

**CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE AND THE FORT LAUDERDALE  
COMMUNITY REDEVELOPMENT AGENCY**

**APPLICATION FOR FUNDING  
NE 4<sup>TH</sup> AVENUE COMPLETE STREET PROJECT  
IN THE CENTRAL CITY CRA**

**BROWARD REDEVELOPMENT PROGRAM (BRP)  
Fiscal Year 2018**

**HAND DELIVERED**

***September 21, 2017***

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<b>Page Number</b>
Cover Sheet	1
Application Form	6
Project Description	7
Detailed Plans and Cost Estimates	10
Criteria	10
Proximity To Transit	10
Environmental Sustainability Components	11
Ability To Timely Complete Project	12
Contribution of Non-County Sources	13
Increase in Tax Base	13
Higher Unemployment & Lower Property Growth Rate	16
Removal of Blighting Condition	17
Number of Jobs Created	20
Number of Jobs Created For Area Residents	23
Number of High Paying Jobs	26
Project Costs and Funding Sources	30
Project Site Control	31
Location of Project to Surrounding Area	33
Project Development Schedule	33

## APPENDICES

### ATTACHMENTS

LTR	DESCRIPTION
A	Signed Letter from City Manager Confirming City and CRA Support for Application and Project with copies to respective Boards.
B	Certified Resolutions from City Commission and CRA Board Approved July 11, 2017 declaring Application/projects having Beneficial Use and Supporting Economic Development.
C	Certified Resolution No 10-108 (Blight Resolution)
D	Legal Description and Map -Documentation that Project Is within CRA Area Meeting Blighting Conditions.
E	GIS Location Map
F	Location Map with Zoning & GIS Location Map -Aerial
G	Ft Lauderdale Multi Modal Connectivity Map, Certified Resolution 16-183 & Strava Data
H	Certified Resolution No. 12-02 -City Commission Approval of Redevelopment Plan
I	Certified Ordinance No. C-12-06
J	Community Redevelopment Plan
K	Detailed Cost Estimates
L	Concept Plans
M	Detailed Preliminary Project Plans-Section
N	GIS Mapping of Bus Stops within a 1/4 mile radius of Project Area
O	Project Development Schedule
P	Documentation of Funding Match
Q	Central City Advisory Board & Central City Alliance Support Documentation
R	Reports from National Complete Street Coalition, EPA and Wharton School, University of Penn and Victoria Transport Policy Institute
S	Estimated Increase in Tax Value and Tax Base as a Result of the Project
T	Higher Unemployment Documentation
U	Lower Property Value Growth Documentation
V	Survey of Blighting Conditions of Central City CRA and Summary Tables
W	Florida Statutes Definition of Blighted Area.
X	Crime Statistics
Y	CPTED Guidebook - US Dept of Justice Involvement
Z	US Dept of Transportation - Federal Highway Admin. Office Of Safety Requirements
AA	Existing Businesses along NE 4 <sup>th</sup> Avenue
BB	Consumer Spending Analysis - Claritas Report
CC	Dept of Labor Statistics - Occupational Wage Estimates
DD	Funding Source Information-Contact Persons
EE	Reports from Victoria Transport Institute & National Trust-Barracks Row

- FF Business Owners Letters from Warsaw Coffee, Out of Africa Gallery and HOMES Inc/Eat the Tea Restaurant – Job Creation.
- GG Purchase Order for Central City CRA Rezoning Consultant



**CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE AND THE FORT LAUDERDALE  
COMMUNITY REDEVELOPMENT AGENCY**

**APPLICATION FOR FUNDING  
NE 4<sup>TH</sup> AVENUE COMPLETE STREET PROJECT  
IN THE CENTRAL CITY CRA**

**BROWARD REDEVELOPMENT PROGRAM (BRP)  
Fiscal Year 2018**

**HAND DELIVERED**

***September 21, 2017***

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<b>Page Number</b>
Cover Sheet	1
Application Form	6
Project Description	7
Detailed Plans and Cost Estimates	10
Criteria	10
Proximity To Transit	10
Environmental Sustainability Components	11
Ability To Timely Complete Project	12
Contribution of Non-County Sources	13
Increase in Tax Base	13
Higher Unemployment & Lower Property Growth Rate	16
Removal of Blighting Condition	17
Number of Jobs Created	20
Number of Jobs Created For Area Residents	23
Number of High Paying Jobs	26
Project Costs and Funding Sources	30
Project Site Control	31
Location of Project to Surrounding Area	33
Project Development Schedule	33

## APPENDICES

### ATTACHMENTS

LTR	DESCRIPTION
A	Signed Letter from City Manager Confirming City and CRA Support for Application and Project with copies to respective Boards.
B	Certified Resolutions from City Commission and CRA Board Approved July 11, 2017 declaring Application/projects having Beneficial Use and Supporting Economic Development.
C	Certified Resolution No 10-108 (Blight Resolution)
D	Legal Description and Map -Documentation that Project Is within CRA Area Meeting Blighting Conditions.
E	GIS Location Map
F	Location Map with Zoning & GIS Location Map -Aerial
G	Ft Lauderdale Multi Modal Connectivity Map, Certified Resolution 16-183 & Strava Data
H	Certified Resolution No. 12-02 -City Commission Approval of Redevelopment Plan
I	Certified Ordinance No. C-12-06
J	Community Redevelopment Plan
K	Detailed Cost Estimates
L	Concept Plans
M	Detailed Preliminary Project Plans-Section
N	GIS Mapping of Bus Stops within a 1/4 mile radius of Project Area
O	Project Development Schedule
P	Documentation of Funding Match
Q	Central City Advisory Board & Central City Alliance Support Documentation
R	Reports from National Complete Street Coalition, EPA and Wharton School, University of Penn and Victoria Transport Policy Institute
S	Estimated Increase in Tax Value and Tax Base as a Result of the Project
T	Higher Unemployment Documentation
U	Lower Property Value Growth Documentation
V	Survey of Blighting Conditions of Central City CRA and Summary Tables
W	Florida Statutes Definition of Blighted Area.
X	Crime Statistics
Y	CPTED Guidebook - US Dept of Justice Involvement
Z	US Dept of Transportation - Federal Highway Admin. Office Of Safety Requirements
AA	Existing Businesses along NE 4 <sup>th</sup> Avenue
BB	Consumer Spending Analysis - Claritas Report
CC	Dept of Labor Statistics - Occupational Wage Estimates
DD	Funding Source Information-Contact Persons
EE	Reports from Victoria Transport Institute & National Trust-Barracks Row



- FF Business Owners Letters from Warsaw Coffee, Out of Africa Gallery and HOMES Inc/Eat the Tea Restaurant – Job Creation.
- GG Purchase Order for Central City CRA Rezoning Consultant

**BROWARD REDEVELOPMENT PROGRAM (BRP)  
(FY 2018)**

**HOUSING FINANCE COMMUNITY REDEVELOPMENT DIVISION  
BROWARD REDEVELOPMENT PROGRAM (BRP)**

**APPLICATION FORM**

(To Be Completed by Applicant)

1. Application Date: September 5, 2017
  
2. Applicant(s): City of Fort Lauderdale and the Fort Lauderdale Community  
Redevelopment Agency  
  
Address: 914 NW 6<sup>th</sup> Street – Suite 200, Fort Lauderdale, FL 33311  
  
Contact Person: Donald Morris. Title: CRA Manager  
Telephone #: (954) 828-4518 FAX #: (954) 828-4500  
  
E-mail: [dmorris@fortlauderdale.gov](mailto:dmorris@fortlauderdale.gov)
  
3. Project: NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue Complete Street Project In the Central City CRA  
  
Project Address: NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue Complete Street Project from Sunrise Boulevard to NE  
13<sup>th</sup> Street  
  
Project Location (Attach Map and Legal Description): GIS for Map /Surveyor for Legal:  
Legal Description & Map as Attachment D. Surveyor is Javier De la Rocha, P.S.M.  
Exacta Commercial Surveyors Location Maps attached as Attachments E & F.
  
