Executive A	irport Does N	lot Have a HL	DHP Plan Offe	ring	
Miami-Dade College		М	iami-Dade Colle	ege Does No	t Have a HDF	HP Plan Offerii	ng	
Palm Beach County School District	86%	80%	77%	71%	14%	20%	23%	29%
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	South Florida Regional Transportation Authority Does Not Have a HDHP Plan Offering					1		
Toho Water Authority	Toho Water Authority Does Not Have a HDHP Plan Offering							
Market Average	93%	93% 84% 80% 77% 7% 16% 20% 23					23%	
City of Fort Lauderdale	83%	71%	70%	62%	17%	29%	30%	38%

- (A) Are Rx benefits included in the medical premium?
- (B) Are dental benefits included in the medical premium?
- (C) Are vision benefits included in the medical premium?
- (D) Are part-time employees eligible to participate in the medical plan?

**TABLE 40** TYPE OF HEALTH PLANS OFFERED – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

	Incl	uded in Me Premium?		PT Employees	
Peer Employer	Rx	Dental	Vision	Eligible?	
City of Delray Beach	Yes	No	No	No	
City of Hollywood	Yes	No	No	Yes	
City of Miami	Yes	No	Yes	No	
City of Miami Beach	Yes	No	Yes	No	
City of Miramar	Yes	No	No	Yes	
City of Pompano Beach	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	No	No	Yes	
Miami Executive Airport	NR	NR	NR	NR	
Miami-Dade College	Yes	No	No	No	
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	No	No	Yes	
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Yes	No	No	Yes	
Toho Water Authority	Yes	No	No	No	
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	

### **Dental**

### TABLE 41 MOST POPULOUS DENTAL PLAN MONTHLY COST

	Employer Cost (\$)				Employee Cost (\$)			
Peer Employer	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family
City of Delray Beach	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$34.36	\$75.05	\$67.88	\$108.79
City of Hollywood	\$19.00	\$19.00	\$19.00	\$19.00	\$10.27	\$49.16	\$30.49	\$49.16
City of Miami	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$33.37	\$68.12	\$68.73	\$121.51
City of Miami Beach	\$21.94	\$42.28	\$42.28	\$64.82	\$21.94	\$42.28	\$42.28	\$64.82
City of Miramar		Healt	h / Benefits Info	rmation Prov	vided was Un	able to be Vali	dated	
City of Pompano Beach		Dental Benef	its for City of Po	mpano Bea	ch are Encom	passed in the	Medical Plan	
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	\$11.83	\$21.91	\$18.26	\$30.78	\$2.09	\$7.30	\$6.08	\$10.26
Miami Executive Airport	\$31.22	\$31.22	\$31.22	\$31.22	\$0.00	\$30.53	\$30.53	\$68.32
Miami-Dade College	\$14.41	\$14.41	\$14.41	\$14.41	\$0.00	\$16.36	\$16.36	\$16.36
Palm Beach County School District	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$15.72	\$33.36	\$27.48	\$43.18
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	\$14.01	\$14.01	\$14.01	\$14.01	\$14.01	\$56.41	\$47.31	\$72.06
Toho Water Authority	\$26.70	\$31.57	\$31.57	\$31.57	\$0.00	\$53.40	\$53.40	\$53.40
Market Average	\$13.91	\$17.44	\$17.08	\$20.58	\$13.18	\$43.20	\$39.05	\$60.79
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$48.60	\$93.60	\$91.06	\$117.98

**TABLE 42** MOST POPULOUS DENTAL PLAN MONTHLY COST - COST SHARING

		Employe	r Cost (\$)		Employee Cost (\$)			
Peer Employer	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family
City of Delray Beach	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%	100%	100%	100%
City of Hollywood	65%	28%	38%	28%	35%	72%	62%	72%
City of Miami	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%	100%	100%	100%
City of Miami Beach	50%	50%	50%	50%	50%	50%	50%	50%
City of Miramar		Healt	h / Benefits Info	rmation Prov	∕ided was Un	able to be Vali	dated	
City of Pompano Beach		Dental Benef	its for City of Po	mpano Bea	ch are Encon	passed in the	Medical Plan	
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	85%	75%	75%	75%	15%	25%	25%	25%
Miami Executive Airport	100%	51%	51%	31%	0%	49%	49%	69%
Miami-Dade College	100%	47%	47%	47%	0%	53%	53%	53%
Palm Beach County School District	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%	100%	100%	100%
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	50%	20%	23%	16%	50%	80%	77%	84%
Toho Water Authority	100%	37%	37%	37%	0%	63%	63%	63%
Market Average	51%	29%	30%	25%	49%	71%	70%	75%
City of Fort Lauderdale	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%	100%	100%	100%

