# **City of Fort Lauderdale**

City Hall 100 North Andrews Avenue Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301 www.fortlauderdale.gov



## **Meeting Minutes**

Thursday, June 29, 2017

6:30 PM

Joint Workshop with Budget Advisory Board

**City Commission Conference Room** 

## **CITY COMMISSION WORKSHOP**

FORT LAUDERDALE CITY COMMISSION

JOHN P. "JACK" SEILER Mayor - Commissioner BRUCE G. ROBERTS Vice Mayor - Commissioner - District I DEAN J. TRANTALIS - Commissioner - District II ROBERT L. MCKINZIE - Commissioner - District III ROMNEY ROGERS - Commissioner - District IV

> LEE R. FELDMAN, City Manager JOHN HERBST, City Auditor JEFFREY A. MODARELLI, City Clerk CYNTHIA A. EVERETT, City Attorney

## **ROLL CALL**

**Present 5** - Vice Mayor Bruce G. Roberts, Commissioner Dean J. Trantalis, Commissioner Robert L. McKinzie, and Romney Rogers

Excused: Mayor John P. "Jack" Seiler

## QUORUM ESTABLISHED

**Budget Advisory Board Members Present:** Chair June Page, Vice Chair Drew Saito, Josias N. Dewey, Gregg McKee, Frederick H. Nesbitt, and David Orshefsky

Not Present: James McMullen, Johnnie Smith

**Also Present:** City Manager Lee R. Feldman, City Auditor John Herbst, City Clerk Jeffrey A. Modarelli, City Attorney Cynthia A. Everett

## No e-comments were submitted for this meeting.

## CALL TO ORDER

Vice Mayor Roberts called the meeting to order at 6:33 p.m.

## **BUSINESS UPDATES**

Chair June Page introduced Gregg McKee, newest member of the Budget Advisory Board. Mr. McKee, a former member of the Audit Advisory Board, replaces Bob Oelke for the remainder of Mr. Oelke's term. Mr. Oelke was replaced due to his relocation out of Fort Lauderdale.

<u>17-0115</u> Presented by June Page, Budget Advisory Board Chair

Chair June Page gave the following update of the Budget Advisory Board's (BAB) efforts since the last Joint Workshop with the Commission. Key topics the BAB has reviewed and discussed since the recent workshop include:

- The Fire Assessment methodology
- The City's methodology and policy for ROI, and the associated charges by fund
- The City's Pension Funds and the related discussions from the Commission Pension Board Workshop
- Pension Fund Actuarial Reports

- Parks and Recreation Master Plan
- Sustainable Development Building Permits Update
- Sanitation Rate Study
- Storm Water Rate Study
- Canal Dredging Special Assessment
- Departmental Budget Reviews

Since the last Joint Workshop, the BAB sent the Commission two motions:

The BAB recommended the Commission institute the canal dredging special assessment program without a required minimum reserve, passing 4 to 1. Ms. Page confirmed the issue of canal dredging is off the table.

The BAB sent the Commission a motion about Commission compensation recommending the Mayor's salary be increased to \$50,000, and the Commissioner's salaries increased to \$45,000 annually. The BAB also recommended that the BAB review the salaries every three years to make recommendations regarding adjustments. In a voice vote, the BAB passed the motion.

Over the past four weeks, the BAB met with all Departments to review their top 5 budget requests for fiscal 2018. The BAB's overall observations are listed below, followed by a consensus opinion on the department's top five requests:

General Observations:

There were 84 new Full Time Employee (FTE) positions requested for fiscal year 2018. Although the bulk of the FTEs will not be approved by the City Manager and the Commission, the BAB looks upon this as a negative, upward trend in the expansion of the overall annual FTE count.

Following the 2009 recession, the City went through a costly early retirement buyout program to "right size" personnel levels. These requests indicate a trend backwards and upwards for FTEs. As a result of the early retirement program, many departments were reorganized with services centralized. The BAB urged and supported these changes to encourage smaller government. The current trend for additional FTEs is edging toward decentralization. This year there were multiple requests from individual departments to duplicate existing positions.

