

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD
CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE
MONDAY, FEBRUARY 2, 2015 - 5:00 P.M.
FIRST FLOOR COMMISSON CHAMBER
100 NORTH ANDREWS AVENUE
FORT LAUDERDALE, FLORIDA**

| <u>Board Members</u> | <u>Attendance</u> | <u>Cumulative Attendance</u> | |
|-------------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| | | <u>6/2014 through 5/2015</u> | |
| | | <u>Present</u> | <u>Absent</u> |
| David Kyner, Chair | P | 4 | 2 |
| George Figler, Vice Chair | P | 6 | 0 |
| Ginger Coffey | P | 2 | 0 |
| Brenda Flowers [arrived 5:30] | P | 5 | 1 |
| Marie Harrison [arrived 5:04] | P | 4 | 2 |
| Timothy Lyons | P | 5 | 1 |
| Marilyn Mammano | P | 5 | 1 |
| Phillip Morgan | P | 6 | 0 |
| Carol Lee Ortman | A | 6 | 0 |
| Alexandria Scherer | P | 3 | 3 |

City Staff

Merrilyn Rathbun, Fort Lauderdale Historical Society, Consultant to HPB
Linda Mia Franco, AICP, Historic Preservation Board Liaison
Dwayne Spence, Assistant City Attorney
Jamie Opperee, Recording Secretary, Prototype Inc.

Communication to the City Commission

None.

| <u>Index</u> | <u>Applicant/Owner</u> | <u>Page</u> |
|---------------------|---|--------------------|
| H-14-020 | Michael Trigg | <u>2</u> |
| | Communication to the City Commission | 5 |
| | Good of the City | 6 |

I. Call to Order/Pledge of Allegiance

Chair Kyner called the meeting of the Historic Preservation Board to order at 5:00 p.m.

Roll was called and it was determined a quorum was present.

~~II. Determination of Quorum/Approval of Minutes of January 2015 Meeting~~

~~Motion made by Ms. Mammano, seconded by Ms. Scherer, to approve the minutes of the Board's January 2015 meeting. In a voice vote, motion passed unanimously.~~

III. Public Sign-in/Swearing-In

All members of the public wishing to address the Board on any item were sworn in.

IV. Agenda Items:

1.

Index

| | | | |
|---------------------------------|---|---------------|--------|
| Case | H14020 | FMSF # | BD2048 |
| Applicant | Michael Trigg | | |
| Owner | Michael Trigg | | |
| Address | 600 SW 9 th Street | | |
| General Location | The corner of SW 9 th Street and SW 6 th Avenue. | | |
| Legal Description | .LAUDERDALE 2-9D LOT 1,2 E1/2 BLK 10 TOGETHER W 1/2 OF PART OFVAC'D SW 6 AVE WHIDH LIES E OF ADJACENT TO LOT 1 BLK 10 | | |
| Existing Use | Apartment building | | |
| Proposed Use | Same | | |
| Applicable ULDR Sections | Section 47-24.11.B.6 | | |
| Request(s) | 1. Historic Designation of House. | | |

Board members disclosed communications and site visits they had regarding this case.

Ms. Rathbun read from her memo:

Property Background:

The Knapps of Missouri, the original owners of the house at 600 SW 9th Street, were among those people who were residents of Fort Lauderdale when it was incorporated in 1911. According to his daughter Mr. Henry Knapp was attracted to the area by the

Everglades Drainage project and in 1911, Mr. Knapp took part in the Progresso Land Sale (the Bolles land lottery); he probably, acquired land in the "new" town of Progresso and the newly dredged Everglades.

Leaving his family at their home in St. Louis, Mr. Knapp came to Fort Lauderdale in 1910. According to the family history provided by the applicant, Mr. Knapp acquired property in the largely undeveloped southwest section of town and built the 9th Street house sometime in 1910. Early Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps do not cover this area of the city and, as the town was unincorporated at this point there are no building records, so this early date cannot be confirmed. The historic address for the house was 302 South Street. The early Sanborn maps do show a few properties on the north side of South Street, but the maps do not show the south side of the street where the Knapp house is located; however, the 1918 City of Fort Lauderdale City Directory shows Mr. Henry Knapp and family residing at "W South Street" in that year.

Mr. Knapp's wife, Margaret Mahala and their three children arrived in Fort Lauderdale in 1911. Henry Knapp was a workman who obviously had construction skills and was capable of building a substantial (for the time) home for his family. The 1918 City of Fort Lauderdale City Directory lists Mr. Knapp as a driver for the Standard Oil Company. The 1924-25 directory lists Mr. Knapp as the foreman for J.L. Gibbons, a concrete contractor, which indicates that he had skill with that material. The house walls and porches, built with coral rock, were replaced after the 1926 hurricane with concrete.