### **Vision**

**TABLE 43** MOST POPULOUS VISION PLAN MONTHLY COST

	Employer Cost (\$)				Employee Cost (\$)			
Peer Employer	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family
City of Delray Beach	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$4.37	\$8.91	\$12.70	\$12.70
City of Hollywood	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$6.09	\$19.57	\$12.16	\$19.57
City of Miami		Vision E	Benefits for City	of Miami are	Encompass	ed in the Medi	cal Plan	
City of Miami Beach		Vision Bene	efits for City of I	Miami Beach	are Encompa	assed in the M	ledical Plan	
City of Miramar		Healt	h / Benefits Info	rmation Prov	vided was Un	able to be Vali	dated	
City of Pompano Beach		Vision Benefi	its for City of Po	mpano Bead	ch are Encom	passed in the	Medical Plan	
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	\$1.29	\$2.45	\$2.45	\$2.45	\$0.23	\$0.81	\$0.81	\$0.81
Miami Executive Airport	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$4.14	\$8.30	\$8.30	\$15.23
Miami-Dade College	\$14.41	\$14.41	\$14.41	\$14.41	\$19.74	\$73.45	\$73.45	\$73.45
Palm Beach County School District	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$5.46	\$14.00	\$14.00	\$14.00
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$6.32	\$12.34	\$12.48	\$19.38
Toho Water Authority	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$6.57	\$18.37	\$12.49	\$18.37
Market Average	\$1.96	\$2.11	\$2.11	\$2.11	\$6.62	\$19.47	\$18.30	\$21.69
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$4.58	\$9.28	\$8.76	\$14.36

**TABLE 44** MOST POPULOUS VISION PLAN MONTHLY COST - COST SHARING

	Employer Cost (\$)				Employee Cost (\$)			
Peer Employer	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family
City of Delray Beach	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%	100%	100%	100%
City of Hollywood	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%	100%	100%	100%
City of Miami		Vision E	Benefits for City	of Miami are	Encompass	ed in the Medi	cal Plan	
City of Miami Beach		Vision Ben	efits for City of I	Miami Beach	are Encomp	assed in the M	ledical Plan	
City of Miramar		Healt	h / Benefits Info	rmation Prov	vided was Un	able to be Vali	idated	
City of Pompano Beach		Vision Benefi	its for City of Po	mpano Bead	ch are Encom	passed in the	Medical Plan	
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	85%	75%	75%	75%	15%	25%	25%	25%
Miami Executive Airport	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%	100%	100%	100%
Miami-Dade College	42%	16%	16%	16%	58%	84%	84%	84%
Palm Beach County School District	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%	100%	100%	100%
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%	100%	100%	100%
Toho Water Authority	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%	100%	100%	100%
Market Average	23%	10%	10%	9%	77%	90%	90%	91%
City of Fort Lauderdale	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%	100%	100%	100%

- (A) Do you reimburse employees for expenses associated with wellness activities?
- (B) Do you offer lower employee medical contributions for participation in wellness programs?
- (C) Are part-time employees eligible for wellness benefits?

### TABLE 45 – GENERAL EMPLOYEES WELLNESS

Peer Employer	Question A	Question B	Question C
City of Delray Beach	No	No	No
City of Hollywood	NR	No	NR
City of Miami	No	No	No
City of Miami Beach	No	No	No
City of Miramar	Yes	No	Yes
City of Pompano Beach	No	No	No
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	No	Yes
Miami Executive Airport	No	No	NR
Miami-Dade College	No	No	NR
Palm Beach County School District	No	Yes	Yes
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	No	No	No
Toho Water Authority	Yes	Yes	No
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	No	Yes

### **Study Findings - Retirement Benefits**

Survey Question: Do you participate in Social Security?

TABLE 46
SOCIAL SECURITY / MEDICARE PARTICIPATION – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Door Employer	Partio	cipate?
Peer Employer	OASDI?	Medicare?
City of Delray Beach	Yes	Yes
City of Hollywood	Yes	Yes
City of Miami	Yes	Yes
City of Miami Beach	No	Yes
City of Miramar	Yes	Yes
City of Pompano Beach	Yes	Yes
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	Yes
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	Yes
Miami-Dade College	Yes	Yes
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	Yes
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Yes	Yes
Toho Water Authority	Yes	Yes
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	Yes

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable Survey Question: Please answer the following questions regarding retirement plans offered to current employees.

The total employer contribution for each peer includes the defined contribution automatic employer contributions and employer match, deferred compensation automatic employer contributions and employer match, and social security contributions as shown below.

