

# City of Fort Lauderdale

*City Hall  
100 North Andrews Avenue  
Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301  
www.fortlauderdale.gov*



## Meeting Minutes

**Tuesday, December 17, 2019**

**1:30 PM**

**City Commission Conference Room**

### **City Commission Conference Meeting**

***FORT LAUDERDALE CITY COMMISSION***

***DEAN J. TRANTALIS Mayor  
ROBERT L. McKINZIE Vice Mayor - Commissioner - District III  
HEATHER MORAITIS Commissioner - District I  
STEVEN GLASSMAN Commissioner - District II  
BEN SORENSEN Commissioner - District IV***

***CHRIS LAGERBLOOM, City Manager  
JOHN HERBST, City Auditor  
JEFFREY A. MODARELLI, City Clerk  
ALAIN E. BOILEAU, City Attorney***

## CALL TO ORDER

Mayor Trantalis called the meeting to order at 1:18 p.m.

## QUORUM ESTABLISHED

**Commission Members Present:** Commissioner Heather Moraitis, Commissioner Steven Glassman, Vice Mayor Robert L. McKinzie, Commissioner Sorensen, and Mayor Dean J. Trantalis

**Also Present:** City Manager Chris Lagerbloom, City Clerk Jeffrey A. Modarelli, City Attorney Alain E. Boileau, and Sergeant at Arms Heather Lee

## CITY COMMISSION REPORTS

*Members of the City Commission announced recent and upcoming events and matters of interest.*

Commissioner Moraitis updated the Commission on her recent attendance at an Elected Women Officials Conference held at the White House. She discussed aspects of apprenticeship efforts and federal funding that flows through the State of Florida, reaching the local area through *Career Source Broward*. Mayor Trantalis confirmed he serves on the *Career Source Broward Board* (Board) along with City of Hollywood Mayor Josh Levy and Broward County Commissioner Tim Ryan.

Mayor Trantalis recognized Zoie Saunders, Chief Education Officer. Ms. Saunders discussed ongoing collaboration efforts with Mason Jackson, *Career Source Broward*, to address workforce development in the community. In response to Commissioner Moraitis' question, Ms. Saunders expounded on recent efforts, initiatives and details focusing on targeted communities. The Aviation Apprenticeship Program (Program) is a partnership with Atlantic Technical College and Broward College to explore grant funding opportunities in addition to engaging business partners for sponsorship opportunities.

Commissioner Moraitis commented on the possibility of matching grant funding to launch the Program. Ms. Sanders confirmed, stating she would pursue and follow-up with *Career Source Broward*.

Commissioner Moraitis noted that Federal Work-Study funding can now

be used for apprenticeship costs. Further comment and discussion ensued on Pell Grant opportunities.

Mayor Trantalis recognized Gregory Adam Haile, President of Broward College. Mr. Haile explained the differences in the Federal Work-Study Program and Pell Grant opportunities. Pell Grants address credits towards degree programs and cannot apply towards short-term Workforce Certificate Programs (Certificate Programs). Mr. Haile explained current efforts to expand Pell Grants towards Certificate Programs to meet workforce needs, commenting on the value of augmenting work-study funding. He updated the Commission on ongoing efforts at the federal level.

Commissioner Glassman discussed his attendance at the Integrated Solid Waste and Recycling System Working/Technical Group meeting on Friday, December 6, 2019. Efforts are moving quickly, and the next meeting will be on January 6, 2020 to determine a Broward County (County) governing structure. He would provide additional information as things move forward.

Commissioner Glassman commented on the NE 13th Street and Dixie Highway improvements resulting from the Complete Streets Program and private investment efforts. Mayor Trantalis noted the contributions of the City Staff, Broward County and the Broward County Metropolitan Planning Organization (MPO) towards these projects. Mayor Trantalis and Commissioner Glassman commented on NE 13th Street holiday decorations supplied by a local business owner. Further comment ensued.

Commissioner Glassman commented on the upcoming Bonnet House Board of Directors Meeting, noting input has been encouraging.

Commissioner Glassman requested Staff provide an update to residents regarding Suntex Marina taking on the operations of the Bahia Mar Marina. City Manager Chris Lagerbloom confirmed.