The BAB is generally not in favor of drifting toward decentralization

and bigger city government and is generally not in agreement with the addition of more staff, especially support staff, unless a clearly identified need is demonstrated in existing programs. Additionally, there are existing cell phone applications that can be used.

In response to Commissioner Rogers's inquiry, Chair Page gave the example of the existing Public Information Office (PIO) and the Transportation and Mobility Department (TAM) requesting a Public Information Specialist for traffic advisories and warnings. The BAB suggested the existing PIO should be able to address this need.

The BAB continues to recommend contracting out services to the extent appropriate. The BAB recommends upgrading to new technologies to streamline operations, reducing personnel needs through efficiencies and attrition.

Commissioner Trantalis commented on the 13 FTE hiring requests for public safety. Chair Page confirmed that BAB is in support of that request. Further discussions continued on the remaining FTE requests. Commissioner Trantalis asked if there was an analysis of the FTE requests replacing services currently contracted out. Chair Page confirmed 12 positions were for the growth maintenance programs, confirming the BAB always asks if the service can be contracted out and expounded on this point. Further discussions continued on this topic.

City Manager Feldman commented that out of the 84 FTE's requests, his recommendation was 57, including the 10 paramedics, 3 paramedic firefighters, 3 new police officers and civilians in the Police Department for administrative duties. City Manager Feldman expounded on the analysis of FTE requests from other departments, the decision to contract out services, and 7 net new positions for road maintenance crews.

City Manager Feldman stated the 84 requested FTE's represented all departmental requests. What is funded in the proposed FY 2018 budget is less, citing examples such as the Fire Department. He confirmed he does not censor departmental FTE requests prior to presenting the requests to the BAB.

Board Member David Orshefsky discussed additional staff, explaining is it a result of additional or heightened governmental services based on requests from the Commission, i.e., Code Enforcement and associated back-office Staff. Mr. Orshefsky clarified new technology capabilities also require support staff towards the goal of providing additional and improved services requested by the Commission. Commissioner Rogers commented on the FTE requests being a two percent increase and on the BAB's recommendation for contracted out services. Chair Page gave an example of the Finance Department requesting a person to assist in collections that could be contracted out at no cost. Commissioner Rogers commented on the need for road crews to address pot holes, stating it is money well spent.

In response to Vice Mayor Roberts's question, Chair Page confirmed the BAB has reviewed the FTE requests, noting their concerns over the increasing trend and number of annual requests. Vice Mayor Roberts asked City Manager Feldman for a comparison of current FTE requests compared to years prior to the recession.

The BAB considers it imperative to invest in technological infrastructure that will better support public safety, streamline operations, improve services and response times for citizens, and improve efficiency through automation. This will allow the City to operate at an optimal, cost-effective level.

### Major Priorities of the BAB

The Budget Advisory Board's major priorities for fiscal year 2018 departmental budget requests include:

The budget should include more appropriations for the repair and maintenance of infrastructure for the Parks & Recreation Department, including buildings, facilities, fields, etc. City Manager Feldman is to fund an additional \$500,000 above the department's \$500,000 request. The BAB feels this amount is insufficient to address essential repairs. In response to Commissioner Rogers's question, Chair Page confirmed the BAB reviewed the Parks and Recreation Master Plan in addition to City Hall and the Police Department. Mr. Orshefsky commented this was well documented in the CBRE report. Further discussions continued on this topic.

Vice Mayor Roberts confirmed facility aspects are part of the Infrastructure Task Force (ITF), confirming the BAB and the ITF will be working together. City Manager Feldman confirmed all revenue stream numbers are yet to be determined and will be forthcoming, i.e., Property Appraisal Values, final Communication Service Tax from the state. He noted there will be variances after which dollar allocations will be determined. City Manager Feldman also discussed the process moving forward regarding the tax rate and the final budget to be presented to the Commission in August. Vice Mayor Roberts confirmed there will be an additional Joint Workshop with the BAB at the end of August. The BAB endorses full funding for the Police Department's Body Camera Pilot Program and should be a high priority. The BAB also endorses the purchasing more dogs and horses to support K-9 and mounted patrol units. To keep these divisions functional, aging animals need to be replaced in addition to repair and maintenance to support humane housing. Chair Page commented on the thorough presentation given on Body Camera Pilot Program. Chief Maglione commented on the request for increased mounted patrols and related issues. The BAB endorses funding for 10 additional Fire/Rescue personnel and is considered vital.