RETIREMENT BENEFITS – GENERAL EMPLOYEES **TABLE 47** 

	Defined Con	Defined Contribution 401(a)	Deferred Compensation 457(b)	ensation 457(b)	Social Security	
Peer Employers	Automatic Employer Contributions	Employer Match	Automatic Employer Contributions	Employer Match	Social Security Contributions	Total Employer Contribution
	(% of pay)	(% of pay)	(% of pay)	(% of pay)	(%)	(% of pay)
City of Delray Beach	AN	AN	NA	AN	AN	NA
City of Hollywood	NA	ΑΝ	AN	NA	AN	NA
City of Miami	%00'0	8.00%	%00'0	%00:0	7.65%	15.65%
City of Miami Beach	8.00%	%00'0	%00'0	%00:0	1.45%	9.45%
City of Miramar	NA	ΑN	AN	NA	AN	NA
City of Pompano Beach	NA	ΑN	ΝΑ	NA	AN	NA
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	%00.9	4.00%	0.00%	0.00%	7.65%	17.65%
Miami Executive Airport	NA	ΑN	ΑN	NA	AN	NA
Miami-Dade College	NA	ΑN	AN	NA	AN	NA
Palm Beach County School District	NA	ΑN	NA	NA	AN	WA
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	3.00%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	7.65%	10.65%
Toho Water Authority	%05'9	2.00%	%00'0	%00:0	7.65%	16.15%
				Overa	Overall Market Average	13.91%
City of Fort Lauderdale	0.00%	%00.6	ΨN	%00'0	7.65%	16.65%
NR = No Response						

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

8782033v1/14397.004

Survey Question: Are part-time employees eligible to participate in any of the plans below?

RETIREMENT BENEFITS - PART TIME ELIGIBILITY IN RETIREMENT BENEFITS - GENERAL EMPLOYEES **TABLE 48** 

	EMENT DENETHO - OF	
Peer Employer	Defined Contribution 401(a) Retirement Plan	Deferred Compensation 457(b) Retirement Plan
City of Delray Beach	oN.	No
City of Hollywood	NR	Yes
City of Miami	No	No
City of Miami Beach	No	Yes
City of Miramar	No	o <sub>N</sub>
City of Pompano Beach	No	No
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	Yes
Miami Executive Airport	NR	o <sub>N</sub>
Miami-Dade College	Yes	No
Palm Beach County School District	NR	N. S.
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Yes	Yes
Toho Water Authority	No	No
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	Yes

NR = No Response, NA = Not Applicable

### **Study Findings – Total Compensation**

The total compensation costs for each benchmark are the sum of the following:

- > The calculated midpoint of the base pay range (average of the minimum and maximum base pay rates)
- > Total employer costs for all health related benefits (medical, prescription drug, dental, and vision), weighted by City of Fort Lauderdale's current enrollment distribution among coverage tiers across all plans
- > The current total employer contribution associated with the defined contribution retirement plan
- > Maximum employer contribution to the deferred compensation plan

#### TABLE 49 **CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE** MARKET POSITION AT THE 75TH PERCENTILE ACROSS ALL BENCHMARKS AND PEER EMPLOYERS **TOTAL COMPENSATION**

		Employer Co	st of Benefits	
	Base Pay (Range Midpoint)	Weighted Total Health Costs (Medical, Dental, & Vision)	Total Retirement Benefits (Defined Contribution & Deferred Compensation)	Employer Total Compensation Costs (Pay and Benefits)
Overall Average	96%	71%	115%	95%

As previously displayed in **Table 7**, the values in **Table 49** show the City of Fort Lauderdale's market position across all benchmarks and peer employers from a total compensation standpoint. **Table 50** shows all benchmark jobs and their respective total compensation market competitiveness. "Insufficient Data" indicates that the job did not garner three or more matches. Market findings with three or more matches provide a more reliable indication of the City's market position amongst the peer employers. Job matches are defined as a peer employer having a job comparable to the benchmark job.