4. Project Start Date: December 1, 2017  
  
Project Completion Date: November 1, 2020
  
5. Property Owner(s): Public Right-Of-Way in City of Fort Lauderdale (State Road 811)  
  
Property Owner(s) Address: 100 N Andrews Avenue, Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301  
  
Telephone #: (954) 828-4518 FAX #: (954) 828-4500  
  
E-mail: dmorris@fortlauderdale.gov
  
6. Funds Requested: \$1,000,000.00

## APPLICATION FORM *cont'd*

### 7. Project Description:

- a. Provide brief narrative of the proposed project including project objectives, major project characteristics, number and type of permanent jobs created, removal of blighting conditions, population served, public purpose, proximity to public or other transportation, and non-County funding sources. Identify any in-kind match.

#### Response:

The project consists of public improvements in the Central City CRA in the Right-of-Way of NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue from Sunrise Boulevard to NE 13<sup>th</sup> Street to the northern boundary of the Central City CRA, a distance of approximately .35 miles (Excluding the ROW of NE 13 Street). The improvements will be in the form of a Complete Street Project in accordance with Broward County's Complete Streets Program Guidelines as approved by Broward County Commission on March 12, 2013 and the Metropolitan Planning Council in July, 2012. The project is located in the Central City Community Redevelopment Area (CRA), formerly known as the Middle River-South Middle River- Sunrise Boulevard CRA and as shown on **Attachments "C", "D", "E" and "F"**. The public improvements to the street will include transportation improvements and streetscape enhancements. The project consists of road diet that includes lane elimination, buffered color enhanced bicycle lanes, milling and resurfacing, new signing and markings, median modifications, construction of right turn lane at NE 13<sup>th</sup> Street, intersection lighting improvements, ADA ramps, decorative LED pedestrian/security lighting, bike racks, wide sidewalks, and increased landscaping and entryway/place making design features. The corridor is part of the City of Fort Lauderdale Multimodal Connectivity Plan (**Attachment "G"**). The 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue Complete Streets project includes streetscape elements that are designed to create a thoroughfare that provides safe access for all users. Pedestrians, bicyclists, motorist and transit riders of all ages and abilities will be able to safely move along the roadway. The project is supported by the Central City CRA Advisory Board, Central City Alliance and consistent with recommendations of the approved Community Redevelopment Plan for the area. Upon completion the NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue Complete Street project will encourage pedestrian activity and make it easier to walk to shops or bicycle to work. The project will improve safety, lower transportation costs, promote economic development, increase property values, reduce emissions and fossil fuel use, foster a green environment and help create a healthier community by encouraging walking and biking.

The community redevelopment area was identified as blighted by the City Commission of the City of Fort Lauderdale on April 20, 2010 (**Attachment “C”**) and the City Commission approved the Community Redevelopment Plan for the area on January 5, 2012 by Resolution No. 12-02. (**Attachment “H”**) The City Commission by Ordinance No. C-12-06 on April 3, 2012 established a Redevelopment Trust Fund for the area (**Attachment “I”**), with the City of Fort Lauderdale being the only taxing authority levying ad valorem taxes within the redevelopment area that will be required to contribute to the fund, a sum equal to 95% of the incremental increase in ad valorem taxes levied each year by that taxing authority for period of 30 years.

NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue along with NE 13<sup>th</sup> Street are identified in the approved Community Redevelopment Plan as important neighborhood shopping streets and that the aging building stock, now occupied by marginal businesses and vacant underutilized land gives the impression of an area neglected and in decline. In addition, the surrounding residential uses, once solidly full of home owners has changed over the years and has now become predominantly rental, have not been as well maintained as the owner occupied units and are a primary contributor to the slum and blight condition of the area. These conditions are substantiated by the fact that the area has lower property value growth than both City of Fort Lauderdale and Broward County (**Page 16**). In addition to deterioration of building conditions in the project area, there are significant adverse environmental conditions and blighting conditions along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue that will be eliminated with the Complete Street Project (**Page 17**). The aging public improvements along this business corridor includes sidewalks of inadequate width and poor condition, missing ramps for ADA accessibility, inadequate street level lighting, inadequate separation between vehicular and pedestrian uses, poorly defined crosswalks, and inadequate landscaping.

The Community Redevelopment Plan identifies the redevelopment of the NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue Corridor as an Economic Development Strategy for this area (**P. V-2 of the approved Community Redevelopment Plan-Attachment J**), and as a major street having some of the greatest redevelopment potential in the area. It serves, along with NE 13<sup>th</sup> Street, as a “Main Street” and a “Neighborhood Center”. A proposed transit station is recommended in the CRA Plan along the FEC Railroad corridor at NE 13<sup>th</sup> Street in the Central City Area less than 2,000 feet east of NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue. Mixed use development and transit oriented development design (TOD) characteristic is part of the housing strategy and economic development strategy under the CRA Plan. In the 2017 Central City CRA budget, \$100,000 in CRA funding has been set aside to hire a planning consultant to recommend new zoning classifications to create mixed use - transit oriented zoning in the area, securing these services on August 31, 2017 (**Attachment “GG”**). The City of Fort Lauderdale has been engaged in planning for the potential of mass transit stations along the FEC Railway corridor in conjunction with the South Florida Regional Transportation Authority’s Fast Start Plan which proposes to move commuter rail service to the more centrally located FEC tracks. The potential for TOD developments near these new stations particularly in Fort Lauderdale is a major factor in the program. The Central

City proposed commuter rail stop along the FEC is identified on the City of Fort Lauderdale Multimodal Connectivity Map (**Attachment "G"**) along with a bikeway connecting greenway/bikeway along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Dixie Highway, the FEC Railway, Andrews Avenue, NE 13<sup>th</sup> Street and NE 15<sup>th</sup> Avenue. 2013 Strava Bike Counts shows a 1135% increase in bike ridership along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue from 2012 and an increase of 202% between 2013 and 2014, demonstrating the great need for Complete Street improvements to NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue to include buffered bike lanes. To help expedite the approval process, the City approved a Resolution (Resolution 16-183) (**Attachment "G"**) supporting Lane Elimination for NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue for this purpose with plans (shovel ready) at 80% complete and the project has already been presented to numerous civic groups receiving community support of the Central City Advisory Board who has representation from the five (5) neighborhood associations in the Central City CRA and from the Central City Alliance, its representative business association (**Attachment "Q"**). The connecting Dixie Highway greenway/bikeway is funded by the MPO and the NE 13 Street Bikeway funded by the Broward Redevelopment Program in 2014 will be completed in October 2017. The area is currently served by Public Transportation in the form of Broward County Transit with twenty eight (28) transit stops within the project area or within a ¼ mile radius of the project area (**Page 10**) with bus access to anywhere in Broward County.

The NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue Complete Streets Project will be a catalyst for job creation as the project will result in new businesses opening along the corridor, an increase in new private investment and an increase in sales volume in existing businesses resulting in new hires. (**Pages 20-30**) In addition, increased property values of housing in the surrounding neighborhood will attract new residents to the area with higher incomes. Currently the average household income of the district which is \$41,432 is over 50% less than the City's average of \$84,681. With those living in poverty in the Central City CRA being 40.88% compared to the City of 15.5%, poverty in the Central City CRA is 2.6 times greater than the City. The median income of the City (\$52,643) is 1.8 times greater than the CRA district (\$29,018). Unemployment in the CRA is also greater than the City Wide average (**Page 16**). The NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue Complete Streets Project is expected to create new permanent jobs. These jobs will primarily be in the area of neighborhood oriented commercial retail and office uses. A total of between 30 to 111 Full Time Equivalent (FTE) jobs will be created with a majority of these jobs being able to be filled by lower income neighborhood area residents (**Page 23**). The required minimum 15% cash match will be exceeded for this project with the match representing 32.6% of the total project approved for the NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue Complete Street Project.

- b. **Property acquisition projects must provide current appraisal(s) (i.e. no older than 6 months), and environmental audits(s), in accordance with the County requirements shown in Appendix II on Page 27. A Contract for Purchase is the minimum required documentation.**

**Response:**

N.A. There is no property acquisition proposed by this project.

