



CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE

DRAFT
HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD
CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE
Fort Lauderdale Executive Airport (FXE)
Red Tails Conference Room
6000 NW 21st Ave
Fort Lauderdale, FL 33309
Monday, May 1, 2023 - 5:00 P.M.

<u>Board Members</u>	<u>Attendance</u>	<u>Cumulative Attendance</u> <u>6/2022 through 5/2023</u>	
		<u>Present</u>	<u>Absent</u>
Arthur Marcus, Chair	P	8	1
Richard Bray	P	9	0
Allen Jones	P	4	2
Donald Karney	P	9	0
Richard Rosa, Vice Chair	P	7	2
Tim Schiavone (via Zoom)	P	7	2
Ashley Walker	P	2	0

City Staff

Shari Wallen, Assistant City Attorney
Trisha Logan, Historic Preservation Planner
Yvonne Redding, Urban Planner III
Kimberly Pearson, Park Manager
Jamie Opperlee, Recording Secretary, Prototype Inc.

Guests:

Margi Nothard
Blaise McGinley
Curt Fretham, via Zoom
Terrance Willard
Hallie Willard
Charles Willard
Chuck Willard
Anthony Abbate
Gregory Madar, via Zoom
Dr. David Kyner

<u>Index</u>	<u>Owner/Applicant</u>	<u>Page</u>
1. UDP-HP23016	301 SW 14 th Way, Curt John Fretham	<u>2</u>
2. UDP-HP23018	1016 Waverly Road, City of Fort Lauderdale	<u>6</u>
	Communication to the City Commission	<u>7</u>
	For the Good of the City	7

I. Call to Order/Pledge of Allegiance

The meeting of the Historic Preservation Board was called to order at 5:00 p.m. Roll was taken, and it was determined that a quorum was present.

II. Determination of Quorum/Approval of Minutes

a. Approval of Minutes: March 6, 2023

~~Motion made by Mr. Karney, seconded by Mr. Jones:
 To approve the minutes of the March 6, 2022, meeting as presented.
 In a voice vote, the motion passed 7-0.~~

III. Public Sign-in/Swearing-In

~~All members of the public wishing to address the Board on any item were sworn in.~~

~~Board members disclosed communications and site visits for each agenda item.~~

IV. Agenda Items

1. Index

REQUEST: Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition
 • **Complete Demolition of a One-Story Single-Family Residence, a Metal Shed, and Two Wood Frame Sheds**

Case Number	UDP-HP23016	FMSF#	
Owner	Curt John Fretham		
Applicant	Curt John Fretham		
Address	301 SW 14 th Way		
General Location	Southwest corner of SW 14th Way and SW 2nd Street		
Legal Description	LOTS 3, 4, 5, 6 and the North-Half (N ½) of Lot 7, Block 2, RIVER HIGHLANDS, according to the plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 10, Page 3, of the public records of Broward County, Florida		
Existing Use	Single-Family Residence		
Proposed Use	Single-Family Residence		
Zoning	RS-8		
Applicable ULDR Sections	47-24.11.D.3.c.i; 47-24.11.D.4; 47-17		
Landmark/Historic District	Sailboat Bend Historic District		
Section 166.033, Florida Statutes	180-day Expiration Date	Extension Date(s)	
	October 17, 2023	Not Applicable	
Authored By	Trisha Logan, AICP, Principal Urban Planner		

Ms. Logan summarized the staff report and concluded the report with:

Staff finds that the application for a **COA for Demolition** under case number UDP-HP23016 located at 301 SW 14th Way does not meet the criteria as outlined in Section 47-24.11.D.3.c.i. of the ULDR and partially meets the criteria as outlined in Sections 47-24.11.D.4. of the ULDR.

The following conditions for the COA for Demolition are provided for consideration by the HPB if the application is to be approved:

1. The demolition of the structure shall not negatively impact properties within the historic district and protection from construction debris and construction equipment shall be provided, as necessary.
2. This property is located in an Archaeologically Significant Zone and a Cultural Resource Assessment Survey (CRAS) by a qualified professional is required. The completed survey must be submitted and reviewed by preservation staff prior to building permit application for demolition. Following the review of the completed survey, additional archaeological testing or monitoring comments may apply.
3. This application is subject to the approval by Building, Zoning, and all ULDR requirements, including landscaping.

Ms. Logan stated a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for New Construction would be on a future agenda, once the applications are complete.

Chair Marcus asked for clarification on the possible future historic landmark designation discussed in the staff report. Ms. Logan explained the historic significance briefly.

Curt Fretham, applicant, presented via Zoom. He stated he had purchased the property 18 months ago, and asserted the building was not the architect's best work. He stated he had stopped the construction plans pending this application and noted he would be willing to withdraw the application and bring it back with plans for construction if that were the preference of the Board.

Chair Marcus asked whether one home was planned on the site. Mr. Fretham explained the lot was three parcels with the existing home straddling two of the parcels, and stated his goal was to build three homes on the property. He noted he had heard a request to move the site to a preserve nearby, and if that was of interest, he would be happy to donate the structure.

Chair Marcus opened a public hearing on the item.

Anthony Abbate, Florida Atlantic University School of Architecture, asserted the case deserved careful consideration. He noted that as designed and constructed, the house meets all the criteria for historical integrity and historic designation. He stated it was an excellent example of Bill Bigoney's climate-based designs.

Margi Nothard, 215 SW 14th Way, stated she had lived next door to the applicant's home for 25 years. She called it a gift, and noted it is part of an enclave that looks back to Florida in days gone by. She discussed location, setting, materials, and workmanship, and asked the Board to deny the application.

