# DRAFT HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE MONDAY, NOVEMBER 4, 2013 - 5:00 P.M. FIRST FLOOR COMMISSION CHAMBER 100 NORTH ANDREWS AVENUE FORT LAUDERDALE, FLORIDA

# Cumulative Attendance 6/2013 through 5/2014

<b>Board Members</b>	<b>Attendance</b>	Present	<u>Absent</u>
David Kyner, Chair	Р	5	0
Gretchen Thompson, Vice Chair	Α	4	1
Brenda Flowers	Р	4	1
Marie Harrison	Р	2	3
Richard Heidelberger	Р	3	2
Phillip Morgan	Р	5	0
Carol Lee Ortman	Р	2	1
Alexandria Scherer	Р	4	0
Richard Schulze [5:19]	Р	5	0
Jackie Scott	Р	3	2

## **City Staff**

Merrilyn Rathbun, Fort Lauderdale Historical Society, Consultant to HPB Lynda Crase, Board Liaison Linda Mia Franco, AICP, Historic Preservation Board Liaison Carrie Sarver, Assistant City Attorney Anthony Fajardo, Zoning Administrator Lisa Edmondson, Recording Secretary, Prototype Inc.

## **Communication to the City Commission**

None

Inde	X		
		Applicant/Owner	<u>Page</u>
1.	19-H-13	Dave Baber/Broward County Board of Commissioners	2
<del>2.</del>	21-H-13	Karen Beard/Florida Trust for Historic Preservation	<u>6</u>
3.	23-H-13	Lee Williams/SJW Investment Trust	<u>11</u>
		Old Business	<u>18</u>
		New Business	<u>18</u>
		Good of the City	18
		Communication to the City Commission	18

#### **Call to Order**

Chair Kyner called the meeting of the Historic Preservation Board to order at 5:03 p.m. Roll was called and it was determined a quorum was present.

All members of the public wishing to address the Board on any item were sworn in.

Board members disclosed communications they had concerning cases on their agenda.

#### **Approval of Minutes of October 2013 Meeting**

Chair Kyner requested a change to the minutes.

**Motion** made by Ms. Scott, seconded by Ms. Scherer, to approve the minutes of the Board's October 2013 meeting as amended. In a voice vote, motion passed unanimously.

#### Cases:

1. Index

Case	19H13	FMSF#
Applicant	Dave Baber	
Owner	Broward County Board of Commissioners	
Address	100 South Andrews Avenue	
General Location	NE corner of S. Andrews Avenue and SE 2 <sup>nd</sup> Street	
Legal Description	STRANAHANS SUB LOTS 13 TO 18 BLK 14 FT LAUDERDALE 3-10 D COMM NE COR BLK A, SLY 24.96 TO POB, NWLY 28.25,WLY 5 FT S OF THE N/L FOR 215.94,SWLY 35.39,S 23 FT E OF W/L FOR 235,SELY 35.32, ELY 215.99,NELY 28.31,NLY 245 TO POB	
Existing Use	Library	
Proposed Use	Library	
Applicable ULDR Sections	ULDR Section 47-24.11.B.6	
Request(s)	Historic Landmark Designation	

Ms. Rathbun read from her memo:

#### **Property Background:**

The applicant has provided a narrative that discusses the foundation of the Broward County Library system in detail. To re-cap, briefly, prior to 1973 Broward County did not have a county wide library system; however a number of municipalities in the county had established their own libraries that were free to residents and in some cases open to non-residents for a fee. In 1973 the County Commission provided a budget to start the development of the county system. In 1979 a bond issue was approved by county voters which included monies for library construction including a central library to be built somewhere in the area of I-95 and Broward Blvd. After considerable debate a downtown site, adjacent to Stranahan Park, was chosen by the selection committee.

#### **Architect:**

In 1980, the New York firm of Marcel Breuer and Associates was chosen from five finalists to design the new Main Library. Marcel Breuer studied architecture at the Bauhaus in Germany and later joined the faculty as head of the carpentry department. The Bauhaus school was founded in 1913 by the iconic modernist architect, Walter Gropius. The school philosophy taught the unity of the arts, i.e. architecture, crafts and fine arts. The Bauhaus school sought to develop a functional architecture, which rejected ornament and traditional styles in favor of simplicity of form, geometric shapes, flat roofs and large areas of glass.

The Bauhaus school was publicly funded which left it vulnerable to the politics of the day. The school was considered radical and in 1933 the school's directors closed it under pressure from the National Socialists (Nazi Party). Many of the faculty and the artists and architects associated with the school left Germany. Breuer left Germany for London in 1935; there he worked as an architect and continued to design furniture. In 1937, Walter Gropius was appointed chairman of the Harvard Graduate School of Design Breuer followed Gropius to America and joined the faculty at Harvard. In 1946 Breuer opened his office in New York where he became one of the foremost practitioners of the Bauhaus style, or, the International Style, and later developments of Modernism.

Robert F Gatje joined Breuer's practice in 1953. Gatje had trained as an architect at Cornell University College of Architecture Art and Planning. For Breuer, Gatje was director of the practice's European office. Working closely with his mentor, Gatje shared in the design for such projects as the IBM Building in Boca Raton, the Engineering Campus at the University of Buffalo and the Baldegg Convent at Lucerne, Switzerland.

By the 1960s Marcel Breuer, influenced by his mentor Gropius, designed the Whitney Museum of Art in New York in the Brutalist style. However, the architect rejected the

exposed concrete surface of the style and substituted granite cladding. The substitution may have earned Breuer the critical opinion that he practiced a "soft" Brutalism. In 1970, Robert Gatje joined with Breuer in the Brutalist design for the Armstrong Rubber Company building (Pirelli Tire Co.) now considered a prime example of the style.