- c. **In addition to the number of permanent jobs, created, interior build-out project for economic development must identify the project to be undertaken, the long-term tenant or business/property owner, and the term of the lease.**

**Response:**

N.A. There is no tenant build-out proposed as part of this project

- d. **Provide detailed cost information regarding the project. Include design plans and costs estimates, bids, and other available information. Attach project plans and detailed cost estimates. Plans must be to scale. Interior build-out projects must include the cost per square foot, number of square feet, and cost of the interior build-out not including furniture and equipment.**

**Response:**

The project is estimated to cost approximately \$1,482,652. Attached as **Attachment “K”** is detailed cost information regarding the project as prepared by engineering staff of the the Fort Lauderdale Transportation and Mobility Department and information from the Florida Department of Transportation. Also attached are concept plans and a preliminary section for the Complete Street (**Attachments “L” and “M”**). The final section and plan will be subject to further community, City, Broward County and FDOT input in accordance with the Broward County Complete Street Guidelines.

- e. **Demonstrate how the project addresses the Criteria, shown on Pages 17-20.**

**Criteria**

- 1. **Proximity to Transit and Transit Accommodations: To obtain a high score of “3,” the Application must demonstrate that the project is within ¼ mile of public transportation (attach map) and that the project includes transit accommodations. The low score of “0” will be given if the Application provides no documentation or the project is one mile or more from public transportation. Transit accommodations include, but are not limited to: shuttle service, bicycle racks, private shower, etc.**

**Response:**

The project is very centrally located for service by Broward County Transit. Within a ¼ mile radius of the project there are a total of 28 transit stops that include Broward County Transit Bus Route 50 along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Broward County Transit Route 60 along Andrews Avenue, Broward County Transit Routes 36 and 101 along Sunrise Boulevard

and Broward County Transit Routes 10 and 20 along Federal Highway. Broward County Transit Route 50 includes 5 bus stops directly along the project area route at 1122 NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue, 1316 NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue, 1428 NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue, 1211 NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue, and 1401 NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue, with nearby stops at NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue at NE 13 Street, NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue at NE 14 Street and NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue at NE 15 Street. Route 50 runs north and south starting at the Broward Central Bus Terminal downtown traveling north along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue to Wilton Drive to Dixie Highway terminating at Hillsboro Boulevard in Deerfield Beach at the Northeast Transit Center (where there is also a Tri-Rail and Amtrak Station). The bus stop wait for Route 50 Buses is from 15 to 30 minutes depending on weekday or weekend services. The distance traveled by buses on Route 50 to the Broward Central Bus Terminal, starting from where it can be boarded in the project area is less than 1 mile away (less than 5 minutes away). From there, the traveler can transfer onto to any one of 17 other bus routes to anywhere in Broward County. Next to the Central Bus Terminal is the location of the new Brightline Terminal passenger service that will provide service from Miami to Orlando.

Route 60 along Andrews Avenue includes 10 stops within a 1/4 mile at Andrews Avenue and Sunrise Blvd, NE 11 Street, NE 13 Street and NE 14 Street and will take the traveler as far north as the NE Transit Center at Atlantic Boulevard along Coconut Creek Parkway to Broward College north Campus and Atlantic Technical Center. It can also take the traveler south into downtown and the Greyhound Station, Broward College downtown campus and FAU, and the Broward Central Terminal where a connecting bus can take the traveler as far south as the Village at Gulfstream Park in Hallandale.

Route 36 bus along Sunrise Boulevard can take the traveler as far west as Sawgrass Mills and as far east as the Galleria Mall and Fort Lauderdale Beach. Route 101 bus (AKA The Breeze) along Federal Highway provides service to airport and Aventura Mall. Route 10 Bus Service will take the traveler all the way up Federal Highway to Camino Real for connection in Palm Beach County at Palm Tram stopping at Holiday Park, Atlantic Shores Hospital, Holy Cross Hospital, Imperial Point Hospital and the Pompano Citi Center, and Route 20 bus takes the traveler to the Northeast Transit Center in Pompano, up to Sample Road and Broward Health North.

All buses include Wheelchair Accessible Bike Racks (transit accommodations) which correlate well to the transit accommodations - ie. bike lanes and bike racks to be constructed and installed as part of the Project. A copy of the Broward County Transit Map, Bus Schedule for Route 50, 60, 36, 101, 10 and 20 and GIS mapping showing the bus stop locations are within the Project Area or within a 1/4 mile of the Project Area is provided as **Attachment "N"**. **From the Project Area the traveler can take transit virtually anywhere!**

- 2. Environmental Sustainability Components (solar technology, LEED standards, sea-level rise mitigation/adaptation, etc.). To obtain a high score of "3," the Application must demonstrate that the project contains two (2) or**

**more components that address environmental sustainability. The low score of “0” will be given if the Application provides no documentation or there are no environmental sustainability components.**

**Response:**

The NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue Complete Street Project incorporates thirteen (13) Sustainable Components. These include:

- Six foot buffered , color enhanced bicycle lanes and continuous wide sidewalks provided on both sides of the Roadway to encourage alternative transportation and carbon emissions reductions;
- Wide, detached 7 foot sidewalks that encourage walkability and reduce carbon emissions;
- LED street lighting for energy savings;
- Increased landscape areas and shade trees to reduce heat island effect, increase storm water capacity and encourage walking and biking;
- Existing pavement removed will be crushed, recycled and reused, keeping it out of landfills;
- Improved traffic flow will reduce emissions and fossil fuel use;
- Existing street widths will be reduced as a result of eliminating traffic lanes and replacing them with dedicated buffered bicycle bike lanes. Wide streets are problematic for both mobility and ecology;
- The project will utilize areas with a high Solar Reflective Index (SRI) further reducing the heat absorption of the street;
- The street design will follow Complete Streets guidelines ensuring benefits for mobility, community and environment. Materials selected for construction will be readily maintained and durable over an extended period of time in consideration of long term maintenance needs;
- The street design will be cost effective taking into consideration lifecycle costing. The street design will also be context sensitive to help define the character of the area;
- The street design will expand usable public space by reallocating underutilized roadway space to create improved walkability and connectivity;
- Bike racks will be installed along the corridor to accommodate bicycle transit stops; and
- Water efficient Xeriscaping will be used using plant material that is both drought resistant and native to South Florida or Adapted Plants.

- 3. Ability to Timely Complete Project: To obtain a high score of “3,” the Application must include a Project Development Schedule and demonstrate that the project will be completed in accordance with the Project Development Schedule. The low score of “0” will be given if the Application provides no documentation regarding a Project Development Schedule or ability to complete within the Project Development Schedule.**



**Response:**

The Project Development Schedule is attached as **Attachment “O”**. The project will be completed in accordance with the Project Development Schedule. The project will be managed and designed by FDOT and the City of Fort Lauderdale Transportation and Mobility Department. The Fort Lauderdale Transportation and Mobility Department is highly qualified to implement the project and keep it on schedule, having recently done the NE 13th Street Complete Street Project and coordinated the Dixie Highway Complete Street Project. The project implementation will be in two components. The first component implemented by FDOT is “Shovel Ready” with FDOT plans 80% complete and consist mostly of improvements to occur within the street. There have been numerous meetings with the community to get their input and to review plans, the most recent occurring on August 24, 2017. In addition, the City Commission approved lane elimination to allow for safe bicycle usage per Resolution 16-183 (**Attachment “G”**) The second component of this project will be designed and implemented by the City of Fort Lauderdale with input from FDOT with most of this work occurring between the ROW line and the curb to include the wider sidewalks, landscaping and pedestrian lighting. All work will be completed in accordance with Broward Redevelopment Program requirements.