**TOTAL COMPENSATION – GENERAL EMPLOYEES** 

#### **Employer Cost of Benefits Employer Total Benchmark Title** Compensation **Base Pay** Weighted Total Costs **Total Health** Retirement Costs **Benefits** City Attorney's Office **Assistant City Attorney III** City of Fort Lauderdale \$139,038 \$8,100 \$23,150 \$170,288 \$11.431 Market \$130,323 \$18,128 \$159,882 FL as % Mkt 107% 71% 128% 107% Legal Assistant III City of Fort Lauderdale \$64.043 \$82.806 \$8.100 \$10.663 Market \$60,963 \$11,431 \$8,480 \$80,874 FL as % Mkt 105% 71% 126% 102% City Clerk's Office **Assistant City Clerk II** City of Fort Lauderdale \$52,333 \$8,713 \$69,146 \$8,100 Market \$43.207 \$11.431 \$6.010 \$60.648 FL as % Mkt 121% 71% 145% 114% **City Commission's Office Commission Assistant IV** City of Fort Lauderdale \$91,711 \$71,677 \$8,100 \$11,934 Market \$63,909 \$11,431 \$8.890 \$84,229 FL as % Mkt 112% 71% 134% 109% City Manager's Office **Assistant City Manager** City of Fort Lauderdale \$149.791 \$8.100 \$24.940 \$182.831 Market \$167,149 \$11.431 \$23,250 \$201,830 FL as % Mkt 90% 71% 107% 91% **Construction Review Specialist** City of Fort Lauderdale \$57,200 \$8,100 \$9,524 \$74,824 Market \$60,342 \$11,431 \$8,394 \$80,166 FL as % Mkt 95% 71% 113% 93% **Senior Financial Management Analyst** City of Fort Lauderdale \$73,507 \$8,100 \$12,239 \$93,846 Market \$86,810 \$11,431 \$12,075 \$110,316 71% FL as % Mkt 85% 101% 85%

		Employer Co	st of Benefits	Employer Total Compensation Costs
Benchmark Title	Base Pay	Weighted Total Health Costs	Total Retirement Benefits	
	rosses Multiple	Departments		
Accounting Clerk				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$40,518	\$8,100	\$6,746	\$55,364
Market	\$45,145	\$11,431	\$6,280	\$62,855
FL as % Mkt	90%	71%	107%	88%
Administrative Aide				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$49,306	\$8,100	\$8,209	\$65,615
Market	\$51,755	\$11,431	\$7,199	\$70,385
FL as % Mkt	95%	71%	114%	93%
Administrative Assistant II				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$74,308	\$8,100	\$12,372	\$94,780
Market	\$74,243	\$11,431	\$10,327	\$96,001
FL as % Mkt	100%	71%	120%	99%
Clerk III				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$48,578	\$8,100	\$8,088	\$64,766
Market	\$43,107	\$11,431	\$5,996	\$60,534
FL as % Mkt	113%	71%	135%	107%
Code Compliance Officer				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$51,802	\$8,100	\$8,625	\$68,527
Market	\$56,365	\$11,431	\$7,840	\$75,636
FL as % Mkt	92%	71%	110%	91%
Construction Worker II				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$49,306	\$8,100	\$8,209	\$65,615
Market	\$46,505	\$11,431	\$6,469	\$64,404
FL as % Mkt	106%	71%	127%	102%
Customer Service Representative I				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$39,530	\$8,100	\$6,582	\$54,212
Market	\$44,785	\$11,431	\$6,230	\$62,445
FL as % Mkt	88%	71%	106%	87%
Deputy Director				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$129,137	\$8,100	\$21,501	\$158,738
Market	\$133,023	\$11,431	\$18,503	\$162,957
FL as % Mkt	97%	71%	116%	97%

Ponchmark Title		Employer Co	Employer Total	
Benchmark Title	Base Pay	Weighted Total Health Costs	Total Retirement Benefits	Compensation Costs
Electrician				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$57,200	\$8,100	\$9,524	\$74,824
Market	\$58,819	\$11,431	\$8,182	\$78,431
FL as % Mkt	97%	71%	116%	95%
Event Worker				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$36,005	\$8,100	\$5,995	\$50,100
Market	\$30,483	\$11,431	\$4,240	\$46,154
FL as % Mkt	118%	71%	141%	109%
Heavy Equipment Operator				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$48,235	\$8,100	\$8,031	\$64,366
Market	\$50,878	\$11,431	\$7,077	\$69,386
FL as % Mkt	95%	71%	113%	93%
Municipal Maintenance Worker II				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$39,530	\$8,100	\$6,582	\$54,212
Market	\$41,628	\$11,431	\$5,790	\$58,849
FL as % Mkt	95%	71%	114%	92%
Planner III				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$78,073	\$8,100	\$12,999	\$99,172
Market	\$82,609	\$11,431	\$11,491	\$105,530
FL as % Mkt	95%	71%	113%	94%
Principal Planner				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$89,575	\$8,100	\$14,914	\$112,589
Market	\$92,457	\$11,431	\$12,861	\$116,748
FL as % Mkt	97%	71%	116%	96%
Project Manager II				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$86,154	\$8,100	\$14,345	\$108,599
Market	\$97,142	\$11,431	\$13,512	\$122,085
FL as % Mkt	89%	71%	106%	89%
Secretary I				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$42,526	\$8,100	\$7,081	\$57,707
Market	\$45,152	\$11,431	\$6,281	\$62,863
FL as % Mkt	94%	71%	113%	92%