Charles Willard, Fort Lauderdale, held a sign that said "homes not hotels" and stated it said it all for him. He noted the area is a very unique place to live and to visit. He asked that the application be tabled to allow all interested parties to speak.

Chair Marcus asked Mr. Willard if he was a neighbor of the property. Mr. Willard stated he owns lot 20 and his family has been in the neighborhood since 1977.

Blaise McGinley, 1500 Argyle Drive, asked that the application be denied. He stated he understood the financial motive, but thought it was a responsibility of this Board to look beyond that. He noted this was a special place.

Gregory Madar, trustee of the John McSweeney Family Trust and neighbor, stated his feeling was that the neighbors want the area to maintain its current character.

Chair Marcus closed the public hearing.

Ms. Walker asked for clarification on the process, including whether applications for demolition typically come forward without plans for new construction and next steps if the Board were to deny the application. Attorney Wallen explained they can do so, but it is not a requirement under the Code. She reviewed the criteria briefly.

Mr. Bray stated the property was not marked as contributing and not designated historical, though he would prefer the owner move the house rather than demolish it.

Mr. Jones thanked the public for coming to share their perspectives. He asked whether there had been any conditions when purchasing the property. Mr. Fretham shared a brief background on the sellers and stated that the previous owner was a mentee of the architect. He stated the previous owner's plan had been to subdivide the lot, and that plan was given to him as part of the sale. He noted his intent to maintain the nature on the property.

Chair Marcus asked whether the applicant had been made aware the house was in a historic district at purchase. Mr. Fretham stated he was aware of the district, but also that this was not a home that was designated historic.

Mr. Rosa stated the Board had made determinations on past homes to allow for demolition. He expressed appreciation for the architect and the nature of the street. He asked whether the house had been damaged in the recent floods. Mr. Fretham confirmed the house is in a flood zone and had gotten wet. He noted a building project would require raising the elevation of the ground floor.

Mr. Rosa asked whether the applicant was open to relocating the home within his property and conforming setback lines. Mr. Fretham stated that he would be open to moving it, but the challenge would be requirements to bring the home up to Code. Ms. Logan noted there are exemptions for historic preservation in the Florida Building Code.

Mr. Rosa inquired as to whether the applicant would be willing to donate the house to be moved to another location in Sailboat Bend. Mr. Fretham confirmed that he was.

Attorney Wallen clarified that the discussion of relocation was not part of the current request for demolition and explained the process. She explained there is a separate application for relocation. Discussion continued regarding the criteria.

Chair Marcus stated as an architect, he has always admired Mr. Bigoney's work, and feels that although this structure may not be formally designated, it is historic. He asserted it is a real example of the midcentury era, and unfortunately none of the City's Codes have been updated to include these buildings. He argued for preserving the house and relocating it on the property or off.

Mr. Bray referenced Bigoney properties outside of Sailboat Bend and stated it was unfair to discuss historical designation for this home based only on its location. Discussion continued regarding the property, the criteria, and the responsibility of the Board.

Mr. Bray asked the applicant if he was willing to withdraw the application and consider relocation. Mr. Fretham reiterated that his preference was approval of demolition, with the intention he would postpone the action to investigate relocation.

Attorney Wallen explained private agreements regarding location would not be covered under the jurisdiction of the City and would not be enforceable as a condition of approval. Discussion continued regarding whether the application met the factual criteria and similar applications.

Attorney Wallen noted Mr. Abbate had handed Chair Marcus a piece of paper, and that paper would be distributed to all Board members and made part of the record.

Chair Marcus reopened the public hearing.

Mr. Abbate read his submission for the record. He stated criteria one in the staff report was not applicable, as the home was not designated historic, so could not be considered "no longer contributing."

Mr. Rosa disagreed with the interpretation and pointed to the "or" between clauses.

Chair Marcus closed the public hearing.

Attorney Wallen read the resolution:

A resolution of the Historic Preservation Board of the City of Fort Lauderdale, Florida, approving a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition for the property located at 301 SW 14th Way, Fort Lauderdale, Florida under case number UDP-HPD23016 [The entire text of the resolution is attached to these minutes for the public record.]

Motion made by Mr. Karney, seconded by Ms. Walker to **approve with conditions** the resolution for a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition under case number UDP-HP23016 located at 301 SW 14th Way based on the facts and findings as outlined in the staff memorandum and the preceding discussion subject to the following conditions:

1. The demolition of the structure shall not negatively impact properties within the historic district and protection from construction debris and construction equipment shall be provided, as necessary.
2. This property is located in an Archaeologically Significant Zone and a Cultural Resource Assessment Survey (CRAS) by a qualified professional is required. The completed survey must be submitted and reviewed by preservation staff prior to building permit application for demolition. Following the review of the completed survey, additional archaeological testing or monitoring comments may apply.
3. This application is subject to the approval by Building, Zoning, and all ULDR requirements, including landscaping.

In a voice vote, the motion **passed 6-1**. Mr. Marcus was opposed.

Historic Preservation Board
May 1, 2023
Page 9

Attest:



Prototype Inc. Recording Secretary

Chairman:



Arthur Marcus, Chair

The City of Fort Lauderdale maintains a website for the Historic Preservation Board Meeting Agendas and Results:

<http://www.fortlauderdale.gov/departments/city-clerk-s-office/board-and-committee-agendas-and-minutes/historic-preservation-board>

Any written public comments made 48 hours prior to the meeting regarding items discussed during the proceedings have been attached hereto.