- 4 Contribution from non-County Sources: To obtain a high score of “3,” the Application must provide detailed project costs and all funding including County and non-County funding, including an in-kind match as defined on Page 12. The low score of “0” will be given if the Application provides no documentation regarding the contribution or there is no non-County contribution.**

**Response:**

Detailed Project Costs is provided on **Attachment “K”**. Contribution of non-County funding is approximately \$483,000. The project will be completed in two stages. New pavement, buffered bike lanes and striping will be completed for approximately \$483,000 with wide sidewalks, lighting and landscaping completed for approximately \$1,000,000. With a total project cost of \$1,482,652, the contribution of non-County funding sources represents 32.6% of the estimated project cost, far exceeding the minimum 15% Broward Redevelopment Program requirement. The match is provided from approved funding from FDOT where approximately \$700,000 was approved for NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue Complete Street Improvements from the FDOT and the MPO using state and federal funds for NE 4<sup>TH</sup> Avenue from Sunrise Boulevard to the Middle River Bridge. The plans related to this funding are “Shovel Ready” at 80% compete. On **Attachment “P”** is documentation of non-county match by FDOT/MPO.

- 5 Increase in Tax Base: To obtain a high score of “3,” the Application must provide calculations of the expected increase in the tax base due to private redevelopment, document the private redevelopment, and show the increase in the tax base. The low score of “0” will be given if the**

**Application provides no calculations or insufficient documentation of private redevelopment or no increase in the tax base.**

**Response:**

On March 12, 2013, the Broward County Commission unanimously approved Complete Streets, approved coordinating efforts with municipalities, the MPO, FDOT and others, to work with partners to identify funding sources to finance improvements associated with Complete Streets and direct staff to take all steps to amend the Traffic-ways Plan, Comp Plan, Land Use Plan, Administrative Code and all other documents to fully implement the Complete Street Guidelines. Broward's Complete Street Guidelines were approved by the Broward Metropolitan Planning Organization in July, 2012. The National Complete Streets Coalition is a national organization that advocates adoption of complete streets policies, provides technical assistance and research into impacts of this important national initiative. They have documentation that complete streets raise property values. According to their research, in a survey of real estate markets from Jacksonville, Florida to Stockton, California, a one-point increase in the walkability of a neighborhood as measured by WalkScore.com increased home values by \$700 to \$3,000. For neighborhoods in the Washington, D.C. region, becoming one step more walkable on a five-point scale can add \$9 per square foot to retail rents and nearly \$82 per square foot to home values. This increase is amplified when walkable neighborhoods are near each other, demonstrating the value of networks of Complete Streets connected throughout a community (such as the NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue Project which is part of the City's Multi-Modal Connectivity Network). Its not just sidewalks that add value, bike paths add value to neighboring properties as well. One North Carolina neighborhood saw property values rise \$5,000 due to a nearby bikeway, while research showed that bike paths in Delaware could be expected to add \$8,800 to neighboring home values. Even design elements like street trees can raise property values. Having trees on a street in front of homes in Portland, Oregon added more than \$7,000 to selling prices.

The US Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) Office of Sustainable Communities have also documented the economic impacts of public projects that make walking safer and more appealing, such as improving sidewalks, reducing traffic speeds, adding streetlights and street trees and beautifying the streetscape as would occur with the NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue Street Complete Street Project. According to their 2012 research, in Lodi, California, a \$4.5 million streetscape retrofit of a five block area helped attract 60 new businesses, reducing the vacancy rate from 18 to 6 percent. Similarly in West Palm Beach, Florida, streetscape improvements changed the vacancy rate from 80% vacant to 80% occupied with property values increasing more than six fold. EPA has concluded that walkable neighborhoods have higher home prices with one study finding that homes with above average levels of walkability command a premium of about \$4,000 to \$34,000 above homes with average levels of walkability. The walkability premium exists for commercial real estate as well. An analysis of more that 4,200 properties found that walkability was associated with higher property values and higher net operating income for offices, retail and industrial properties. They state that an extensive body of research exist that

correlate such transit accessibility to increased property values. The size of the premium will vary among studies and markets with the greatest increase occurring in the office and retail markets as follows:

<b>PROPERTY TYPE</b>	<b>PREMIUM</b>
Single Family Home	2 to 32%
Condominium	2 to 18%
Apartment	4 to 45%
Office	9 to 120%
Retail	1 to 167%

A study by the Wharton School at the University of Pennsylvania examined the economic impact on property values of a range of place-based public investments including commercial corridor improvements and streetscapes in the City of Philadelphia. While it is a well understood in principle that investments in blighted area raise property values, their research quantifies these benefits through econometric analysis and integration of data from multiple city sources. The study uses 200,000 property sales price observations over a 14 year period and constructed a spatial database at their GIS Lab. They concluded that while being located within ¼ to ½ mile of a commercial corridor adversely affects house values by 13% to 9%, the negative effect of the commercial corridor is reversed if it is in excellent condition increasing their value by as much as 36% and a commercial corridor that was improved with streetscape impacts a considerable increase in surrounding home values as well on the order of a 28% gain in value relative to similar homes in comparable areas without streetscape improvements.

<b>Impact on House Values - Philadelphia</b>	
<b>Variable</b>	<b>% Impact</b>
<+ 1/4 Mile to a Commercial Corridor in Excellent Condition	36%
1/4 to 1/2 Mile to a Commercial Corridor in Excellent Condition	20%
Improvements in Streetscapes of Commercial Corridors	28%
Near New Tree Plantings	9%
Adjacent to a Stabilized and Greened Lot	17%
Located in a Business Improvement District	30%

Copies of these reports are provided as **Attachment “R”**. Considering that the project are in the Central City CRA has experienced lower property growth than both the City and the County as documented in Evaluation Criteria (**Page 16**), and that the existing commercial corridor along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue is in a deteriorating condition with 30% of the

adjacent property vacant and underutilized as documented in Evaluation Criteria (**Page 17**), it is reasonable to assume that the NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue Complete Street Project streetscape improvements will increase property values along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue where the improvements are constructed and in the immediate surrounding areas. The increase in property values directly equate to an increase in the tax base in ad valorem property tax. Using the data produced by the Wharton School at the University of Pennsylvania and conservatively estimating that residential property values within a ½ mile radius of the streetscape project will increase in value by 20% as a result of the project, the estimated increase in residential property values alone in a ½ mile radius in the Central City CRA Community Redevelopment Area would be \$9,838,092 resulting in an increase in ad valorem property tax revenues of \$187,442. This is based on using last years taxable values and the 2016 millage rate for the area of 19.0527 Mills and does not take into account homesteaded property since homesteaded assessments are capped at a maximum increase of 3% annually. A copy of the Excel Spread sheet and calculations which provides the backup for this information, is provided as **Attachment “S”**.

- 6. Higher Unemployment than Municipality and County and/or Lower Property Value Growth for Redevelopment Area than for Municipality and County: To obtain a high score of “3,” the Application must demonstrate higher unemployment and/or lower property value growth in the redevelopment area than those of the Municipality or the County. The low score of “0” will be given if the Application provides no documentation regarding unemployment and property values or if unemployment in the redevelopment area is lower than those of the Municipality and the County and/or property value growth is higher than those of the Municipality and the County.**

**Response:**

There is higher unemployment in the Central City Community Redevelopment Area (CRA) than in the City of Fort Lauderdale and Broward County. In the Central City CRA, 78% of the labor force is estimated to be employed for the current year. By comparison, in the City of Fort Lauderdale 89% of the labor force is estimated to be employed in the current year, while in Broward County, 90% of the labor force is estimated to be employed for the current year. This information is based on Claritas site reports for the Central City CRA area, City of Fort Lauderdale and Broward County. The 2017 Demographics Summary Reports documenting this information along with their methodology is included under **Attachment “T”**. The data was compiled by Environics Analytics who uses the American Community Survey which provides annual data down to the block group level.

There is Lower Property Value Growth for the Central City CRA project area than for the City of Fort Lauderdale and Broward County. In the Central City CRA redevelopment project area the market value of property along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue increased by 8.4 % between 2015 and 2016 as compared to increases to property in Broward County that increased 9.1% and the City of Fort Lauderdale that increased 10.2% during this same

period. This pattern continues into 2017, where in the Central City CRA the market value of property in the redevelopment project area along NE 4th Avenue increased by 6.6% between 2016 and 2017 as compared to Broward County that increased 7.4% and the City of Fort Lauderdale that increased 7.6% during the same period. This information is based on Broward County Property Appraiser Reports for the Central City CRA project area and Fort Lauderdale and Broward County Real Estate Use Code Summary Reports from the County Property Appraiser. Copies of these reports documenting these values along with the Excel Spread Sheet providing the comparison is attached as **Attachment “U”**.

