

# City of Fort Lauderdale, FL

# 2018 TOTAL COMPENSATION SURVEY RESULTS – GENERAL EMPLOYEES – DEFINED BENEFIT

September 2018

**Final Report** 

## Table of Contents

# **2018 Total Compensation Survey Results – General Employees – Defined Benefit** September 2018

Executive Summary	. 1
Background	. 1
Summary of Findings	. 8
Methodology	. 12
Peer Employers	. 12
Published Data Sources	. 13
Data Adjustments	. 14
Geographic Adjustments	. 14
Workweek Adjustments	. 15
Study Findings – Base Pay	. 16
Pay Ranges - Overall	. 16
Study Findings – Pay Practices	. 21
Pay Schedule Design & Increases	. 21
Study Findings – Health Benefits	. 52
Total Health	. 52
Medical	
Dental	
Vision	. 63
Study Findings - Retirement Benefits	. 66
Study Findings – Total Compensation	.70
Conclusions	. 83
Pay Range Competitiveness	. 83
Total Compensation Competitiveness	. 83
Appendix A – Benchmark Summaries	. 84
Appendix B – Detailed Market Data	. 180

## **Executive Summary**

#### **Background**

The City of Fort Lauderdale engaged Segal Waters Consulting to evaluate the competitiveness of both pay and benefits for general employee positions. To gather this information, Segal Waters, in consultation with the City's Human Resources team, developed a customized survey instrument that was distributed to public sector employers found to be representative of its competitive labor market. Additionally, Segal Waters referenced published market data to represent the private sector. All data is effective as of February 1, 2017 and has been aged to April 1, 2018. Data is shown at the 75<sup>th</sup> percentile of market per the request of the City of Fort Lauderdale.

The thirty (30) peer employers selected for participation in the study are shown in **Table 1**. Of the thirty (30) surveyed employers, eleven (11) employers submitted both the pay and benefits sections of the survey, one (1) employer responded only to the benefits portion of the survey, and two (2) employers responded only to the pay portion of the survey. Segal Waters completed the pay portion of the survey for five (5) additional comparables, including the comparable mentioned previously who only submitted the benefits portion of the survey, based on job descriptions and pay data provided on the comparables' websites. As a result, Broward County, the City of Boca Raton, the City of Coral Springs, the City of Sunrise, the City of West Palm Beach, and Miami-Dade County will not be included in **Table 12** through **Table 49**, as they did not complete the benefits portion of the survey. Overall, eighteen (18) employers participated in at least one portion of the survey providing a 60% response rate.

#### TABLE 1 **SURVEYED EMPLOYERS**

Peer Employers Surveyed			
Cities			
City of Boca Raton	√ (Segal matched pay data)		
City of Coral Springs	√ (Submitted pay portion only)		
City of Delray Beach	$\sqrt{\text{(Segal matched pay data, comparable submitted}}$ only benefit data)		
City of Hialeah			
City of Hollywood	$\sqrt{}$		
City of Miami	√		
City of Miami Beach	$\sqrt{}$		
City of Miami Gardens			
City of Miramar	√		
City of Pembroke Pines			
City of Pompano Beach	√		
City of Sunrise	√ (Segal matched pay data)		
City of West Palm Beach	√ (Segal matched pay data)		
Counties			
Broward County	√ (Segal matched pay data)		
Miami-Dade County	√ (Submitted pay portion only)		
Palm Beach County			
School Districts			
Broward County School District			
Miami-Dade County School District			
Palm Beach County School District	√		
Transportation			
Florida Department of Transportation			
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority	V		
Miami Executive Airport	√		
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	√		
Universities			
Barry University			
Florida International University			
Miami-Dade College	√		
University of Miami			
Utilities			
South Florida Water Management District			
Orange County Utilities			
Toho Water Authority	V		

 $\sqrt{=\text{Responded to Survey}}$ 

The study covers ninety-two (92) benchmark jobs, representing approximately 50% of the City of Fort Lauderdale's workforce shown in **Table 2**. The benchmark jobs are listed by department in Table 3 and by occupational category in Table 5. To assist survey respondents in making job matches based on duties and qualifications rather than title, the survey instrument contained job summaries. The job summaries for each benchmark job are detailed in **Appendix A**.

BENCHMARK JOB TITLES BY DEPARTMENT - COMPOSITION OF WORKFORCE

		BENCHMARK TITLES				
Department	Benchmark Titles Being Evaluated in Study	Number of Employees within Benchmark Titles Being Evaluated	Employees in Benchmark Titles Evaluated As a Percent of the Total Workforce	Percentage of Workforce by Department		
City Attorney's Office	2	16	0.5%	0.9%		
City Auditor's Office	1	1	0.0%	0.1%		
City Clerk's Office	1	6	0.2%	0.3%		
City Commission's Office	1	4	0.1%	0.2%		
City Manager's Office	7	19	0.6%	1.7%		
Finance	12	42	1.4%	2.1%		
Fire Rescue	9	183	6.1%	18.5%		
Human Resources Department	8	17	0.6%	1.2%		
Information Technology Services	14	36	1.2%	2.4%		
Public Works / Building Services	24	202	6.7%	13.1%		
Parks and Recreation	24	675	22.3%	26.2%		
Police	13	110	3.6%	23.0%		
Sustainable Development	16	107	3.5%	5.4%		
Transportation and Mobility	17	86	2.8%	4.6%		
Other <sup>1</sup>	O <sup>2</sup>	0	0.0%	0.3%		
Total:	92³	1,504	49.7%4	100%		

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> 'Other' includes positions in Pension and Community Redevelopment Agency departments as noted in the 12.09.17 census file.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> No benchmark titles were selected from the Pension and Community Redevelopment Agency departments.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The column 'Titles Being Evaluated' does not add to the 92 benchmark positions as 18 positions cross multiple departments, encompassing 467 employees.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The percentage of total workforce value is based upon the 12.09.16 census provided by the client, which included a total of 3,024 job incumbents. These values are subject to change with workforce fluctuations.

#### TABLE 3 **BENCHMARK JOB TITLES BY DEPARTMENT**

	City Attorney's Office (2)				
>					
	City Clerk's Office (1)				
>	Assistant City Clerk II				
	-	ssion's Office (1)			
>	Commission Assistant IV				
	City Manag	ger's Office (3)			
>	Assistant City Manager	> Senior Financial Management Analyst			
>	Construction Review Specialist	Some Timensia management timenyet			
	Crosses Multi	ple Departments (19)			
>	Accountant II Manager - Procurement & Contracts Procurement Specialist II	<ul> <li>Heavy Equipment Operator</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker II</li> <li>Planner III</li> <li>Principal Planner</li> <li>Project Manager II</li> <li>Secretary I</li> <li>Senior Accounting Clerk</li> <li>Senior Project Manager</li> <li>Service Clerk</li> </ul> ance (6) <ul> <li>Senior Accountant</li> <li>Senior Procurement Specialist</li> <li>Treasurer</li> </ul> Sescue (3) Beach Patrol Lieutenant			
	Human Resour	ces Department (5)			
> > >	Claims Adjuster Human Resources Assistant Insurance Benefits Specialist	<ul><li>Risk Manager</li><li>Senior Claims Adjuster</li></ul>			
	Information Ted	chnology Services (10)			
>	Application Developer Assistant Database Administrator Computer Operator II Data Warehouse Analyst Geographic Information System Analyst	<ul> <li>Network Support Analyst</li> <li>Senior Tech Support Analyst</li> <li>Systems Administrator</li> <li>Technical Support Analyst</li> <li>Technology Strategist</li> </ul>			
	Parks and Recreation (12)				
>	Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker Community Program Supervisor Field Operating Technician (Level IV) Head Groundskeeper Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities) Parks Foreman	<ul> <li>Pool Equipment Mechanic</li> <li>Pool Lifeguard I</li> <li>Recreation Instructor II</li> <li>Recreation Program Coordinator</li> <li>Recreation Programmer I</li> <li>Recreation Worker</li> </ul>			

#### TABLE 3 **BENCHMARK JOB TITLES BY DEPARTMENT**

	Police (6)				
>	Accident Investigator II	>	Police Records Clerk		
>	Crime Analyst II	>	Public Safety Aide		
>	Police Aide II	> Senior Police Records Clerk			
Public Works / Building Services (12)					
>	Distribution & Collection Chief	>	Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Public Services)		
>	Electro Technician	>	Public Service Maintenance Chief		
>	Engineering Aide II	>	Utilities Mechanic I		
>	Engineering Technician II	> Utilities Service Worker			
>	Environmental Lab Technician	> Utility Field Representative			
>	Industrial Electrician	>	Water Treatment Plant Operator II		
Sustainable Development (7)			elopment (7)		
>	Building Inspector	>	Plumbing Inspector		
>	Chief Building Inspector	>	Senior Code Compliance Officer		
>	Economic and Business Development Manager	>	Structural Plans Examiner		
>	Electrical Inspector				
	Transportatio	n an	d Mobility (5)		
>	Airport Operations Aide	>	Parking Meter Technician		
>	Parking Enforcement Shift Coordinator	>	Parking Operations Supervisor		
>	Parking Enforcement Specialist				

TABLE 4
BENCHMARK JOB TITLES BY OCCUPATIONAL CATEGORY – COMPOSITION OF WORKFORCE

Occupational Category	Benchmark Titles Being Evaluated in Study	Number of Employees within Benchmark Titles Being Evaluated	Employees in Benchmark Titles Evaluated As a Percent of the Total Workforce
Administrative & Support Services	11	201	6.6%
Managerial & Supervisory	6	19	0.6%
Paraprofessional	8	92	3.0%
Professional	31	274	9.1%
Service Maintenance	13	646	21.4%
Skilled Crafts	10	189	6.3%
Technical	13	83	2.7%
Total:	92	1,504	49.7%5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The percentage of total workforce value is based upon the 12-09-16 census provided by the client, which included a total of 3,024 job incumbents. These values are subject to change with workforce fluctuations.