		Employer Co	Employer Total	
Benchmark Title	Base Pay	Weighted Total Health Costs	Total Retirement Benefits	Compensation Costs
Senior Accounting Clerk				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$49,306	\$8,100	\$8,209	\$65,615
Market	\$53,568	\$11,431	\$7,451	\$72,450
FL as % Mkt	92%	71%	110%	91%
Senior Project Manager				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$96,481	\$8,100	\$16,064	\$120,645
Market	\$99,026	\$11,431	\$13,775	\$124,231
FL as % Mkt	97%	71%	117%	97%
Service Clerk				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$42,526	\$8,100	\$7,081	\$57,707
Market	\$43,644	\$11,431	\$6,071	\$61,145
FL as % Mkt	97%	71%	117%	94%
	Finance Depar	tment	<u> </u>	
Accountant II				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$76,170	\$8,100	\$12,682	\$96,952
Market	\$70,661	\$11,431	\$9,829	\$91,921
FL as % Mkt	108%	71%	129%	105%
Manager - Procurement & Contracts				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$105,373	\$8,100	\$17,545	\$131,018
Market	\$108,606	\$11,431	\$15,107	\$135,144
FL as % Mkt	97%	71%	116%	97%
Procurement Specialist II				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$74,308	\$8,100	\$12,372	\$94,780
Market	\$66,260	\$11,431	\$9,217	\$86,907
FL as % Mkt	112%	71%	134%	109%
Senior Accountant				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$89,575	\$8,100	\$14,914	\$112,589
Market	\$81,160	\$11,431	\$11,289	\$103,880
FL as % Mkt	110%	71%	132%	108%
Senior Procurement Specialist				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$87,391	\$8,100	\$14,551	\$110,042
Market	\$74,781	\$11,431	\$10,402	\$96,614
FL as % Mkt	117%	71%	140%	114%

#### **EMPLOYERS TOTAL COMPENSATION - GENERAL EMPLOYEES**

		Employer Co	st of Benefits	
Benchmark Title	Base Pay	Weighted Total Health Costs	Total Retirement Benefits	Employer Total Compensation Costs
Treasurer				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$102,804	\$8,100	\$17,117	\$128,021
Market	\$113,941	\$11,431	\$15,849	\$141,221
FL as % Mkt	90%	71%	108%	91%
	Fire Departm	ent		
Battalion Chief				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$102,804	\$8,100	\$17,117	\$128,021
Market	\$104,571	\$11,431	\$14,546	\$130,547
FL as % Mkt	98%	71%	118%	98%
Beach Lifeguard				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$43,638	\$8,100	\$7,266	\$59,004
Market	\$48,350	\$11,431	\$6,725	\$66,506
FL as % Mkt	90%	71%	108%	89%
Beach Patrol Lieutenant				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$61,578	\$8,100	\$10,253	\$79,931
Market	\$61,095	\$11,431	\$8,498	\$81,024
FL as % Mkt	101%	71%	121%	99%
H	luman Resources [	Department		
Claims Adjuster				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$60,882	\$8,100	\$10,137	\$79,119
Market	\$68,693	\$11,431	\$9,555	\$89,679
FL as % Mkt	89%	71%	106%	88%
Human Resources Assistant				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$59,374	\$8,100	\$9,886	\$77,360
Market	\$54,538	\$11,431	\$7,586	\$73,555
FL as % Mkt	109%	71%	130%	105%
Insurance Benefits Specialist				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$54,964	\$8,100	\$9,152	\$72,216
Market	\$59,959	\$11,431	\$8,340	\$79,730
FL as % Mkt	92%	71%	110%	91%
Risk Manager				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$102,804	\$8,100	\$17,117	\$128,021
Market	\$103,250	\$11,431	\$14,362	\$129,043
FL as % Mkt	100%	71%	119%	99%