The BAB is strongly in favor of funding the Road Maintenance and Repair Program as necessary to substantially improve road maintenance.

The BAB considers it imperative to invest in the technological infrastructure that will better support public safety, streamline operations, improve service and response times for citizens and improving efficiency through automation. This will allow operations at an optimal and cost-effective level. Chair Page stated the City's technology is lagging. Commissioner Trantalis and City Manager Feldman commented on the large capital investments in software for the Department of Sustainable Development and Financial Systems.

Chair Page commented many departments requested new technology. In response to Commissioner Rogers's question about the BAB's agreement with the Parks and Recreation Department, Chair Page confirmed they were four programs for citizens and the community including Light-Up Sistrunk and Huizenga Park. Further comments ensued on this topic.

#### Priorities by Department

#### Fire Department

The BAB supports adding a third person to the two downtown fire stations. Those stations are to be identified by City Manager Feldman. The BAB agrees that the assignment of 10 extra personnel to emergency vehicles in the downtown area has proven successful. There is a sufficient track record of data-driven outcomes to back up this request for faster response times.

## Police Department

The BAB is in support of all of this year's requests from the Police Department, noting they asked for very little. The BAB is particularly impressed by the development and design of the Police Body Camera Pilot Program. It could also serve as a model for similar pilot programs in other departments.

#### **Finance**

The BAB is in favor of adding an Accountant II and the purchase of the LaserFiche software program. Though not requested, the BAB would recommend additional funding for improved software and an appropriate level of hardware to automate utility billing and services.

#### Sustainable Development

Generally, the BAB is in favor of additional support staff for Code Enforcement. Regarding vacation rental compliance, the BAB believes the City should follow a phased approach to hiring. It might be more prudent for the department to use overtime. The estimated number of vacation rentals is far different than registered rentals. The registered number should drive Code Enforcement hiring, adding personnel only when a need is demonstrated. Vice Mayor Roberts and Commissioner Trantalis commented on understaffing for this issue and the need for more compliance. Vice Chair Drew Saito commented on the lack of certainty on the number of vacation rentals, its impact on staffing and the need to be cautious.

City Manager Feldman discussed increased staffing of Code Enforcement Officers rather than back office support personnel who process Code Violations. Commissioner Trantalis commented on Code Enforcement's latitude. Mr. Orshefsky commented on the BAB's consensus in support of Code Enforcement in all areas and the need for hard numbers to support staffing in terms of vacation rentals. Further comments and discussions ensued on vacation rentals, including efforts to identify non-registered vacation rental properties and subsequent consequences. City Manager Feldman commented on the Nighttime Economy Group the BAB has not yet seen, confirming their ability and tools to address vacation rental party homes.

Board Member Frederick Nesbitt commented on previous large budget requests for staffing due to the increased number of vacation rentals, red light cameras projected income, and the Fire Department's non-emergency transports.

The BAB is in favor of purchasing new vehicles for Urban Design and Planning employees. The BAB is in support of the request to obtain the new technologies to improve efficiencies and speed up processing.

#### Parks and Recreation

The BAB is generally in favor funding all 4 programs requested by Parks and Recreation.

#### Human Resources

The BAB recommends the purchase of the additional testing materials needed by the Police and Fire Departments to evaluate potential hires.

### Public Works

The BAB supports the department's request to add 12 FTEs to establish a Road Maintenance Crew. The BAB believes this initiative will substantially improve the timing and quality of road maintenance.