# TABLE 5 BENCHMARK JOB TITLES BY OCCUPATIONAL CATEGORY

Administrative Aide  Administrative Assistant II  Aassistant City Clerk II  Clerk III  Customer Service Representative I  Parking Enforcement Specialist  Managerial and Supervisory (6)  Beach Patrol Lieutenant  Deputy Director  Economic and Business Development Manager  Paraprofessional (8)  Accident Investigator II  Accounting Clerk  Airport Operations Aide  Insurance Benefits Specialist  Professional (31)  Accountant II  Application Developer  Aassistant City Attorney III  Assistant Database Administrator  Battalion Chief  Claims Adjuster  Commission Assistant IV  Community Program Supervisor  Crime Analyst II  Data Warehouse Analyst  Human Resources Assistant  City Manager  Corriect Manager  Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker  Network Support Analyst  Parking Operations Supervisor  Service Maintenance (13)  Service Maintenance (13)  Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker III  Event Worker  Municipal Maintenance Worker II  Municipal Maintenance Worker II  Municipal Maintenance Worker III  Municipal Maintenance Worker III  Municipal Maintenance Worker III  Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)  Skilled Craft (10)		Administrative and Support Services (11)				
> Administrative Assistant II	>			· ,		
> Assistant City Clerk II	>		>	Police Records Clerk		
> Clerk III > Customer Service Representative I > Parking Enforcement Specialist    Managerial and Supervisory (6)			>			
Customer Service Representative   Parking Enforcement Specialist						
Managerial and Supervisory (6)						
Managerial and Supervisory (6)			^	OCIVIOC OICIR		
> Beach Patrol Lieutenant > Deputy Director Economic and Business Development Manager			Sur	pervisory (6)		
> Deputy Director > Economic and Business Development Manager  Paraprofessional (8)  > Accident Investigator II > Accounting Clerk > Airport Operations Aide > Insurance Benefits Specialist  Professional (31)  > Accountant II > Application Developer > Assistant City Attorney III > Assistant City Manager > Claims Adjuster > Community Program Supervisor > Crime Analyst II > Data Warehouse Analyst > Environmental Lab Technician > Geographic Information System Analyst > Parking Operations Supervisor  Service Maintenance (13)  > Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker II > Legal Assistant III > Legal Assistant III > Public Safety Aide > Recreation Programmer I > Principal Planner > Principal Planner > Principal Planner > Procurement Specialist II > Project Manager II > Recreation Instructor II > Recreation Program Coordinator > Senior Accountant > Senior Accountant > Senior Frouer Manager II > Senior Project Manager II > Prohicial Support Analyst II > Prohicial Support Analyst II > Prohicial Maintenance Worker II > Pool Equipment Mechanic II > Pool Lifeguard I I > Recreation Worker II > Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Public Service III (Public Ser	>					
Paraprofessional (8)  Accident Investigator II  Accounting Clerk  Airport Operations Aide  Insurance Benefits Specialist  Professional (31)  Accountant II  Application Developer  Assistant City Attorney III  Assistant City Manager  Assistant Database Administrator  Battalion Chief  Community Program Supervisor  Crime Analyst II  Data Warehouse Analyst  Benvironmental Lab Technician  Geographic Information System Analyst  Human Resources Assistant  Network Support Analyst  Parking Operations Supervisor  Service Maintenance Worker  Construction Worker II  Event Worker  Accident Investigator II  Public Safety Aide  Peceration Programmer I  Professional (31)  Principal Planner  Project Manager II  Peceration Program Coordinator  Senior Accountant  Senior Project Manager II  Senior Project Manager II  Paceration Program Coordinator  Senior Project Manager II  Senior Project Manager II  Peceration Program Coordinator  Senior Project Manager II  Municipal Maintenance Worker II  Prool Equipment Mechanic  Prool Equipment Mechanic  Prool Equipment Mechanic  Project Manager II  Recreation Worker II  Project Manager II  Project Man						
Paraprofessional (8)  Accident Investigator II  Accounting Clerk  Airport Operations Aide  Insurance Benefits Specialist  Professional (31)  Accountant II  Application Developer  Assistant City Attorney III  Assistant City Manager  Assistant Database Administrator  Battalion Chief  Claims Adjuster  Commission Assistant IV  Community Program Supervisor  Crime Analyst II  Data Warehouse Analyst  Environmental Lab Technician  Geographic Information System Analyst  Human Resources Assistant  Network Support Analyst  Parking Operations Supervisor  Service Maintenance (13)  Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker  Construction Worker II  Event Worker  Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)  Skilled Craft (10)						
> Accident Investigator II > Accounting Clerk > Airport Operations Aide > Insurance Benefits Specialist  Professional (31) > Accountant II > Application Developer > Assistant City Attorney III > Assistant City Manager > Assistant Database Administrator Battalion Chief > Claims Adjuster > Commission Assistant IV > Community Program Supervisor  Crime Analyst II > Data Warehouse Analyst > Environmental Lab Technician S Geographic Information System Analyst > Human Resources Assistant > Network Support Analyst > Parking Operations Supervisor  Service Maintenance (13)  > Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker II > Field Operating Technician (Level IV) + Head Groundskeeper > Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)  Skilled Craft (10)			<u> </u>			
> Accounting Clerk > Airport Operations Aide > Insurance Benefits Specialist  Professional (31)  > Accountant II > Application Developer > Assistant City Attorney III > Assistant Database Administrator > Battalion Chief > Commission Assistant IV > Community Program Supervisor > Crime Analyst II > Data Warehouse Analyst > Environmental Lab Technician > Geographic Information System Analyst > Network Support Analyst > Parking Operations Supervisor  Service Maintenance (13)  > Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker II > Hunnicipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)  > Kelled Craft (10)						
> Airport Operations Aide   Insurance Benefits Specialist				•		
Naturance Benefits Specialist   Senior Accounting Clerk						
Professional (31)  A Accountant II  Application Developer  Apsistant City Attorney III  Assistant City Manager  Assistant Database Administrator  Battalion Chief  Claims Adjuster  Commission Assistant IV  Commission Assistant IV  Community Program Supervisor  Crime Analyst II  Data Warehouse Analyst  Environmental Lab Technician  Geographic Information System Analyst  Human Resources Assistant  Network Support Analyst  Parking Operations Supervisor  Service Maintenance (13)  Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker  Construction Worker II  Event Worker  Field Operating Technician (Level IV)  Head Groundskeeper  Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)  Skilled Craft (10)						
> Accountant II > Application Developer > Assistant City Attorney III > Assistant City Manager > Assistant City Manager > Assistant Database Administrator > Battalion Chief > Claims Adjuster > Commission Assistant IV > Community Program Supervisor > Crime Analyst II > Data Warehouse Analyst > Environmental Lab Technician > Recographic Information System Analyst > Network Support Analyst > Parking Operations Supervisor  Service Maintenance (13) > Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker > Construction Worker II > Event Worker > Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)  > Planner III > Principal Planner > Procurement Specialist II > Project Manager II > Recreation Program Coordinator > Senior Accountant > Senior Accountant > Senior Financial Management Analyst > Senior Financial Management Analyst > Senior Procurement Specialist > Senior Financial Management Analyst > Senior Procurement Specialist > Senior Financial Management Analyst > Senior Procurement Specialist > Senior Parking II	<b>&gt;</b>		1 1			
<ul> <li>Application Developer</li> <li>Assistant City Attorney III</li> <li>Assistant City Manager</li> <li>Assistant Database Administrator</li> <li>Battalion Chief</li> <li>Claims Adjuster</li> <li>Commission Assistant IV</li> <li>Community Program Supervisor</li> <li>Crime Analyst II</li> <li>Data Warehouse Analyst</li> <li>Environmental Lab Technician</li> <li>Human Resources Assistant</li> <li>Network Support Analyst</li> <li>Parking Operations Supervisor</li> <li>Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Field Operating Technician (Level IV)</li> <li>Head Groundskeeper</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)</li> <li>Skilled Craft (10)</li> <li>Procurement Specialist II</li> <li>Recreation Instructor II</li> <li>Recreation Program Coordinator</li> <li>Senior Project Manager</li> <li>Senior Financial Management Analyst</li> <li>Senior Procurement Specialist</li> <li>Senior Procurement Specialist</li> <li>Senior Financial Management Analyst</li> <li>Senior Procurement Analyst</li> <li>Senior Procurement Specialist</li> <li>Senior Financial Management Analyst</li> <li>Senior Procurement Specialist</li> <li>Senior Financial Management Analyst</li> <li>Senior Procurement Specialist</li> <li>Senior Financial Management Analyst</li> <li>Senior Financial Management Analyst</li> <li>Senior Procurement Specialist</li> <li>Senior Financial Management Analyst</li> <li>Senior Fioarce Manager</li> <li>Pool Equipment Mechanic</li> <li>Po</li></ul>			I .			
<ul> <li>Assistant City Attorney III</li> <li>Assistant City Manager</li> <li>Assistant Database Administrator</li> <li>Battalion Chief</li> <li>Claims Adjuster</li> <li>Commission Assistant IV</li> <li>Community Program Supervisor</li> <li>Crime Analyst II</li> <li>Data Warehouse Analyst</li> <li>Environmental Lab Technician</li> <li>Geographic Information System Analyst</li> <li>Network Support Analyst</li> <li>Parking Operations Supervisor</li> <li>Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Construction Worker II</li> <li>Field Operating Technician (Level IV)</li> <li>Head Groundskeeper</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)</li> <li>Polt Ities</li> <li>Polt Ities</li> <li>Project Manager II</li> <li>Recreation Instructor II</li> <li>Recreation Program Coordinator</li> <li>Senior Accountant</li> <li>Senior Claims Adjuster</li> <li>Senior Financial Management Analyst</li> <li>Senior Frocurement Specialist</li> <li>Senior Claims Adjuster</li> <li>Senior Financial Management Analyst</li> <li>Senior Frocurement Specialist</li> <li>Senior Claims Adjuster</li> <li>Senior Financial Management Analyst</li> <li>Senior Frocurement Specialist</li> <li>Senior Financial Management Analyst</li> <li>Senior Frocurement Specialist</li> <li>Senior Financial Management Analyst</li> <li>Senior Financial Management Analyst</li> <li>Senior Frocurement Specialist</li> <li>Senior Financial Management Analyst</li>     &lt;</ul>						
<ul> <li>Assistant City Manager</li> <li>Assistant Database Administrator</li> <li>Battalion Chief</li> <li>Claims Adjuster</li> <li>Commission Assistant IV</li> <li>Community Program Supervisor</li> <li>Crime Analyst II</li> <li>Data Warehouse Analyst</li> <li>Environmental Lab Technician</li> <li>Mecreation Program Supervisor</li> <li>Senior Accountant</li> <li>Senior Accountant</li> <li>Senior Program Adjuster</li> <li>Senior Financial Management Analyst</li> <li>Senior Procurement Specialist</li> <li>Senior Project Manager</li> <li>Senior Project Manager</li> <li>Senior Tech Support Analyst</li> <li>Systems Administrator</li> <li>Technical Support Analyst</li> <li>Technical Support Analyst</li> <li>Technology Strategist</li> </ul> Service Maintenance (13) Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker <ul> <li>Construction Worker II</li> <li>Event Worker</li> <li>Field Operating Technician (Level IV)</li> <li>Head Groundskeeper</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)</li> </ul> Service Maintenance (13) <ul> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Utilities Service Worker</li> <li>Utility Field Representative</li> </ul>	١.					
<ul> <li>Assistant Database Administrator</li> <li>Battalion Chief</li> <li>Claims Adjuster</li> <li>Commission Assistant IV</li> <li>Community Program Supervisor</li> <li>Crime Analyst II</li> <li>Data Warehouse Analyst</li> <li>Environmental Lab Technician</li> <li>Geographic Information System Analyst</li> <li>Network Support Analyst</li> <li>Network Support Analyst</li> <li>Parking Operations Supervisor</li> </ul> Service Maintenance (13) Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker <ul> <li>Construction Worker II</li> <li>Event Worker</li> <li>Field Operating Technician (Level IV)</li> <li>Head Groundskeeper</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)</li> </ul> Skilled Craft (10) Senior Financial Management Analyst <ul> <li>Senior Project Manager</li> <li>Senior Project Management Analyst</li> <li>Senior Project Manager</li> <li>Senior Project Manager</li> <li>Senior Project Management Analyst</li> <li>Senior Project Management Analyst</li> <li>Senior Project Management Analyst</li> <li>Senior Project Manager</li> <li>Senior Project Management Analyst</li> <li>Senior Project Management Analyst</li> <li>Senior Project Management Analyst</li> <li>Senior Project Management Analyst</li> <li>Senior Project Manag</li></ul>	>		>			
<ul> <li>Battalion Chief</li> <li>Claims Adjuster</li> <li>Commission Assistant IV</li> <li>Community Program Supervisor</li> <li>Crime Analyst II</li> <li>Data Warehouse Analyst</li> <li>Environmental Lab Technician</li> <li>Geographic Information System Analyst</li> <li>Network Support Analyst</li> <li>Parking Operations Supervisor</li> <li>Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Construction Worker II</li> <li>Event Worker</li> <li>Field Operating Technician (Level IV)</li> <li>Head Groundskeeper</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)</li> <li>Recreation Program Coordinator</li> <li>Senior Accountant</li> <li>Senior Frocurement Specialist</li> <li>Senior Project Management Analyst</li> <li>Senior</li></ul>	>		>			
<ul> <li>Claims Adjuster</li> <li>Commission Assistant IV</li> <li>Community Program Supervisor</li> <li>Crime Analyst II</li> <li>Data Warehouse Analyst</li> <li>Environmental Lab Technician</li> <li>Geographic Information System Analyst</li> <li>Network Support Analyst</li> <li>Parking Operations Supervisor</li> </ul> <ul> <li>Senior Procurement Specialist</li> <li>Senior Project Manager</li> <li>Senior Tech Support Analyst</li> <li>Systems Administrator</li> <li>Technical Support Analyst</li> <li>Technology Strategist</li> </ul> <ul> <li>Service Maintenance (13)</li> <li>Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Construction Worker II</li> <li>Event Worker</li> <li>Field Operating Technician (Level IV)</li> <li>Head Groundskeeper</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)</li> </ul> <ul> <li>Senior Accountant</li> <li>Senior Claims Adjuster</li> <li>Senior Procurement Specialist</li> <li>Senior Procuremet Specialist</li> <li>Senior Procuremet Speciali</li></ul>	>		>			
<ul> <li>Commission Assistant IV</li> <li>Community Program Supervisor</li> <li>Crime Analyst II</li> <li>Data Warehouse Analyst</li> <li>Environmental Lab Technician</li> <li>Geographic Information System Analyst</li> <li>Human Resources Assistant</li> <li>Network Support Analyst</li> <li>Parking Operations Supervisor</li> </ul> <ul> <li>Service Maintenance (13)</li> <li>Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Construction Worker II</li> <li>Event Worker</li> <li>Field Operating Technician (Level IV)</li> <li>Head Groundskeeper</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)</li> <li>Senior Procurement Specialist</li> <li>Senior Project Manager</li> <li>Pochalist</li> <li>Pool Equipment Mechanic</li> <li>Pool Equipment Mechanic</li> <li>Pool Equipment Mechanic</li> <li< th=""><th>&gt;</th><th></th><th>&gt;</th><th></th></li<></ul>	>		>			
<ul> <li>Community Program Supervisor</li> <li>Crime Analyst II</li> <li>Data Warehouse Analyst</li> <li>Environmental Lab Technician</li> <li>Geographic Information System Analyst</li> <li>Human Resources Assistant</li> <li>Network Support Analyst</li> <li>Parking Operations Supervisor</li> </ul> <ul> <li>Service Maintenance (13)</li> <li>Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Construction Worker II</li> <li>Event Worker</li> <li>Field Operating Technician (Level IV)</li> <li>Head Groundskeeper</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)</li> <li>Skilled Craft (10)</li> </ul> <ul> <li>Senior Financial Management Analyst</li> <li>Senior Procurement Specialist</li> <li>Senior Project Manager</li> <li>Senior Project Manager</li> <li>Senior Project Manager</li> <li>Senior Project Manager</li> <li>Manalyst</li> <li>Senior Project Manager</li> <li>Manalyst</li> <li>Senior Project Manager</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Public Service Worker</li> <li>Utilities Service Worker</li> <li>Utility Field Representative</li> </ul>	>		>			
<ul> <li>Crime Analyst II</li> <li>Data Warehouse Analyst</li> <li>Environmental Lab Technician</li> <li>Geographic Information System Analyst</li> <li>Human Resources Assistant</li> <li>Network Support Analyst</li> <li>Parking Operations Supervisor</li> </ul> Service Maintenance (13) Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker <ul> <li>Construction Worker II</li> <li>Event Worker</li> <li>Field Operating Technician (Level IV)</li> <li>Head Groundskeeper</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)</li> <li>Senior Procurement Specialist</li> <li>Senior Procurement Specialist</li> <li>Senior Procurement Specialist</li> <li>Senior Procurement Specialist</li> <li>Senior Tech Support Analyst</li> <li>Systems Administrator</li> <li>Technical Support Analyst</li> <li>Technical Support Analyst</li> <li>Technical Support Analyst</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Pool Equipment Mechanic</li> <li>Pool Lifeguard I</li> <li>Recreation Worker</li> <li>Utilities Service Worker</li> <li>Utility Field Representative</li> </ul> Skilled Craft (10)	>	Commission Assistant IV	>			
<ul> <li>Data Warehouse Analyst</li> <li>Environmental Lab Technician</li> <li>Geographic Information System Analyst</li> <li>Human Resources Assistant</li> <li>Network Support Analyst</li> <li>Parking Operations Supervisor</li> <li>Service Maintenance (13)</li> <li>Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Construction Worker II</li> <li>Event Worker</li> <li>Field Operating Technician (Level IV)</li> <li>Head Groundskeeper</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)</li> <li>Skilled Craft (10)</li> </ul>	>	Community Program Supervisor	>	Senior Financial Management Analyst		
<ul> <li>Environmental Lab Technician</li> <li>Geographic Information System Analyst</li> <li>Human Resources Assistant</li> <li>Network Support Analyst</li> <li>Parking Operations Supervisor</li> <li>Service Maintenance (13)</li> <li>Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Construction Worker II</li> <li>Event Worker</li> <li>Field Operating Technician (Level IV)</li> <li>Head Groundskeeper</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Utilities Service Worker</li> <li>Utility Field Representative</li> <li>Skilled Craft (10)</li> </ul>	>	Crime Analyst II	>	Senior Procurement Specialist		
<ul> <li>Geographic Information System Analyst</li> <li>Human Resources Assistant</li> <li>Network Support Analyst</li> <li>Parking Operations Supervisor</li> <li>Service Maintenance (13)</li> <li>Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Construction Worker II</li> <li>Event Worker</li> <li>Field Operating Technician (Level IV)</li> <li>Head Groundskeeper</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Pool Lifeguard I</li> <li>Recreation Worker</li> <li>Utilities Service Worker</li> <li>Utility Field Representative</li> <li>Skilled Craft (10)</li> </ul>	>	Data Warehouse Analyst	>	Senior Project Manager		
<ul> <li>Human Resources Assistant</li> <li>Network Support Analyst</li> <li>Parking Operations Supervisor</li> <li>Service Maintenance (13)</li> <li>Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Construction Worker II</li> <li>Event Worker</li> <li>Field Operating Technician (Level IV)</li> <li>Head Groundskeeper</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Utilities Service Worker</li> <li>Utility Field Representative</li> </ul> Skilled Craft (10)	>	Environmental Lab Technician	>	Senior Tech Support Analyst		
<ul> <li>Network Support Analyst</li> <li>Parking Operations Supervisor</li> <li>Service Maintenance (13)</li> <li>Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Construction Worker II</li> <li>Event Worker</li> <li>Field Operating Technician (Level IV)</li> <li>Head Groundskeeper</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker II</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker II</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker II</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)</li> <li>Skilled Craft (10)</li> </ul>	>	Geographic Information System Analyst	>	Systems Administrator		
<ul> <li>Network Support Analyst</li> <li>Parking Operations Supervisor</li> <li>Service Maintenance (13)</li> <li>Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Construction Worker II</li> <li>Event Worker</li> <li>Field Operating Technician (Level IV)</li> <li>Head Groundskeeper</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker II</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker II</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker II</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)</li> <li>Skilled Craft (10)</li> </ul>	>	Human Resources Assistant	>	Technical Support Analyst		
Service Maintenance (13)  Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker Construction Worker II Event Worker Field Operating Technician (Level IV) Head Groundskeeper Municipal Maintenance Worker II Municipal Maintenance Worker II  Municipal Maintenance Worker III Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)  Skilled Craft (10)	>	Network Support Analyst	>			
<ul> <li>Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Construction Worker II</li> <li>Event Worker</li> <li>Field Operating Technician (Level IV)</li> <li>Head Groundskeeper</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Recreation Worker</li> <li>Utilities Service Worker</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker II</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)</li> </ul>	>					
<ul> <li>Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Construction Worker II</li> <li>Event Worker</li> <li>Field Operating Technician (Level IV)</li> <li>Head Groundskeeper</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker</li> <li>Recreation Worker</li> <li>Utilities Service Worker</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker II</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)</li> </ul>			_	(40)		
<ul> <li>Construction Worker II</li> <li>Event Worker</li> <li>Field Operating Technician (Level IV)</li> <li>Head Groundskeeper</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker II</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)</li> <li>Skilled Craft (10)</li> </ul>			T .	· · ·		
<ul> <li>Event Worker</li> <li>Field Operating Technician (Level IV)</li> <li>Head Groundskeeper</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker II</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)</li> </ul> Skilled Craft (10)				·		
<ul> <li>Field Operating Technician (Level IV)</li> <li>Head Groundskeeper</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker II</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)</li> </ul> Skilled Craft (10)						
<ul> <li>Head Groundskeeper</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker II</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)</li> </ul> Skilled Craft (10)	>			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
<ul> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker II</li> <li>Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)</li> <li>Skilled Craft (10)</li> </ul>		. • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •				
> Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)  Skilled Craft (10)	>	•	>			
Skilled Craft (10)	>		>	Utility Field Representative		
· ·	>	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·				
			d Cr	• •		
> Beach Lifeguard > Parking Meter Technician	>		>	Parking Meter Technician		
> Distribution & Collection Chief > Parks Foreman	>	Distribution & Collection Chief	>	Parks Foreman		
> Electrician > Public Service Maintenance Chief	>	Electrician	>	Public Service Maintenance Chief		
<ul> <li>Heavy Equipment Operator</li> <li>Utilities Mechanic I</li> </ul>	>	Heavy Equipment Operator	>	Utilities Mechanic I		
> Industrial Electrician > Water Treatment Plant Operator II	>	• • • •	>			

# TABLE 5 BENCHMARK JOB TITLES BY OCCUPATIONAL CATEGORY

Technical (13)				
Building Inspector	Engineering Aide II			
<ul> <li>Chief Building Inspector</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Engineering Technician II</li> </ul>			
Code Compliance Officer	Parking Enforcement Specialist			
Computer Operator II	Plumbing Inspector			
Construction Review Specialist	Senior Code Compliance Officer			
> Electrical Inspector	Structural Plans Examiner			
> Electro Technician				

#### **Summary of Findings**

This analysis is based on market data covering both the public sector, encompassing cities, counties, school districts, transportation entities, universities, and utilities, and the private sector. Public sector information was gathered through a custom market survey. Private sector information was derived from published data sources. The City of Fort Lauderdale's overall market position is based on an equal weighting of the two market sector averages and is relative to the 75<sup>th</sup> percentile of market.

Based on <u>overall</u> market data, including custom survey peer employers and published data representative of the private sector, the City of Fort Lauderdale's pay structure is at the market average at the pay range midpoint and maximum and below market at the pay range minimum. The City of Fort Lauderdale's market position is shown below in **Table 6A** as an overall to market, in **Table 6B** by department, and in **Table 6C** by occupational group.

We define market competitiveness as being between 95% and 105% of the market average at the minimum, midpoint, and maximum. Market comparisons that fall within this competitive corridor are noted in black, below 95% are noted in red, and above 105% are noted in blue.

# TABLE 6A CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE, FL MARKET POSITION AT THE 75<sup>TH</sup> PERCENTILE OVERALL – PAY ONLY<sup>6</sup>

	City of Fort Lauderdale as a Percent of the 75th Percentile of the Market Average			
	Pay Range Minimum Pay Range Midpoint Pay Range Maximun			
Overall	100%	96%	93%	

Figures shown in **red** are below market (less than 95% of the market average)
Figures shown in **black** within the market range (95% to 105% of the market average)
Figures shown in **blue** are above market (more than 105% of the market average)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Base pay rates have been adjusted for geographic differences in the cost-of-labor

# **TABLE 6B** CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE, FL MARKET POSITION AT THE $75^{\text{TH}}$ PERCENTILE BY DEPARTMENT – PAY ONLY<sup>7</sup>

		City of Fort Lauderdale as a Percent of the 75 <sup>th</sup> Percentile of the Market Average		
	Pay Range Minimum	Pay Range Midpoint	Pay Range Maximum	
City Attorney's Office	108%	106%	106%	
City Clerk's Office	113%	121%	110%	
City Commission's Office	116%	112%	110%	
City Manager's Office	90%	89%	87%	
Crosses Multiple Departments	100%	96%	93%	
Finance Department	111%	104%	100%	
Fire Department	95%	97%	95%	
Human Resources Department	97%	96%	95%	
Information Technology Department	103%	96%	90%	
Parks and Recreation Department	97%	95%	93%	
Police	93%	86%	81%	
Public Works / Building Services Department	99%	94%	90%	
Sustainable Development Department	90%	87%	86%	
Transportation and Mobility Department	108%	100%	94%	
Overall	100%	96%	93%	

Figures shown in **red** are below market (less than 95% of the market average) Figures shown in **black** within the market range (95% to 105% of the market average) Figures shown in **blue** are above market (more than 105% of the market average)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Base pay rates have been adjusted for geographic differences in the cost-of-labor

# TABLE 6C CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE, FL MARKET POSITION AT THE $75^{\text{TH}}$ PERCENTILE BY OCCUPATIONAL GROUP— PAY ONLY8

		City of Fort Lauderdale as a Percent of the 75 <sup>th</sup> Percentile of the Market Average		
	Pay Range Minimum	Pay Range Midpoint	Pay Range Maximum	
Administrative & Support Services	105%	98%	93%	
Managerial & Supervisory	101%	98%	95%	
Paraprofessional	97%	91%	87%	
Professional	102%	99%	96%	
Service Maintenance	95%	95%	94%	
Skilled Crafts	103%	97%	93%	
Technical	91%	86%	82%	
Overall	100%	96%	93%	

Figures shown in **red** are below market (less than 95% of the market average)
Figures shown in **black** within the market range (95% to 105% of the market average)
Figures shown in **blue** are above market (more than 105% of the market average)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Base pay rates have been adjusted for geographic differences in the cost-of-labor

We did find variation in the competitiveness of individual benchmark job titles (see **Table 11**). Overall, at the midpoint of the pay range:

- > 39 benchmark job titles are below market (less than 95% at the midpoint)
- > 34 benchmark job titles are at market (between 95% and 105% at the midpoint)
- > 17 benchmark job titles are above market (above 105% at the midpoint)
- > 2 benchmark job titles did not garner sufficient matches to be statistically significant

On a total compensation basis, taking into consideration base pay, employer health benefit costs, and retirement plan contributions, the City's market position relative to the base pay improves slightly from 96% to 98%, as shown below in **Table 7**.

