



Loren & Kean Law

August 7, 2018

**(Via FedEx Overnight
and Hand Delivery)**

Jodi S. Hart, Manager
Procurement and Contracts
100 N. Andrews Avenue
Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33301
jhart@fortlauderdale.gov

(Via Email Only)

Ben Sorensen
Vice Mayor/Commissioner
City Hall
100 N. Andrews Avenue
Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33301
BSorensen@fortlauderdale.gov

(Via Email Only)

Robert L. McKinzie, Commissioner
City Hall
100 N. Andrews Avenue
Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33301
RMckinzie@fortlauderdale.gov

(Via Email Only)

Kirk Buffington, Director of Finance
100 N. Andrews Avenue
Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33301
KBuffington@fortlauderdale.gov

(Via Email Only)

Mayor Dean J. Trantalis
City Hall
100 N. Andrews Avenue
Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33301
dtrantalis@fortlauderdale.gov

(Via Email Only)

Heather Moraitis, Commissioner
City Hall
100 N. Andrews Avenue
Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33301
hmoraitis@fortlauderdale.gov

(Via Email Only)

Steven Glassman, Commissioner
City Hall
100 N. Andrews Avenue
Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33301
SGlassman@fortlauderdale.gov

(Via Email Only)

Tanzania Johnson, Team Lead Senior Procurement
Specialist Public Works
100 N. Andrews Avenue
Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33301
tajohnson@fortlauderdale.gov

Re: WEST CONSTRUCTION, INC.'S LETTER OF PROTEST OF AWARD

Bid Number: 12139-983
Solicitation Name: New Fire Station #8 Construction
Protester: West Construction, Inc.

Dear Honorable Mayor, Vice Mayor, City Commissioners, City Manager and Procurement Manager:

This law firm represents West Construction, Inc. ("West") in connection with West's sealed response to the City of Fort Lauderdale, Florida's (the "City") Invitation to Bid No. 12139-

983 (the "Bid") for the New Fire Station No. 8 Construction (the "Project"). This shall serve as West's Letter of Protest of the City's Intent to Award the Project to Burke Construction Group, Inc. ("Burke"). As required by City Ordinance, this Letter is accompanied by a \$5,000.00 fee.¹

Despite the undisputed facts that West was the lowest bidder for the Project and West's bid was responsive to the invitation, City's staff recommended that West be disqualified as "not responsible." The City's staff based its recommendation upon the pretense that there were deficiencies in West's bid submittal, West's references and West's prior projects with the City. The basis of West's protest is the following:

- (1) the City's unsupported and arbitrary finding that West was not a responsible bidder based upon some undisclosed deficiency in West's bid submittal;
- (2) the City's unsupported and arbitrary finding that West was not a responsible bidder based upon some undisclosed responses from West's references;
- (3) the City's unsupported and arbitrary finding that West was not a responsible bidder based upon some undisclosed deficiency in West's previous projects with the City (presumably as punishment for a prior lawsuit between West and the City); and
- (4) the City's actions are arbitrary and capricious, vesting unbridled discretion in the City and violating the competitive bidding requirements in the award of the Project.

I. Governing Law

Florida courts have held that the purpose of the competitive bidding process is as follows:

- (1) To protect the public against collusive contracts;
- (2) To secure fair competition upon equal terms to all bidders;
- (3) To remove not only collusion but temptation for collusion and opportunity for gain at public expense;
- (4) To close all avenues to favoritism and fraud in its various forms;
- (5) To secure the best value for the City at the lowest possible expense; and
- (6) To afford an equal advantage to all desiring to do business with the City by affording an opportunity for an exact comparison of bids.

See Harry Pepper & Associates, Inc. v. City of Cape Coral, 352 So. 2d 1190, 1192 (Fla. 2d DCA 1977) (second lowest bidder in lawsuit sued city for accepting amended bid of winning bidder after bid closing; held that amendment violated purpose competitive bidding).

Florida courts have further held that the award of public contracts must not be arbitrary and capricious:

While a public authority has wide discretion in award of contracts for public works on competitive bids, such discretion must be exercised based upon clearly defined criteria and may not be exercised arbitrarily or capriciously. . . . the United States District Court for the Southern District of Florida defined arbitrary and capricious for substantive due process to include acts

¹ Although West is including full payment as required by City Ordinance, West objects to the exorbitant fee as it violates due process and is designed as a pretext to avoid any legitimate bid protests.

taken with improper motive, without reason or for a reason that is merely pretextual.

