

CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE
RFP EVALUATION COMMITTEE TABULATION
RFP 223-11035 Shipboard Firefighter Training
DATE: August 20, 2012

RFP 223-11035 Scoring Tabulation

RFP 223-11035 Scoring Tabulation	John M										Jo-Ann Lorber															
	Approach to scope of work; Understanding of the overall needs of the City for such services, as presented in the narrative proposal. This will include problem identification and the proposed method to accomplish the work required.			Qualification of Firm: To include Licenses, Certifications, etc.; Experience, qualifications and past performance of the proposing firm, including persons proposed to provide the services, previous similar services and references.			Training program: To include syllabus, course description, equipment, facilities, resources policies, times, days, hours/day, location, meeting the objectives/requirements			Cost of Services			Total Points Awarded	Approach to scope of work; Understanding of the overall needs of the City for such services, as presented in the narrative proposal. This will include problem identification and the proposed method to accomplish the work required.			Qualification of Firm: To include Licenses, Certifications, etc.; Experience, qualifications and past performance of the proposing firm, including persons proposed to provide the services, previous similar services and references			Training program: To include syllabus, course description, equipment, facilities, resources policies, times, days, hours/day, location, meeting the objectives/requirements			Cost of Services			Total Points Awarded
PROPOSING FIRM	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal		Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	
Resolve Marine Group / Maritime Academy	0.10	1	0.10	0.2	1	0.20	0.40	1	0.40	0.3	1	0.30	1.00	0.10	1	0.10	0.2	1	0.20	0.40	1	0.40	0.3	1	0.30	1.00

RFP 223-11035 Scoring Tabulation

	Ken R.																			
	Approach to scope of work; Understanding of the overall needs of the City for such services, as presented in the narrative proposal. This will include problem identification and the proposed method to accomplish the work required.			Qualification of Firm: To include Licenses, Certifications, etc.; Experience, qualifications and past performance of the proposing firm, including persons proposed to provide the services, previous similar services and references			Training program: To include syllabus, course description, equipment, facilities, resources policies, times, days, hours/day, location, meeting the objectives/requirements			Qualification of Firm: To include Licenses, Certifications,			Cost of Services							
PROPOSING FIRM	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Total Points Awarded	Average Points Awarded	Total Combined Points Awarded	Local Preference (if applicable)	Local Preference Deduction	Final Score	AWARD RANK	Total Cost
Resolve Marine Group / Maritime Academy	0.10	1	0.10	0.2	1	0.20	0.40	1	0.40	0.3	1	0.30	1.00	1.00	3.00	10.0%	0.30	2.70	1	\$ 249,000

	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor
Atkins North America, Inc.	0.25	6	1.50	0.25
Calvin, Giordano & Associates, Inc	0.25	1	0.25	0.25
A.D.A Engineering, Inc.	0.25	16	4.00	0.25
AMEC Environmental & Infrastructure, Inc.	0.25	12	3.00	0.25
Chen Moore and Associates	0.25	8	2.00	0.25
CPH Engineers, Inc.	0.25	20	5.00	0.25
Crain Atlantis Engineering, Inc.	0.25	22	5.50	0.25
Craven Thompson & Associates, Inc.	0.25	4	1.00	0.25
Langan Engineering and Environmental Services Inc.	0.25	15	3.75	0.25
Miller Legg & Associates, Inc.	0.25	2	0.50	0.25
R.J. Behar & Company, Inc.	0.25	13	3.25	0.25
Tetra Tech, Inc.	0.25	10	2.50	0.25
The Corradino Group	0.25	9	2.25	0.25
URS Corporation Southern	0.25	11	2.75	0.25
Wade Trim, Inc.	0.25	7	1.75	0.25
CSA Central, Inc.	0.25	17	4.25	0.25
Florida Transportation Engineering, Inc.	0.25	14	3.50	0.25
GAI Consultants, Inc.	0.25	5	1.25	0.25
Keith and Schnars, P.A.	0.25	3	0.75	0.25
King Engineering Associates, Inc	0.25	19	4.75	0.25
Pillar Consultants, Inc.	0.25	21	5.25	0.25
CIMA Engineering Corp.	0.25	18	4.50	0.25

Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor
12	3.00	0.25	10	2.50	0.20	5	1.00	0.05
6	1.50	0.25	4	1.00	0.20	1	0.20	0.05
8	2.00	0.25	8	2.00	0.20	7	1.40	0.05
18	4.50	0.25	16	4.00	0.20	11	2.20	0.05
17	4.25	0.25	17	4.25	0.20	15	3.00	0.05
22	5.50	0.25	20	5.00	0.20	20	4.00	0.05
21	5.25	0.25	22	5.50	0.20	22	4.40	0.05
2	0.50	0.25	9	2.25	0.20	4	0.80	0.05
16	4.00	0.25	14	3.50	0.20	14	2.80	0.05
1	0.25	0.25	1	0.25	0.20	3	0.60	0.05
15	3.75	0.25	15	3.75	0.20	13	2.60	0.05
14	3.50	0.25	11	2.75	0.20	10	2.00	0.05
3	0.75	0.25	13	3.25	0.20	8	1.60	0.05
13	3.25	0.25	12	3.00	0.20	12	2.40	0.05
4	1.00	0.25	7	1.75	0.20	9	1.80	0.05
11	2.75	0.25	18	4.50	0.20	18	3.60	0.05
10	2.50	0.25	19	4.75	0.20	17	3.40	0.05
9	2.25	0.25	2	0.50	0.20	6	1.20	0.05
5	1.25	0.25	3	0.75	0.20	2	0.40	0.05
7	1.75	0.25	18	4.50	0.20	16	3.20	0.05
20	5.00	0.25	22	5.50	0.20	21	4.20	0.05
19	4.75	0.25	19	4.75	0.20	19	3.80	0.05

Ranking (Y=0, N=1)	Point Subtotal	Total Points Awarded	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal
0	0.00	8.00	0.25	2	0.50	0.25	9	2.25
1	0.05	3.00	0.25	16	4.00	0.25	5	1.25
1	0.05	9.45	0.25	11	2.75	0.25	10	2.50
0	0.00	13.70	0.25	15	3.75	0.25	16	4.00
1	0.05	13.55	0.25	14	3.50	0.25	15	3.75
1	0.05	19.55	0.25	21	5.25	0.25	13	3.25
0	0.00	20.65	0.25	22	5.50	0.25	18	4.50
0	0.00	4.55	0.25	18	4.50	0.25	1	0.25
1	0.05	14.10	0.25	19	4.75	0.25	21	5.25
0	0.00	1.60	0.25	17	4.25	0.25	8	2.00
0	0.00	13.35	0.25	12	3.00	0.25	11	2.75
0	0.00	10.75	0.25	4	1.00	0.25	17	4.25
0	0.00	7.85	0.25	6	1.50	0.25	4	1.00
0	0.00	11.40	0.25	3	0.75	0.25	6	1.50
0	0.00	6.30	0.25	13	3.25	0.25	14	3.50
1	0.05	15.15	0.25	7	1.75	0.25	19	4.75
0	0.00	14.15	0.25	5	1.25	0.25	2	0.50
0	0.00	5.20	0.25	9	2.25	0.25	12	3.00
0	0.00	3.15	0.25	10	2.50	0.25	7	1.75
1	0.05	14.25	0.25	1	0.25	0.25	3	0.75
1	0.05	20.00	0.25	20	5.00	0.25	20	5.00
0	0.00	17.80	0.25	8	2.00	0.25	22	5.50

Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking (Y=0, N=1)	Point Subtotal
0.25	7	1.75	0.20	13	2.60	0.05	0	0.00
0.25	5	1.25	0.20	12	2.40	0.05	1	0.05
0.25	12	3.00	0.20	15	3.00	0.05	1	0.05
0.25	21	5.25	0.20	8	1.60	0.05	0	0.00
0.25	20	5.00	0.20	16	3.20	0.05	1	0.05
0.25	18	4.50	0.20	9	1.80	0.05	1	0.05
0.25	22	5.50	0.20	22	4.40	0.05	0	0.00
0.25	8	2.00	0.20	11	2.20	0.05	0	0.00
0.25	3	0.75	0.20	19	3.80	0.05	1	0.05
0.25	10	2.50	0.20	7	1.40	0.05	0	0.00
0.25	9	2.25	0.20	1	0.20	0.05	0	0.00
0.25	13	3.25	0.20	5	1.00	0.05	0	0.00
0.25	1	0.25	0.20	3	0.60	0.05	0	0.00
0.25	4	1.00	0.20	2	0.40	0.05	0	0.00
0.25	6	1.50	0.20	4	0.80	0.05	0	0.00
0.25	15	3.75	0.20	10	2.00	0.05	1	0.05
0.25	2	0.50	0.20	21	4.20	0.05	0	0.00
0.25	16	4.00	0.20	17	3.40	0.05	0	0.00
0.25	19	4.75	0.20	14	2.80	0.05	0	0.00
0.25	14	3.50	0.20	6	1.20	0.05	1	0.05
0.25	11	2.75	0.20	20	4.00	0.05	1	0.05
0.25	17	4.25	0.20	18	3.60	0.05	0	0.00

Total Points Awarded	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking
7.10	0.25	6	1.50	0.25	1	0.25	0.25	8
8.95	0.25	7	1.75	0.25	9	2.25	0.25	9
11.30	0.25	11	2.75	0.25	13	3.25	0.25	6
14.60	0.25	15	3.75	0.25	8	2.00	0.25	14
15.50	0.25	8	2.00	0.25	7	1.75	0.25	11
14.85	0.25	14	3.50	0.25	15	3.75	0.25	15
19.90	0.25	22	5.50	0.25	20	5.00	0.25	21
8.95	0.25	3	0.75	0.25	6	1.50	0.25	10
14.60	0.25	18	4.50	0.25	18	4.50	0.25	18
10.15	0.25	9	2.25	0.25	11	2.75	0.25	13
8.20	0.25	10	2.50	0.25	12	3.00	0.25	12
9.50	0.25	2	0.50	0.25	3	0.75	0.25	4
3.35	0.25	12	3.00	0.25	16	4.00	0.25	16
3.65	0.25	1	0.25	0.25	2	0.50	0.25	1
9.05	0.25	16	4.00	0.25	14	3.50	0.25	3
12.30	0.25	4	1.00	0.25	5	1.25	0.25	5
6.45	0.25	20	5.00	0.25	21	5.25	0.25	20
12.65	0.25	17	4.25	0.25	17	4.25	0.25	17
11.80	0.25	5	1.25	0.25	4	1.00	0.25	7
5.75	0.25	13	3.25	0.25	10	2.50	0.25	2
16.80	0.25	21	5.25	0.25	22	5.50	0.25	22
15.35	0.25	19	4.75	0.25	19	4.75	0.25	19

Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking (Y=0, N=1)	Point Subtotal	Total Points Awarded	Average Points Awarded
2.00	0.20	2	0.40	0.05	0	0.00	4.15	6.42
2.25	0.20	5	1.00	0.05	1	0.05	7.30	6.42
1.50	0.20	9	1.80	0.05	1	0.05	9.35	10.03
3.50	0.20	12	2.40	0.05	0	0.00	11.65	13.32
2.75	0.20	11	2.20	0.05	1	0.05	8.75	12.60
3.75	0.20	15	3.00	0.05	1	0.05	14.05	16.15
5.25	0.20	21	4.20	0.05	0	0.00	19.95	20.17
2.50	0.20	6	1.20	0.05	0	0.00	5.95	6.48
4.50	0.20	18	3.60	0.05	1	0.05	17.15	15.28
3.25	0.20	14	2.80	0.05	0	0.00	11.05	7.60
3.00	0.20	13	2.60	0.05	0	0.00	11.10	10.88
1.00	0.20	4	0.80	0.05	0	0.00	3.05	7.77
4.00	0.20	16	3.20	0.05	0	0.00	14.20	8.47
0.25	0.20	1	0.20	0.05	0	0.00	1.20	5.42
0.75	0.20	7	1.40	0.05	0	0.00	9.65	8.33
1.25	0.20	8	1.60	0.05	1	0.05	5.15	10.87
5.00	0.20	19	3.80	0.05	0	0.00	19.05	13.22
4.25	0.20	17	3.40	0.05	0	0.00	16.15	11.33
1.75	0.20	3	0.60	0.05	0	0.00	4.60	6.52
0.50	0.20	10	2.00	0.05	1	0.05	8.30	9.43
5.50	0.20	22	4.40	0.05	1	0.05	20.70	19.17
4.75	0.20	20	4.00	0.05	0	0.00	18.25	17.13