Overall, a total compensation analysis indicates:

- > 33 benchmark job titles are below market (less than 95% at the midpoint)
- > 37 benchmark job titles are at market (between 95% and 105% at the midpoint)
- > 20 benchmark job titles are above market (above 105% at the midpoint)
- > 2 benchmark job titles did not garner sufficient matches to be statistically significant

Health and retirement benefits used in the total compensation analysis reflect the Public Sector peer employers only.

TABLE 7 CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE, FL 75TH PERCENTILE MARKET POSITION ACROSS ALL BENCHMARKS AND PEER **EMPLOYERS - TOTAL COMPENSATION** 

		Employer Co	Employer Cost of Benefits		
	<b>Base Pay<sup>9</sup></b> (Range Midpoint)	Weighted Total Health Costs (Medical, Dental, & Usion)  Total Retirement Benefits (Defined Benefit & Deferred Compensation)		Employer Total Compensation Costs (Pay and Benefits)	
Overall Average	96%	71%	137%	98%	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Base pay rates have been adjusted for geographic differences in the cost-of-labor

# Methodology

#### **Peer Employers**

**Table 8** shows the demographic characteristics of the 18 comparable employers participating in the study, a combination of cities, counties, school districts, transportation entities, universities, and utilities identified by the City as representative of its competitive labor market.

TABLE 8
PEER EMPLOYER CHARACTERISTICS

Peer Employers	Population Change Since 2010	Median Household Income as of 2014
Cities		
City of Boca Raton	10.5%	\$354,800
City of Coral Springs	6.9%	\$269,600
City of Delray Beach	9.5%	\$176,900
City of Hollywood	6.4%	\$172,800
City of Miami	10.4%	\$211,400
City of Miami Beach	5.2%	\$341,000
City of Miramar	12.4%	\$194,000
City of Pompano Beach	7.9%	\$154,900
City of Sunrise	9.8%	\$137,300
City of West Palm Beach	6.9%	\$173,000
Counties		
Broward County	8.5%	\$177,300
Miami-Dade County	7.9%	\$194,100
School Districts		
Palm Beach County School District	7.8%	\$194,600
Transportation		
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	13.7%	\$158,600
Miami Executive Airport	10.4%	\$211,400
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	8.0%	\$188,666 <sup>10</sup>
Universities		
Miami-Dade College	10.4%	\$30,858
Utilities		
Toho Water Authority	20.6%	\$44,551
City of Fort Lauderdale	7.9%	\$243,600

<sup>10</sup> Average of Broward, Miami-Dade and Palm Beach Counties 2014 Median Household Value data.

#### **Published Data Sources**

Additionally, Segal Waters referenced three (3) published data sources to reflect private sector pay levels. The sources are:

#### **Economic Research Institute (ERI)**

The ERI Salary Assessor compiles pay data from hundreds of published data sources for thousands of job titles. The database is updated quarterly and provides salary information for nearly any geographic area in the United States. The information in this database reflects base salaries at the 10th and 90th percentiles, applicable to data sources and locations near Fort Lauderdale, Florida. The midpoint was calculated from the 10th and 90th percentiles. The geographic data cut used was Fort Lauderdale, Florida and the data was effective as of July 1, 2016.

#### **Towers Watson Data Services, Compensation Surveys**

Towers Watson Data Services publishes multiple compensation surveys throughout the year. We compiled data from Towers Watson's General Industry compensation surveys. This report reflects the 10<sup>th</sup> and 90<sup>th</sup> percentiles of base salaries and the midpoint was calculated from these percentiles. The geographic cut used was the Southeast Region. Due to general proximity, data was not geographically adjusted. The data was effective as of February 1, 2015.

#### **Mercer US Benchmark Database Survey 2015**

The 2015 Mercer Compensation Survey Report complies pay data from over 3,000 organizations across a variety of industries throughout the United States. The information in this report reflects base salary and pay range data for all responding organizations in the Southeast region. This report reflects the 25<sup>th</sup> and 75<sup>th</sup> percentiles of base salaries and the midpoint was calculated from these percentiles. The data was effective as of March 1, 2015.

Data from the three published data sources above were aged to the data effective date of April 1, 2018.

#### **Data Adjustments**

#### **Geographic Adjustments**

To adjust for geographic difference in the cost-of-labor between the City of Fort Lauderdale and peer locations, we used the cost-of-labor differentials report by the Economic Research Institute (ERI) for each peer location.

It is important to note that the cost-of-labor differentials do not necessarily reflect cost-of-living differences. ERI has found that cost-of-living differences (which reflect the supply and demand for goods and services) are not a good predictor of salary levels. In other words, while the cost of housing (or other goods and services) in the City of Fort Lauderdale may differ from the cost of housing in another peer location by a certain percentage, the prevailing salaries may not differ by the same percentage. ERI emphasizes that – for adjusting salaries in a market study such as this one – the cost-of-labor differentials provide a more accurate method of determining whether employers are paying a competitive wage appropriate to a given geographic area.

The geographic adjustments applied are shown in **Table 9**. A **negative** adjustment means that the cost-of-labor in a comparator location is higher than in the City of Fort Lauderdale. For example, the cost of labor in the City of Boca Raton is higher than in the City of Fort Lauderdale, shown as -1.1%. Conversely, a **positive** adjustment means that the cost-of-labor in a comparator location is lower than in the City of Fort Lauderdale. For example, the cost of labor in the City of Miami is lower than in the City of Fort Lauderdale, shown as an adjustment of 0.1%.

**TABLE 9** GEOGRAPHIC ADJUSTMENTS

Peer Employer	Geographic Adjustment
Broward County	0.0%
City of Boca Raton	-1.1%
City of Coral Springs	0.3%
City of Delray Beach	-0.8%
City of Hollywood	0.2%
City of Miami	0.1%
City of Miami Beach	-0.3%
City of Miramar	0.3%
City of Pompano Beach	0.4%
City of Sunrise	1.1%
City of West Palm Beach	-1.4%
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	5.0%
Miami Executive Airport	0.1%
Miami-Dade College	0.1%
Miami-Dade County	0.1%
Palm Beach County School District	-1.4%
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	0.1%
Toho Water Authority	5.4%

Since workweeks sometimes vary across peer employers, we typically adjust Non-Exempt positions based on the reported pay ranges to be consistent with the City of Fort Lauderdale's standard workweeks for employees; as shown below in **Table 10**, there were some differences in workweeks for the peer employers.

# TABLE 10 WORKWEEK ADJUSTMENTS

	40 HOUI	40 HOUR WORKWEEK	48 HOU	48 HOUR WORKWEEK
Peer Employer	Hours Worked by Employees in Comparable Positions	Workweek Adjustment by Employees in Comparable Positions	Hours Worked by Employees in Comparable Positions	Workweek Adjustment by Employees in Comparable Positions
Broward County	40.0	%0.0	48.0	%0.0
City of Boca Raton	40.0	%0.0	40.0	20.0%
City of Coral Springs	40.0	%0.0	48.0	0.0%
City of Delray Beach	40.0	%0:0	40.0	20.0%
City of Hollywood	40.0	%0.0	40.0	20.0%
City of Miami	40.0 29.5	0.0% 35.6%	40.0	20.0%
City of Miami Beach	40.0	%0.0	40.0	20.0%
City of Miramar	40.0	%0:0	40.0	20.0%
City of Pompano Beach	40.0	%0:0	48.0	0.0%
City of Sunrise	40.0	0.0%	40.0	20.0%
City of West Palm Beach	40.0	%0.0	48.0	%0.0
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	40.0	%0.0	40.0	20.0%
Miami Executive Airport	40.0	0.0%	40.0	20.0%
Miami-Dade College	37.5 25.0	6.7% 60.0%	40.0	20.0%
Miami-Dade County	40.0	0.0%	40.0	20.0%
Palm Beach County School District	40.0	%0.0	40.0	20.0%
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	40.0	0.0%	40.0	20.0%
Toho Water Authority	40.0	0.0%	40.0	20.0%
City of Fort Lauderdale	40.0	%0.0	48.0	%0.0

## Study Findings – Base Pay

#### Pay Ranges - Overall

Based on overall market data the City of Fort Lauderdale's pay structure is at the market average midpoint. We define market competitiveness as being between 95% and 105% of the market average. We did find variation in the competitiveness of individual benchmark job titles.

#### Specifically:

- 39 benchmark job titles are below market (less than 95% at the midpoint)
- > 34 benchmark job titles are at market (between 95% and 105% at the midpoint)
- > 17 benchmark job titles are above market (above 105% at the midpoint)
- 2 benchmark job titles did not garner sufficient matches to be statistically significant

Table 11 shows all benchmark jobs and their respective pay range market competitiveness based on the market data. "Insufficient Data" indicates that a specific benchmark job did not have three or more matches, as noted in the second column of the table. Segal Waters requires three or more matches for the data to be statistically significant; if a benchmark job does not garner enough matches Segal Waters will remove the position from analysis.

# **TABLE 11** CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE, FL OVERALL MARKET POSITION – 75<sup>TH</sup> PERCENTILE – PAY ONLY BY DEPARTMENT

OVERALL MARKET POSITION - 75	" PERCENT	City of Fort Lauderdale Pay Ranges as a			
		Percent of the 75th Percentile			
Benchmark Title	# of Matches	Pay Range Minimum	Pay Range Midpoint	Pay Range Maximum	
City A	ttorney's Offic	e (2)	-		
Assistant City Attorney III	10	112%	107%	105%	
Legal Assistant III	10	99%	105%	106%	
City Attorney's Office Average	<u> </u>	108%	106%	106%	
City	Clerk's Office	(1)			
Assistant City Clerk II	6	113%	121%	110%	
City Clerk's Office Average		113%	121%	110%	
City Cor	nmission's Of	fice (1)	1		
Commission Assistant IV	5	116%	112%	110%	
City Commission's Office Average		116%	112%	110%	
	lanager's Offic	e (3)			
Assistant City Manager	11	87%	90%	88%	
Construction Review Specialist	4	103%	95%	89%	
Senior Financial Management Analyst	12	88%	85%	86%	
City Manager's Office Average		90%	89%	87%	
	ultiple Departn	nents (19)	<u>I</u>	<u>I</u>	
Accounting Clerk	16	100%	90%	86%	
Administrative Aide	13	105%	95%	89%	
Administrative Assistant II	9	104%	100%	95%	
Clerk III	12	119%	113%	110%	
Code Compliance Officer	11	97%	92%	87%	
Construction Worker II	12	110%	106%	101%	
Customer Service Representative I	13	97%	88%	82%	
Deputy Director	12	96%	97%	94%	
Electrician	18	102%	97%	94%	
Event Worker	3	64%	118%	154%	
Heavy Equipment Operator	14	101%	95%	92%	
Municipal Maintenance Worker II	15	100%	95%	93%	
Planner III	11	100%	95%	90%	
Principal Planner	9	102%	97%	94%	
Project Manager II	12	92%	89%	84%	
Secretary I	12	104%	94%	89%	
Senior Accounting Clerk	9	96%	92%	89%	
Senior Project Manager	9	99%	97%	94%	
Service Clerk	5	105%	97%	93%	
Crosses Multiple Departments Average		100%	96%	93%	
	ce Departmen		2370	22,0	
	<del>-</del>		108%	102%	
Accountant II  Manager, Procurement And Contracts	17 13	117% 104%	108% 97%	102% 92%	

# TABLE 11 CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE, FL OVERALL MARKET POSITION – 75<sup>TH</sup> PERCENTILE – PAY ONLY BY DEPARTMENT

OVERALL MARKET POSITION = 75	City of Fort Lauderdale Pay Ranges as a				
			t of the 75th Pe		
Benchmark Title	# of Matches	Pay Range Minimum	Pay Range Midpoint	Pay Range Maximum	
Procurement Specialist II	13	123%	112%	105%	
Senior Accountant	17	118%	110%	109%	
Senior Procurement Specialist	10	122%	117%	112%	
Treasurer	10	94%	90%	87%	
Finance Department Average		111%	104%	100%	
Fire	e Department (	3)			
Battalion Chief	12	85%	98%	102%	
Beach Lifeguard	7	98%	90%	85%	
Beach Patrol Lieutenant	7	113%	101%	92%	
Fire Department Average	·	95%	97%	95%	
Human Re	sources Depai	tment (5)			
Claims Adjuster	11	87%	89%	87%	
Human Resources Assistant	6	112%	109%	111%	
Insurance Benefits Specialist	8	99%	92%	88%	
Risk Manager	8	100%	100%	100%	
Senior Claims Adjuster	10	92%	93%	91%	
Human Resources Department Average		97%	96%	95%	
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	echnology Dep	partment (10)	<u> </u>		
Application Developer	10	108%	107%	102%	
Assistant Database Administrator	10	100%	96%	90%	
Computer Operator II	6	94%	80%	71%	
Data Warehouse Analyst	4	104%	102%	95%	
Geographic Information Systems Analyst	6	111%	101%	93%	
Network Support Analyst	9	100%	96%	90%	
Senior Tech Support Analyst	9	111%	101%	97%	
Systems Administrator	13	112%	103%	97%	
Technical Support Analyst	11	103%	96%	91%	
Technology Strategist	6	87%	80%	75%	
Information Technology Department Average	ae	103%	96%	90%	
	ecreation Depa	l			
Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker	9	90%	83%	80%	
Community Program Supervisor	7	92%	94%	95%	
Field Operations Technician - Level IV	4	108%	98%	91%	
Head Groundskeeper	4	98%	94%	91%	
Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)	10	92%	89%	85%	
Parks Foreman	7	112%	105%	102%	
Pool Equipment Mechanic	4	110%	108%	107%	
Pool Lifeguard I	11	98%	91%	85%	
Recreation Instructor II	5	64%	82%	94%	

# TABLE 11 CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE, FL OVERALL MARKET POSITION – 75<sup>TH</sup> PERCENTILE – PAY ONLY BY DEPARTMENT

OVERALL MARKET POSITION = 75	LKOLIVI	City of Fort Lauderdale Pay Ranges as a Percent of the 75 <sup>th</sup> Percentile				
Benchmark Title	# of Matches	Pay Range Minimum	Pay Range Midpoint	Pay Range Maximum		
Recreation Program Coordinator	7	116%	113%	108%		
Recreation Programmer I	7	96%	87%	81%		
Recreation Worker	7	62%	75%	84%		
Parks and Recreation Department Average		97%	95%	93%		
Polic	e Department	(6)	ı	ı		
Accident Investigator II	2		Insufficient Dat	a		
Crime Analyst II	8	103%	93%	86%		
Police Aide II	1		a			
Police Records Clerk	8	98%	86%			
Public Safety Aide	6	86%	84%	78%		
Senior Police Records Clerk	4	91%	82%	76%		
Police Department Average	_	93%	86%	81%		
Public Works / Buil	ding Services					
Distribution And Collection Chief	6	97%	94%	92%		
Electro Technician	7	101%	96%	92%		
Engineering Aide II	6	85%	83%	75%		
Engineering Technician II	6	106%	100%	93%		
Environmental Laboratory Technician	6	99%	95%	93%		
Industrial Electrician	18	102%	97%	93%		
Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Public Services)	4	95%	88%	83%		
Public Service Maintenance Chief	9	100%	96%	92%		
Utilities Mechanic I	10	105%	98%	90%		
Utilities Service Worker	8	83%	88%	91%		
Utility Field Representative	3	105%	99%	94%		
Water Treatment Plant Operator II	8	103%	95%	90%		
Public Works / Building Services Departmen	nt Average	99%	94%	90%		
Sustainable De	velopment De	epartment (7)				
Building Inspector	10	80%	82%	85%		
Chief Building Inspector	10	87%	85%	86%		
Economic And Business Development Manager	10	106%	106%	106%		
Electrical Inspector	8	87%	83%	80%		
Plumbing Inspector	9	88%	83%	80%		
Senior Code Compliance Officer	10	88%	80%	75%		
Structural Plans Examiner	8	89%	83%	80%		
Sustainable Development Department Avera	ige	90%	87%	86%		
Transportation a	_	epartment (5)				
Airport Operations Aide	3	100%	88%	81%		
Parking Enforcement Shift Coordinator	3	114%	106%	99%		

#### TABLE 11 CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE, FL OVERALL MARKET POSITION - 75<sup>TH</sup> PERCENTILE - PAY ONLY BY DEPARTMENT

City of Fort Lauderdale Pay Ranges as a Percent of the 75<sup>th</sup> Percentile # of Pay Range **Pay Range** Pay Range **Benchmark Title** Minimum Midpoint Maximum **Matches** Parking Enforcement Specialist 95% 80% 5 85% Parking Meter Technician 5 107% 100% 95% Parking Operations Supervisor 120% 118% 117% **Transportation and Mobility Department Average** 108% 100% 94% 100% 93% 96%

Figures shown in **red** are below market (less than 95% of the market average)

Figures shown in **black** within the market range (95% to 105% of the market average)

Figures shown in **blue** are above market (more than 105% of the market average)

# **Study Findings – Pay Practices**

#### Pay Schedule Design & Increases

Tables 12 through 49 detail characteristics of peer employer pay plans for general employee positions including:

- > Pay Schedule Design
- > Pay Progression
- > Pay Increase Amounts
- > Type of Base Pay Increases
- > Pay Progression and Pay Increase Policies

Questions to which a comparable employer provided no response display an 'NR' in the associated field, and questions where an answer was not applicable display an 'NA' in the associated field.

**Survey Question:** What type of pay schedule design(s) covers employees?

**TABLE 12 PAY SCHEDULE DESIGN – GENERAL EMPLOYEES** 

Peer Employer	Grade and Step	Open Ranges	Flat Rates	Other
City of Delray Beach	No	Yes	No	No
City of Hollywood	No	Yes	No	No
City of Miami	Yes	Yes	No	No
City of Miami Beach	No	Yes	No	No
City of Miramar	No	Yes	No	No
City of Pompano Beach	No	Yes	No	No
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	Yes	No	No
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	Yes	No	No
Miami-Dade College	NR	Yes	NR	No
Palm Beach County School District	No	Yes	No	No
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	No	Yes	No	No
Toho Water Authority	Yes	No	No	No
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	No	No	No

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

CAM 18-1147

Exhibit 10 Page 28 of 91

Survey Question: What determines how employees progress though the pay range (that is, moves from the minimum to the maximum of the range)?

**TABLE 13 PAY PROGRESSION - GENERAL EMPLOYEES** 

Peer Employer	Steps (Time in Position)	Individual Performance	Other
City of Delray Beach	No	Yes	NA
City of Hollywood	No	Yes	No
City of Miami	Yes	Yes	No
City of Miami Beach	No	Yes	NA
City of Miramar	No	Yes	No
City of Pompano Beach	No	Yes	No
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	No	No	Yes – General Increase
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	Yes	NA
Miami-Dade College	Yes	NR	NA
Palm Beach County School District	No	No	Yes
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	No	Yes	Yes
Toho Water Authority	Yes	No	NA
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	Yes	NA

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable Survey Question: What type(s) / amount of base pay increases were applied in FY 2017 for employees? If other, please explain.