See City of Sweetwater v. Solo Construction Corporation, 823 So. 2d 798 (Fla. 3d DCA 2002) (lowest responsible bidder on public project challenged bid award to another bidder; Court held that the city was required to award the bid to the lowest responsible bidder).

II. Statement of Entitlement to Relief

A. The City's Finding That West Was Not A Responsible Bidder Was Arbitrary and Capricious.

West timely submitted its response to the Invitation to Bid ("West's Bid") in full compliance with all Bid requirements. There is no dispute that West's bid was responsive and was the lowest bid.

First, the City, without any support or explanation, determined that West was not responsible because of the City's review of West's bid submittal. But, the City fails to identify any deficiencies in West's bid. What was missing? What was incorrect? Presumably nothing, as any valid deficiency would have likely resulted in the City finding that West's bid was unresponsive. Without any explanation, the bidder and the public are left to guess why the lowest bidder was not awarded the project. Without any disclosed basis by the City, its decision is purely arbitrary.

Second, again without any support or explanation, the City states that its review of West's references was a basis to find that West was not responsible. West identified four references in compliance with the Bid requirements. Upon information and belief, each of these references did or would have (if the City had contacted them) provided favorable recommendations to the City regarding West's work on previous projects. In fact, despite the short turnaround required to submit this Letter of Protest, West was able to contact two of the four references it provided. Specifically, West spoke with Luis Seta (Project Manager, Broward County) who confirmed that he was contacted by the City by phone and provided an excellent reference on West's behalf based upon West's work on the Broward County Public Safety Complex for Buildings 2, 3, 4 and 5. Another reference identified by West, Sean S. Holway, P.E. (Project Manager, AKEA, Inc.) confirmed he was contacted by the City and provided the favorable review of West's work on the AUTC Federal Building – SSA Build Out Project attached as **Exhibit A**. Nevertheless, without any basis and as a pretense to disqualify West, the City arbitrarily found that West was not responsible.²

B. The City's Finding That West Was Not A Responsible Bidder Based Upon Prior Projects Was Merely Pretextual and Meant to Punish West For Disputing The City's Payments On A Prior Project.

² Notably, simultaneous with this protest, West has submitted a public records request seeking any documents that were relied upon or used as a basis for the City's staff's recommendation. Should the City come forward with the basis for any of its findings or should West's public records request reveal relevant information, West reserves the right to supplement this protest to address each individual basis.

The final basis for the City's finding that West was not a responsible bidder was "previous projects with the City." Again, the City provides no explanation, but presumably City staff is referring to a previous award to West for a contract for the South Side School Restoration & Hardy Park Redevelopment – Bid Package 3, Project No. 10777D, located at 701 N. Andrews Avenue, Fort Lauderdale, Florida (the "South Side Project"). After disputes regarding the South Side Project arose, West brought suit in the Circuit Court of the 17th Judicial Circuit in and for Broward County, Florida, Case No. 12-008336(12). Eventually, West recovered a sizeable settlement from the City. West was obviously justified in pursuing monies owed.

The Bid that is the subject of this protest is not the first time that the City has punished West for bringing suit on the South Side Project. In a prior bid, West submitted a sealed response to the City's Invitation to Bid No. 273-11865 for the New Fire Station No. 54 Facility (the "Fire Station 54 Project"). There, the City deemed West's bid unresponsive because West's references were allegedly unverifiable. However, the City failed to even attempt to contact West's references and used this reason as a pretense to disqualify West from the Fire Station 54 Project. The City deemed West's bid protest on the Fire Station 54 Project late. Ironically, the Fire Station 54 Project was also awarded to Burke (the third highest bidder), even though Burke's bid was more than \$40,000 higher than West's bid amount.

Continuing with its arbitrary and capricious conduct of disqualifying West from its projects as a penalty for West's previous good-faith (and ultimately successful) conduct, the City once again has fashioned an excuse to avoid awarding the Project to West. The City's staff's finding that West is not a responsible bidder based upon "previous projects with the City" is patently false, arbitrary and capricious, merely pretextual and violates the competitive bidding requirements in the award of the Project.