Commissioner Glassman requested Staff provide notification and easy access to information regarding the *Unified Direct Procurement Authority (UDPA) Meetings* between the City of Fort Lauderdale Commission and the Broward County Commission. City Clerk Jeffrey Modarelli noted the link available on the City website, expounding on related details. Further comment ensued. Commissioner Glassman requested additional information be included on the City's website.

Commissioner Glassman commented on input from Sabrina Javellana, Vice Mayor of Hallandale Beach, regarding age restrictions in the Charter for individuals who desire to serve in a City elected office. It was noted that the Charter only allows individuals to serve in elected office if they are 21 years of age. Other municipalities allow individuals to serve in elected office if they are 18 years of age. Further comment and discussion ensued.

Commissioner Glassman commented on median work being done between State Road A1A and the Sunrise Boulevard Intracoastal Bridge. City Manager Lagerbloom confirmed coordinated efforts among Staff, contractors and an interlocal agreement to achieve median upgrades. Phil Thornburg, Director of the Parks and Recreation Department, confirmed additional median enhancements in the vicinity, expounding on details. He confirmed ongoing efforts with the State of Florida to implement *Welcome to the Beach* signage approved by a prior Commission. Mayor Trantalis requested Mr. Thornburg circulate the signage to current Commission members for review and input. Mr. Thornburg confirmed.

In response to Commissioner Glassman's question regarding communicating *Adopt a Median* signage to all median contractors, Mr. Thornburg confirmed Staff would target all landscape architects and median contractors.

Commissioner Sorensen thanked everyone for working to mitigate and repair the recent sewer line incident in the Rio Vista Neighborhood. He expounded on details, confirming the need for continued infrastructure efforts and acknowledging this is a top priority of the Commission throughout the City. Further comment ensued.

Commissioner Sorensen confirmed the negative impact of Fort Lauderdale/Hollywood International Airport noise on neighborhoods. He expounded on current efforts to address this topic, including details related to wind direction that impacts areas east and west, and the need for future Commission discussion.

Commissioner Sorensen confirmed an upcoming meeting with Weston Mayor Daniel J. Stermer regarding airport noise. Discussion ensued on engaging members of the South Florida Congressional delegation and federal lobbyists. City Manager Lagerbloom confirmed he would brief the City's federal lobbyist. Commissioner Sorensen said he would keep the Commission updated.

Commissioner Sorensen updated the Commission on progress related to the Continuum of Care Board, noting positive headway made to addressing homelessness. District I Broward County Commissioner Nan Rich would assist in working towards advocating for all Broward County municipalities to contribute their share of funding. Commissioner Sorensen said he would follow-up with other Broward County municipalities to contribute their fair share of homelessness costs. He confirmed the large number of students in Broward County Public Schools experiencing some form of homelessness, expounding on related details and efforts of the County to address these needs. Further comment ensued on sources of homelessness in the City. Mayor Trantalis commented on the need to move forward with building of Homelessness Assistance Center. Further comment ensued.

Mayor Trantalis discussed meetings with Moody's and Standard and Poor's (Bond Rating Agencies). City Manager Lagerbloom discussed the meeting with the Bond Rating Agencies, noting the meeting consisted of a tour of the City and a presentation. City Manager Lagerbloom expounded on additional details, noting the favorable feedback received. The City's current bond rating is *AA Plus* and *AA Stable*. Updated bond ratings are anticipated in the next three weeks.

Mayor Trantalis noted a scheduling conflict on March 18, 2020 with the St. Patrick's Day Parade and the Inter Miami's first soccer game at Lockhart Stadium. City Manager Lagerbloom said this topic has been delegated to the Parks, Recreation and Beaches Board, expounding on details. Further comment and discussion ensued. City Manager Lagerbloom confirmed he would work to move the start time for the St. Patrick's Day Parade to 11:00 a.m.

Mayor Trantalis gave an update on the recent Joint City-County Government Campus Meeting. City Manager Lagerbloom will execute an agreement with the County Administrator Bertha Henry and the entity tasked with preparing the Needs Assessment Report (Report). Comment ensued on the timeline for receipt of the Report. Mayor Trantalis requested City Manager Lagerbloom ensure the Report is received by late May or early June 2020 to allow the Commission enough time to review and digest the Report before the Commission Summer Recess.