## Information Technology

The BAB had difficulty this year evaluating the necessity of adding new FTEs for the Information Technology (IT) Department. Likewise, the BAB also had difficulty evaluating the new programs proposed for the IT Department. The BAB is supportive of the purchase of MDM software in support of public safety.

## Transportation and Mobility (TAM)

The BAB supports the Commission's new focus on moving cars safely through the City. The BAB is concerned that the City's investments in the area of transportation may not be best targeted towards the City. What has been done was not measured/monitored in a transparent way. TAM Department's budget requests have not included adequate supportive information to recommend budget requests, though requested by the Commission. Chair Page requested metrics for the requests.

The \$617,000 request to increase safety for the implementation of Vision Zero also concerns the BAB, as they have not seen good data regarding when and where fatalities occur. The BAB has not seen evidence that any of the current or proposed programs will directly reduce injuries and fatalities.

Vice Chair Saito stated a section in each departmental budget modification request seeks information about expected results, confirming the BAB is looking for deliverables. The BAB would like to see this information in all budget requests. Mr. Nesbitt commented this information allows the BAB to evaluate, measure and follow-up on budget requests to determine their efficiency. Mr. Orshefsky confirmed he had the same concern with metrics. Though supporting Vision Zero, the City is just now purchasing equipment to support data gathering to review historical data and provide the BAB with metrics. Commissioner Rogers commented on the need for a TAM Marketing Specialist as it relates to Vision Zero and coordinating with Metropolitan Planning Organization (MPO), Broward County, and County traffic light signalization. This position lends itself to being separate from the group, citing examples and noting they must be specialized.

In response to Commissioner Trantalis's inquiry, City Manager Feldman explained the allocation of the \$617,000 funding request, included implementing Mobility Plan improvements and data gathering devices. Commissioner McKinzie commented on the need for TAM to narrow their focus and the possibility of decentralizing to achieve this goal. Chair Page stated TAM would benefit from a TAM Master Plan as a result of large requests for funds.

It would also be prudent to request a Master Plan from other departments requesting large amounts of funding to focus and function efficiently. Vice Mayor Roberts concurred noting the need to jointly address traffic flow and traffic calming. He confirmed the opportunity for TAM to fine-tune their product, establish metrics and present to the BAB prior to the August 2017 Joint Commission Workshop with the BAB. Further comments and discussions continued on this topic, citing safety measures and examples. Commissioner Rogers commented on the heavy workload within TAM and the need to possibly reexamine this area. Vice Mayor Roberts concurred, noting the inability to describe the goal.

Vice Chair Saito commented on the overarching theme during the TAM departmental review, including where the City is year to date on pedestrian fatalities and the required backup data. He discussed the need for quick measurables that can be done currently to lower that number. Commissioner Rogers concurred commenting on the lengthy implementation time. Vice Mayor Roberts noted the importance of getting the County, League of Cities, and commuters to the City from surrounding cities on board with Vision Zero. Mr. Orshefsky stated a large portion of the TAM budget request for hard costs for neighborhood mobility plans. Vice Chair Saito commented that a large portion is for engineering.

The BAB has concerns about adding 5 additional FTEs to facilitate initiatives moving both cars and people. Those initiatives might have worked in other cities. However, no evidence was presented that these initiatives would successful in cities with demographics and geography similar to Fort Lauderdale. In that regard, the BAB would like to see data applicable to cities with geography and demographics similar to Fort Lauderdale regarding the impact of traffic calming on traffic backups, road rage, shifting of traffic to other streets, and its direct impact on injuries and deaths.

The BAB is not in support of adding the requested Pubic Information Specialist position at this time. Similar less costly off the shelf applications are available. As previously mentioned, the BAB believes the current PIO under City Manager Feldman should be able to handle traffic updates and alerts.

In line with the above comments, the BAB recommends development of a goal-oriented TAM Master Plan, including measurable outcomes that directly benefit citizens along with possible pilot programs, prior to requesting the commitment of such large sums for processes that may or may not work. While the BAB has singled out TAM as the department most in need of such a plan, the BAB believes other departments with large requests would also benefit from a Master Plan.