III. Relief Sought

In conclusion, West requests that all City action related to the Project must cease immediately because the recommended award to Burke was a violation of the Competitive Bidding Requirements, Florida Statutes and Florida law.

Accordingly, West requests that the City make the following findings and grant the following relief:

1. West is a responsible bidder;
2. Burke was erroneously ranked as the lowest responsive and responsible bidder and cannot be considered for award of the Project;
3. West is the lowest responsive, responsible bidder; and
4. West is entitled to award of the contract for the Project.

Please contact me should you require additional information or documents.

Sincerely yours,



Bruce E. Loren
bloren@lorenkeanlaw.com

Enclosure

Copies to:

(By email only)

Alain E. Boileu, Esq., Interim City Attorney
City Hall
100 N. Andrews Avenue
Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33301
aboileau@fortlauderdale.gov

(By email only)

Lee R. Feldman, City Manager
City Hall
100 N. Andrews Avenue
Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33301
lfeldman@fortlauderdale.gov

THIS DOCUMENT CONTAINS VOID TEXT ON A BLUE BACKGROUND THAT WILL APPEAR WHEN PHOTOCOPIED



Official Check

64-79/611

5300095611

Purchaser West Construction, Inc.

Date

August 07, 2018

Pay FIVE THOUSAND DOLLARS and 00 CENTS

\$5000.00

To the Order of City of Fort Lauderdale

SunTrust Banks, Inc. by an Authorized Agent

SunTrust Bank

Memo

Bid Protest FS-8

Authorized Signature

Payable at SunTrust Bank

⑈5300095611⑈

⑆061100790⑆

7019019996⑈



CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE
RFP EVALUATION COMMITTEE TABULATION - FINAL RANKING

RFP# 12149-885
TITLE: Disaster Debris Removal and Management Services
DATE: 8/9/2018

| Rater #1 - Melissa Doyle | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|--------------------|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|----------------------------------|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|-----------------------------------|---------|----------------|------------------|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------|--|--|
| Firm background, history and overall experience | | | Staff experience and resumes- specifically, operational and administrative personnel assigned to the City | | | Subcontractor Plan | | | Quality control and customer service plans | | | Organizational structure of Firm | | | Current workload and future commitments | | | Plan for managing multiple Florida based contracts | | | Demonstrated financial capability | | | Reference Checks | | | Closed, active and pending FEMA disputes, audits or lawsuits | | | Explanation of unrecovered (de-obligated) FEMA reimbursements | | | Price Proposal - Section A | | | Price Proposal - Section B | | | Price Proposal - Section C | | | | | |
| Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Total Points Awarded | | |
| 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.27 | 3 | 0.81 | 0.015 | 3 | 0.05 | 0.015 | 1 | 0.02 | 1.97 | | |
| 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.27 | 1 | 0.27 | 0.015 | 1 | 0.02 | 0.015 | 3 | 0.05 | 1.48 | | |
| 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.27 | 2 | 0.54 | 0.015 | 2 | 0.03 | 0.015 | 2 | 0.03 | 2.55 | | |

| Rater #2 - Bruce Freud | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|--------------------|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|----------------------------------|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|-----------------------------------|---------|----------------|------------------|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------|--|--|
| Firm background, history and overall experience | | | Staff experience and resumes- specifically, operational and administrative personnel assigned to the City | | | Subcontractor Plan | | | Quality control and customer service plans | | | Organizational structure of Firm | | | Current workload and future commitments | | | Plan for managing multiple Florida based contracts | | | Demonstrated financial capability | | | Reference Checks | | | Closed, active and pending FEMA disputes, audits or lawsuits | | | Explanation of unrecovered (de-obligated) FEMA reimbursements | | | Price Proposal - Section A | | | Price Proposal - Section B | | | Price Proposal - Section C | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Total Points Awarded | | |
| 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.27 | 3 | 0.81 | 0.015 | 3 | 0.05 | 0.015 | 1 | 0.02 | 2.12 | | |
| 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.27 | 1 | 0.27 | 0.015 | 1 | 0.02 | 0.015 | 3 | 0.05 | 1.23 | | |
| 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.27 | 2 | 0.54 | 0.015 | 2 | 0.03 | 0.015 | 2 | 0.03 | 2.65 | | |