7. **Increasing Accredited Child Care Facilities Available: NA**
8. **Removal of Blighting Conditions: To obtain a high score of “3,” the Application must demonstrate the blighting conditions and how the project will remove such conditions. The low score of “0” will be given if the Application provides no documentation regarding blighting conditions.**

**Response:**

By Resolution No. 10-108, On April 20<sup>th</sup> 2010, the City Commission found the Central City CRA Community Redevelopment Area to be Blighted as defined in Part III, Chapter 163, Florida Statutes. The “Predominance of defective or inadequate street layout, parking facilities, roadways, or public transportation facilities”, “Faulty layout in relation to size, adequacy, accessibility or usefulness” and “Deterioration of improvements “ are some of the factors under this statute which defines whether an area is blighted when such conditions are present. The inadequacy of NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue and conditions of blight have been documented by a Conditions Survey which surveyed along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue between in the Central City CRA area. A copy of the surveys and summary tables of blighting conditions are provided in **Attachment “V”**

The results of the field survey indicate that NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue project area in the Central City CRA is blighted as follows:

- Inadequate sidewalk width was found in the R.O.W adjacent to 76% of adjacent properties;
- Deteriorating sidewalks were found in the R.O.W. fronting 60% of the adjacent properties; Obstacles or protrusions in the sidewalk were present in the R.O.W. fronting 56% of the adjacent properties;
- Changes in sidewalk grade was present in the R.O.W fronting 50% of the adjacent properties;
- Missing ADA curb ramps with detectable warnings were found in the R.O.W fronting 23% of the adjacent properties;
- Inadequate existing curb ramps were found in the R.O.W fronting 26% of the adjacent properties;

- Other hazardous sidewalk conditions such as tripping hazards, signs or trees blocking sidewalks, storm drains in the pathway and raised sidewalks were found in the R.O.W fronting 46% of the adjacent properties;
- Standing street water was present in the R.O.W fronting 16% of the adjacent properties;
- Deteriorating street surface was found in the R.O.W fronting 36% of the adjacent properties;
- Inadequate crosswalks was present in the R.O.W fronting 33% of the adjacent properties;
- Inadequate pedestrian level lighting was found in the R.O.W fronting 96% of the adjacent properties;
- Lack of street trees or landscape exist in the R.O.W fronting 76% of the adjacent properties;
- Dead or dying street trees or landscaping exist in the R.O.W fronting 10% of the adjacent properties;
- Deteriorated or inadequate driveways were present in the R.O.W fronting 20% of the adjacent properties; and
- Other inadequate or deteriorated street conditions were present including missing curb, damaged curb and obsolete driveways located where sidewalk should be in the R.O.W fronting 20% of the adjacent properties.

The existing aging street does not meet current standards and deteriorating conditions creates safety and design issues. The NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue Complete Streets Project will redesign and reconstruct the roadways in accordance with the Complete Street Guidelines and Florida Department of Transportation criteria and standards for roadway design. This will eliminate the blighting conditions described and documented from the Conditions Survey.

In addition to the clear physical indicators of blight that will be removed as a result of the project, other factors leading to economic distress in the blighted area as defined under Florida Statutes will be corrected as a result of the project. These other factors include assessed values of surrounding property failing to show any appreciable increase, and incidence of crime higher in the area than in the county or municipality and unsafe conditions. A copy of Florida Statutes definition of “Blighted Area” is attached as **Attachment “W”**.

Market values of surrounding property failing to show any appreciable increase: On **Page 16**, it was documented that there is Lower Property Value Growth for properties in the Central City CRA redevelopment project area along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue than for the City of Fort Lauderdale and Broward County. In the question regarding Increase in the Tax Base as a result of the project, it was shown on **Pages 16** of the Application that the project would remove the blight associated with lower property values by increasing property values of property within a ½ mile radius of the project.

Incidence of Crime Higher Than in the City: While crime city wide in Fort Lauderdale dropped between 2015 and 2016, in the Central City CRA crime increased by 11.3%. Crime Statistics for the Central City CRA Area show that Part I Crimes (Violent Crime) that include homicide, robbery, aggravated assault, vehicle theft, aggravated stalking, burglary, larceny and sex offenses increased between 2015 and 2016 from a total of 528 offences to 595 offenses, an increase of 12.6%. During the same period, Part 2 Crimes including damage to property, disorderly conduct, drug violations, fraud, liquor law violations, domestic offences, stolen property, weapons violations and other offenses increased from 418 offenses to 458 offenses, an increase of 9.5%. By comparison, between 2015 and 2016 Part I Crimes Citywide increased only 8.2% and Part II crimes decreased by 1.5%. The Central City CRA, which is only 344 acres in size represents only 14% of the total area of the City of Fort Lauderdale which is 23,240 acres. However, in the Central City CRA homicides tripled between 2015 and 2016 with 20% of all homicides in 2016 in the City of Fort Lauderdale occurring in the Central City CRA area. The greatest incidents of Part I and Part II crimes were along the proposed project location of NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue between Sunrise Boulevard and NE 13 Street with two of the eleven addresses with the greatest incidence of crime along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue. The data is provided by the Fort Lauderdale Police Department and attached as **Attachment “X”**.

CRIME STATISTICS						
OFFENCE	Central City CRA			CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE		
	2015	2016	% CHANGE	2015	2016	% CHANGE
PART I (VIOLENT) CRIMES	528	595	12.6% Increase	9757	10560	8.2% increase
PART II CRIMES.	418	458	9.5% increase	9211	8144	11.5% decrease
ALL CRIMES	946	1053	11.3% increase	18,968	18704	1.3% decrease
DRUG VIOLATIONS	83	90	8.4% increase	1504	1046	30.4% decrease
HOMICIDE	0	3	300% increase	9	15	66% increase
ROBBERY	35	41	17.1% increase	386	446	15% increase

Source: Fort Lauderdale Police Department

The civic associations in the Central City CRA are very active in crime prevention, working closely with the Fort Lauderdale Police, and have anti-crime meetings with City staff. While these actions help, additional tools are needed to help reduce crime.

Installing improved lighting along NE 4th Avenue as part of the Complete Street Project will have an impact on reducing crime in the area. Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED) has been promoted and endorsed by the US Department of Justice Office of Community Policing, National Crime Prevention Council as a Best Practice and numerous local policing agencies across the county and internationally for 40 years. It is a multi-disciplinary approach to deterring criminal behavior through the implementation of four principles which can reduce the incidence and fear of crime. The first principle of CPTED is Natural Surveillance. Natural Surveillance is facilitated by adequate sightlines and lighting. Based on the fundamental premise that criminals do not

wish to be observed, the primary aim of surveillance is to keep intruders under observation which can be achieved in part (according to the Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design Guidebook), through improved street lighting. CPTED minimum standards is that pedestrian walkways and access routes open to the public spaces provide adequate lighting to allow identification of a face at a distance of about 10 meters (33 feet) for a person with normal vision. With NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue being a main business corridor in the South Middle River neighborhood, the blight associated with the rise of victim crimes, which has significantly increased, will be reduced along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue with improved pedestrian lighting as recommended by CPTED. A copy of the CPTED Guidebook highlighting the section on lighting and background on the US Department of Justice involvement with CPTED is attached as **Attachment “Y”**

**Unsafe Conditions:** The US Department of Transportation – Federal Highway Administration created an Office of Safety to work with state and local partners to promote roadway safety. Their engineering solutions to improve pedestrian safety include buffer or planting strips separating pedestrian on sidewalks and bicyclist from moving vehicles on the road, marked crosswalks indicating where pedestrians can cross the street, curb ramps for a smooth transition between sidewalk and street, medians and crossing islands providing pedestrians a safe place to wait while crossing the street, improved signage and signals, narrowing or eliminating travel lanes and improved street lighting. They recognize that the absence of these elements in a street create an unsafe condition. The NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue Street Conditions Survey provided in **Attachment “V”** not only documents blight associated with deteriorating conditions along the street, but also unsafe conditions as recognized by the US Department of Transportation (**Attachment “Z”**). These unsafe conditions will be eliminated through redesign and construction of a Complete Street which incorporates the The US Department of Transportation Office of Safety Engineering solutions to improve street safety.