City Manager Feldman acknowledged there is more work to do prior to presenting the budget to the BAB, requesting the ability to work on the TAM budget. Vice Chair Saito confirmed the BAB's meetings with departments flowed significantly better this year. Vice Chair Saito confirmed the importance of back-up data and metrics to evaluate and justify budget requests.

Mr. Orshefsky commented on the broader perspective gained from working with the Infrastructure Task Force (ITF). He confirmed alternative funding sources for infrastructure have been discussed, i.e., ad valorem taxes and general obligation bonds. He confirmed receipt of a recent significant presentation for ITF funding sources. The ITF now has an understanding of the various funding tools available. He commented on his concerns about the City's ability to respond to potential water and sewer emergencies, cautioning on the possibility of a series of emergencies. He noted all potential funding sources have flaws. This could result in the City not having enough funding to respond to multiple potential emergency situations and infrastructure needs.

Budget Advisory Board Member Josias Dewey arrived at 7:27 p.m.

Commissioner Trantalis confirmed the importance of being proactive, stating this subject is in need of attention and discussion. Vice Mayor Roberts commented on reserves and the capacity for possible critical repair issues. He recommended an established methodology moving forward. Commissioner Trantalis stated those are non-budget related items, commenting on a general obligation bond to fund infrastructure, similar to Waterworks 2011. Commissioner Trantalis confirmed the BAB's work regarding funding methodologies for infrastructure, commenting on the need to fast forward infrastructure issues rather than just addressing emergency repairs. He noted the need to identify all aspects of infrastructure needs, i.e., replacement and smart repairs in addition to identifying costs and determining a funding mechanism.

City Manager Feldman thanked the BAB for their work and assistance. Vice Mayor Roberts and Commissioner Rogers concurred, acknowledging and thanking all members of the BAB.

## BUDGET ADVISORY BOARD COMMUNICATION TO CITY COMMISSION

<u>17-0653</u>

- Motion I Canal Dredging Special Assessment Program
- Motion II Canal Dredging Special Assessment Program without Minimum Reserve
- Motion III City Commission Compensation

June 22, 2017

Honorable Mayor and City Commissioners City of Fort Lauderdale 100 N. Andrews Avenue Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301

Dear Honorable Mayor and City Commissioners:

During the regularly scheduled Budget Advisory Board (BAB) meetings on April 18, 2017 and June 21, 2017, the Board passed three (3) motions related to the Canal Dredging Special Assessment Program and the City Commission Compensation.

Motion I. Canal Dredging Special Assessment Program The Board recommends that the City Commission consider that the City establish a canal dredging special assessment program to be established and collected through the special assessment mechanism and collected by the Property Appraiser's Office. In a voice vote, the motion passed 4-1.

This motion was noted in BAB Chair June Page's Business Update.

Motion II. Canal Dredging Special Assessment Program without Minimum Reserve The Board recommends that the City Commission to institute the canal dredging special assessment program without a required minimum reserve. In a voice vote, the motion passed 4-1. This motion was noted in BAB Chair June Page's Business Update.

Motion III. City Commission Compensation The Board recommends to the City commission that the salary of the Mayor be increased from \$35,000 to \$50,000, the salary of the Commissioners be increased from \$30,000 to \$45,000, and that the Budget Advisory Board review the salaries every three years and make recommendations for adjustments to the City Commission. In a voice vote, the motion passed.

This motion was noted in BAB Chair June Page's Business Update.

Thank you for the continued opportunity to serve in this capacity. Please contact me directly should you have any questions or comments.

Sincerely,

June D. Page, Chair Budget Advisory Board

C: Lee Feldman, City Manager Stanley D. Hawthorne, Assistant City Manager Jeffrey Modarelli, City Clerk Laura Reece, Budget Manager Budget Advisory Board

Board Member Josias N. Dewey arrived at 7:27 p.m.

## OLD BUSINESS

None.

## ADJOURNMENT

Vice Mayor Roberts adjourned the meeting at 7:45 p.m.