**TABLE 14** FY 2017 TYPE OF BASE PAY INCREASES – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	COLA	Amount (\$ or %)	Merit/ Performance	Amount (\$ or %)	Other	Amount (\$ or %)	If other, please explain:
City of Delray Beach	No	NA	Yes	0.0% - 5.0%	NA	NA	NA
City of Hollywood	Yes	2.5%	Yes	1.5%	No	NA	NA
City of Miami	No	NA	Yes	5.0%	Yes	5.0%	Contract Step Increases
City of Miami Beach	Yes	3.0%	Yes	TBD	NA	NA	Merit/Performance percentage is pending Commission approval
City of Miramar	Yes	2.5%	No	NA	No	NA	NA
City of Pompano Beach	Yes	3.0%	Yes	1.0% - 3.0%	No	NA	NA
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	No	NA	No	NA	Yes	3.5%	General Increase
Miami Executive Airport			Pe	ending Labor	Agreemen	t Negotiations	
Miami-Dade College	No	NA	No	NA	Yes	2.0%	As approved by the Board of Trustees, for FY 2016/2017
Palm Beach County School District	No	NA	Yes	See Comment	Yes	See Comment	PBCSD has 6 bargaining units and 6 non-bargaining units. Union negotiations determine increases.
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	No	NA	No	NA	Yes	3.0%	Across the board increase
Toho Water Authority	Yes	1.5%	Yes	2.5%	NA	NA	NA
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	0.5%	Yes	1.5% - 3.0%	NA	NA	NA

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

#### **Survey Questions:**

- (A) Do adjustments to the pay schedule automatically result in increases to employees' base pay?
- (B) Do you have a minimum guaranteed pay increase for promotions?
- (C) Do you have a policy on hiring practices? If yes, please provide any relevant detail.

TABLE 15
PAY PROGRESSION AND PAY INCREASE POLICIES – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	Question A	Question B	Question C	If Yes, please detail any relevant information.
City of Delray Beach	No	Yes	Yes	NR
City of Hollywood	Yes	Yes	Yes	Minimum of 5% for promotion
City of Miami	Yes	Yes	Yes	NR
City of Miami Beach	No	Yes	Yes	NR
City of Miramar	Yes	No	Yes	Varies by department, HR has a blanket policy on hiring polices
City of Pompano Beach	No	Yes	Yes	All newly appointed employees should be appointed at the minimum entrance salary. A department head may hire above salary with the City Manager's approval. A promoted employee's salary will be increased to the minimum of the new pay grade or 15% of their base pay, whichever is the greater.
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	No	Yes	Yes	NR
Miami Executive Airport	No	Yes	Yes	Minimum guaranteed pay increase is approximately 5% or to the minimum of the pay grade, greater of amount.
Miami-Dade College	NR	NR	NR	NR
Palm Beach County School District	No	Yes	Yes	Previous identical experience may apply for purposes of initial salary appointment, depending on the bargaining or non-bargaining unit of assignment.
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	No	No	Yes	It is the policy of SFRTA to be an Equal Opportunity employer.
Toho Water Authority	Yes	Yes	Yes	Question B: Yes – A promotion to a higher salary grade is 7% or the minimum of the new pay grade. A promotion from non-supervisor to a supervisor position is 10%.  Question C: Yes – We have a policy on recruitment and appointment, transfers, promotions and demotions, and pay for performance.
City of Fort Lauderdale	No	Yes	Yes	For exam positions: Must be a job posting (Teamsters requires a two week post), examination process that will make up half of the candidates' overall score. Candidates must be ranked and placed on an eligibility list and the top 5 scores are sent to the hiring department for interviews and selection.  Non-exam positions: Must be a job posting and the overall score is based on the interview panel.

CAM 18-1147 Exhibit 10 Page 31 of 91

#### **Survey Question:**

(D) Do you have a minimum guaranteed pay increases for reclassification to a higher grade?

**TABLE 16** PAY PROGRESSION AND PAY INCREASE POLICIES CONTINUED - GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	Question D	If Yes, please describe below.
City of Delray Beach	Yes	4.0% per grade
City of Hollywood	Yes	Minimum of 5.0% for reclassification
City of Miami	Yes	Minimum 10.0% increase
City of Miami Beach	Yes	5.0%
City of Miramar	No	NA
City of Pompano Beach	Yes	5.0%
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	6.0%
Miami Executive Airport	No	NA
Miami-Dade College	Yes	NR
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	5.0%
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Yes	Employees transferred to a job in a higher salary range will be paid at least the minimum of the new range and no greater than 10.0% above the minimum range.
Toho Water Authority	Yes	A promotion to a higher salary grade is 7.0% or the minimum of the new pay grade. A promotion from non-supervisory to supervisor is 10.0%.
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	5.0% increase or the minimum of the pay grade, whichever is higher.

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

**Survey Question:** What types of pay supplements are offered to any employees (e.g. \$0.10/hour for trades workers)? If you do not offer one or more of the following pay supplements, enter "Not Applicable."

TABLE 17A
PAY SUPPLEMENTS OFFERED – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	Evening Shift	Amount (\$ or %)	Overnight Shift Differential	Amount (\$ or %)	Weekend Differential	Amount (\$ or %)
City of Delray Beach	Yes	NR	Yes	NR	No	NA
City of Hollywood	Yes	\$0.60/hr	Yes	\$1.00/hr	No	NA
City of Miami	No	NA	Yes	\$0.60/hr	No	NA
City of Miami Beach	Yes	Varies	Yes	Varies	No	NA
City of Miramar	Yes	NR	Yes	NR	No	NA
City of Pompano Beach	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	\$0.60/hr	Yes	\$0.85/hr	No	NA
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	5.0%	Yes	5.0%	No	NA
Miami-Dade College	Yes	5.0%	Yes	10.0%	No	NA
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	\$0.25/hr	No	NA	No	NA
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	No	NA	Yes	\$1.00/hr	No	NA
Toho Water Authority	Yes	1.5x for Non- Exempt Employees	Yes	1.5x for Non- Exempt Employees	No	NA
City of Fort Lauderdale	No	NA	Yes	2.5% or 5.0% above pay range depending on the position.	Yes	2.5% or 5.0% above pay range depending on the position.

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable Survey Question: What types of pay supplements are offered to any employees (e.g. \$0.10/hour for trades workers)? If you do not offer one or more of the following pay supplements, enter "Not Applicable."

**TABLE 17B PAY SUPPLEMENTS OFFERED - GENERAL EMPLOYEES** 

Peer Employer	On-Call or Stand- Amount		Call-Back	Amount	
i eei Lilipioyei	By Pay	(\$ or %)	Pay	(\$ or %)	
City of Delray Beach	Yes	NR	Yes	NR	
City of Hollywood	No	NA	Yes	NR	
City of Miami	Yes	Receive a 7.5% pay supplement added to their base rate of pay should they be continually assigned to on-call rotation.	Yes	If recalled to duty during off-duty hours, receive a minimum of three (3) hours plus one (1) hour travel time, paid at the overtime rate	
City of Miami Beach	Yes	2 Hours	Yes	4 Hours Minimum	
City of Miramar	No	NA	Yes	NR	
City of Pompano Beach	Yes	Additional \$1.00/hr	Yes	\$100 monthly only for Zoning Techs	
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	2/10 of one hour	Yes	4 Hrs Min	
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	Amount dependent on employee's individual pay rate	Yes	Min. 4 Hrs Pay	
Miami-Dade College	No	NA	No	NA	
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	NR	No	NA	
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	No	NA	No	NA	
Toho Water Authority	Yes	Paid overtime for the actual hours called out and a flat \$140 for serving standby duty	Yes	Minimum 2 hrs. and a minimum of 15 minutes of work for responses from a remote location, at the applicable rate of pay	
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	Non-duty day employee receives 2 hr straight time, on duty day is 1 hr	Yes	Call back pay is time and one-half with a minimum of 3 hours	

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

CAM 18-1147 Exhibit 10 Page 34 of 91

Survey Question: What types of pay supplements are offered to any employees (e.g. \$0.10/hour for trades workers)? If you do not offer one or more of the following pay supplements, enter "Not Applicable."

**TABLE 17C PAY SUPPLEMENTS OFFERED - GENERAL EMPLOYEES** 

Peer Employer	Holiday Pay	Amount (\$ or %)			
City of Delray Beach	Yes	NR			
City of Hollywood	Yes	NR			
City of Miami	Yes	1.5x the Hourly Rate			
City of Miami Beach	Yes	NR			
City of Miramar	Yes	NR			
City of Pompano Beach	No	NA			
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando	Yes	Holiday + Regular			
Executive Airport	162	Tibliday + Regulai			
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	One day of pay, amount dependent on employee's individual pay rate			
Miami-Dade College	No	NA			
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	NR			
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Yes	8/4 hr FT/PT			
Toho Water Authority	NR	NR			
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	Employees not scheduled receive 8 hours pay at straight time. scheduled on a holiday, employee receive holiday compensato time off calculated at 1-1/2 times the hours worked			

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

CAM 18-1147 Exhibit 10 Page 35 of 91

Survey Question: What types of pay supplements are offered to any employees (e.g. \$0.10/hour for trades workers)? If you do not offer one or more of the following pay supplements, enter "Not Applicable."

**TABLE 17D PAY SUPPLEMENTS OFFERED - GENERAL EMPLOYEES** 

Peer Employer	Bi-Lingual Pay	Amount (\$ or %)	Special Skills	Amount (\$ or %)	Sign-On Bonus	Amount (\$ or %)
City of Delray Beach	Yes	NR	No	NA	No	NA
City of Hollywood	No	NA	NR	NR	No	NA
City of Miami	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
City of Miami Beach	No	NR	Yes	NR	No	NR
City of Miramar	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
City of Pompano Beach	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
Miami Executive Airport	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
Miami-Dade College	NR	NR	NR	NR	NR	NR
Palm Beach County School District	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
Toho Water Authority	No	NA	NR	NR	No	NA
City of Fort Lauderdale	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

Page 36 of 91

**Survey Question:** What types of pay supplements are offered to any employees (e.g. \$0.10/hour for trades workers)? If you do not offer one or more of the following pay supplements, enter "Not Applicable."

# TABLE 17E PAY SUPPLEMENTS OFFERED- GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	Referral Bonus	Amount (\$ or %)	Profess. Edu. Diff.	Amount (\$ or %)	Educational Stipend	Amount (\$ or %)
City of Delray Beach	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
City of Hollywood	No	NA	No	NA	NR	NR
City of Miami	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
City of Miami Beach	No	NR	NR	NR	Yes	UNDERGRADUATE COURSES:  80% for courses where employee earns an A 60% for courses where employee earns a B 40% for courses where employee earns a C GRADUATE COURSES:  80% for courses where employee earns an A 60% for courses where employee earns a B
City of Miramar	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
City of Pompano Beach	No	NA	Yes	Only for Zoning Technician	No	NA
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
Miami Executive Airport	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
Miami-Dade College	NR	NR	NR	NR	NR	NR
Palm Beach County School District	No	NA	Yes	NR	No	NA
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	No	NA	No	NA	No	NA
Toho Water Authority	No	NA	No	NA	Yes	\$4,690 per fiscal year, reimbursement of courses associated with attaining a degree in a field related to the employee's role at TWA
City of Fort Lauderdale	No	NA	No	NA	Yes	Differs based on bargaining group and classification

Survey Question: What types of pay supplements are offered to any employees (e.g. \$0.10/hour for trades workers)? If you do not offer one or more of the following pay supplements, enter "Not Applicable."

**TABLE 17F1** PAY SUPPLEMENTS OFFERED- GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	Other	Amount (\$ or %)	Comments
City of Delray Beach	NR	NR	NR
City of Hollywood	NR	NR	NR
			•Emergency Dispatchers who are actively assigned the duty of training new Emergency Dispatchers shall be entitled to receive a five percent (5%) per pay period pay supplement for the actual full pay period they are assigned in a training capacity by their supervisor.
City of Miami	Yes	See	•All Police Emergency Dispatchers, Emergency Dispatcher Supervisors, and Police and Emergency Dispatch Assistants assigned to Police Communications shall receive a five percent (5%) pay supplement if the employee holds and maintains the Quality Assurance Proficiency (QAP) rating in accordance with Police Standards after a period of three (3) months.
Oity of Milanii	100	Comment	•Fire Garage Mechanics and Supervisors who obtain Emergency Vehicle Technicians certificates, shall receive a one percent (1%) pay supplement for every two (2) licenses that mechanics and supervisors obtain and maintain, up to a maximum of five percent (5%) for holding a minimum of ten (10) approved licenses.
			•All fleet employees and supervisors in the Department of General Services Administration, who obtain Automotive Service Excellence (ASE) certification, shall receive a one percent (1%) pay supplement for every two (2) licenses obtained and maintained, up to a maximum of five percent (5%) for holding a minimum of ten (10) approved licenses.
City of Miami Beach	NR	NR	NR
City of Miramar	No	NA	NR
City of Pompano Beach	No	NA	NR
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	No	NA	NR

CAM 18-1147 Exhibit 10 Page 38 of 91

# **TABLE 17F2** PAY SUPPLEMENTS OFFERED- GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	Other	Amount (\$ or %)	Comments
Miami Executive Airport	No	NA	Lead worker is a pay supplement provided to employees that are determined to be performing extraordinary duties within their classification, such as providing direction, issuing work assignments to other employees within their same classification, performing added duties outside their classification, etc. For employees in the Purchasing or Contracting Profession there is a certification available to employees in the purchasing & contract procurement area such as Certified Public Procurement Officer (CPPO); the supplement is for attaining the certification.
Miami-Dade College	Yes	3%	Lead workers are provided a pay supplement of 3% of their base pay.
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	NR	NR
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	No	NA	Pay differential of \$1.00 per hour for hours between 10 pm and 6 am. Holiday pay is paid at rate of 8 hours for full time employees and 4 hours for part time employees.
Toho Water Authority	Yes	7%	Field Services has a Skill Based Pay program that incentivizes progression of skills and knowledge. The employee's job title advances and their pay grade increases by meeting the requirements.
City of Fort Lauderdale	No	NA	NR

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

CAM 18-1147 Exhibit 10 Page 39 of 91

- (A) Do you offer longevity pay to any employees?
- (B) If Yes, which employee groups receive longevity pay?

# TABLE 18 LONGEVITY PAY – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	Offered?	Employee Groups which Receive Longevity Pay
City of Delray Beach	No	NA
City of Hollywood	Yes	General, Professional, Supervisory, and Non-Represented
City of Miami	No	NA
City of Miami Beach	No	NA
City of Miramar	Yes	Employees with 15 Years of Full-time Service or More
City of Pompano Beach	No	NA
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	All Employee Groups
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	All Employee Groups
Miami-Dade College	No	NA
Palm Beach County School District	No	NA
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	No	NA
Toho Water Authority	Yes	All Full-time and Permanent Employees
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	Employees hired before 10/1/2004

Survey Question: How much longevity pay do general employees receive for each year of service?

TABLE 19A
AMOUNT OF LONGEVITY PAY BY YEARS OF SERVICE – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	1 < 5 Years	5 < 10 Years	10 < 15 Years	15 < 20 Years	20 < 25 Years	25 < 30 Years	30+ Years
		Anr	nual Amount (\$/ho	ur or % of pay)			
City of Delray Beach	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
City of Hollywood	0.0%	0.0%	5.0%	3.0%	2.0%	2.0%	2.0%
City of Miami	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
City of Miami Beach	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
City of Miramar	NR	NR	NR	NR	NR	NR	NR
City of Pompano Beach	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	\$0.00	\$425.00	\$825.00	\$1,200.00	\$1,600.00	\$1,600.00	\$1,600.00
Miami Executive Airport	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	15 Yrs – 1.5% 16 Yrs – 1.6% 17 Yrs – 1.7% 18 Yrs – 1.8% 19 Yrs – 1.9%	20 Yrs – 2.0% 21 Yrs – 2.1% 22 Yrs – 2.2% 23 Yrs – 2.3% 24 Yrs – 2.4%	25 Yrs – 2.5% 26 Yrs – 2.6% 27 Yrs – 2.7% 28 Yrs – 2.8% 29 Yrs – 2.9%	30 Yr. Cap at 3.0%
Miami-Dade College	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Palm Beach County School District	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Toho Water Authority	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$300.00 - \$450.00	\$450.00 - \$600.00	\$600.00 - \$750.00	\$750.00 - \$900.00	\$900.00 - \$1,020.00
City of Fort Lauderdale	NA	2.5%	5.0%	7.5%	10.0%	12.5%	12.5%

Survey Question: How much longevity pay do management employees receive for each year of service?

TABLE 19B
AMOUNT OF LONGEVITY PAY BY YEARS OF SERVICE – MANAGEMENT – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	1 < 5 Years	5 < 10 Years	10 < 15 Years	15 < 20 Years	20 < 25 Years	25 < 30 Years	30+ Years
r. P. J.			Amount (\$/hour				
City of Delray Beach	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
City of Hollywood	0.0%	0.0%	5.0%	3.0%	2.0%	2.0%	2.0%
City of Miami	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
City of Miami Beach	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
City of Miramar	NR	NR	NR	NR	NR	NR	NR
City of Pompano Beach	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	\$0.00	\$425.00	\$825.00	\$1,200.00	\$1,600.00	\$1,600.00	\$1,600.00
Miami Executive Airport	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	15 Yrs – 1.5% 16 Yrs – 1.6% 17 Yrs – 1.7% 18 Yrs – 1.8% 19 Yrs – 1.9%	20 Yrs – 2.0% 21 Yrs – 2.1% 22 Yrs – 2.2% 23 Yrs – 2.3% 24 Yrs – 2.4%	25 Yrs – 2.5% 26 Yrs – 2.6% 27 Yrs – 2.7% 28 Yrs – 2.8% 29 Yrs – 2.9%	30 Yr. Cap at 3.0%
Miami-Dade College	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Palm Beach County School District	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Toho Water Authority	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$300.00 - \$450.00	\$450.00 - \$600.00	\$600.00 - \$750.00	\$750.00 - \$900.00	\$900.00 - \$1,020.00
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$0.00	Starting at 5	years of service	employees will e	earn \$264 for eac	ch year of continu	uous service

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

CAM 18-1147 Exhibit 10 Page 42 of 91 **Survey Questions:** What is the maximum amount of longevity pay an employee can receive? Is longevity pay included in pension calculations?