Mayor Trantalis requested an update on the timeline to receive the comprehensive infrastructure needs report (Comprehensive Report). City Manager Lagerbloom confirmed a draft of the Comprehensive Report was received. Staff and the Office of the City Attorney are reviewing it and are making Statutory redactions that identify critical asset locations, i.e., drinking water wells.

## OLD/NEW BUSINESS

### BUS-1 [19-1197](#)

Broward UP Presentation - (Commission Districts 1, 2, 3 and 4)

Mayor Trantalis recognized Zoie Saunders, Chief Education Officer. Ms. Saunders brought forward a partnership opportunity with Broward College aligned with the City's Workforce Development Program entitled *Broward UP*. She gave a brief update of ongoing activities in support of workforce development initiatives and business development efforts, citing examples.

Ms. Saunders explained *Broward UP* brings college opportunities to underserved zip code locations, providing wrap-around support for students to complete their degrees and develop career readiness skills. The paradigm shift includes offering free courses, certifications and training in community locations.

Ms. Saunders introduced Gregory Adam Haile, President of Broward College. Mr. Haile thanked the Commission for its efforts towards furthering education. He narrated the *Broward UP* program slide presentation, expounding on relevant details.

***A copy of the presentation is attached to these minutes.***

In response to Commissioner Sorensen's question, City Manager Lagerbloom confirmed that City facilities, services and locations could partner with *Broward Up*. Commissioner Moraitis commented on activating the Community Center space at Lockhart Stadium and her support of enabling all City facilities as determined by Broward College.

Commissioner Moraitis proposed partnering with the Northwest-Progresso-Flagler Heights (NWPFH) Community Redevelopment Agency (CRA) to find a hangar building location for aviation students. Commissioner Moraitis noted the opportunity to include a marine engine training facility with aviation training. Further comment ensued on the economic viability and available areas in the NWPFH CRA.

Mr. Haile noted the importance of eliminating transportation barriers, confirming educational opportunities located within communities serves to address this need. Comment and discussion ensued on items in the presentation, including income levels, expectations and social mobility. Mr. Haile expounded on additional barriers in underserved communities

and efforts to address these needs. He commented on conversations with aviation industry employers and the importance of including them in the *Broward UP* conversation. The Commission confirmed its support of *Broward UP*.

### **CITY COMMISSION REPORTS (Continued)**

[19-1188](#)

Communications to the City Commission - (Commission Districts 1, 2, 3 and 4)

#### ***Sustainability Advisory Board (SAB) November 25, 2019***

***A copy of this communication is attached to these minutes.***

Mayor Trantalis recognized Jeff Dorian, Local Chapter of the Citizens' Climate Lobby (Climate Lobby). Mr. Dorian said the Climate Lobby initiated the SAB communication request, expounding on details relating to support of a fee on carbon and proposed bi-partisan federal legislation contained in H.R. 763 entitled *Energy Innovation and Carbon Dividend Act of 2019*. City Attorney Alain Boileau explained related details, stating the fee on carbon is a tax on the producers and importers of carbon emissions. Mr. Dorian explained additional details, including the tax being returned to taxpayers to incentivize investment in renewable energy and energy conservation.

Mayor Trantalis recognized Vaughn English, Citizens' Climate Lobby. Mr. English spoke in support of the SAB communication and H.R. 763, expounding on his position and related details.

Mayor Trantalis recognized Steve Jens-Rochow, Citizens' Climate Lobby. Mr. Jens-Rochow spoke in support of the SAB communication and H.R. 763, expounding on his position and his use of renewable energy. He urged the Commission to initiate and support a resolution in support of H.R. 763.

Mayor Trantalis noted the need for additional conversations with U.S. Congressman Ted Deutch for a full understanding of H.R. 763 prior to enacting a resolution in support. There was consensus on this point. A vote on H.R. 763 is anticipated in 2020. Mayor Trantalis thanked the SAB for bringing this to the attention of the Commission.

#### ***Historic Preservation Board (HPB) December 2, 2019***

***A copy of this communication is attached to these minutes.***

Mayor Trantalis recognized Trisha Logan, Urban Planner III and Historic Preservation Officer. Ms. Logan explained aspects of the HPB communication regarding the Henry E. Kinney Tunnel ventilation tower located at the Tunnel Top Park (Park). It would be utilized for traditional education and/or as an artistic component. Comment ensued. Florida Department of Transportation (FDOT) has completed its work on the Tunnel ventilation system tower.