		Employer Co	Employer Total	
Benchmark Title	Total I	Weighted Total Health Costs	Total Retirement Benefits	Compensation Costs
Senior Claims Adjuster				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$71,677	\$8,100	\$11,934	\$91,711
Market	\$76,989	\$11,431	\$10,709	\$99,129
FL as % Mkt	93%	71%	111%	93%
Information T	echnology Se	rvices Departme	nt	
Application Developer				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$90,501	\$8,100	\$15,068	\$113,669
Market	\$84,818	\$11,431	\$11,798	\$108,047
FL as % Mkt	107%	71%	128%	105%
Assistant Database Administrator				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$86,154	\$8,100	\$14,345	\$108,599
Market	\$89,891	\$11,431	\$12,504	\$113,825
FL as % Mkt	96%	71%	115%	95%
Computer Operator II				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$48,235	\$8,100	\$8,031	\$64,366
Market	\$60,617	\$11,431	\$8,432	\$80,479
FL as % Mkt	80%	71%	95%	80%
Data Warehouse Analyst				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$90,501	\$8,100	\$15,068	\$113,669
Market	\$88,312	\$11,431	\$12,284	\$112,027
FL as % Mkt	102%	71%	123%	101%
Geographic Information System Analyst				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$75,088	\$8,100	\$12,502	\$95,690
Market	\$74,381	\$11,431	\$10,346	\$96,158
FL as % Mkt	101%	71%	121%	100%
Network Support Analyst				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$82,867	\$8,100	\$13,797	\$104,764
Market	\$86,484	\$11,431	\$12,030	\$109,945
FL as % Mkt	96%	71%	115%	95%
Senior Tech Support Analyst				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$80,818	\$8,100	\$13,456	\$102,374
Market	\$79,863	\$11,431	\$11,109	\$102,403
FL as % Mkt	101%	71%	121%	100%

Danaharank Titla		Employer Co	Employer Total	
Benchmark Title	Base Pay	Weighted Total Health Costs	Total Retirement Benefits	Compensation Costs
Systems Administrator				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$92,747	\$8,100	\$15,442	\$116,289
Market	\$89,648	\$11,431	\$12,470	\$113,549
FL as % Mkt	103%	71%	124%	102%
Technical Support Analyst				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$71,448	\$8,100	\$11,896	\$91,444
Market	\$74,814	\$11,431	\$10,407	\$96,651
FL as % Mkt	96%	71%	114%	95%
Technology Strategist				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$78,894	\$8,100	\$13,136	\$100,130
Market	\$98,733	\$11,431	\$13,734	\$123,897
FL as % Mkt	80%	71%	96%	81%
Parks a	nd Recreation	Department		
Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$32,406	\$8,100	\$5,396	\$45,902
Market	\$39,102	\$11,431	\$5,439	\$55,972
FL as % Mkt	83%	71%	99%	82%
Community Program Supervisor				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$75,348	\$8,100	\$12,545	\$95,993
Market	\$80,378	\$11,431	\$11,181	\$102,989
FL as % Mkt	94%	71%	112%	93%
Field Operating Technician (Level IV)				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$51,802	\$8,100	\$8,625	\$68,527
Market	\$52,621	\$11,431	\$7,320	\$71,371
FL as % Mkt	98%	71%	118%	96%
Head Groundskeeper				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$48,235	\$8,100	\$8,031	\$64,366
Market	\$51,273	\$11,431	\$7,132	\$69,836
FL as % Mkt	94%	71%	113%	92%
Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$42,526	\$8,100	\$7,081	\$57,707
Market	\$47,905	\$11,431	\$6,664	\$65,999
FL as % Mkt	89%	71%	106%	87%

#### **TABLE 50** CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE, FL

#### MARKET POSITION AT THE 75<sup>TH</sup> PERCENTILE ACROSS ALL BENCHMARKS AND PEER **EMPLOYERS**

		Employer Co	Employer Cost of Benefits		
Benchmark Title  Parks Foreman	Base Pay	Weighted Total Health Costs	Total Retirement Benefits	Compensation Costs	
Parks Foreman					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$66,331	\$8,100	\$11,044	\$85,475	
Market	\$63,344	\$11,431	\$8,811	\$83,586	
FL as % Mkt	105%	71%	<b>125%</b>	102%	
Pool Equipment Mechanic					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$49,306	\$8,100	\$8,209	\$65,615	
Market	\$45,458	\$11,431	\$6,323	\$63,212	
FL as % Mkt	108%	71%	<b>130%</b>	104%	
Pool Lifeguard I					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$37,638	\$8,100	\$6,267	\$52,005	
Market	\$41,571	\$11,431	\$5,783	\$58,784	
FL as % Mkt	91%	71%	108%	88%	
Recreation Instructor II					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$33,322	\$8,100	\$5,548	\$46,970	
Market	\$40,412	\$11,431	\$5,621	\$57,464	
FL as % Mkt	82%	71%	99%	82%	
Recreation Program Coordinator					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$69,701	\$8,100	\$11,605	\$89,406	
Market	\$61,491	\$11,431	\$8,553	\$81,475	
FL as % Mkt	113%	71%	<b>136%</b>	110%	
Recreation Programmer I					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$42,526	\$8,100	\$7,081	\$57,707	
Market	\$48,924	\$11,431	\$6,805	\$67,160	
FL as % Mkt	87%	71%	104%	86%	
Recreation Worker					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$25,251	\$8,100	\$4,204	\$37,555	
Market	\$33,675	\$11,431	\$4,684	\$49,790	
FL as % Mkt	75%	71%	90%	<b>75%</b>	
	Police Depart	ment			
Accident Investigator II					
City of Fort Lauderdale					
Market		Incuff	icient Data		
FL as % Mkt		iliəuli	oon Data		
Crime Analyst II	¢54.547	<b>CO 400</b>	<b>#0.077</b>	¢74.604	
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$54,517	\$8,100	\$9,077	\$71,694	
Market	\$58,919	\$11,431	\$8,196	\$78,545	
FL as % Mkt	93%	71%	111%	91%	