TABLE 20
MAXIMUM AMOUNT OF LONGEVITY PAY – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	Maximum Amount	Included in Pension Benefit Calculations?	Use this space below for additional comments regarding longevity pay.
City of Delray Beach	NA	NA	NA
City of Hollywood	Capped at 2.0% of Pay at 20 years of Service	Yes	NR
City of Miami	NA	NA	NA
City of Miami Beach	NA	NA	NA
City of Miramar	NR	NR	NR
City of Pompano Beach	NA	NA	NA
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Capped at \$1,600.00	No	The years are slightly off compared to Greater Orlando Aviation  Authority
Miami Executive Airport	Capped at 3.0% of Pay	NR	NR
Miami-Dade College	No	NA	NA
Palm Beach County School District	NA	NA	NA
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	NA	NA	NA
Toho Water Authority	Capped at \$1,020.00	Yes	NR
City of Fort Lauderdale	12.5%	NR	Annual dollar amount for Longevity pay differs based on bargaining group. Annual rates listed for general employees are from Teamsters bargaining union.  Employees must be hired prior to April 10, 1983 and must have served continuous for 5 years. For Federation employees: must be employed on or before Feb. 28, 1987. For management: must be employed on or before March 1, 1987 and 5 years of continuous serves.

- (A) Do you offer performance-based rewards?
- (B) If yes, what types of performance-based rewards do you offer to any employees?

TABLE 21
PERFORMANCE-BASED REWARDS – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	Offered?	Organization Wide Pay Increases	Organization Wide Lump Sum Bonuses	Department/ Team Pay Increases	Department/ Team Lump Sum Bonuses	Individual Pay Increases	Individual Lump Sum Bonuses
City of Delray Beach	Yes	No	No	No	No	Yes	Yes
City of Hollywood	No	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
City of Miami	No	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
City of Miami Beach	No	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
City of Miramar	No	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
City of Pompano Beach	Yes	No	No	No	No	Yes	No
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	No	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	No	No	No	No	Yes	Yes
Miami-Dade College	No	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	No	No	No	No	Yes	No
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Yes	No	No	No	No	Yes	No
Toho Water Authority	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	No	No	No	No	Yes	No

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

Page 44 of 91

**Survey Question:** Which employee groups are eligible for any performance-based rewards?

TABLE 22
PERFORMANCE-BASED REWARDS – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	Eligible Employee Groups
City of Delray Beach	All
City of Deliay Beach	,
City of Hollywood	Only general employees currently, management just received a COLA
City of Miami	NA
City of Miami Beach	NA
City of Miramar	NR
City of Pompano Beach	Full-time employees only
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	NA
Miami Executive Airport	All non-bargaining unit employees.
Miami-Dade College	NA
Palm Beach County School District	Teachers, Principals, Assistant Principals
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	NR
Toho Water Authority	All permanent full-time and part time employees
City of Fort Lauderdale	NR

Survey Question: Do you reimburse employees for expense associated with education, such as getting a college degree, continuing education, or certifications?

TABLE 23 SUPPLEMENTAL PAY – TUITION ASSISTANCE – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

		SOPPLEMENIALF	AY - IUIION ASSIS	SUPPLEMENTAL PAY - LUITION ASSISTANCE - GENERAL EMPLOYEES	
Peer Employer	Offered?	Amount (% of base or \$ per hour)	Frequency (Annual or One Time)	Additional Policy Information	Additional Comments
City of Delray Beach	Yes	State Rate	Annual	12 Credits per Year	None
City of Hollywood	Yes	NR	N. N.	NR	None
City of Miami	Yes	\$4,000 Maximum	Annual	NR	None
City of Miami Beach	Yes	Grade A: 80% reimburse. Grade B: 60% reimburse. Grade C: 40% reimburse.	Limited to 6 credit hours per semester	Tuition assistance shall be based upon and not exceed the established credit hour tuition rate in the State university system at the time of enrollment	None
City of Miramar	Yes	<u>Undergraduate:</u> Up to \$5,000.00 Graduate: Up to \$7,000.00	Annual	W.	None
City of Pompano Beach	Yes	100%	Annual	NR	None
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	\$2,500.00	Annual	Grade "C" or Better Required	None
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	20%	Annual	Grade "C" or Better Required	None
Miami-Dade College	N.	N. N.	N. N.	NR	None
Palm Beach County School District	S N	AN	ΑN	NA	NA
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Yes	\$200 / credit hr for undergraduate \$590 / credit hr for graduate	Annual	Annual Max \$7,000	\$200 credit hour for undergraduate. \$590 credit hour for graduate. Annual max \$7,000 Grade of "B" or higher = 100% reimbursement. Grade of "C" = 75% reimbursement Less than a "C" = 0% reimbursement
Toho Water Authority	Yes	\$4,690.00	Annual	NR RN	None
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	% Based on Grade	Annual	% of tuition cost up to a max of 24 sem hrs annually	Grade A = 100%; Grade B = 75%; Grade C = 50%, D or below = None

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

Survey Question: Do you have a traditional leave or paid time off (PTO) program?

**TABLE 24** 

L	PTO PROGRAM OFFERING – GENERAL EMPLOYEES
Peer Employer	Type of Program
City of Delray Beach	Traditional Leave
City of Hollywood	Traditional Leave
City of Miami	Paid Time Off (PTO)
City of Miami Beach	Traditional Leave
City of Miramar	NR NR
City of Pompano Beach	Traditional Leave
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Traditional Leave
Miami Executive Airport	Paid Time Off (PTO)
Miami-Dade College	Traditional Leave
Palm Beach County School District	Traditional Leave
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Traditional Leave
Toho Water Authority	Traditional Leave
City of Fort Lauderdale	Traditional Leave

Survey Question: How many Vacation OR Paid Time Off (PTO) leave days do full-time employees accrue in a year? If you have PTO days instead of vacation days, enter the number of PTO days.

TABLE 25A FULL-TIME EMPLOYEES VACATION / PAID TIME OFF DAYS OFFERED – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

	0-1	_	2	က	4	2														20	21	22	23	24	25+
Employer	YOS	YOS	YOS	YOS	YOS	YOS							_	_	_	_	_		_	YOS	YOS	YOS	YOS	YOS	YOS
City of Delray Beach	0	12	12	12	14	14														18	18	18	18	18	18
City of Hollywood	0	10	10	10	10	10		_								_				52	22	22	25	25	22
City of Miami (PTO)11	0	12	12	12	12	12														22	22	22	22	22	22
City of Miami Beach	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12 1	17	17   17	17   17		17   17	17	17	17	17	22	22	22	22	22	22
City of Miramar	10	10	10	10	15	15														22	25	25	25	25	25
City of Pompano Beach	0	10	10	10	10	10	15													20	20	20	20	20	20
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando	10	10	10	10	10	12	12	12	12	12 1	15 1	15 15				15	15	15		20	20	20	20	20	25
Executive Airport																									
Miami Executive Airport (PTO) <sup>11</sup>	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10 1	10 1	10 10	0 10		0 10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
Miami-Dade College	12	12	12	12	12	12	15	15	15	15	15	18 18	8 18	3 18	8 18	18	18	138	18	18	18	18	18	18	18
Palm Beach County School District	0	12	12	12	12	12	15	15	15	15 1	15 1	18 18	18 18		8 18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	10	10	10	10	10	15	15	15			20 2	20 20	0 20		0 20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
Toho Water Authority	10	10	10	10	10	12	12	12										17	17	20	20	20	20	20	20
Market Average	9	11	11	11	11	12	13		14	14 1	16	17 17	71 17	71 17	7 17	18	18	18	18	20	20	20	20	20	20
City of Fort Lauderdale	15	15	15	15	15	16	17											25	25	22	25	25	25	22	25
Difference between Fort Lauderdale and the	6	4	4	4	4	4	4	'n	ر.	9	25		9	<b>~</b>	© ————————————————————————————————————			<b>^</b>	<b>^</b>	2	2	S.	'n	2	2
Market Average							-	_	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-								

11 The City of Miami and Miami Executive Airport offer a paid time off (PTO) program while all other comparable surveyed offer Traditional Leave.

Survey Question: How many Vacation OR Paid Time Off (PTO) leave days do part-time employees accrue in a year? If you have PTO days instead of vacation days, enter the number of PTO days.

TABLE 25B
PART-TIME EMPLOYEES
VACATION / PAID TIME OFF DAYS OFFERED – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

															-								-			
Employer	0-1 YOS	1 YOS	yos	3 YOS	4 Y OS	YOS	soy Yos	7 YOS	8 YOS	80X	10 YOS	11 Y0S	12 Y0S	13 Y0S	44 YOS	15 YOS	16 YOS	17 Y0S	18 YOS	19 YOS	20 YOS	21 Y0S	22 Y0S	23 Y0S	24 Y0S	25+ YOS
City of Delray Beach									Part-	Time Emp	loyees t	Do Not A	ccrue Va	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days	aid Time	(PTO) Le	заке Da	ى ئ								
City of Hollywood	0	5	5	5	5	2	5	5	7	7	6	6	6	6	<u>б</u>	10	10	10	10	10	13	13	13	13	13	13
City of Miami									Part-	Time Emp	Noyees L	Do Not A	ccrue Va	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days	aid Time	(PTO) Le	eave Da	s,								
City of Miami Beach	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	22	22	22	22	22	22
City of Miramar									Part-	Time Emp	loyees t	Do Not A	ccrue Va	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days	aid Time	(PTO) Le	eave Da	S,								
City of Pompano Beach									Part-	Time Emp	loyees L	Do Not A	ccrue Va	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days	aid Time	(PTO) Le	eave Da	δ								
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	5	5	5	5	5	9	9	9	9	9	80	80	80	80	80	80	- ∞	- ∞	80	- ∞	10	10	10	10	10	13
Miami Executive Airport									Part-	Time Emp	loyees L	Do Not A	ccrue Va	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days	aid Time	(PTO) L	eave Da	S,								
Miami-Dade College									Part-	Time Emp	Noyees L	Do Not A	ccrue Va	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days	aid Time	(PTO) Le	eave Da	s,								
Palm Beach County School District	0	12	12	7	12	12	15	15	15	15	5	8	18	8	8	18	8	8	18	8	8	8	18	8	8	8
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	2	2	2	5	2	80	80	œ	80	∞	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
Toho Water Authority	2	5	5	5	5	9	9	9	9	9	8	8	8	8	80	6	6	6	6	6	10	10	10	10	10	10
Market Average	2	3	3	က	3	4	4	4	4	4	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	7	7	7	7	7	7
City of Fort Lauderdale									Part-Ti.	me Empl	oyees L	No Not A	ccrue Va	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days	Paid Tim	e (PTO)	Leave D	ays								
Difference between Fort Lauderdale and the Market Average	7	ဗှ	ကု	ကု	ကု	4-	4	4-	4-	4-	ڻن	rç.	ιγ̈́	rç.	rç.	<del>ب</del>	رن ا	٠ <del>٠</del>	رئ ا	٠ċ	-2-	2-		۲-	-2-	-7

Survey Question: How many of the following paid leave days are employees allowed each year? Please provide any relevant notes or comments on other paid leave days.

**TABLE 26A** 

PAID LEAVE DAYS - GENERAL EMPLOYEES

		LAID LEAVE DATO - GENERAL	<b>₹</b>			
	3	<b>FULL-TIME EMPLOYEES</b>	LOYEES	PA	<b>PART-TIME EMPLOYEES</b>	LOYEES
Employer	Sick Leave	Holidays	Personal/Floating	Sick Leave	Holidays	Personal/Floating
City of Delray Beach	12	11	_	0	0	0
City of Hollywood	12	∞	0	9	2	0
City of Miami	12	11	0	0	0	0
City of Miami Beach	0	11	က	0	11	က
City of Miramar	15	10	2	0	0	0
City of Pompano Beach	12	12	2	0	0	0
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	13	<u></u> တ	2	9	6	2
Miami Executive Airport	12	13	2	0	0	0
Miami-Dade College	12	6	4	0	0	0
Palm Beach County School District	12	9	9	12	9	9
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	12	10	2	9	10	2
Toho Water Authority	12	11	4	9	11	0
City of Fort Lauderdale	12	6	0	0	0	0

Survey Question: Please provide any relevant notes or comments on other paid leave days.

# TABLE 26B PAIN I FAVE DAVS.

	PAID LEAVE DAYS – GENERAL EMPLOYEES
Peer Employer	Notes
City of Delray Beach	None
City of Hollywood	Sick accruals are the same as vacation accruals either 50% or 75% based on hours worked. Holidays are 8 for employees working 30 + hours or 5 for employees working 15 - 29 hours.
City of Miami	None
City of Miami Beach	None
City of Miramar	None
City of Pompano Beach	None
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	None
Miami Executive Airport	None
Miami-Dade College	Twelve days per year are earned. Personal days are taken from sick leave. No limit on sick leave; use when needed. Sick leave at retirement is based on a percentage; an employee must have at least 10 years of service at which point eligible for 50%. For each year above 10 years, 1.5% is added to a maximum of 100% of the average final compensation for the 3 highest years' salary.
Palm Beach County School District	None
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Sick leave accrual is 3.69 hours per pay period for full time and 1.845 hours per pay period for part time.
Toho Water Authority	None
City of Fort Lauderdale	None

The table below details the total paid time off days allotted to full-time employees encompassing vacation days / paid time off (PTO) days, sick leave, holidays, and personal/floating days.

TABLE 27A
FULL-TIME EMPLOYEES
TOTAL VACATION / PAID TIME OFF AND PAID LEAVE DAYS ACCRUED / ALLOTTED – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

	0-1	-	7	က	4	S.	ဖ	_	<b>∞</b>	တ															
Elliployer	YOS	YOS	_	_					_	_	_	_		_		_	_								
City of Delray Beach	24	36	36	36	38	38	38	38	40	40										_					
City of Hollywood	20	30	30	30	30	30	30	30	34	34	38	38	38	38	38	40	40 4	40 40	0 40	0 45	5 45	5 45	45	45	45
City of Miami	23	32	35	35	35	35	37	37	37	37										_					
City of Miami Beach	56	56	56	26	56	56	26	26	26	26										_					
City of Miramar	37	37	37	37	42	42	42	42	42	42										_					
City of Pompano Beach	26	36	36	36	36	36	41	41	41	41															
Greater Orlando Aviation																									
Authority / Orlando	34	34	34	34	34	36	36	36	36	36	39	39	36	39	39	39	39 3	39 39	6 39	9 44	† 44	- - 44	44	4	49
Executive Airport	ļ	ļ		ļ		ļ			-	-			+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	ļ
Miami Executive Airport	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37		_	37	_	37 37	_	7 37	7 37		37	37	37
Miami-Dade College	37	37	37	37	37	37	40	40	40	40	40	43	43	43	43	43 4	43 4	43 43	3 43	3 43	3 43	43	43	43	43
Palm Beach County School District	24	36	36	36	36	36	39	39	39	39	39	42	42	42		42 4	42 4	42 42	2 42	2 42	2 42	42	42	42	42
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	34	34	34	34	34	39	39	39	39	39	44	44	44	44	44	44	44 4	44 44	44	44		44	44	44	44
Toho Water Authority	37	37	37	37	37	39	39	39	39	39	42	42	42			44 4					7 47	, 47		47	47
Market Average	30	35	35	35	35	36	37	37	38	38	40	40		40				42 42	2 42				44	44	44
City of Fort Lauderdale	36	36	36	36	36	37	38	39	40	11	42	43	44	45	46	46 4		46 46	6 46	6 46	3 46	46	46	46	46
Difference between Fort Lauderdale and the	9	1	1	1	1	-	1	8	8	ო	8	ო	4	2	2	2	4	4	4	2	~	7	8	8	8
ווומו ויסני בו מאלים						_		_	_	_	_	_	_	_		_		_	_		_	_		_	

47

The table below details the total paid time off days allotted to part-time employees encompassing vacation days / paid time off (PTO) days, sick leave, holidays, and personal/floating days.

TABLE 27B
PART-TIME EMPLOYEES
TOTAL VACATION / PAID TIME OFF AND PAID LEAVE DAYS ACCRUED / ALLOTTED – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Employer	0-1 YOS	1 YOS	2 Y0S	3 Y0S	4 YOS	YOS	soy Yos	7 YOS	8 Y0S	9 X0Y	10 Y0S	40S	12 Y0S	13 Y0S	14 YOS	15 Y0S	16 YOS	17 YOS	18 Y0S	19 YOS	, 708	21 Y0S	70S 70S	73 70S	708 708	25+ YOS
City of Delray Beach					A	art-Time	Employe	es Do M	ot Accrue	Vacation	7 / Paid 7	'ime (PT	Э) Геаvе	Days or	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days or Offered Sick Leave, Holidays, and/or Personal/Floating Days	sick Leav	re, Holidε	ıys, and/κ	or Perso	nal/Floati	ng Days					
City of Hollywood		16	16	16	16	16	16	16	18	18	20	20	20	20	20	21	21	21	21	21	24	24	24	24	24	24
City of Miami					F	art-Time	Employe	es Do M	ot Accrue	Vacation	7 / Paid 7	'ime (PT	Э) Leave	Days or	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days or Offered Sick Leave, Holidays, and/or Personal/Floating Days	sick Leav	'e, Holidε	ıys, and/ι	or Perso	nal/Floati	ng Days					
City of Miami Beach	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	23	23	23	23	23	23	23	23	23	23	36	36	36	36	36	36
City of Miramar					F	art-Time	Employe	es Do M	ot Accrue	Vacation	ا Paid آ	'ime (PT	О) Leave	Days or	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days or Offered Sick Leave, Holidays, and/or Personal/Floating Days	sick Leav	re, Holidε	ıys, and/ι	or Perso	nal/Floati	ng Days					
City of Pompano Beach					Ā	art-Time	Employe	es Do M	ot Accrue	Vacation	/ Paid ī	'ime (PT	О) Leave	Days or	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days or Offered Sick Leave, Holidays, and/or Personal/Floating Days	sick Leav	re, Holidε	ıys, and⁄ι	or Perso	nal/Floati	ng Days					
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	22	22	22	22	22	23	23	23	23	23	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	27	27	27	27	27	30
Miami Executive Airport					Ā	art-Time	Employe	es Do M	ot Accrue	Vacation	ا Paid آ	'ime (PT	Э) Геаvе	Days or	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days or Offered Sick Leave, Holidays, and/or Personal/Floating Days	sick Leav	re, Holida	ıys, and⁄κ	or Perso	nal/Floati	ng Days					
Miami-Dade College					4	art-Time	Employ	es Do M	ot Accrue	Vacation	ا Paid آ	'ime (PT	О) Leave	Days or	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days or Offered Sick Leave, Holidays, and/or Personal/Floating Days	sick Leav	re, Holida	ıys, and/κ	or Perso	nal/Floati	ng Days	ļ	ļ			
Palm Beach County School District	24	36	36	36	36	36	39	39	39	39	39	42	42	42	42	42	42	42	42	42	42	42	42	42	42	42
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	23	23	23	23	23	26	26	26	26	26	28	28	28	28	28	28	28	28	28	28	28	28	28	28	28	28
Toho Water Authority	22	22	22	22	22	23	23	23	23	23	25	25	25	25	25	26	26	26	56	26	27	27	27	27	27	27
Market Average	10	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	13	13	13	13	13	14	14	14	14	14	15	15	15	15	15	16
City of Fort Lauderdale					Part-	Time En	ployees	Do Not	Accrue 1	(acation ,	/ Paid T	me (PTC	) Leave	Days or	Part-Time Employees Do Not Accrue Vacation / Paid Time (PTO) Leave Days or Offered Sick Leave, Holidays, and/or Personal/Floating Days	Sick Lea	ve, Holi	days, and	d/or Per	sonal/Flo	oating D	ays				
Difference between Fort Lauderdale and the Market Average	-10	-12	-12	-12	-12	-12	-12	-12	-12	-12	-13	-13	-13	-13	-13	-14	-14	-14	-14	-14	-15	-15	-15	-15	-15	-16

- (A) Can employees carry-over unused vacation/PTO days?
- (B) If "Yes," enter the maximum number of days per year that an employee can "bank" into the space below. If there is no limit, please write "unlimited."