Total Combined Points Awarded
19.25
19.25
30.10
39.95
37.80
48.45
60.50
19.45
45.85
22.80
32.65
23.30
25.40
16.25
25.00
32.60
39.65
34.00
19.55
28.30
57.50
51.40

		Artio -	Artio -	BLX	BNY	Columbia	Cutwater	
		Inv. Grade	Term Bond	Group	Mellon	Mgmt.	Investor	
		PROPOSING FIRM						
Rater #1	Understanding of the overall needs of the City as presenseted in the narative proposal.	Weight Factor	30	30	30	30	30	
		Ranking						
		Point Subtotal	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
	Ability to excel within the fixed income investement environment. Ability to produce meaningful reports on a monthly basis. Ability to stay within the parametersof the City's Investment policy. Ability to provide on-line computer access by city reps.	Weight Factor	40	40	40	40	40	40
		Ranking						
		Point Subtotal	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
	Cost of Services	Weight Factor	30	30	30	30	30	30
		Ranking	37	33				
		Point Subtotal	11.10	990.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
		Total Points Awarded	11.10	990.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
			J.P. Morgan	Lee Munder	LM Capital	Maeirow Financial	Morgan Stanley	NCM Capital
			PROPOSING FIRM					
Rater #2	Understanding of the overall needs of the City as presenseted in the narative proposal.	Weight Factor	30	30	30	30	30	
		Ranking						
		Point Subtotal	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
	Ability to excel within the fixed income investement environment. Ability to produce meaningful reports on a monthly basis. Ability to stay within the parametersof the City's Investment policy. Ability to provide on-line computer access by city reps.	Weight Factor	40	40	40	40	40	40
		Ranking						
		Point Subtotal	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
	Cost of Services	Weight Factor	30	30	30	30	30	30
		Ranking						
		Point Subtotal	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
		Total Points Awarded	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
			Regions Trust	Ridgeworth Capital	Sawgrass Asset	Seacrest Invest.	Smith Graham Low Dur.	Smith Graham Cash Mngt
			PROPOSING FIRM					
Rater #3	Understanding of the overall needs of the City as presenseted in the narative proposal.	Weight Factor		0	0	0	0	
		Ranking						
		Point Subtotal	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
	Ability to excel within the fixed income investement environment. Ability to produce meaningful reports on a monthly basis. Ability to stay within the parametersof the City's Investment policy. Ability to provide on-line computer access by city reps.	Weight Factor		0	0	0	0	0
		Ranking						
		Point Subtotal	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
	Cost of Services	Weight Factor		0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
		Ranking						
		Point Subtotal	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
		Total Points Awarded	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
			Average Points Awarded	3.70	330.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
			Total Combined Points Awarded	11.10	990.00	0.00	0.00	0.00

Dim. Fund Advisors	Fidelity Invest.	FTN Financial	Garcia Hamilton	GW&K Invest.	Invesco Advisors	
30	30	30	30	30	30	
0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
40	40	40	40	40	40	
0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
30	30	30	30	30	30	
0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
Pacific Invest.	PNC Capital	Public Trust Adv.	Ramirez Asset <30 Days	Ramirez 30 days - 12 mths	Ramirez 1 yr. - 2-1/2 yrs.	Ramirez 2-1/2 yrs. 10 yrs.
30	30	30	30	30	30	30
0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
40	40	40	40	40	40	40
0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
30	30	30	30	30	30	30
0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Sterling Capital	Victory Capital	Wells Capital	Western Asset	William Blair	Ziegler Lotsoff	
			0	0	0	
			0.00	0.00	0.00	
			0	0	0	
			0.00	0.00	0.00	
			0.00	0.00	0.00	
			0.00	0.00	0.00	
0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
			0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
			0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00