In response to Commissioner Glassman's question, Ms. Logan confirmed the six (6) items listed in the HPB communication are part of the information being sought by FDOT. Commissioner Sorensen noted that FDOT had given wide latitude to the Park's design.

## **CONFERENCE REPORTS**

**CF-1**    [19-1163](#)

Quarterly Investment Report for Period Ending September 30, 2019 - (Commission Districts 1, 2, 3 and 4)

City Manager Chris Lagerbloom announced the recent hiring of Director of Finance Susan Grant.

City Manager Lagerbloom acknowledged that the OPEB Trust Fund underperformed compared to the benchmark, noting the need to provide an explanation.

Mayor Trantalis recognized Linda Short, Deputy Finance Director. Ms. Short gave an update on the performance of the City's Operating Portfolio.

Ms. Short explained the OPEB Trust Fund Quarterly Investment Report for the period ending September 30, 2019 underperformed due to uninvested cash in the fund. Staff met with the Investment Advisory Board who assisted with Index Fund recommendations that were invested in September 2019. The results of these investments will be realized in the next OPEB Trust Fund Report.

Ms. Short said that other Investment Funds are managed by the respective Boards of Trustees that can provide the Commission with performance updates.



### OLD/NEW BUSINESS (Continued)

**BUS-2** [19-1223](#)

Tunnel Top Park Update - (Commission District 4)

Mayor Trantalis recognized Christine Fanchi, Engineering and Design Manager, Department of Transportation and Mobility.

Ms. Fanchi introduced members of Tunnel Top Park Plaza Project (Project) design team: Fausto Gomez, P.E., Project Manager - Florida Department of Transportation (FDOT) District 4; Naldo Gonzalez, PE, ENV SP, Vice President - Florida Transportation Director, Gannett Fleming, Inc. - Civil Engineers; Matt Klein, Principal, TBG Partners - Landscape Architects; Jeffrey Huber, AIA, Assoc. ASLA, NCARB, LEED AP, Principal and Director of Planning and Urban Design, Brooks + Scarpa Architects.

Ms. Fanchi explained FDOT's rehabilitation project on the Henry E. Kinney Tunnel (Tunnel), which allows a partnership with the City to address the Project. She gave a brief update regarding public outreach and efforts to accommodate public input and feedback. Project recommendations included an extension, increased shade, additional seating and public art.

Ms. Fanchi confirmed there could be a 117-foot extension from the Tunnel wall on the north side of Las Olas Boulevard, noting design team efforts to integrate public input and recommendations. The HPB supports the updated design. Ms. Fanchi requested Commission feedback on the concept and costs following the presentation.

City Manager Lagerbloom clarified the process, stating that design and cost items would need to go through the Parks, Recreation and Beaches Advisory Board (PRBAB) for input and recommendations to the Commission.

In response to Mayor Trantalis' question regarding alternative funding sources for the Project, Ms. Fanchi said this could be explored.

Mayor Trantalis recognized Matt Klein, Principal, TBG Partners - Landscape Architects. Mr. Klein presented the Project's design concepts to the Commission. A brief discussion ensued regarding the naming of the Project. Prior to starting the design concept presentation, Mr. Klein noted geological aspects of the area related to trees and landscaping opportunities.

***A copy of the design concepts is attached to these minutes.***

Questions, answers and comments ensued on aspects of the design concept, including the need to capitalize on the 117-foot extension over the north side of the Tunnel, the streetscape and linkage of spaces.

In response to Mayor Trantalis, Mr. Klein explained the design of the Project's travel lanes, stating there will be bollards, pavement banding and other indicators of vehicular circulation.

Commissioner Sorensen asked about engagement features for children. Mr. Klein noted limited children's play features due to the area's vehicular traffic. Commissioner Sorensen requested the consultants pursue this opportunity in the southwest or northern portion of the Project area. Mr. Klein confirmed.

Mayor Trantalis requested additional water features and greenery to soften the area. Mr. Klein confirmed public input for extra shade, explaining natural limitations and restrictions related to water features due to the Tunnel.

In response to questions regarding the color and durability of the Project's roadway pavers, Mr. Klein explained a darker-toned brick is being considered. He noted aspects of paver materials and the importance of base preparation and proper engineering. Further comment and discussion ensued.