TABLE 28
VACATION/ PTO CARRY-OVER POLICIES – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	Question A	Question B
City of Delray Beach	Yes	36 Days
City of Hollywood	Yes	Must be used in the following 15 months
City of Miami	Yes	500 Hours / Year
City of Miami Beach	No	NA
City of Miramar	Yes	Same as Accrued
City of Pompano Beach	Yes	40 Days
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	440 Hours / Year 220 Hours / Year
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	500 Hours
Miami-Dade College	Yes	44 Days
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	Rolls over to max 60 days
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Yes	480 Hours
Toho Water Authority	Yes	Up to three times their annual accrual rate
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	Varies based on years of service, 5 years max is 240

- (A) Can employees cash-out unused vacation/PTO leave days?
- (B) If "Yes," enter the maximum number of days an employee can cash out at the events listed below. If there is no limit, please write "unlimited."

**TABLE 29 VACATION / PTO CASH-OUT RATES - GENERAL EMPLOYEES** 

	Question A		Question B	
Peer Employer	Yes / No	At Year End	At Termination	At Retirement
City of Delray Beach	Yes	0 Days	36 Days	36 Days
City of Hollywood	Yes	0 Days	All	All
City of Miami	Yes	5 Days	All	All
City of Miami Beach	Yes	62.5 Days	77.5 Days	77.5 Days
City of Miramar	No	NA	NA	NA
City of Pompano Beach	Yes	0 Days	20 Days	40 Days
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	NR	NR	NR
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	0 Days	All	All
Miami-Dade College	Yes	0 Days	30 Days	62 Days
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	NR	60 Days	60 Days
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Yes	50% of Days	Unlimited	Unlimited
Toho Water Authority	Yes	Balance over three times their annual accrual rate	NR	NR
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	NR	All Unused	All Unused

- (A) Can employees carry-over unused sick leave days?
- (B) If "Yes," enter the maximum number of days per year that an employee can "bank" into the space below. If there is no limit, please write "unlimited."

**TABLE 30 UNUSED SICK LEAVE CARRY OVER - GENERAL EMPLOYEES** 

Peer Employer	Question A	Question B
City of Delray Beach	Yes	Unlimited
City of Hollywood	Yes	Unlimited
City of Miami	Yes	93.75 Days
City of Miami Beach	Yes	Varies
City of Miramar	Yes	NR
City of Pompano Beach	Yes	Unlimited
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	Unlimited
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	Unlimited
Miami-Dade College	No	NA
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	Unlimited
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Yes	Unlimited
Toho Water Authority	Yes	240 Days
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	816 Days

(A) Can employees cash-out unused sick leave days?
(B) If "Yes," enter the maximum number of days an employee can cash out at the events listed below. If there is no limit, please write "unlimited."

# UNUSED SICK LEAVE CASH-OUT - GENERAL EMPLOYEES **TABLE 31**

	Question A		Question B	
Peer Employer	Yes / No	At Year End	At Termination	At Retirement
City of Delray Beach	Yes	5	140 Days	140 Days
City of Hollywood	Yes		A Percentage based on years of service at retirement or termination	ment or termination
City of Miami	o <sub>N</sub>	Ϋ́Ν	NA	NA
City of Miami Beach	Yes	ΨZ	75 Days	75 Days
City of Miramar	X X	N. R.	NR	N. N.
City of Pompano Beach	Yes	None	62.5 Days	125 Days
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	N R	NR	One Third the Number Accrued each calendar year
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	None	After 15 years, a percentage of sick hours will be paid at termination or retirement.	After 15 years, a percentage of sick hours will be paid at termination or retirement.
Miami-Dade College	Yes	None	0 Days	% of Days
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	None	A pro-rated share of the accumulated sick is paid based on service, with 10 YOS equaling 100% pay out.	Unlimited
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Yes	None	Balance Less 10 Days Prorated	Balance Less 10 Days Prorated
Toho Water Authority	Yes	NR	Unused leave above 240 Days	N.
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	NR R	28% of unused if in good standing	28% of unused if in good standing
NR = No Response				

NA = Not Applicable

8782032v1/14397.004

# Study Findings – Health Benefits

# **Total Health**

The City's total monthly costs for all health-related benefits (medical, prescription drugs, dental, and vision plans) are higher than the survey average, as shown in Tables 32, however the City contributes a smaller percentage in regard to cost sharing arrangements than the survey average, as shown in Table 33.

(AVERAGE OF PPO, HMO, AND HDHP MEDICAL PLAN, RX, DENTAL, AND VISION) TOTAL MONTHLY HEALTH COST **TABLE 32** 

		Employe	Employer Cost (\$)			Employe	Employee Cost (\$)	
Peer Employer	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family
City of Delray Beach	\$719.68	\$719.68	\$719.68	\$719.68	\$38.73	\$179.99	\$261.73	\$395.27
City of Hollywood	\$653.14	\$2,074.70	\$1,292.42	\$2,074.70	\$75.95	\$232.91	\$156.67	\$232.91
City of Miami	\$638.45	\$1,181.16	\$1,404.59	\$1,819.63	\$121.23	\$230.64	\$262.02	\$371.89
City of Miami Beach	\$522.35	\$1,093.15	\$1,093.15	\$1,344.99	\$362.93	\$758.36	\$758.36	\$986.48
City of Miramar		Healt	Health / Benefits Information Provided was Unable to be Validated	rmation Prov	iided was Un	able to be Val	idated	
City of Pompano Beach	\$766.29	\$1,333.62	\$1,333.62	\$1,333.62	\$0.00	\$566.98	\$566.98	\$566.98
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	\$747.05	\$1,161.02	\$1,242.51	\$1,798.54	\$83.87	\$292.28	\$312.34	\$454.90
Miami Executive Airport	\$699.29	\$699.29	\$699.29	\$699.29	\$4.14	\$344.33	\$398.50	\$594.88
Miami-Dade College	\$795.03	\$795.03	\$795.03	\$795.03	\$193.82	\$945.36	\$1,066.72	\$1,328.16
Palm Beach County School District	\$400.00	\$680.00	\$716.50	\$870.50	\$76.18	\$193.36	\$229.48	\$377.18
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	\$656.85	\$1,393.61	\$1,393.61	\$1,393.61	\$70.33	\$248.75	\$239.79	\$271.44
Toho Water Authority	\$651.82	\$1,223.10	\$1,223.10	\$1,223.10	\$6.57	\$411.77	\$405.89	\$411.77
Market Average	\$659.09	\$1,123.12	\$1,083.04	\$1,279.34	\$93.98	\$400.43	\$423.50	\$544.71
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$148.13	\$288.58	\$322.39	\$453.70

CAM 18-1147 Exhibit 10 Page 59 of 91

# **TABLE 33 TOTAL HEALTH COST SHARING** (AVERAGE OF PPO, HMO, AND HDHP MEDICAL PLAN, RX, DENTAL, AND VISION)

		Employe	r Cost (\$)			Employee	e Cost (\$)	
Peer Employer	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family
City of Delray Beach	95%	80%	73%	65%	5%	20%	27%	35%
City of Hollywood	90%	90%	89%	90%	10%	10%	11%	10%
City of Miami	84%	84%	84%	83%	16%	16%	16%	17%
City of Miami Beach	59%	59%	59%	58%	41%	41%	41%	42%
City of Miramar		Healt	h / Benefits Info	rmation Prov	vided was Un	able to be Vali	dated	
City of Pompano Beach	100%	70%	70%	70%	0%	30%	30%	30%
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	90%	80%	80%	80%	10%	20%	20%	20%
Miami Executive Airport	99%	67%	64%	54%	1%	33%	36%	46%
Miami-Dade College	80%	46%	43%	37%	20%	54%	57%	63%
Palm Beach County School District	84%	78%	76%	70%	16%	22%	24%	30%
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	90%	85%	85%	84%	10%	15%	15%	16%
Toho Water Authority	99%	75%	75%	75%	1%	25%	25%	25%
Market Average	88%	74%	72%	70%	12%	26%	28%	30%
City of Fort Lauderdale	82%	70%	68%	60%	18%	30%	32%	40%

We collected data regarding most populous medical plan coverage, as well as prescription drug, dental, and vision benefits. Most of the peer employers offer a PPO medical plan. While all peers also offer other health-related benefits, the dental and vision programs are typically provided as a separate benefit election.

Survey Question: Please provide the following information for your most populous HMO, PPO, and HDHP health plan.

### Medical

# TABLE 34 MOST POPULOUS PPO MEDICAL PLAN MONTHLY COST

		Employe	r Cost (\$)			Employe	e Cost (\$)	
Peer Employer	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family
City of Delray Beach		The	e City of Delray	Beach Does	Not Have a	PPO Plan Offe	ering	
City of Hollywood	\$612.86	\$2,158.29	\$1,301.55	\$2,158.29	\$119.17	\$184.17	\$162.50	\$184.17
City of Miami	\$638.45	\$1,181.16	\$1,404.59	\$1,819.63	\$87.86	\$162.52	\$193.29	\$250.38
City of Miami Beach	\$534.28	\$1,122.00	\$1,122.00	\$1,311.18	\$534.28	\$1,122.00	\$1,122.00	\$1,311.18
City of Miramar		Healt	h / Benefits Info	ormation Pro	vided was Un	able to be Val	idated	
City of Pompano Beach	Health / Benefits Information Provided was Unable to be Validated   \$906.30   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$0.00   \$599.82   \$599.82   \$599.82   Greater Orlando Aviation Authority Does Not Have a PPO Plan Offering   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11   \$1,506.11							
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	\$906.30 \$1,506.11 \$1,506.11 \$1,506.11 \$0.00 \$599.82 \$599.82 \$599.82 Greater Orlando Aviation Authority Does Not Have a PPO Plan Offering							
Miami Executive Airport		Mi	ami Executive	Airport Does	Not Have a F	PPO Plan Offe	ring	
Miami-Dade College	\$766.21	\$766.21	\$766.21	\$766.21	\$348.16	\$1,156.34	\$1,300.25	\$1,610.25
Palm Beach County School District		Palm Be	ach County Sc	hool District	Does Not Ha	ve a PPO Plan	Offering	
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	\$642.84	\$1,379.60	\$1,379.60	\$1,379.60	\$50.00	\$180.00	\$180.00	\$180.00
Toho Water Authority		Т	oho Water Autl	hority Does N	lot Have a Pl	PO Plan Offerii	ng	
Market Average	\$683.49	\$1,352.23	\$1,246.68	\$1,490.17	\$189.91	\$567.48	\$592.98	\$689.30
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$154.37	\$300.54	\$337.08	\$476.40

**TABLE 35** MOST POPULOUS PPO MEDICAL PLAN MONTHLY COST - COST SHARING

		Employe	r Cost (\$)		Employee Cost (\$)			
Peer Employer	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family
City of Delray Beach		The	City of Delray	Beach Does	Not Have a F	PPO Plan Offe	ring	
City of Hollywood	84%	92%	89%	92%	16%	8%	11%	8%
City of Miami	88%	88%	88%	88%	12%	12%	12%	12%
City of Miami Beach	50%	50%	50%	50%	50%	50%	50%	50%
City of Miramar		Health / Benefits Information Provided was Unable to be Validated						
City of Pompano Beach	100%	72%	72%	72%	0%	28%	28%	28%
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Greater Orlando Aviation Authority Does Not Have a PPO Plan Offering							
Miami Executive Airport		Mia	ami Executive A	Airport Does	Not Have a P	PO Plan Offer	ing	
Miami-Dade College	69%	40%	37%	32%	31%	60%	63%	68%
Palm Beach County School District		Palm Be	ach County Scl	hool District I	Does Not Hav	e a PPO Plan	Offering	
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	93%	88%	88%	88%	7%	12%	12%	12%
Toho Water Authority	Toho Water Authority Does Not Have a PPO Plan Offering							
Market Average	78%	70%	68%	68%	22%	30%	32%	32%
City of Fort Lauderdale	76%	63%	61%	53%	24%	37%	39%	47%

**TABLE 36** MOST POPULOUS HMO MEDICAL PLAN MONTHLY COST

	Employer Cost (\$)				Employee Cost (\$)					
Peer Employer	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family		
City of Delray Beach	\$719.68	\$719.68	\$719.68	\$719.68	\$0.00	\$166.01	\$207.31	\$351.74		
City of Hollywood	\$655.41	\$1,953.11	\$1,245.28	\$1,953.11	\$0.00	\$144.19	\$65.54	\$144.19		
City of Miami		City of Miami Does Not Have a HMO Plan Offering								
City of Miami Beach	\$466.54	\$979.74	\$979.74	\$1,249.16	\$147.70	\$310.16	\$310.16	\$532.14		
City of Miramar	Health / Benefits Information Provided was Unable to be Validated									
City of Pompano Beach	\$626.27	\$1,161.12	\$1,161.12	\$1,161.12	\$0.00	\$534.14	\$534.14	\$534.14		
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	\$796.41	\$1,233.44	\$1,325.82	\$1,915.62	\$88.49	\$308.36	\$331.45	\$478.91		
Miami Executive Airport	\$668.07	\$668.07	\$668.07	\$668.07	\$0.00	\$305.50	\$359.67	\$511.33		
Miami-Dade College	\$766.21	\$766.21	\$766.21	\$766.21	\$0.00	\$554.75	\$653.56	\$866.45		
Palm Beach County School District	\$430.00	\$730.00	\$763.00	\$931.00	\$50.00	\$136.00	\$178.00	\$308.00		
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	\$642.84	\$1,379.60	\$1,379.60	\$1,379.60	\$50.00	\$180.00	\$180.00	\$180.00		
Toho Water Authority	\$625.12	\$1,191.53	\$1,191.53	\$1,191.53	\$0.00	\$340.00	\$340.00	\$340.00		
Market Average	\$639.66	\$1,078.25	\$1,020.01	\$1,193.51	\$33.62	\$297.91	\$315.98	\$424.69		
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$204.17	\$390.40	\$434.62	\$611.55		

**TABLE 37** MOST POPULOUS HMO MEDICAL PLAN MONTHLY COST - COST SHARING

		Employe	r Cost (\$)		Employee Cost (\$)					
Peer Employer	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family		
City of Delray Beach	100%	81%	78%	67%	0%	19%	22%	33%		
City of Hollywood	100%	93%	95%	93%	0%	7%	5%	7%		
City of Miami		City of Miami Does Not Have a HMO Plan Offering								
City of Miami Beach	76%	76%	76%	70%	24%	24%	24%	30%		
City of Miramar	Health / Benefits Information Provided was Unable to be Validated									
City of Pompano Beach	100%	68%	68%	68%	0%	32%	32%	32%		
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	90%	80%	80%	80%	10%	20%	20%	20%		
Miami Executive Airport	100%	69%	65%	57%	0%	31%	35%	43%		
Miami-Dade College	100%	58%	54%	47%	0%	42%	46%	53%		
Palm Beach County School District	90%	84%	81%	75%	10%	16%	19%	25%		
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	93%	88%	88%	88%	7%	12%	12%	12%		
Toho Water Authority	100%	78%	78%	78%	0%	22%	22%	22%		
Market Average	95%	78%	76%	74%	5%	22%	24%	26%		
City of Fort Lauderdale	72%	58%	56%	48%	28%	42%	44%	52%		

# **TABLE 38** MOST POPULOUS HDHP MEDICAL PLAN MONTHLY COST

		Employe	r Cost (\$)			Employee	e Cost (\$)	
Peer Employer	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family
City of Delray Beach	\$719.68	\$719.68	\$719.68	\$719.68	\$0.00	\$26.04	\$154.98	\$195.82
City of Hollywood		City of Hollywood Does Not Have a HDHP Plan Offering						
City of Miami		City of Miami Does Not Have a HDHP Plan Offering						
City of Miami Beach		City of Miami Beach Does Not Have a HDHP Plan Offering						
City of Miramar		Health / Benefits Information Provided was Unable to be Validated						
City of Pompano Beach		City	of Pompano B	each Does N	lot Have a HL	DHP Plan Offe	ring	
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	\$671.44	\$1,039.87	\$1,117.77	\$1,615.00	\$74.60	\$259.97	\$279.44	\$408.75
Miami Executive Airport		Mia	mi Executive A	irport Does ∧	lot Have a HL	OHP Plan Offe	ring	
Miami-Dade College		М	iami-Dade Colle	ege Does No	t Have a HDF	HP Plan Offerii	ng	
Palm Beach County School District	\$370.00	\$630.00	\$670.00	\$810.00	\$60.00	\$156.00	\$198.00	\$332.00
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	South Florida Regional Transportation Authority Does Not Have a HDHP Plan Offering							1
Toho Water Authority	Toho Water Authority Does Not Have a HDHP Plan Offering							
Market Average	\$587.04	\$796.52	\$835.82	\$1,048.23	\$44.87	\$147.34	\$210.81	\$312.19
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$675.00	\$154.37	\$300.54	\$337.08	\$476.40

# **TABLE 39** MOST POPULOUS HDHP MEDICAL PLAN MONTHLY COST - COST SHARING

		Employe	r Cost (\$)			Employee	e Cost (\$)		
Peer Employer	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	
City of Delray Beach	100%	97%	82%	79%	0%	3%	18%	21%	
City of Hollywood		City of Hollywood Does Not Have a HDHP Plan Offering							
City of Miami			City of Miami	Does Not Ha	ave a HDHP I	Plan Offering			
City of Miami Beach		City of Miami Beach Does Not Have a HDHP Plan Offering							
City of Miramar		Healt	h / Benefits Info	rmation Prov	vided was Un	able to be Vali	dated		
City of Pompano Beach		City of Pompano Beach Does Not Have a HDHP Plan Offering							
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	90%	80%	80%	80%	10%	20%	20%	20%	
Miami Executive Airport		Mia	mi Executive A	irport Does N	lot Have a HL	DHP Plan Offe	ring		
Miami-Dade College		M	iami-Dade Colle	ege Does No	t Have a HDI	HP Plan Offerii	ng		
Palm Beach County School District	86%	80%	77%	71%	14%	20%	23%	29%	
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	South Florida Regional Transportation Authority Does Not Have a HDHP Plan Offering								
Toho Water Authority	Toho Water Authority Does Not Have a HDHP Plan Offering								
Market Average	93%	84%	80%	77%	7%	16%	20%	23%	
City of Fort Lauderdale	83%	71%	70%	62%	17%	29%	30%	38%	

- (A) Are Rx benefits included in the medical premium?
- (B) Are dental benefits included in the medical premium?
- (C) Are vision benefits included in the medical premium?
- (D) Are part-time employees eligible to participate in the medical plan?