		Employer Co	st of Benefits	
Benchmark Title	Base Pay			Employer Total Compensation
Delicilitate Title	2.00 / 0,	Weighted Total Health Costs	Total Retirement Benefits	Costs
Police Aide II				
City of Fort Lauderdale				
Market	-	Insuff	icient Data	
FL as % Mkt	-			
Police Records Clerk				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$39,530	\$8,100	\$6,582	\$54,212
Market	\$43,571	\$11,431	\$6,061	\$61,062
FL as % Mkt	91%	71%	109%	89%
Public Safety Aide				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$42,526	\$8,100	\$7,081	\$57,707
Market	\$50,552	\$11,431	\$7,032	\$69,014
FL as % Mkt	84%	71%	101%	84%
Senior Police Records Clerk				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$45,916	\$8,100	\$7,645	\$61,661
Market	\$56,107	\$11,431	\$7,804	\$75,342
FL as % Mkt	82%	71%	98%	82%
Public Works	/ Building Sei	vices Departme	nt	
Distribution & Collection Chief				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$66,331	\$8,100	\$11,044	\$85,475
Market	\$70,590	\$11,431	\$9,819	\$91,840
FL as % Mkt	94%	71%	112%	93%
Electro Technician				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$57,200	\$8,100	\$9,524	\$74,824
Market	\$59,381	\$11,431	\$8,260	\$79,071
FL as % Mkt	96%	71%	115%	95%
Engineering Aide II				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$43,638	\$8,100	\$7,266	\$59,004
Market	\$52,502	\$11,431	\$7,303	\$71,236
FL as % Mkt	83%	71%	99%	83%
Engineering Technician II				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$60,154	\$8,100	\$10,016	\$78,270
Market	\$60,207	\$11,431	\$8,375	\$80,012
FL as % Mkt	100%	71%	120%	98%

#### **TABLE 50** CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE, FL

#### MARKET POSITION AT THE 75<sup>TH</sup> PERCENTILE ACROSS ALL BENCHMARKS AND PEER **EMPLOYERS**

Benchmark Title	Base Pay	Employer Cost of Benefits		Employer Total			
		Weighted Total Health Costs	Total Retirement Benefits	Compensation Costs			
Environmental Lab Technician							
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$54,517	\$8,100	\$9,077	\$71,694			
Market	\$57,501	\$11,431	\$7,998	\$76,930			
FL as % Mkt	95%	71%	113%	93%			
Industrial Electrician							
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$57,200	\$8,100	\$9,524	\$74,824			
Market	\$58,819	\$11,431	\$8,182	\$78,431			
FL as % Mkt	97%	71%	116%	95%			
Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Public Services)							
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$44,689	\$8,100	\$7,441	\$60,230			
Market	\$50,877	\$11,431	\$7,077	\$69,385			
FL as % Mkt	88%	71%	105%	87%			
Public Service Maintenance Chief							
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$67,995	\$8,100	\$11,321	\$87,416			
Market	\$70,707	\$11,431	\$9,835	\$91,973			
FL as % Mkt	96%	71%	115%	95%			
Utilities Mechanic I							
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$50,523	\$8,100	\$8,412	\$67,035			
Market	\$51,492	\$11,431	\$7,163	\$70,085			
FL as % Mkt	98%	71%	117%	96%			
Utilities Service Worker							
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$40,102	\$8,100	\$6,677	\$54,879			
Market	\$45,459	\$11,431	\$6,323	\$63,213			
FL as % Mkt	88%	71%	106%	87%			
Utility Field Representative							
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$48,235	\$8,100	\$8,031	\$64,366			
Market	\$48,606	\$11,431	\$6,761	\$66,798			
FL as % Mkt	99%	71%	119%	96%			
Water Treatment Plant Operator II							
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$53,165	\$8,100	\$8,852	\$70,117			
Market	\$56,123	\$11,431	\$7,807	\$75,360			
FL as % Mkt	95%	71%	113%	93%			
Sustainable Development Department							
Building Inspector							
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$64,792	\$8,100	\$10,788	\$83,680			
Market	\$78,833	\$11,431	\$10,966	\$101,229			
FL as % Mkt	82%	71%	98%	83%			