- 9 Number of Permanent Jobs Created:** To obtain a high score of “3,” the Application must demonstrate the number of permanent jobs and/or job training created and how the project contributes to long-term job creation and/or job training .
- The low score of “0” will be given if the Application provides no documentation regarding the permanent number of jobs created or how the project contributes to long- term job creation. The number of jobs created must be calculated in accordance with the American Recovery and Reinvestment Act of 2009 (ARRA),as described at [http://www.whitehouse.gov/omb/assets/memoranda\\_2010/m10-08.pdf](http://www.whitehouse.gov/omb/assets/memoranda_2010/m10-08.pdf). The number of jobs must be expressed as Full-Time Equivalents (FTE) and must not include indirect and induced jobs.

**Response:**

The National Complete Streets Coalition and The US Environmental Protection Agency Office of Sustainable Communities has documented the impact of Complete Street



policies and smart growth on private investment including job creation (**Attachment “R” and “EE”**). Based on their finding, the investment communities made in implementing Complete Streets-smart growth streetscapes can stimulate far greater private investment especially in retail districts. In Washington DC, \$8.5 million in design improvements along a three-quarter mile corridor in Barracks Row, including new patterned sidewalks, street trees and lighting helped attract 44 new businesses and 200 new jobs (one job per \$42,500 in streetscape improvements), along with increases in sales and foot traffic. Lancaster, California added pedestrian safety features as part of their revitalization effort including wider sidewalks, landscaping and traffic calming that resulted in \$125 million in private investment, a 26% increase in sales tax revenue and 800 new jobs after a public investment of \$10.6 million (one job per \$13,250 in streetscape improvements).

As described in Evaluation Criteria on **Page 14** of the Application, in Lodi California a \$4.5 million streetscape retrofit of a five block area helped attract 60 new businesses and corresponding job creation. There are numerous examples of economic revitalization where public investment in roadway infrastructure which improves safety and comfort create conditions favorable for economic activity to occur and lead to a surge in private investment at adjacent properties. As documented by the Victoria Transport Policy Institute in New York City on Ninth Avenue in Manhattan, retail sales increased 49% after the installation of parking protected bike lanes, or 16 times the borough wide retail sales growth. In Brooklyn on streets adjacent to public improvements at Pear Street Plaza, retail sales went up 172%. In Times Square, rents doubled following the 2009 Green Light for Manhattan Improvement Project and new flagship stores opened generating \$110 billion in economic activity. Commercial vacancies decreased 49% in the Union Square area following public street improvements including protected bike lanes. Similar impacts occurred on First and Second Avenue in New York where similar improvements resulted in 47% fewer commercial vacancies. Copies of these reports are provided as **Attachment “R” and “EE”**. Decrease in vacancy rates and attraction of new businesses to an area directly results in an increase in jobs. Vacancy rates along the NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue Corridor proposed to be improved with a Complete Street streetscape and are also expected to decrease, new businesses will be attracted to the area and an increase in sales for existing businesses is expected to occur based on documented impacts in other areas where similar improvements were constructed. This will result in long term job creation as new permanent jobs will be created. Based on the number of jobs created on similar projects nationally as described above correlated to the dollar amount of public investment in streetscape improvements, one job created for every \$13,250 to \$42,500 in public improvements along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue would result in 34 to 111 permanent jobs created as a result of the NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue Complete Street Project.

The jobs would be the result of the attraction of new businesses to the area and new hires by existing businesses from increased sales. The jobs would occur along the commercial corridor of NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue and along surrounding commercial streets positively impacted by the improvements. The 34 to 111 jobs would be 34 to 111 Full-Time Equivalent (FTE) based on all positions working a full time work week schedule of 40 hours using guidance for reporting on job estimates from Memoranda M-10-08 from

the US Director of the Office of Management and Budget. These jobs are not temporary construction jobs as a result of the project but permanent jobs that contribute to long term job growth as a result of new businesses opening along the corridor, expanded business as a result of increased investment and an increase in sales volume in existing businesses resulting in new hires. There are 31 existing businesses along the NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue Complete Street project area (**Attachment “AA”**) and a total of 41 Business Licenses along the corridor. The creation of one new job by each existing business as a result of an improved business climate created by this revitalization activity could create 31 jobs alone.

The likelihood of new job opportunities being created along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue as a result of the project is further supported by the demographics of the area. Retail spending by area residents shows that consumer expenditures of Central City CRA residents far exceed retail sales in the Central City CRA in the following areas among others:

- Food and Beverage – \$3,662,728 Opportunity Gap/Surplus;
- Grocery Stores - \$5,042,863 Opportunity Gap/Surplus;
- Men’s and Women’s Clothing – \$362,155 Opportunity Gap/Surplus;
- Sporting, Hobby, Books and Music - \$477,918 Opportunity Gap/Surplus;
- General Merchandise - \$1,154,814 S Opportunity Gap/Surplus;
- Florist - \$54,146 Opportunity Gap/Surplus
- Hobby, Toys and Games – 181,309 Opportunity Gap/Surplus
- Office Supplies, Stationary and Gifts - \$501,175 Opportunity Gap/Surplus, and
- Food Service and Drinking Places - \$2,708,818 Opportunity Gap/Surplus

Other areas where opportunity exist for new businesses are shown in the chart below. The chart also shows businesses that are in overabundance in the CRA areas such as convenience, beer-wine/liquor stores, gas stations and building supplies. This demonstrates that an opportunity exist for redevelopment of new retail and service establishments along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue (where 30% of the adjacent property is vacant land) and the surrounding area once the street is significantly improved since the spending patterns of area residents and their surplus spending outside the area would support new business opportunities in the neighborhood. These would include restaurants, retail shops and specialty stores. A copy of the analysis based on Claritas Reports for the Central City CRA area (**Attachment “BB”**) and summarized as follows:

**RETAIL SALES GENERATED BY POPULATION OF THE CENTRAL CITY CRA AND DOLLARS SPENT BY THAT POPULATION**

CATEGORY	2017 Demand (Consumer Expenditures)	2017 Supply (Retail Sales)	Opportunity Gap/Surplus

Convenience	\$ 440,023	\$ 544,442	\$ (104,419)
Beer, Wine Liquor Stores	\$ 354,249	\$ 1,982,130	\$ (1,627,881)
Gas Stations	\$ 621,250	\$ 9,166,330	\$ (6,058,159)
Building Material & Supply	\$ 4,053,077	\$ 47,182,372	\$ (43,129,365)
Grocery Stores	\$ 6,599,266	\$ 1,556,403	\$ 5,042,868
Food and Beverage	\$ 7,201,260	\$ 3,538,532	\$ 3,662,728
Men's Clothing	\$ 81,106	\$ 29,480	\$ 51,626
Women's Clothing	\$ 373,948	\$ 63,419	\$ 310,529
Health and Personal Care	\$ 192,318	\$ 0	\$ 192,318
Cosmetics, Beauty Supplies, Perfumes	\$ 257,724	\$ 99,635	\$ 158,090
Optical stores	\$ 90,571	\$ 38,332	\$ 52,239
Florist	\$ 54,146	\$ 0	\$ 54,146
Office Supply, Stationary and Gifts	\$ 501,175	\$ 0	\$ 501,175
Food Service And Drinking Places	\$ 5,399,219	\$ 2,690,401	\$ 2,708,818

Source: Claritas Retail Market  
Retail Stores Opportunity 2017  
– Environics Analytics

As a result of public improvements in the Central City CRA along NE 13<sup>th</sup> Street and additional improvements proposed along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue, linking the business districts in the Central City CRA to the Downtown Regional Activity Center that starts at Sunrise Boulevard, businesses in the area including Warsaw Coffee, Out of Africa Gallery and Homes Inc /Eat the Tea Restaurant are proposing to expand their operations that will result in job creation. **Attachment “FF” provides letters from these businesses stating their proposed expansion/development plans and the estimated number of FTE permanent jobs estimated to be created which is projected as approximately 30 permanent jobs.**

10. **The final Score will be up to two (2) points based on the responses to each of the following:**
  - a. **Number of Jobs Created for Area Residents: To obtain the full “2”**

**points, the Application must demonstrate that the permanent jobs created are for residents of the redevelopment area. No points will be given if the Application provides no documentation or none of the jobs created are for residents of the redevelopment area.**

**Response:**

In the Central City CRA, 1.08% walk to work and 1.32% bicycle to work (2.4% combined) with the travel time for 10.36% of the estimated workers age 16+ less than 15 minutes. Based on this demographic profile it can be assumed that of the 34 to 111 new permanent jobs that will be created as a result of new business and improved sales of existing businesses along the corridor, that between 2.4% and 10.36% will be area residents who have less than 15 minutes of travel time to the new jobs created and who would include those that walk or bicycle to work.