Vice Mayor McKinzie arrived at 3:23 p.m.

Mayor Trantalis commented on the need to present this to the PRBAB and consider the increased cost of this expanded Project.

Commissioner Glassman commented on his perspective and the need for the Project's design to be personalized to the City, asking if there is a plan to address architectural features and work with local artists. He noted concerns regarding too much hardscape, the need for additional green space and shade, expounding on related details. Further comment and discussion ensued. Mr. Klein confirmed public input and support for public art within the Project. Mayor Trantalis noted that this presentation is a good starting point for the Project.

Mr. Klein said architectural elements had been excluded from the scope of work, noting the need for other aspects involving FDOT to move forward.

Commissioner Moraitis asked about incorporating an area for a food truck and *Uber* drop-offs. Mr. Klein noted negative public input regarding food trucks.

Mayor Trantalis recognized Jenni Morejon, President and Chief Executive Officer, Downtown Development Authority (DDA). Ms. Morejon confirmed the DDA's support of the Project. In response to Mayor Trantalis' inquiry about naming opportunities for the Project, Ms. Morejon confirmed, expounding on related details. Further comment ensued.

Mayor Trantalis recognized April Kirk, Executive Director of the Stranahan House. Ms. Kirk discussed items regarding the Project, expounding on details. These include the need for pedestrian and vehicular safety in passive and active portions in the Project, not including hammocks or splash pads, and offering to work with FDOT to research and create historical markers and smaller pieces of artwork within the Project.

Mayor Trantalis recognized Genia Ellis, President and Chief Executive Officer of Riverwalk Fort Lauderdale, Inc. Ms. Ellis concurred with Ms. Kirk's comments. She noted that Laura Ward Park and Riverwalk are transportation hubs, expounding on related details and affirming support for the inclusion of public art.

Mayor Trantalis recognized Robyn Vegas, Business for the Arts of Broward (Business for the Arts). Ms. Vegas confirmed the need for iconic art at the Project to draw visitors, offering Business for the Arts services to achieve this goal.

City Manager Lagerbloom recapped the next steps moving forward. Based upon Commission input today, Public Works Staff and Parks and Recreation Staff will collaborate to bring the Project before the PRBAB for feedback and recommendations. Following PRBAB review and input, the Project would be brought back to the Commission for approval.

Mayor Trantalis commented on the favorable nature of the Project and the creation of a neighborhood respite center.

In response to Vice Mayor McKinzie's question regarding how FDOT would move forward, Fausto Gomez, P.E., Project Manager - Florida Department of Transportation (FDOT) District 4, confirmed FDOT would continue with the Tunnel rehabilitation project, noting the current additions to the conceptual design. FDOT is concerned with the Project's

scheduling and the number of remaining Project decisions.

Vice Mayor McKinzie commented on his concerns regarding scheduling. Mr. Gomez discussed efforts to coordinate FDOT work with the incorporation of the Project's current design, including related infrastructure and details.

Ms. Fanchi emphasized the City's current opportunity with the Project in coordination with FDOT's ongoing Tunnel work. Mayor Trantalis confirmed the City's process would be expedited.

In response to Commissioner Sorensen's question regarding a timeline of items FDOT requires, Mr. Gomez confirmed FDOT needs a final decision on Project design to allow the FDOT consultant to begin its design work, noting the need for expediency.

Mr. Klein explained that due to an increase in the Project's scope of work, plans are behind schedule. The final completed Project design from the consultants is needed by October 2020. The submission of the completed Project design to FDOT Headquarters in Tallahassee is the end of 2020. The Project would proceed with construction in March 2021.

Mayor Trantalis said that following review and input by the PRBAB, the City's final approved design would need to be completed and approved by the first Commission Meeting in February 2020.

In response to Commissioner Sorensen's questions regarding costs, City Manager Lagerbloom confirmed the cost of the Project presented today is approximately \$21,000,000. Mr. Klein reviewed the last page of the presentation regarding costs, noting additional architectural elements could increase costs from \$1,500,000 to \$4,500,000. FDOT will do the work but will not contribute towards costs. The City would pay for the Project.