## TABLE 50 CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE, FL

### MARKET POSITION AT THE 75<sup>TH</sup> PERCENTILE ACROSS ALL BENCHMARKS AND PEER EMPLOYERS

Benchmark Title	Base Pay	Employer Cost of Benefits		Employer Total
		Weighted Total Health Costs	Total Retirement Benefits	Compensation Costs
Chief Building Inspector				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$77,158	\$8,100	\$12,847	\$98,105
Market	\$90,442	\$11,431	\$12,580	\$114,453
FL as % Mkt	85%	71%	102%	86%
<b>Economic and Business Development Manager</b>				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$108,014	\$8,100	\$17,984	\$134,098
Market	\$101,655	\$11,431	\$14,140	\$127,226
FL as % Mkt	106%	71%	127%	105%
Electrical Inspector				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$63,180	\$8,100	\$10,519	\$81,799
Market	\$75,882	\$11,431	\$10,555	\$97,868
FL as % Mkt	83%	71%	100%	84%
Plumbing Inspector				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$63,180	\$8,100	\$10,519	\$81,799
Market	\$76,163	\$11,431	\$10,594	\$98,188
FL as % Mkt	83%	71%	99%	83%
Senior Code Compliance Officer				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$54,517	\$8,100	\$9,077	\$71,694
Market	\$68,438	\$11,431	\$9,520	\$89,388
FL as % Mkt	80%	71%	95%	80%
Structural Plans Examiner				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$71,479	\$8,100	\$11,901	\$91,480
Market	\$86,090	\$11,431	\$11,975	\$109,496
FL as % Mkt	83%	71%	99%	84%
Transporta	ation and Mobi	lity Department		
Airport Operations Aide				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$50,523	\$8,100	\$8,412	\$67,035
Market	\$57,337	\$11,431	\$7,976	\$76,743
FL as % Mkt	88%	71%	105%	87%
Parking Enforcement Shift Coordinator				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$54,517	\$8,100	\$9,077	\$71,694
Market	\$51,560	\$11,431	\$7,172	\$70,163
FL as % Mkt	106%	71%	127%	102%
Parking Enforcement Specialist				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$40,518	\$8,100	\$6,746	\$55,364
Market	\$47,458	\$11,431	\$6,601	\$65,490
FL as % Mkt	85%	71%	102%	85%

#### **TOTAL COMPENSATION - GENERAL EMPLOYEES**

Benchmark Title	Base Pay	Employer Cost of Benefits		Employer Total
		Weighted Total Health Costs	Total Retirement Benefits	Compensation Costs
Parking Meter Technician				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$49,306	\$8,100	\$8,209	\$65,615
Market	\$49,373	\$11,431	\$6,868	\$67,671
FL as % Mkt	100%	71%	120%	97%
Parking Operations Supervisor				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$63,970	\$8,100	\$10,651	\$82,721
Market	\$54,042	\$11,431	\$7,517	\$72,990
FL as % Mkt	118%	71%	142%	113%
Overall	96%	71%	115%	95%

Figures shown in **red** are below market (less than 95% of the market average)

Figures shown in **black** within the market range (95% to 105% of the market average)

Figures shown in **blue** are above market (more than 105% of the market average)

### **Conclusions**

Our conclusions cover the following areas:

- > Pay Range Competitiveness
- > Total Compensation Competitiveness

#### **Pay Range Competitiveness**

This study found that across the majority of benchmark jobs, the City's pay structure is at the market average at the pay range midpoint and maximum and above market at the pay range minimum.

Overall, at the midpoint of the pay range:

- > The City's overall average pay range midpoint is 96% of the overall market average.
- > 39 benchmark job titles are below market (less than 95% at the midpoint)
- > 34 benchmark job titles are at market (between 95% and 105% at the midpoint)
- > 17 benchmark job titles are above market (above 105% at the midpoint)
- > 2 benchmark job titles did not garner sufficient matches to be statistically significant

#### **Total Compensation Competitiveness**

On a total compensation basis (taking into consideration base pay, employer health benefit costs, social security participation and retirement plan contributions) the City's average total compensation costs are:

> 95% of the overall market average

While the City's contributions to health care costs compared to its peer are below the overall market average at 71%, its retirement contributions are at market at 164% of the market average. On a Total Compensation basis, the City is at 103% of the overall market average.