Therefore, of those with less than 15 minutes travel time to work, a minimum of 3.5 and a maximum of 11.49 (rounded to a minimum of 3 to a maximum of 11 Full Time Equivalent Jobs) of the new permanent jobs created would be filled by area residents. Within this group, a minimum of .81 and a maximum of 2.6 (Rounded to 2 Full Time Equivalent Jobs) of the new permanent jobs would be filled by area residents that walk or bicycle to work. With new transit facilities to be constructed along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue as part of the complete streets project, including a designated bicycle lane and bicycle racks, along with new wide handicap accessible sidewalks, these facilities will encourage and attract area residents to new jobs along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue who are most likely to walk and bicycle to work or whose from households who may not own a car (which is 16.63% of all households in this CRA area)

This information is based on Claritas site reports for the Central City CRA area as provided in **Attachment “T”**. The data was compiled by Environics Analytics a nationally recognized demographic source and drawn from Claritas Reports designed from the specific boundaries of the CRA, using American Community Surveys down to the block group level.

ESTIMATED MINIMUM NUMBER OF TOTAL PERMANENT JOBS (FULL TIME EQUIVALENT (FTE)) CREATED AS A RESULT OF THE PROJECT: 34 JOBS		
ESTIMATED NUMBER OF PERMANENT JOBS CREATED FOR AREA RESIDENTS		
Total	Percent	Worker Demographic Profile
0	2.4%	Minimum (Workers that Walk or Bicycle to Work)
3	10.36%	Maximum (Workers with Less than 15 Minutes Travel Time to Work)

ESTIMATED MAXIMUM NUMBER OF TOTAL PERMANENT JOBS (FULL TIME EQUIVALENT (FTE)) CREATED AS A RESULT OF THE PROJECT: 111 JOBS		
ESTIMATED NUMBER OF PERMANENT JOBS CREATED FOR AREA RESIDENTS		
Total	Percent	Worker Demographic Profile
2	2.4%	Minimum (Workers that Walk or Bicycle to Work)
11	10.36%	Maximum (Workers with Less than 15 Minutes Travel Time to Work)

Source: Claritas Demographic Snapshot- 2017  
Environis Analytics

Existing businesses in the area predominantly consists of service and retail establishments making up approx.  $\frac{3}{4}$  of the businesses in the Central City CRA district. They also employ the same percentage of workers with  $\frac{3}{4}$  of the CRA workforce employed in the service and retail sector (**Section III-3 –Central City Community Redevelopment Plan – Attachment “J”-Table 3.1**). The new jobs created along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue as a result of the Complete Streets Project will also primarily consists of service and retail establishments. With the majority of the CRA workforce experienced and employed in service and retail jobs, the new service and retail jobs that will be created along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue will attract area residents to these new jobs. **Also the commitment to create at least 30 FTE jobs by Warsaw Coffee, Out of Africa Gallery and Homes Inc /Eat the Tea Restaurant who are proposing to expand their operations will result in the majority of these jobs being filled by area residents as bar tenders, waiter servers, kitchen staff and sales and office staff since they do not require highly specialized skills, already comprise the majority of the CRA workforce and will be the most likely candidates applying for these jobs.** This would suggest that the number of jobs for area residents could

be higher than the estimated 11 jobs presented above and could be as high 22 to 83 Full Time Equivalent (FTE) Jobs based on 75% of the new businesses and jobs being in the service and retail area.

**BUSINESS ESTABLISHMENTS IN THE CENTRAL CITY CRA  
BY INDUSTRY AND EMPLOYEES**

<b>CATEGORY</b>	<b>Number of Businesses</b>	<b>Percent of Total Businesses</b>	<b>Number of Employees</b>	<b>Percent of Total Employees</b>
Agriculture	5	1.90%	15	0.80%
Construction	13	5.00%	99	5.30%
Manufacturing	8	3.10%	88	4.70%
Transportation and Communications	17	6.60%	56	3.00%
Wholesale Trade	10	3.90%	43	2.30%
Retail	81	31.30%	706	37.50%
Finance	18	6.90%	158	8.40%
Service	106	40.90%	713	37.90%
Government	1	0.40%	4	0.20%
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>259</b>	<b>100.00%</b>	<b>1,882</b>	<b>100.00%</b>
Source: Claritas, Inc				

- b. Number of High-Paying Jobs. To obtain the full “2” points, the Application must demonstrate that the jobs created are permanent high-paying jobs. No points will be given if the Application provides no documentation or no high-paying jobs are created. High-paying jobs are jobs paying at least 115% of the County average wage. Effective January 1, 2017, the Broward County Average Wage, as defined by the “State of Florida Incentives Average Wage Requirements,” is \$47,859; and, 115% of this amount is \$55,038.**

**Response:**

On **Pages 22-23**, is provided information on the types of businesses that would be attracted to the area as a result of the project, that would primarily be in the form of

restaurants, retail shops and specialty stores. These businesses would be supported by at least \$14,410,000 in CRA resident consumer spending surpluses in the following areas, where as spending in these areas is presently spent at businesses outside the area.

- Food and Beverage – \$3,662,728 Surplus;
- Grocery Stores - \$5,042,863 Surplus;
- Men’s and Women’s Clothing – \$362,155 Surplus;
- Sporting, Hobby, Books and Music - \$477,918 Surplus;
- General Merchandise - \$1,154,814 Surplus;
- Florist - \$54,146 Surplus
- Hobby, Toys and Games – 181,309 Surplus
- Office Supplies, Stationary and Gifts - \$501,175 Surplus, and
- Food Service and Drinking Places - \$2,708,818 /Surplus
- Cosmetics, Beauty Supplies, Perfumes - \$158,090 Surplus
- Optical stores - \$52,239 Surplus
- Florist - \$54,146 Surplus

TOTAL: \$14,410,401.00 CRA Resident Consumer Spending Surpluses

Department Of Labor Statistics Occupational Employment and Wage Estimates for the Fort Lauderdale-Pompano Beach-Deerfield, Fl Metropolitan Division provide the Annual Mean Wage for a full range of Occupational Titles. Some of the typical Occupational Titles for occupations related to the Food and Beverage, Clothing, Sporting, Hobby, General Merchandise, Food Service businesses and other above listed businesses include the following:

**DEPT OF LABOR OCCUPATIONAL  
EMPLOYMENT STATISTICS – May 2016  
Fort Lauderdale-Pompano-Deerfield Metro  
Division**

<b>Occupation Title</b>	<b>Occupation Code</b>	<b>Mean Hourly Wage</b>	<b>Annual Mean Wage</b>
Food Service Manager.	11 9051	\$ 29.75	\$ 61,890
Head Cook	35 1011	\$ 24.31	\$ 50,550
First Line Super of Food Prep.	35 1012	\$ 19.31	\$ 40.160
Cook-Restaurant	35 2014	\$ 13.57	\$ 28,230

Food Prep Worker	35 2021	\$ 11.18	\$ 23,250
Waitress- Waiter	35 3031	\$ 13.39	\$ 21,350
Counter Attendant	35 3022	\$ 10.26	\$ 21,780
Hostess	35 9031	\$ 11.37	\$ 23,640
Dishwasher	35 9021	\$ 10.34	\$ 21,510
Supervisor of Retail Sales Workers	41 1011	\$ 23.21	\$ 48,270
Cashier	41 2011	\$ 10.27	\$ 21,360
Retail Sales Person	41 2031	\$ 12.80	\$ 26,610
Sales Rep	41 3099	\$ 28.27	\$ 58,810

Within these occupations there is some opportunity for employment in High-paying jobs paying at least 115% of the County average wage. This would occur in the management positions in the food service and retail sales area. With management occupations represented as 2.6% of all jobs in Fort Lauderdale-Pompano Beach-Deerfield, FL Metropolitan area, at least 1 to 3 of the Full-Time Equivalent (FTE) Jobs of the 34 to 111 Full Time Equivalent (FTE) Jobs would be High-paying Full Time Equivalent (FTE) Jobs paying at least 115% of the County average wage.