City Manager Lagerbloom discussed the initial cost, revised costs and the requirement for the Project going before the PRBAB. The PRBAB would prioritize the Project, provide input, recommendations and address funding the increased costs by transferring Park Bond project funds or allocating unappropriated Park Bond funds for future projects not yet identified to this Project. Mayor Trantalis commented on the ability to go to philanthropic organizations for donations, expounding on details. City Manager Lagerbloom confirmed the need for a discussion with the PRBAB.

In response to Commissioner Moraitis' question, City Manager Lagerbloom confirmed the following amounts designated within the Parks Bond Fund for the categories listed:

- \$7,000,000 per District for the acquisition of land for Parks; and
- \$30,000,000 per District for future park projects not yet identified.

**BUS-3** [19-1180](#)

Made to Move Grant Update - (Commission District 2)

Mayor Trantalis recognized, Karen Warfel, Program Manager, Department of Transportation and Mobility. Ms. Warfel explained the \$100,000 Unilever Degree® Deodorant & Blue Zones® Made to Move Grant (Made to Move Grant) is a one-year grant, confirming the presentation would provide an update regarding efforts over the past three (3) months and plans moving forward.

Ms. Warfel introduced Mark Fenton and Danielle Schaeffner, Built Environmental Specialists, Blue Zones, LLC. (Blue Zones), and Christine Fanchi, Engineering Design Manager, Department of Transportation and Mobility.

***A copy of the presentation is attached to these minutes.***

Ms. Schaeffner gave an overview of Blue Zones, explaining it is a community well-being initiative. She expounded on details, including its origins and goal to recreate Blue Zones across North America.

Mr. Fenton explained his role addresses this Program from an infrastructure perspective, acknowledging the numerous aspects of the City's efforts to create mixed-use zones and walkability, serving public health benefits. He cited improvements to NE 13th Street as an example of enhancing economic energy in that community. Mr. Fenton discussed similar opportunities to improve existing areas that require underground infrastructure improvements.

Mr. Fenton said Staff had identified the Flagler Greenway for this Grant opportunity, confirming the need to connect transportation areas in the Flagler Greenway into surrounding neighbors. Further comment and discussion ensued.

Ms. Warfel confirmed the focus of this Grant is the Mass District between Andrews Avenue and Sunrise Boulevard. It is associated with the collaborative efforts of LauderTrail and Mockingbird Trail to address

Flagler Greenway. She reviewed the needs of Flagler Avenue as illustrated in the presentation and ways to improve safety and accessibility into surrounding neighborhoods, citing examples.

Ms. Fanchi gave a brief review of neighbor input along Flagler Avenue. She noted the need for raised sidewalks in addition to a traffic light. The community has a desire for decorative bike racks.

Mayor Trantalis recessed the Commission Conference Meeting at 4:20 p.m. to begin the Other Post-Employee Benefits (OPEB) Board Meeting.

Mayor Trantalis reconvened the Commission Conference Meeting at 4:24 p.m.

### **CITY MANAGER REPORTS**

City Manager Lagerbloom announced the retirement of Paul Berg, Director of Public Works, on Friday, December 20, 2019, following 47 years of public service.

Mr. Berg gave a presentation updating the Commission on repairs to a recent sewer line break in the Rio Vista neighborhood, explaining details related to the repair process.

***A copy of the presentation is attached to these minutes.***

In response to Mayor Trantalis' question regarding the reason for the pipe failure, Mr. Berg confirmed the broken portion of the pipe would be sent out for analysis, expounding on related details. The length of time to repair the pipe is anticipated to take five (5) days. A bypass will be used until the repair is complete.

Discussions ensued on structural aspects and thickness of the pipe. It was noted that the bottom of the pipeline has more wear than the top.

Due to time constraints, City Manager Lagerbloom confirmed the Commission would receive a link to the pipe repair manufacturer film.

### **EXECUTIVE CLOSED DOOR SESSION - 4:30 P.M. OR AS SOON THEREAFTER AS POSSIBLE**

Mayor Trantalis announced the Executive Closed-Door Session.

[19-1235](#)

The City Commission will meet privately pursuant to Florida Statute,

Section 286.011(8) concerning:

Hinton, Walter, et al. v. City of Fort Lauderdale  
Case No.: CACE 07-030358 (26)

Adderly, Ray, et al. v. City of Fort Lauderdale  
Case No.: CACE 11-008499 (26)

## **ADJOURNMENT**

Mayor Trantalis adjourned the meeting at 4:36 p.m.