**TABLE 40** TYPE OF HEALTH PLANS OFFERED – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

	Incl	uded in Me Premium?		PT Employees Eligible?	
Peer Employer	Rx	Dental	Vision	Eligible?	
City of Delray Beach	Yes	No	No	No	
City of Hollywood	Yes	No	No	Yes	
City of Miami	Yes	No	Yes	No	
City of Miami Beach	Yes	No	Yes	No	
City of Miramar	Yes	No	No	Yes	
City of Pompano Beach	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	No	No	Yes	
Miami Executive Airport	NR	NR	NR	NR	
Miami-Dade College	Yes	No	No	No	
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	No	No	Yes	
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Yes	No	No	Yes	
Toho Water Authority	Yes	No	No	No	
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	

# **Dental**

TABLE 41 MOST POPULOUS DENTAL PLAN MONTHLY COST

		Employe	r Cost (\$)		Employee Cost (\$)				
Peer Employer	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	
City of Delray Beach	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$34.36	\$75.05	\$67.88	\$108.79	
City of Hollywood	\$19.00	\$19.00	\$19.00	\$19.00	\$10.27	\$49.16	\$30.49	\$49.16	
City of Miami	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$33.37	\$68.12	\$68.73	\$121.51	
City of Miami Beach	\$21.94	\$42.28	\$42.28	\$64.82	\$21.94	\$42.28	\$42.28	\$64.82	
City of Miramar	Health / Benefits Information Provided was Unable to be Validated								
City of Pompano Beach		Dental Benefits for City of Pompano Beach are Encompassed in the Medical Plan							
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	\$11.83	\$21.91	\$18.26	\$30.78	\$2.09	\$7.30	\$6.08	\$10.26	
Miami Executive Airport	\$31.22	\$31.22	\$31.22	\$31.22	\$0.00	\$30.53	\$30.53	\$68.32	
Miami-Dade College	\$14.41	\$14.41	\$14.41	\$14.41	\$0.00	\$16.36	\$16.36	\$16.36	
Palm Beach County School District	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$15.72	\$33.36	\$27.48	\$43.18	
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	\$14.01	\$14.01	\$14.01	\$14.01	\$14.01	\$56.41	\$47.31	\$72.06	
Toho Water Authority	\$26.70	\$31.57	\$31.57	\$31.57	\$0.00	\$53.40	\$53.40	\$53.40	
Market Average	\$13.91	\$17.44	\$17.08	\$20.58	\$13.18	\$43.20	\$39.05	\$60.79	
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$48.60	\$93.60	\$91.06	\$117.98	

**TABLE 42** MOST POPULOUS DENTAL PLAN MONTHLY COST - COST SHARING

		Employe	r Cost (\$)		Employee Cost (\$)			
Peer Employer	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family
City of Delray Beach	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%	100%	100%	100%
City of Hollywood	65%	28%	38%	28%	35%	72%	62%	72%
City of Miami	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%	100%	100%	100%
City of Miami Beach	50%	50%	50%	50%	50%	50%	50%	50%
City of Miramar	Health / Benefits Information Provided was Unable to be Validated							
City of Pompano Beach		Dental Benefits for City of Pompano Beach are Encompassed in the Medical Plan						
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	85%	75%	75%	75%	15%	25%	25%	25%
Miami Executive Airport	100%	51%	51%	31%	0%	49%	49%	69%
Miami-Dade College	100%	47%	47%	47%	0%	53%	53%	53%
Palm Beach County School District	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%	100%	100%	100%
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	50%	20%	23%	16%	50%	80%	77%	84%
Toho Water Authority	100%	37%	37%	37%	0%	63%	63%	63%
Market Average	51%	29%	30%	25%	49%	71%	70%	75%
City of Fort Lauderdale	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%	100%	100%	100%

# **Vision**

**TABLE 43** MOST POPULOUS VISION PLAN MONTHLY COST

	Employer Cost (\$)				Employee Cost (\$)			
Peer Employer	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family
City of Delray Beach	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$4.37	\$8.91	\$12.70	\$12.70
City of Hollywood	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$6.09	\$19.57	\$12.16	\$19.57
City of Miami		Vision E	Benefits for City	of Miami are	Encompass	ed in the Medi	cal Plan	
City of Miami Beach		Vision Benefits for City of Miami Beach are Encompassed in the Medical Plan						
City of Miramar		Health / Benefits Information Provided was Unable to be Validated						
City of Pompano Beach		Vision Benefits for City of Pompano Beach are Encompassed in the Medical Plan						
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	\$1.29	\$2.45	\$2.45	\$2.45	\$0.23	\$0.81	\$0.81	\$0.81
Miami Executive Airport	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$4.14	\$8.30	\$8.30	\$15.23
Miami-Dade College	\$14.41	\$14.41	\$14.41	\$14.41	\$19.74	\$73.45	\$73.45	\$73.45
Palm Beach County School District	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$5.46	\$14.00	\$14.00	\$14.00
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$6.32	\$12.34	\$12.48	\$19.38
Toho Water Authority	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$6.57	\$18.37	\$12.49	\$18.37
Market Average	\$1.96	\$2.11	\$2.11	\$2.11	\$6.62	\$19.47	\$18.30	\$21.69
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$4.58	\$9.28	\$8.76	\$14.36

**TABLE 44** MOST POPULOUS VISION PLAN MONTHLY COST - COST SHARING

		Employe	r Cost (\$)		Employee Cost (\$)			
Peer Employer	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family	EE Only	EE + Children	EE + Spouse	Family
City of Delray Beach	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%	100%	100%	100%
City of Hollywood	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%	100%	100%	100%
City of Miami		Vision E	Benefits for City	of Miami are	Encompass	ed in the Medi	cal Plan	
City of Miami Beach		Vision Benefits for City of Miami Beach are Encompassed in the Medical Plan						
City of Miramar		Health / Benefits Information Provided was Unable to be Validated						
City of Pompano Beach		Vision Benefits for City of Pompano Beach are Encompassed in the Medical Plan						
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	85%	75%	75%	75%	15%	25%	25%	25%
Miami Executive Airport	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%	100%	100%	100%
Miami-Dade College	42%	16%	16%	16%	58%	84%	84%	84%
Palm Beach County School District	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%	100%	100%	100%
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%	100%	100%	100%
Toho Water Authority	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%	100%	100%	100%
Market Average	23%	10%	10%	9%	77%	90%	90%	91%
City of Fort Lauderdale	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%	100%	100%	100%

- (A) Do you reimburse employees for expenses associated with wellness activities?
- (B) Do you offer lower employee medical contributions for participation in wellness programs?
- (C) Are part-time employees eligible for wellness benefits?

# **TABLE 45 - GENERAL EMPLOYEES WELLNESS**

Peer Employer	Question A	Question B	Question C
City of Delray Beach	No	No	No
City of Hollywood	NR	No	NR
City of Miami	No	No	No
City of Miami Beach	No	No	No
City of Miramar	Yes	No	Yes
City of Pompano Beach	No	No	No
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	No	Yes
Miami Executive Airport	No	No	NR
Miami-Dade College	No	No	NR
Palm Beach County School District	No	Yes	Yes
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	No	No	No
Toho Water Authority	Yes	Yes	No
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	No	Yes

# **Study Findings - Retirement Benefits**

Survey Question: Do you participate in Social Security?

**TABLE 46** SOCIAL SECURITY / MEDICARE PARTICIPATION - GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Door Employer	Partio	cipate?
Peer Employer	OASDI?	Medicare?
City of Delray Beach	Yes	Yes
City of Hollywood	Yes	Yes
City of Miami	Yes	Yes
City of Miami Beach	No	Yes
City of Miramar	Yes	Yes
City of Pompano Beach	Yes	Yes
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	Yes	Yes
Miami Executive Airport	Yes	Yes
Miami-Dade College	Yes	Yes
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	Yes
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Yes	Yes
Toho Water Authority	Yes	Yes
City of Fort Lauderdale	Yes	Yes

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

8782032v1/14397.004

Survey Question: Please answer the following questions regarding retirement plans offered to current employees.

The total employer contribution for each peer includes the defined benefit employer total cost, deferred compensation automatic employer contributions and employer match, and social security contributions as shown below.

TABLE 47
RETIREMENT BENEFITS – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

		Defined Benefit		Deferred Compensation 457(b)	nsation 457(b)	Social Security	
Peer Employers	Employer Normal Cost	Total Employer Contributions	Total Employee Contributions	Automatic Employer Contributions	Employer Match	Social Security Contributions	Total Employer Contribution
	(% of pay)	(% of pay)	(% of pay)	(% of pay)	(% of pay)	(%)	(% of pay)
City of Delray Beach	10.65%	14.00%	3.00%	0.00%	3.00%	7.65%	21.30%
City of Hollywood	6.65%	%80.99	8.00%	ΑN	AN	7.65%	14.30%
City of Miami (Employer picks up the 10% Employee Contributions to Defined Benefit Plan)	2.60%	45.72%	10.00%	%00:0	%00:0	7.65%	20.25%
City of Miami Beach	%00.6	%00'98	10.00%	%00'0	%00.0	1.45%	10.45%
City of Miramar	12.21%	22.33%	7.36%	ΑN	3.00%	7.65%	22.86%
City of Pompano Beach	24.00%	24.00%	10.00%	ΑN	AN	7.65%	31.65%
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	ΑN	ΝA	NA	AN	NA	NA	NA
Miami Executive Airport	2.75%	8.00%	3.00%	ΑN	ΝΑ	7.65%	10.40%
Miami-Dade College (Employer picks up the 3% Employee Contributions to Defined Benefit Plan)	2.75%	%00'8	3.00%	AN	ΑN	%59'.	13.40%
Palm Beach County School District (Employer picks up the 3% Employee Contributions to Defined Benefit Plan)	2.75%	8.00%	3.00%	NA	AN	%59'.	13.40%
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	2.75%	8.00%	3.00%	%00.0	0.00%	7.65%	10.40%
Toho Water Authority	21.50%	22.66%	16.70%	%00'0	0.00%	7.65%	29.15%
					Overall	Overall Market Average	17.96%
City of Fort Lauderdale	18.00%	24.60%	8.60%	AN	%00'0	7.65%	25.65%

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable

Survey Question: Please answer the following questions regarding retirement plans offered to current employees.

### TABLE 48 RETIREMENT BENEFITS - DEFINED BENEFIT (PENSION) - GENERAL **EMPLOYEES**

Peer Employer	Are employee contributions picked up by the employers?
City of Delray Beach	No
City of Hollywood	No
City of Miami	Yes
City of Miami Beach	No
City of Miramar	No
City of Pompano Beach	No
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	NR
Miami Executive Airport	No
Miami-Dade College	Yes
Palm Beach County School District	Yes
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	No
Toho Water Authority	NR
City of Fort Lauderdale	No

NR = No Response NA = Not Applicable **Survey Question:** Are part-time employees eligible to participate in any of the plans below?

TABLE 49
RETIREMENT BENEFITS – PART TIME ELIGIBILITY IN RETIREMENT BENEFITS – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

Peer Employer	Defined Benefit Retirement	Deferred Compensation 457(b) Retirement Plan
City of Delray Beach	No	No
City of Hollywood	NR	Yes
City of Miami	No	No
City of Miami Beach	No	Yes
City of Miramar	No	No
City of Pompano Beach	No	No
Greater Orlando Aviation Authority / Orlando Executive Airport	NR	Yes
Miami Executive Airport	No	No
Miami-Dade College	No	No
Palm Beach County School District	Yes	NR
South Florida Regional Transportation Authority	Yes	Yes
Toho Water Authority	No	No
City of Fort Lauderdale	No	Yes

NR = No Response, NA = Not Applicable

CAM 18-1147

Exhibit 10 Page 76 of 91

# Study Findings – Total Compensation

The total compensation costs for each benchmark are the sum of the following:

- > The calculated midpoint of the base pay range (average of the minimum and maximum base pay rates)
- > Total employer costs for all health related benefits (medical, prescription drug, dental, and vision), weighted by City of Fort Lauderdale's current enrollment distribution among coverage tiers across all plans
- > The current total employer contribution associated with the defined benefit retirement plan
- > Maximum employer contribution to deferred compensation plans

# TABLE 50 CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE MARKET POSITION AT THE 75<sup>TH</sup> PERCENTILE ACROSS ALL BENCHMARKS AND PEER EMPLOYERS TOTAL COMPENSATION

		Employer Co	st of Benefits	
	Base Pay (Range Midpoint)	Weighted Total Health Costs (Medical, Dental, & Vision)	Total Retirement Benefits (Defined Benefit & Deferred Compensation)	Employer Total Compensation Costs (Pay and Benefits)
Overall Average	96%	71%	137%	98%

As previously displayed in **Table 7**, the values in **Table 50** show the City of Fort Lauderdale's market position across all benchmarks and peer employers from a total compensation standpoint. **Table 51** shows all benchmark jobs and their respective total compensation market competitiveness. "Insufficient Data" indicates that the job did not garner three or more matches. Market findings with three or more matches provide a more reliable indication of the City's market position amongst the peer employers. Job matches are defined as a peer employer having a job comparable to the benchmark job.

# TABLE 51 CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE, FL MARKET POSITION AT THE 75<sup>TH</sup> PERCENTILE ACROSS ALL BENCHMARKS AND PEER EMPLOYERS TOTAL COMPENSATION – GENERAL EMPLOYEES

		Employer Co	st of Benefits	Employer Total
Benchmark Title	Base Pay	Weighted Total Health Costs	Total Retirement Benefits	Compensation Costs
	City Attorney's	Office		
Assistant City Attorney III				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$139,038	\$8,100	\$35,663	\$182,801
Market	\$130,323	\$11,431	\$23,406	\$165,160
FL as % Mkt	107%	71%	152%	111%
Legal Assistant III				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$64,043	\$8,100	\$16,427	\$88,570
Market	\$60,963	\$11,431	\$10,949	\$83,343
FL as % Mkt	105%	71%	150%	106%
	City Clerk's C	ffice		
Assistant City Clerk II				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$52,333	\$8,100	\$13,423	\$73,856
Market	\$43,207	\$11,431	\$7,760	\$62,398
FL as % Mkt	121%	71%	173%	118%
Ci	ity Commission	's Office		
Commission Assistant IV				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$71,677	\$8,100	\$18,385	\$98,162
Market	\$63,909	\$11,431	\$11,478	\$86,818
FL as % Mkt	112%	71%	160%	113%
	City Manager's	Office		
Assistant City Manager				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$149,791	\$8,100	\$38,421	\$196,312
Market	\$167,149	\$11,431	\$30,020	\$208,600
FL as % Mkt	90%	71%	128%	94%
Construction Review Specialist				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$57,200	\$8,100	\$14,672	\$79,972
Market	\$60,342	\$11,431	\$10,837	\$82,610
FL as % Mkt	95%	71%	135%	97%
Senior Financial Management Analyst				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$73,507	\$8,100	\$18,855	\$100,462
Market	\$86,810	\$11,431	\$15,591	\$113,832
FL as % Mkt	85%	71%	121%	88%

		Employer Cost of Benefits		
Benchmark Title	Base Pay	Weighted Total Health Costs	Total Retirement Benefits	Employer Total Compensation Costs
	sses Multiple	Departments		
Accounting Clerk				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$40,518	\$8,100	\$10,393	\$59,011
Market	\$45,145	\$11,431	\$8,108	\$64,684
FL as % Mkt	90%	71%	128%	91%
Administrative Aide				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$49,306	\$8,100	\$12,647	\$70,053
Market	\$51,755	\$11,431	\$9,295	\$72,481
FL as % Mkt	95%	71%	136%	97%
Administrative Assistant II				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$74,308	\$8,100	\$19,060	\$101,468
Market	\$74,243	\$11,431	\$13,334	\$99,008
FL as % Mkt	100%	71%	143%	102%
Clerk III				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$48,578	\$8,100	\$12,460	\$69,138
Market	\$43,107	\$11,431	\$7,742	\$62,280
FL as % Mkt	113%	71%	161%	111%
Code Compliance Officer				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$51,802	\$8,100	\$13,287	\$73,189
Market	\$56,365	\$11,431	\$10,123	\$77,919
FL as % Mkt	92%	71%	131%	94%
Construction Worker II				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$49,306	\$8,100	\$12,647	\$70,053
Market	\$46,505	\$11,431	\$8,352	\$66,288
FL as % Mkt	106%	71%	151%	106%
Customer Service Representative I				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$39,530	\$8,100	\$10,139	\$57,769
Market	\$44,785	\$11,431	\$8,043	\$64,259
FL as % Mkt	88%	71%	126%	90%
Deputy Director				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$129,137	\$8,100	\$33,124	\$170,361
Market	\$133,023	\$11,431	\$23,891	\$168,345
FL as % Mkt	97%	71%	139%	101%

		Employer Co	Employer Total	
Benchmark Title	Base Pay	Weighted Total Health Costs	Total Retirement Benefits	Compensation Costs
Electrician				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$57,200	\$8,100	\$14,672	\$79,972
Market	\$58,819	\$11,431	\$10,564	\$80,813
FL as % Mkt	97%	71%	139%	99%
Event Worker				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$36,005	\$8,100	\$9,235	\$53,340
Market	\$30,483	\$11,431	\$5,475	\$47,388
FL as % Mkt	118%	71%	169%	113%
Heavy Equipment Operator				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$48,235	\$8,100	\$12,372	\$68,707
Market	\$50,878	\$11,431	\$9,138	\$71,446
FL as % Mkt	95%	71%	135%	96%
Municipal Maintenance Worker II				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$39,530	\$8,100	\$10,139	\$57,769
Market	\$41,628	\$11,431	\$7,476	\$60,535
FL as % Mkt	95%	71%	136%	95%
Planner III				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$78,073	\$8,100	\$20,026	\$106,199
Market	\$82,609	\$11,431	\$14,837	\$108,876
FL as % Mkt	95%	71%	135%	98%
Principal Planner				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$89,575	\$8,100	\$22,976	\$120,651
Market	\$92,457	\$11,431	\$16,605	\$120,493
FL as % Mkt	97%	71%	138%	100%
Project Manager II				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$86,154	\$8,100	\$22,099	\$116,353
Market	\$97,142	\$11,431	\$17,447	\$126,019
FL as % Mkt	89%	71%	127%	92%
Secretary I				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$42,526	\$8,100	\$10,908	\$61,534
Market	\$45,152	\$11,431	\$8,109	\$64,692
FL as % Mkt	94%	71%	135%	95%