Marcel Breuer retired from the practice of architecture in 1979. Robert Gatje, with other associates, then formed a partnership to be known as Marcel Breuer and Associates.

#### **Criteria for Historic Designation:**

ULDR Section 47-24.11.B.6

d. Its identification as the work of a master builder, designer, or architect whose individual work has influenced the development of the city, state or nation.

Consultant response: The work of the architects, the internationally known Marcel Breuer and his talented associate and successor Robert Gatje have influenced the development of the city, state and nation.

## **Building Description:**

The applicant has provided a thorough physical description of the Main Library building in his narrative. With the sub-tropical climate in mind, Gatje and his design team oriented the library building south to north on the building site. The eight story library is a pre-cast and site cast concrete structure. The sun-struck south, east and west elevations are concrete curtain walls pierced with asymmetrically placed deep set windows with built-in pre-cast concrete shade elements. The curtain wall design has a strong Brutalist influence. Echoing his mentor, Breuer's "soft" Brutalism, Gatje rejected the style's exposed concrete surfaces and covered the library curtain walls with an elegant skin of Florida keystone

The north elevation of the library is a mass of stepped back glassed in terraces nestled between the curtain walls, rising from the second floor to the eighth. On the first floor of the building the architect provided an interior water feature, which opens to a small exterior waterfall, an architectural witticism that references the huge, glittering, glass assemblage above. The reading rooms and offices are provided with a view of the city and in daytime, they are illuminated with the cool north light that is so prized by artists.

#### **Criteria for Historic Designation:**

**ULDR Section 47-24.11.B.6** 

e. Its value as a building recognized for the quality of its architecture, and sufficient elements showing its architectural significance,

Consultant response: See Building Description above

### **Summary Conclusion:**

The Main Library is one of the most important buildings in the City of Fort Lauderdale. It meets both criteria d. and e. The Board should approve the application.

David Baber, representing Broward County Government, stated this was the most significant and iconic piece of architecture in Broward County and it deserved designation.

Mr. Schulze arrived at 5:19.

Chair Kyner asked about the window replacement project on the north side of the building and Mr. Baber said this was still in progress and the new windows were identical to the old windows in form and tinting.

Chair Kyner opened the public hearing portion of the meeting.

Steve Glassman, Secretary for the Broward County Historical Commission, said he was representing the Broward Trust for Historic Preservation. He stated he supported the request and pointed out that the building's interior was integral to the site design and showed photos demonstrating this. Mr. Glassman requested the interior of the building be included in the designation.

Mr. Baber confirmed that the County Commission had requested including the building exterior, the lot and the bridge to the parking garage. He agreed the interior was eligible as well but the County Commission had not discussed the interior.

Mr. Heidelberger said they must be cautious about exactly what was included if they chose to designate interior spaces because this could affect later changes and hamper functionality in the future. Ms. Scott felt that Mr. Glassman's photos had described the specific areas that should be considered. Ms. Sarver advised the Board to give Ms. Rathbun time to evaluate the interior to ensure it complied with the criteria before considering designation.

Steve Hammond, Broward County Assistant Public Works Director, said he had worked extensively with the building and remarked that there was ongoing maintenance, which was always respectful of the building. He agreed that the interior should be considered but asked the Board to go forward with designation of the exterior because the Commission had not discussed how the building would be used in the future.

There being no other members of the public wishing to address the Board on this matter, Chair Kyner closed the public hearing and brought the discussion back to the Board.

**Motion** made by Ms. Scott, seconded by Mr. Schulze, to approve the application as presented. In a roll call vote, motion passed 9-0.

**2.** 

Case	21H13	FMSF #	
Applicant	Karen Beard, CEO Bonnet House, Inc.		
Owner	Florida Trust for Historic Pre	eservation	
Address	900 North Birch Road		
General Location	Approximately 533 feet south of the Sunrise Boulevard and N. Birch Road intersection. The property is located on both the east and west sides of N. Birch Road		
Legal Description	east and west sides of N. Birch Road  FOLIO: 504201000050: 1-50-42 & 6-50-43 TR OF LAND BOUNDED ON W INTRA W/W, ON N BY S/L OF TWN 49, ON E BY OCEAN, ON S BY N/L OF BIRCH OCEAN FRONT SUB #2 & N/L OF BLK 10 OF SAID SUB EXT E TO OCEAN, LESS PT INC IN SEABRIDGE & LESS PT IN DB 716/574 & LESS PT K/A PARS 1 & 3 ON SURV REC IN DB 689/635 & LESS RDS, LESS BCH ESMT IN DB 372/360 AS MODIFIED BY OR 1213/643 & LESS DB 773/630 & LESS OR 11311/856  FOLIO: 504201000052 1-50-42 & 6-50-43 GOV LOT 1 OF SEC 1,LESS PTS P/A SEABRIDGE & ATLANTIC BCH DEV & LESS N 572.5,& PT GOV LOT 1 OF SEC 6 LYING W OF SR A-1-A,LESS N 572.5,& PT GOV LOT 7 OF SEC 1 LYING N OF BIRCH OCEAN FRONT SUB #2,& PT GOV LOT 2 OF SEC 6 LYING W OF SR A-1-A & N OF BIRCH OCEAN FRONT SUB #2,ALL LESS DBS 716/574 & 773/630 & ALL LESS PT NOT WITHIN E 750 THEREOF, TOGETHER WITH S 300 OF N 1201.25 OF PT SEC 6 LYING BET SR A-1-A & OCEAN		
Existing Use	Museum and gardens		
Proposed Use	Museum and gardens		
Applicable ULDR Sections	SACIION 47-24 11 1 3 C II		
Request(s)	1. Certificate of Appropriate	eness for new construction -	