| Rater #3 - Jermaine Frazier | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|--------------------|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|----------------------------------|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|-----------------------------------|---------|----------------|------------------|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------|--|--|
| Firm background, history and overall experience | | | Staff experience and resumes- specifically, operational and administrative personnel assigned to the City | | | Subcontractor Plan | | | Quality control and customer service plans | | | Organizational structure of Firm | | | Current workload and future commitments | | | Plan for managing multiple Florida based contracts | | | Demonstrated financial capability | | | Reference Checks | | | Closed, active and pending FEMA disputes, audits or lawsuits | | | Explanation of unrecovered (de-obligated) FEMA reimbursements | | | Price Proposal - Section A | | | Price Proposal - Section B | | | Price Proposal - Section C | | | | | |
| Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Total Points Awarded | | |
| 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.27 | 3 | 0.81 | 0.015 | 3 | 0.05 | 0.015 | 1 | 0.02 | 2.17 | | |
| 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.27 | 1 | 0.27 | 0.015 | 1 | 0.02 | 0.015 | 3 | 0.05 | 1.23 | | |
| 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.27 | 2 | 0.54 | 0.015 | 2 | 0.03 | 0.015 | 2 | 0.03 | 2.60 | | |



CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE
RFP EVALUATION COMMITTEE TABULATION - FINAL RANKING

RFP# 12149-885
TITLE: Disaster Debris Removal and Management Services
DATE: 8/9/2018

| Rater #1 - Melissa Doyle | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|--------------------|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|----------------------------------|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|-----------------------------------|---------|----------------|------------------|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------|--|--|
| Firm background, history and overall experience | | | Staff experience and resumes- specifically, operational and administrative personnel assigned to the City | | | Subcontractor Plan | | | Quality control and customer service plans | | | Organizational structure of Firm | | | Current workload and future commitments | | | Plan for managing multiple Florida based contracts | | | Demonstrated financial capability | | | Reference Checks | | | Closed, active and pending FEMA disputes, audits or lawsuits | | | Explanation of unrecovered (de-obligated) FEMA reimbursements | | | Price Proposal - Section A | | | Price Proposal - Section B | | | Price Proposal - Section C | | | | | |
| Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Total Points Awarded | | |
| 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.27 | 3 | 0.81 | 0.015 | 3 | 0.05 | 0.015 | 1 | 0.02 | 1.97 | | |
| 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.27 | 1 | 0.27 | 0.015 | 1 | 0.02 | 0.015 | 3 | 0.05 | 1.48 | | |
| 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.27 | 2 | 0.54 | 0.015 | 2 | 0.03 | 0.015 | 2 | 0.03 | 2.55 | | |

| Rater #2 - Bruce Freud | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|--------------------|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|----------------------------------|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|-----------------------------------|---------|----------------|------------------|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|
| Firm background, history and overall experience | | | Staff experience and resumes- specifically, operational and administrative personnel assigned to the City | | | Subcontractor Plan | | | Quality control and customer service plans | | | Organizational structure of Firm | | | Current workload and future commitments | | | Plan for managing multiple Florida-based contracts | | | Demonstrated financial capability | | | Reference Checks | | | Closed, active and pending FEMA disputes, audits or lawsuits | | | Explanation of unrecovered (de-obligated) FEMA reimbursements | | | Price Proposal - Section A | | | Price Proposal - Section B | | | Price Proposal - Section C | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal |

| Rater #3 - Jermaine Frazier | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|--------------------|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|----------------------------------|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|-----------------------------------|---------|----------------|------------------|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|--------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------|--|--|
| Firm background, history and overall experience | | | Staff experience and resumes- specifically, operational and administrative personnel assigned to the City | | | Subcontractor Plan | | | Quality control and customer service plans | | | Organizational structure of Firm | | | Current workload and future commitments | | | Plan for managing multiple Florida based contracts | | | Demonstrated financial capability | | | Reference Checks | | | Closed, active and pending FEMA disputes, audits or lawsuits | | | Explanation of unrecovered (de-obligated) FEMA reimbursements | | | Price Proposal Section A | | | Price Proposal - Section B | | | Price Proposal - Section C | | | | | |
| Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Total Points Awarded | | |
| 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.27 | 3 | 0.81 | 0.015 | 3 | 0.05 | 0.015 | 1 | 0.02 | 2.17 | | |
| 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.27 | 1 | 0.27 | 0.015 | 1 | 0.02 | 0.015 | 3 | 0.05 | 1.23 | | |
| 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.27 | 2 | 0.54 | 0.015 | 2 | 0.03 | 0.015 | 2 | 0.03 | 2.60 | | |



CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE
RFP EVALUATION COMMITTEE TABULATION - FINAL RANKING

RFP# 12149-885
TITLE: Disaster Debris Removal and Management Services
DATE: 8/9/2018

| Rater #1 - Melissa Doyle | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|--------------------|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|----------------------------------|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|-----------------------------------|---------|----------------|------------------|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|------|------|--|
| Firm background, history and overall experience | | | Staff experience and resumes specifically, operational and administrative personnel assigned to the City | | | Subcontractor Plan | | | Quality control and customer service plans | | | Organizational structure of Firm | | | Current workload and future commitments | | | Plan for managing multiple Florida based contracts | | | Demonstrated financial capability | | | Reference Checks | | | Closed, active and pending FEMA disputes, audits or lawsuits | | | Explanation of unrecovered (de-obligated) FEMA reimbursements | | | Price Proposal - Section A | | | Price Proposal - Section B | | | Price Proposal - Section C | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | | | |
| 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.10 | 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 1.97 | |
| 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.02 | 0.15 | 3 | 0.05 | 1.48 | | |
| 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.27 | 2 | 0.54 | 0.015 | 2 | 0.03 | 0.015 | 2 | 0.03 | 2.55 | | |

| Rater #2 - Bruce Freud | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|--------------------|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|----------------------------------|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|-----------------------------------|---------|----------------|------------------|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|--------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------|---|------|
| Firm background, history and overall experience | | | Staff experience and resumes specifically, operational and administrative personnel assigned to the City | | | Subcontractor Plan | | | Quality control and customer service plans | | | Organizational structure of Firm | | | Current workload and future commitments | | | Plan for managing multiple Florida based contracts | | | Demonstrated financial capability | | | Reference Checks | | | Closed, active and pending FEMA disputes, audits or lawsuits | | | Explanation of unrecovered (de-obligated) FEMA reimbursements | | | Price Proposal Section A | | | Price Proposal - Section B | | | Price Proposal - Section C | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Total Points Awarded | | |
| 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 2.12 |
| 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 1.23 |
| 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 2.65 |

| Rater #3 - Jermaine Frazier | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|--------------------|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|----------------------------------|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|-----------------------------------|---------|----------------|------------------|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------|--|--|
| Firm background, history and overall experience | | | Staff experience and resumes specifically, operational and administrative personnel assigned to the City | | | Subcontractor Plan | | | Quality control and customer service plans | | | Organizational structure of Firm | | | Current workload and future commitments | | | Plan for managing multiple Florida-based contracts | | | Demonstrated financial capability | | | Reference Checks | | | Closed, active and pending FEMA disputes, audits or lawsuits | | | Explanation of unrecovered (de-obligated) FEMA reimbursements | | | Price Proposal - Section A | | | Price Proposal - Section B | | | Price Proposal - Section C | | | Total Points Awarded | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | | | |
| 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.27 | 3 | 0.81 | 0.015 | 3 | 0.05 | 0.015 | 1 | 0.02 | 2.17 | | |
| 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.27 | 1 | 0.27 | 0.015 | 1 | 0.02 | 0.015 | 3 | 0.05 | 1.23 | | |
| 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.27 | 2 | 0.54 | 0.015 | 2 | 0.03 | 0.015 | 2 | 0.03 | 2.60 | | |



CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE
RFP EVALUATION COMMITTEE TABULATION - FINAL RANKING

RFP# 12149-885
TITLE: Disaster Debris Removal and Management Services
DATE: 8/9/2018

| Rater #1 - Melissa Doyle | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|--------------------|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|----------------------------------|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|-----------------------------------|---------|----------------|------------------|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---|------|------|--|--|
| Firm background, history and overall experience | | | Staff experience and resumes- specifically, operational and administrative personnel assigned to the City | | | Subcontractor Plan | | | Quality control and customer service plans | | | Organizational structure of Firm | | | Current workload and future commitments | | | Plan for managing multiple Florida based contracts | | | Demonstrated financial capability | | | Reference Checks | | | Closed, active and pending FEMA disputes, audits or lawsuits | | | Explanation of unrecovered (de-obligated) FEMA reimbursements | | | Price Proposal - Section A | | | Price Proposal - Section B | | | Price Proposal - Section C | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Total Points Awarded | | | | | |
| 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.27 | 3 | 0.81 | 0.015 | 3 | 0.05 | 0.015 | 1 | 0.02 | 1.97 | | |
| 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.27 | 1 | 0.27 | 0.015 | 1 | 0.02 | 0.015 | 3 | 0.05 | 1.48 | | |
| 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.27 | 2 | 0.54 | 0.015 | 2 | 0.03 | 0.015 | 2 | 0.03 | 2.55 | | |

| Rater #2 - Bruce Freud | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|--------------------|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|----------------------------------|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|-----------------------------------|---------|----------------|------------------|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---|------|----------------------|------|
| Firm background, history and overall experience | | | Staff experience and resumes- specifically, operational and administrative personnel assigned to the City | | | Subcontractor Plan | | | Quality control and customer service plans | | | Organizational structure of Firm | | | Current workload and future commitments | | | Plan for managing multiple Florida based contracts | | | Demonstrated financial capability | | | Reference Checks | | | Closed, active and pending FEMA disputes, audits or lawsuits | | | Explanation of unrecovered (de-obligated) FEMA reimbursements | | | Price Proposal - Section A | | | Price Proposal - Section B | | | Price Proposal - Section C | | | Total Points Awarded | |
| Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | | | | | |
| 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.27 | 3 | 0.81 | 0.015 | 3 | 0.05 | 0.015 | 1 | 0.02 | | 2.12 |
| 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.27 | 1 | 0.27 | 0.015 | 1 | 0.02 | 0.015 | 3 | 0.05 | | 1.23 |
| 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.27 | 2 | 0.54 | 0.015 | 2 | 0.03 | 0.015 | 2 | 0.03 | 2.65 | |

| Rater #3 - Jermaine Frazier | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|--------------------|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|----------------------------------|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|-----------------------------------|---------|----------------|------------------|---------|----------------|--|---------|----------------|---|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------------|-------------------|---------------|------|------|---|--|
| Firm background, history and overall experience | | | Staff experience and resumes- specifically, operational and administrative personnel assigned to the City | | | Subcontractor Plan | | | Quality control and customer service plans | | | Organizational structure of Firm | | | Current workload and future commitments | | | Plan for managing multiple Florida-based contracts | | | Demonstrated financial capability | | | Reference Checks | | | Closed, active and pending FEMA disputes, audits or lawsuits | | | Explanation of unrecovered (de-obligated) FEMA reimbursements | | | Price Proposal - Section A | | | Price Proposal - Section B | | | Price Proposal - Section C | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Total Points Awarded | Total Combined Points Awarded | Average Points Awarded | Total Final Score | FINAL RANKING | | | | |
| 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.10 | 2 | 0.20 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.27 | 3 | 0.81 | 0.015 | 3 | 0.05 | 0.015 | 1 | 0.02 | 2.17 | 6.26 | 2.09 | 2.09 | 2 | |
| 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.10 | 1 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.10 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.27 | 1 | 0.27 | 0.015 | 1 | 0.02 | 0.015 | 3 | 0.05 | 1.23 | 3.94 | 1.31 | 1.31 | 1 | |
| 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.10 | 3 | 0.30 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 1 | 0.05 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.05 | 3 | 0.15 | 0.27 | 2 | 0.54 | 0.015 | 2 | 0.03 | 0.015 | 2 | 0.03 | 2.60 | 7.80 | 2.60 | 2.60 | 3 | |