		Employer Cost of Benefits		Employer Total	
Benchmark Title	Base Pay	Weighted Total Health Costs	Total Retirement Benefits	Compensation Costs	
Senior Accounting Clerk					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$49,306	\$8,100	\$12,647	\$70,053	
Market	\$53,568	\$11,431	\$9,621	\$74,619	
FL as % Mkt	92%	71%	131%	94%	
Senior Project Manager					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$96,481	\$8,100	\$24,747	\$129,328	
Market	\$99,026	\$11,431	\$17,785	\$128,242	
FL as % Mkt	97%	71%	139%	101%	
Service Clerk					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$42,526	\$8,100	\$10,908	\$61,534	
Market	\$43,644	\$11,431	\$7,838	\$62,913	
FL as % Mkt	97%	71%	139%	98%	
Finance Department					
Accountant II					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$76,170	\$8,100	\$19,538	\$103,808	
Market	\$70,661	\$11,431	\$12,691	\$94,782	
FL as % Mkt	108%	71%	154%	110%	
Manager - Procurement & Contracts					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$105,373	\$8,100	\$27,028	\$140,501	
Market	\$108,606	\$11,431	\$19,506	\$139,542	
FL as % Mkt	97%	71%	139%	101%	
Procurement Specialist II					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$74,308	\$8,100	\$19,060	\$101,468	
Market	\$66,260	\$11,431	\$11,900	\$89,591	
FL as % Mkt	112%	71%	160%	113%	
Senior Accountant					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$89,575	\$8,100	\$22,976	\$120,651	
Market	\$81,160	\$11,431	\$14,576	\$107,167	
FL as % Mkt	110%	71%	158%	113%	
Senior Procurement Specialist	40= 557	40.155	400 115	044= 22=	
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$87,391	\$8,100	\$22,416	\$117,907	
Market	\$74,781	\$11,431	\$13,431	\$99,642	
FL as % Mkt	117%	71%	167%	118%	

# MARKET POSITION AT THE 75<sup>TH</sup> PERCENTILE ACROSS ALL BENCHMARKS AND PEER **EMPLOYERS**

		Employer Cost of Benefits		Employer Total
Benchmark Title	Base Pay	Weighted Total Health Costs	Total Retirement Benefits	Compensation Costs
Treasurer				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$102,804	\$8,100	\$26,369	\$137,273
Market	\$113,941	\$11,431	\$20,464	\$145,835
FL as % Mkt	90%	71%	129%	94%
	Fire Departm	ent		
Battalion Chief				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$102,804	\$8,100	\$26,369	\$137,273
Market	\$104,571	\$11,431	\$18,781	\$134,783
FL as % Mkt	98%	71%	140%	102%
Beach Lifeguard				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$43,638	\$8,100	\$11,193	\$62,931
Market	\$48,350	\$11,431	\$8,684	\$68,464
FL as % Mkt	90%	71%	129%	92%
Beach Patrol Lieutenant				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$61,578	\$8,100	\$15,795	\$85,473
Market	\$61,095	\$11,431	\$10,973	\$83,498
FL as % Mkt	101%	71%	144%	102%
Huma	n Resources D	Department		
Claims Adjuster				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$60,882	\$8,100	\$15,616	\$84,598
Market	\$68,693	\$11,431	\$12,337	\$92,461
FL as % Mkt	89%	71%	127%	91%
Human Resources Assistant				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$59,374	\$8,100	\$15,229	\$82,703
Market	\$54,538	\$11,431	\$9,795	\$75,764
FL as % Mkt	109%	71%	155%	109%
Insurance Benefits Specialist				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$54,964	\$8,100	\$14,098	\$77,162
Market	\$59,959	\$11,431	\$10,769	\$82,158
FL as % Mkt	92%	71%	131%	94%
Risk Manager				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$102,804	\$8,100	\$26,369	\$137,273
Market	\$103,250	\$11,431	\$18,544	\$133,224
FL as % Mkt	100%	71%	142%	103%

		Employer Cost of Benefits		Employer Total
Benchmark Title	Base Pay	Weighted Total Health Costs	Total Retirement Benefits	Compensation Costs
Senior Claims Adjuster				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$71,677	\$8,100	\$18,385	\$98,162
Market	\$76,989	\$11,431	\$13,827	\$102,247
FL as % Mkt	93%	71%	133%	96%
Information T	echnology Se	rvices Departme	nt	
Application Developer				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$90,501	\$8,100	\$23,214	\$121,815
Market	\$84,818	\$11,431	\$15,233	\$111,482
FL as % Mkt	107%	71%	152%	109%
Assistant Database Administrator				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$86,154	\$8,100	\$22,099	\$116,353
Market	\$89,891	\$11,431	\$16,144	\$117,466
FL as % Mkt	96%	71%	137%	99%
Computer Operator II				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$48,235	\$8,100	\$12,372	\$68,707
Market	\$60,617	\$11,431	\$10,887	\$82,934
FL as % Mkt	80%	71%	114%	83%
Data Warehouse Analyst				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$90,501	\$8,100	\$23,214	\$121,815
Market	\$88,312	\$11,431	\$15,861	\$115,603
FL as % Mkt	102%	71%	146%	105%
Geographic Information System Analyst				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$75,088	\$8,100	\$19,260	\$102,448
Market	\$74,381	\$11,431	\$13,359	\$99,170
FL as % Mkt	101%	71%	144%	103%
Network Support Analyst				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$82,867	\$8,100	\$21,255	\$112,222
Market	\$86,484	\$11,431	\$15,533	\$113,447
FL as % Mkt	96%	71%	137%	99%
Senior Tech Support Analyst				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$80,818	\$8,100	\$20,730	\$109,648
Market	\$79,863	\$11,431	\$14,343	\$105,637
FL as % Mkt	101%	71%	145%	104%

		Employer Co	st of Benefits			
Benchmark Title	Base Pay	Weighted Total Health Costs	Total Retirement Benefits	Employer Total Compensation Costs		
Systems Administrator						
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$92,747	\$8,100	\$23,790	\$124,637		
Market	\$89,648	\$11,431	\$16,101	\$117,179		
FL as % Mkt	103%	71%	148%	106%		
Technical Support Analyst						
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$71,448	\$8,100	\$18,326	\$97,874		
Market	\$74,814	\$11,431	\$13,437	\$99,681		
FL as % Mkt	96%	71%	136%	98%		
Technology Strategist						
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$78,894	\$8,100	\$20,236	\$107,230		
Market	\$98,733	\$11,431	\$17,732	\$127,896		
FL as % Mkt	80%	71%	114%	84%		
Parks and Recreation Department						
Apprentice Municipal Maintenance Worker						
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$32,406	\$8,100	\$8,312	\$48,818		
Market	\$39,102	\$11,431	\$7,023	\$57,555		
FL as % Mkt	83%	71%	118%	85%		
Community Program Supervisor						
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$75,348	\$8,100	\$19,327	\$102,775		
Market	\$80,378	\$11,431	\$14,436	\$106,244		
FL as % Mkt	94%	71%	134%	97%		
Field Operating Technician (Level IV)						
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$51,802	\$8,100	\$13,287	\$73,189		
Market	\$52,621	\$11,431	\$9,451	\$73,502		
FL as % Mkt	98%	71%	141%	100%		
Head Groundskeeper						
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$48,235	\$8,100	\$12,372	\$68,707		
Market	\$51,273	\$11,431	\$9,209	\$71,912		
FL as % Mkt	94%	71%	134%	96%		
Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Parks/Facilities)						
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$42,526	\$8,100	\$10,908	\$61,534		
Market	\$47,905	\$11,431	\$8,604	\$67,939		
FL as % Mkt	89%	71%	127%	91%		

# MARKET POSITION AT THE 75<sup>TH</sup> PERCENTILE ACROSS ALL BENCHMARKS AND PEER **EMPLOYERS**

		Employer Cost of Benefits		Employer Total	
Benchmark Title	Base Pay	Weighted Total Health Costs	Total Retirement Benefits	Compensation Costs	
Parks Foreman					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$66,331	\$8,100	\$17,014	\$91,445	
Market	\$63,344	\$11,431	\$11,377	\$86,151	
FL as % Mkt	105%	71%	150%	106%	
Pool Equipment Mechanic					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$49,306	\$8,100	\$12,647	\$70,053	
Market	\$45,458	\$11,431	\$8,164	\$65,053	
FL as % Mkt	108%	71%	155%	108%	
Pool Lifeguard I					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$37,638	\$8,100	\$9,654	\$55,392	
Market	\$41,571	\$11,431	\$7,466	\$60,468	
FL as % Mkt	91%	71%	129%	92%	
Recreation Instructor II					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$33,322	\$8,100	\$8,547	\$49,969	
Market	\$40,412	\$11,431	\$7,258	\$59,101	
FL as % Mkt	82%	71%	118%	85%	
Recreation Program Coordinator					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$69,701	\$8,100	\$17,878	\$95,679	
Market	\$61,491	\$11,431	\$11,044	\$83,965	
FL as % Mkt	113%	71%	162%	114%	
Recreation Programmer I					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$42,526	\$8,100	\$10,908	\$61,534	
Market	\$48,924	\$11,431	\$8,787	\$69,141	
FL as % Mkt	87%	71%	124%	89%	
Recreation Worker					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$25,251	\$8,100	\$6,477	\$39,828	
Market	\$33,675	\$11,431	\$6,048	\$51,154	
FL as % Mkt	75%	71%	107%	78%	
- = 30 /3	Police Depart		.5.70	7.070	
Accident Investigator II	- Chioo Dopart				
City of Fort Lauderdale					
Market		Insufficient Data			
FL as % Mkt					
Crime Analyst II	<b>AF4 545</b>	00.400	<b>#</b> 40.001	<b>#70.00</b> 1	
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$54,517	\$8,100	\$13,984	\$76,601	
Market	\$58,919	\$11,431	\$10,582	\$80,931	
FL as % Mkt	93%	71%	132%	95%	

Benchmark Title	Base Pay	Employer Cost of Benefits		Employer Total
		Weighted Total Health Costs	Total Retirement Benefits	Compensation Costs
Police Aide II				
City of Fort Lauderdale				
Market		Insuff	icient Data	
FL as % Mkt				
Police Records Clerk				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$39,530	\$8,100	\$10,139	\$57,769
Market	\$43,571	\$11,431	\$7,825	\$62,827
FL as % Mkt	91%	71%	130%	92%
Public Safety Aide				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$42,526	\$8,100	\$10,908	\$61,534
Market	\$50,552	\$11,431	\$9,079	\$71,062
FL as % Mkt	84%	71%	120%	87%
Senior Police Records Clerk				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$45,916	\$8,100	\$11,777	\$65,793
Market	\$56,107	\$11,431	\$10,077	\$77,614
FL as % Mkt	82%	71%	117%	85%
Public Works	/ Building Sei	vices Departme	nt	
Distribution & Collection Chief				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$66,331	\$8,100	\$17,014	\$91,445
Market	\$70,590	\$11,431	\$12,678	\$94,699
FL as % Mkt	94%	71%	134%	97%
Electro Technician				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$57,200	\$8,100	\$14,672	\$79,972
Market	\$59,381	\$11,431	\$10,665	\$81,476
FL as % Mkt	96%	71%	138%	98%
Engineering Aide II	<b>#</b> 40.333	<b>#0.100</b>	<b>044.100</b>	<b>****</b>
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$43,638	\$8,100	\$11,193	\$62,931
Market	\$52,502	\$11,431	\$9,429	\$73,362
FL as % Mkt	83%	71%	119%	86%
Engineering Technician II	¢60.454	¢0 100	¢15.420	¢02 604
City of Fort Lauderdale  Market	\$60,154 \$60,207	\$8,100 \$11,431	\$15,430 \$10,813	\$83,684 \$82,451
FL as % Mkt	100%	71%	143%	φο2,451 101%
FL do 70 IVIKI	100%	/ 170	145%	101%

# MARKET POSITION AT THE 75<sup>TH</sup> PERCENTILE ACROSS ALL BENCHMARKS AND PEER **EMPLOYERS**

Benchmark Title	Base Pay	Employer Cost of Benefits		Employer Total	
		Weighted Total Health Costs	Total Retirement Benefits	Compensation Costs	
Environmental Lab Technician					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$54,517	\$8,100	\$13,984	\$76,601	
Market	\$57,501	\$11,431	\$10,327	\$79,259	
FL as % Mkt	95%	71%	135%	97%	
Industrial Electrician					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$57,200	\$8,100	\$14,672	\$79,972	
Market	\$58,819	\$11,431	\$10,564	\$80,813	
FL as % Mkt	97%	71%	139%	99%	
Municipal Maintenance Worker III (Public Services)					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$44,689	\$8,100	\$11,463	\$64,252	
Market	\$50,877	\$11,431	\$9,138	\$71,445	
FL as % Mkt	88%	71%	125%	90%	
Public Service Maintenance Chief					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$67,995	\$8,100	\$17,441	\$93,536	
Market	\$70,707	\$11,431	\$12,699	\$94,837	
FL as % Mkt	96%	71%	137%	99%	
Utilities Mechanic I					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$50,523	\$8,100	\$12,959	\$71,582	
Market	\$51,492	\$11,431	\$9,248	\$72,171	
FL as % Mkt	98%	71%	140%	99%	
Utilities Service Worker					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$40,102	\$8,100	\$10,286	\$58,488	
Market	\$45,459	\$11,431	\$8,164	\$65,054	
FL as % Mkt	88%	71%	126%	90%	
Utility Field Representative					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$48,235	\$8,100	\$12,372	\$68,707	
Market	\$48,606	\$11,431	\$8,730	\$68,766	
FL as % Mkt	99%	71%	142%	100%	
Water Treatment Plant Operator II					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$53,165	\$8,100	\$13,637	\$74,902	
Market	\$56,123	\$11,431	\$10,080	\$77,633	
FL as % Mkt	95%	71%	135%	96%	
Sustainable Development Department					
Building Inspector					
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$64,792	\$8,100	\$16,619	\$89,511	
Market	\$78,833	\$11,431	\$14,158	\$104,422	
FL as % Mkt	82%	71%	117%	86%	

# MARKET POSITION AT THE 75<sup>TH</sup> PERCENTILE ACROSS ALL BENCHMARKS AND PEER **EMPLOYERS**

	Base Pay	Employer Cost of Benefits		Employer Total
Benchmark Title		Weighted Total Health Costs	Total Retirement Benefits	Compensation Costs
Chief Building Inspector				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$77,158	\$8,100	\$19,791	\$105,049
Market	\$90,442	\$11,431	\$16,243	\$118,116
FL as % Mkt	85%	71%	122%	89%
Economic and Business Development Manager				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$108,014	\$8,100	\$27,706	\$143,820
Market	\$101,655	\$11,431	\$18,257	\$131,343
FL as % Mkt	106%	71%	152%	109%
Electrical Inspector				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$63,180	\$8,100	\$16,206	\$87,486
Market	\$75,882	\$11,431	\$13,628	\$100,941
FL as % Mkt	83%	71%	119%	87%
Plumbing Inspector				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$63,180	\$8,100	\$16,206	\$87,486
Market	\$76,163	\$11,431	\$13,679	\$101,272
FL as % Mkt	83%	71%	118%	86%
Senior Code Compliance Officer				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$54,517	\$8,100	\$13,984	\$76,601
Market	\$68,438	\$11,431	\$12,291	\$92,160
FL as % Mkt	80%	71%	114%	83%
Structural Plans Examiner				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$71,479	\$8,100	\$18,334	\$97,913
Market	\$86,090	\$11,431	\$15,462	\$112,982
FL as % Mkt	83%	71%	119%	87%
Transporta	tion and Mobi	lity Department		
Airport Operations Aide				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$50,523	\$8,100	\$12,959	\$71,582
Market	\$57,337	\$11,431	\$10,298	\$79,065
FL as % Mkt	88%	71%	126%	91%
Parking Enforcement Shift Coordinator				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$54,517	\$8,100	\$13,984	\$76,601
Market	\$51,560	\$11,431	\$9,260	\$72,251
FL as % Mkt	106%	71%	151%	106%
Parking Enforcement Specialist				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$40,518	\$8,100	\$10,393	\$59,011
Market	\$47,458	\$11,431	\$8,523	\$67,412
FL as % Mkt	85%	71%	122%	88%

#### **TOTAL COMPENSATION - GENERAL EMPLOYEES**

Benchmark Title	Base Pay	Employer Cost of Benefits		Employer Total
		Weighted Total Health Costs	Total Retirement Benefits	Compensation Costs
Parking Meter Technician				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$49,306	\$8,100	\$12,647	\$70,053
Market	\$49,373	\$11,431	\$8,867	\$69,671
FL as % Mkt	100%	71%	143%	101%
Parking Operations Supervisor				
City of Fort Lauderdale	\$63,970	\$8,100	\$16,408	\$88,478
Market	\$54,042	\$11,431	\$9,706	\$75,179
FL as % Mkt	118%	71%	169%	118%
Overall	96%	71%	137%	98%

Figures shown in **red** are below market (less than 95% of the market average)

Figures shown in **black** within the market range (95% to 105% of the market average)

Figures shown in **blue** are above market (more than 105% of the market average)

# **Conclusions**

Our conclusions cover the following areas:

- > Pay Range Competitiveness
- > Total Compensation Competitiveness

#### **Pay Range Competitiveness**

This study found that across the majority of benchmark jobs, the City's pay structure is at the market average at the pay range midpoint and maximum and above market at the pay range minimum.

Overall, at the midpoint of the pay range:

- > The City's overall average pay range midpoint is 96% of the overall market average.
- > 39 benchmark job titles are below market (less than 95% at the midpoint)
- > 34 benchmark job titles are at market (between 95% and 105% at the midpoint)
- > 17 benchmark job titles are above market (above 105% at the midpoint)
- > 2 benchmark job titles did not garner sufficient matches to be statistically significant

# **Total Compensation Competitiveness**

On a total compensation basis (taking into consideration base pay, employer health benefit costs, social security participation and retirement plan contributions) the City's average total compensation costs are:

> 98% of the overall market average

While the City's contributions to health care costs compared to its peer are below the overall market average at 71%, its retirement contributions are at market at 164% of the market average. On a Total Compensation basis, the City is at 103% of the overall market average.