In addition to jobs created by new businesses opening along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue, there would also be jobs created as a result of increased sales of existing businesses along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue following completion of the project and favorable conditions for economic activity resulting in an increase in private investment including expansion of existing businesses. **The commitment to create at least 30 FTE jobs by Warsaw Coffee, Out of Africa Art Gallery and Homes Inc /Eat the Tea Restaurant who are proposing to expand their operations will include positions in Food Service Management, Head Cook (Chef), Sales Representative and Retail Sales Supervisory positions that will result in at least 3 to 4 High-Paying Full Time Equivalent (FTE) Jobs.**

The types and number of businesses along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue from Sunrise Blvd to NE 13<sup>th</sup> Street was determined by business license holders (**Attachment "AA"**) and from survey information provided on the Survey of Street Conditions (**Attachment "V"**). In addition to jobs in the retail and service sector, a review of business license holders along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue reveals that among existing businesses there are businesses in the veterinary, private school, chiropractic and interior design fields. The Animal Cancer Care Center is the premier oncology center in Florida with seven location statewide and headquarters in the CRA project area. They provide all services cancer related including chemotherapy, radiation, therapy, surgery, urgent care, nutrition support and counseling. They employ a team of 10 specialist and in addition to 5 medical oncologist have specialist in internal medicine, critical care, cardiology, ophthalmology and social work at this 8,300 square



foot state of the art facility. They have also been providing oncology internship since 2009 and train interns in all aspects of diagnostic, staging, treatment and managment of cancer patients in both medical and radiation oncology, rotating them through the treatment, wellness center and emergency services. They participate in journal club and case rounds and present topics in the field of oncology, attend the veterinary Cancer Society annual conference and receive one on one instruction with a Diplomate that is provided on a daily basis A list of high paying Full Time Equivalent Jobs that could result from expansion of these businesses along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue as a result of the project are as follows:

**DEPT OF LABOR OCCUPATIONAL  
EMPLOYMENT STATISTICS  
Fort Lauderdale-Pompano-Deerfield Metro Division  
May, 2016**

<b>Occupation Title</b>	<b>Occupation Code</b>	<b>Mean Hourly Wage</b>	<b>Annual Mean Wage</b>
Radiologic Technologist	29-2034	\$ 27.90	\$ 58,030
Magnetic Resonance Imaging	29-2035	\$ 33.57	\$ 69,830
Surgical Technologist	29-2055	\$ 33.88	\$ 70,480
Health Practitioners and Technical Workers (all others )	29-9099	\$ 36.82	\$ 76,570
Cadio Vascular Technologist and Technicians	29-2031	\$ 28.36	\$ 58,980
Veterinarians	29-1131	\$ 55.84	\$ 116,140
Medical and Laboratory Technologist	29-2012	\$ 29.11	\$ 60,540
Instructional Coordinators	25-9031	\$ 28.02	\$ 58,280
HealthCare Social Workers	21-1022	\$ 31.40	\$ 65,310

Accountants and Auditors	13-2111	\$ 35.21	\$ 73,230
Vocational Education Teachers Post Secondary	25-1194	\$ 24.31	50,560
Chiropractors	29-1011	\$ 36.92	\$ 76,800
Wholesale and Retail Buyers	13-1022	\$ 29.67	\$ 61,700

The information is taken from Department Of Labor Statistics Occupational Employment and Wage Estimates for the Fort Lauderdale-Pompano Beach-Deerfield, FL Metropolitan Division which provides the Annual Mean Wage for these specific Occupational Titles listed (**Attachment “CC”**). Jobs created as a result of increased sales of existing businesses along NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue following completion of the project and favorable conditions for economic activity could realistically result in hiring in the above occupational titles by each of these businesses. This could result in an additional 3 to 6 High-paying Full Time Equivalent (FTE) Jobs in the veterinary, private school, and chiropractic fields paying at least 115% of the County average wage.

## 8 Project Costs and Funding Sources

### Response:

The Detailed Engineering Cost Estimate for the Project is provided as **Attachment “K”**. Funding Source is provided as **Attachment “DD”** and below on the Project Costs Chart.

**Provide detail necessary to identify funding sources.**

### Response:

PROJECT COSTS					
Itemized Cost	Total Cost	County BRP	FDOT State Funds		Other: NA
A. Acquisition Cost	N.A	N.A	N.A		N.A.
B. Public Improvements					N.A.
1. Engineering.	\$ 221,860	\$ 121,860	\$ 100,000		
2. Construction	\$ 1,010,400	\$ 677,000	\$ 333,400		
3. Construction Management	\$ 114,992	\$ 64,992	\$ 50,000		

4. Contingency	\$ 135,400	\$ 135,400	\$ ----		
5. Other	\$ ----	—	—		
C. Interior Build-out	N.A.	N.A.	N.A.		N.A.
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$ 1,482,652</b>	<b>\$ 999,252</b>	<b>\$ 483,400</b>		

**9 Funding Source Information (Include Match information)**

As an attachment, provide the following for each funding source currently in place to complete this project.

- a. Funding provided
- b. Name, address, telephone number, contact person
- c. Type of funding provided (e.g., grant, loan, other-specify), funding timeframes, and special terms and conditions (e.g., performance-based, interest rate, etc.)
- d. Date funded, requested and expected (Attach commitment or award letters)

**Response**

See Completed table below. Additional Information requested above provided as **Attachment "DD"**

<b>SOURCES OF FUNDS</b>		
<b>Funding Amount</b>	<b>Name of Source</b>	<b>Type of Funding and Terms and Conditions</b>
\$ 483,500	FDOT	Contribution
\$ 1,000,000.00	Broward Redevelopment Program	County Grant Funding
<b>Total Funding:</b> <b>\$1,483,500 (rounded)</b>		

**Project Site Control**

**a Applicant currently has control of project site through:**

- Fee Simple Title
- Lease

X Other (describe) Public Right of Way

**b. Provide Evidence of Site Control (i.e., copy of Warranty Deed, etc.)**

**Response:**

See **Attachment D** (Legal Description and Map of ROW by Exacta Land Surveyors)

**If site is not under Applicant's control, provide time line and schedule for establishing control. (Contract for Purchase is the minimum required documentation.)**

**Response:**

N.A.

**d If the project site is vacant, describe any prior known use. Also indicate the age of any buildings or other structures currently located on the site.**

**Response:**

N.A.

**e Provide a layout of the project site showing details, including the locations of any existing buildings or other structures and any public improvement projects addressed in the application.**

**Response:**

Detailed Preliminary Project Plan/Section provided as **Attachment "M"**

**f Provide a location map, showing location of the project to the surrounding area.**

**Response:**

GIS Location Maps provided as **Attachments “E” and “F”**

**g Attach Phase 1 and Phase 2 environmental assessments, as required. Provide mitigation plan, if required.**

**Response:**

N. A.

**11. Project Development Schedule: Provide a Project Development Schedule from start date to completion date and note milestones.**

**Response:**

Project Schedule with Milestones Provided as **Attachment “O”**