



- TO: Honorable Mayor & Members of the Fort Lauderdale City Commission
- **FROM**: Chris Lagerbloom, ICMA-CM, City Manager
- **DATE**: January 18, 2022
- TITLE:Public Hearing Quasi-Judicial Resolution Approving Historic Landmark
Designation of the Property Commonly Known as the "New River Castle,"
Located at 625 SW 5th Place, Fort Lauderdale, Florida Historic
Preservation Board Case No. UDP-HPD21001 (Commission District 4)

Recommendation

Staff recommends the City Commission consider adopting a resolution approving the historic designation of the property known as "New River Castle" located at 625 SW 5th Place as a Historic Landmark in accordance with Section 47-24.11.C.7. of the Unified Land Development Regulations (ULDR).

Background

On December 7, 2021, the City Commission made a motion to defer the item to the January 18, 2022 meeting to allow for additional time to determine options for designation and future new development of the New River Castle with the property owner and the applicant. The Commission also asked the property owner to confirm whether the exterior material is coral rock and to provide an expert opinion concerning feasibility to relocate the structure. Due to the expiration of the interim protective measures to protect the structure during the designation process, the property owner agreed that there will be no changes to or demolition of the existing structure during this deferral period. Public comment was heard, and the public hearing portion of this item was closed at the December 7, 2021 meeting.

On August 27, 2021, the Department of Sustainable Development received a complete application for historic landmark designation of 625 SW 5th Place from the Broward Trust for Historic Preservation. In accordance with ULDR Section 47-27.7.A.2 a notice was mailed to the owner of the property located at 625 SW 5th Place, which is the subject of an application for designation, with an outline of the interim protective measures placed on the subject property.

On October 4, 2021, the Historic Preservation Board (HPB) reviewed the application and recommended, by a vote of 4-2, that the City Commission approve the request for historical designation as a historic landmark with the condition that the designation apply only to the building, and not the site.

The HPB considered the staff report prepared by Trisha Logan (Historic Preservation Planner and HPB Liaison), the historic designation application and report, prepared by Michaela Conca, President of the Broward Trust for Historic Preservation, and public comment.

Staff and the applicant concluded that the New River Castle meets Criterion (a) and Criterion (f) of ULDR Section 47-24.11.C.7 for historic designation as a historic landmark, which state as follows:

- a. Its value as a significant reminder of the cultural or archeological heritage of the city, state, or nation; and
- f. Its distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style valuable for the study of a period, method of construction, or use of indigenous materials.

Additionally, staff concluded that criteria consideration identified in ULDR Section 47-24.11.C.8.g has also been met, and states as follows: "a property achieving significance within the past 50 years if it is of exceptional importance..." Criteria considerations are used in addition to the criteria found within ULDR Section 47-24.11.C.7, when applicable.

In this case, the criteria consideration is applied due to a later alteration to the exterior of the structure to install the sawed coral and coral rubble that is visible today. Due to the high level of craftsmanship using locally sourced materials applied in a way that is unique to this building, it is found that this structure possesses exceptional importance and the alterations that have occurred to the original structure have become significant in their own right.

Within the historic designation application, the Period of Significance identified was 1890 to 1928. Due to alterations that have occurred at the site and the presumed date of construction, a more appropriate Period of Significance for this structure would be from 1927 to 1974.

Additional information concerning the history and significance of the building may be found within the staff report, provided as Exhibit 1, the historic designation application, provided as Exhibit 2, the historic designation report, provided as Exhibit 3, and a presentation from the applicant, provided as Exhibit 4.

The owner's representative, Greg McAloon, of Tripp Scott provided information to the HPB. Mr. McAloon provided the HPB members with additional materials concerning ownership and tenancy of the property and gave a presentation as an overview of these items. Documents from the owner's representative are provided as Exhibit 5.

The HPB concluded that the property met Section 47-24.11.C.7.a. and Section 47-24.11.C.8.g. of the ULDR and voted to recommend that the City Commission approve the request for historic designation as a historic landmark with the condition that the

designation apply only to the building, and not the property. Draft minutes of the October 4, 2021, HPB meeting are provided as Exhibit 6.

Although the HPB recommended that only the building be designated, and not the surrounding property, protection of its setting and historic context should be considered. As per Section 47-24.11.C.9 of the ULDR, it states that "unless otherwise specified by the approving body, each designation of a landmark shall automatically include the designation of the site upon which the landmark exists as a landmark site." If only the building were to be designated, pursuant to Objective 1.2, Policy 1.2.3b of the Historic Preservation Element of the Comprehensive Plan, all proposed impacts to the designated landmark would require for review and comment by the HPB.

Designation Process

In accordance with ULDR Section 47-24.11.C.7, the criteria for the designation of property as a landmark, landmark site, or historic district shall be based on one (1) or more of the criteria and evaluated in conjunction with guidance provided within the National Register Bulletin series published by the National Park Service.

In this case, the applicant and staff identified that the property located at 625 SW 5th Place is eligible for historic designation under Criterion (a) and Criterion (f) of ULDR Section 47-24.11.C.7. Additionally, staff found that the property also meets Criterion Consideration (g) of ULDR Section 47-24.11.C.8.

Resource Impact

There is no fiscal impact associated with this action.

Strategic Connections

This item supports the *Press Play Fort Lauderdale 2024* Strategic Plan, specifically advancing:

- The Neighborhood Enhancement Focus Area
- Goal 4: Build a thriving and inclusive community of neighborhoods.

This item advances the Fast Forward Fort Lauderdale 2035 Vision Plan: We Are Here.

This item supports the *Advance Fort Lauderdale 2040 Comprehensive Plan* specifically advancing:

- The Neighborhood Enhancement Focus Area
- The Historic Preservation Element
- Goal 3: Ensure historic preservation goals are met through the coordination and implementation of various local, state, and national preservation tools.

Attachments

Exhibit 1 – Staff Report Exhibit 2 – Historic Designation Application

Exhibit 3 – Historic Designation Report

Exhibit 4 – Applicant Presentation

01/18/2022 CAM #22-0035 Exhibit 5 – Additional Documents from Owner Representative

Exhibit 6 – October 4, 2021, HPB Minutes

Exhibit 7 – Resolution Landmark Designation for Building Only – Approving

Exhibit 8 – Resolution Landmark Designation for Property – Approving

Exhibit 9 – Resolution Landmark Designation – Denying

Prepared by: Trisha Logan, AICP, Historic Preservation Planner, Development Services Department

Department Director: Anthony Greg Fajardo, Development Services Department