Criteria for Historic Designation:

ULDR Section 47-24.11.B.6

f. Its distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style valuable for the study of a period, method of construction, or use of indigenous materials.

Consultant response: The house at 600 SW 9th Street is a vernacular or folk style house built by the owner. The builder originally used indigenous materials, i.e. coral rock, but this was later (1926) replaced with poured concrete. He combined elements of the Bungalow style and referenced early Colonial elements in the roof and porch style.

Building Description:

The main body of the house at 600 SW 9th Street has a rectangular footprint. The house has a full width front porch, which extends along both sides of the main body of the house, and a dual pitched hip (a modified pyramid) roof; i.e. a moderately steep pitched roof with extended eaves that cover the wrap around porch. The house has three roof dormers, one on the front and one on each side. The dormers have small gable roofs, called gablets. The original shingle roof cladding has been replaced with metal shingles. The house is built on a raised masonry pier foundation. Interior floors, ceilings and wood elements are Dade County Pine

The porch was originally open, although screened. According to the applicant's narrative, the house walls and the porch columns were originally built of coral rock;

however the native rock was replaced with poured concrete after the 1926 hurricane. At that time Mr. Knapp, trying for greater structural stability, essentially rebuilt the main body of the house. The porch has been enclosed, but it retains its concrete columns and configuration.

The Knapp family was originally from the St. Louis, Mo. Area. The town of Saint Genevieve, Mo., which has a collection of original rural tradition French Colonial style houses, is about fifty miles south of St. Louis. A part of the rural tradition of this style features dual pitched hip roofs and wrap around porches on a raised foundation. It may be that Mr. Knapp knew of this roof and porch style and recognizing its suitability to a southern climate he adapted it to his "modern" early 20th century home. In recent times the house has been repurposed as a four unit apartment building.

Criteria for Historic Designation:

ULDR Section 47-24.11.B.6

e. Its value as a building recognized for the quality of its architecture, and sufficient elements showing its architectural significance.

Consultant response: Although there have been modifications over the years the house retains its historic configuration. The replacement of the indigenous coral rock as a structural element took place in 1926 and is considered an historic replacement.

Summary Conclusion:

The Knapp House at 600 SW 9th Street meets the requirements for historic designation under the ULDR Section 47-24.11.B.6 under criteria e. and f.; the application should be approved. Although the Knapp family assertion that the house was built in 1910 could not be proved it is a reasonable assumption. At that date the house could be considered one of the oldest remaining houses in the city. However the provable date of 1918 (City Directory) puts the house in the historic catalog of the City's built fabric.

Michael Trigg, owner, pointed out that the house had remained relatively the same over the years. There was a poured concrete garage in the rear that was an apartment; he believed it was finished in 1929.

Chair Kyner opened the public input portion of the meeting. There being no one present wishing to address the Board on this matter, Chair Kyner closed the public hearing and brought the discussion back to the Board.

Chair Kyner asked if the application was for the house alone and not the garage. Ms. Franco said the survey showed the garage and the house. Historic designation usually applied to the structures so this designation would cover both. Mr. Spence said the consultant's report addressed the criteria regarding the house but not the garage. Mr. Trigg showed the Board photos of the garage and said he assumed the garage would be included in the designation. Mr. Spence advised the Board to consider the garage in their review.

Mr. Morgan said the major change in the house had been the enclosure of the porch. Mr. Trigg said the porch floor had replaced with concrete and the windows had been installed in 1994. Chair Kyner noted that if the porch were destroyed in a hurricane, the Board would probably want the porch restored to its earlier, open or screened version.

Mr. Trigg said most of the changes had been made by the original owner. He stated he would like to remove the porch windows and convert them back to screens.

Mr. Figler asked if the designation would apply to the house as it existed now, or if they could exclude items, such as the windows, that had been added. Mr. Spence explained that the Board must consider the criteria in the code for designation. Future alterations would consider the request when it was made, but the Board making that decision might refer to this Board's minutes to see what they considered of historic significance. Ms. Franco noted that the consultant's report indicated that even though the building had been altered over the years, there were sufficient details and elements to qualify it for designation.

Motion made by Ms. Scherer, seconded by Ms. Harrison, to approve the application as presented, including the house and garage as indicated on the survey. In a voice vote, motion passed unanimously.

~~V. Communication to the City Commission~~

Index

~~Chair Kyner asked if the City Commission had responded to their previous communication. Ms. Franco distributed copies of a memo by the City Manager to the City Commission describing the progress of the revised historic ordinance in the past year. Ms. Franco said the Commission had discussed the proposed ordinance last year and on April 29, 2014, they had decided "this draft was a good start but that there was a lot of work to still be done, perhaps...getting an outside perspective on this item would be beneficial to allow fresh eyes." Since then, the Commission had not given staff direction to move forward with this item; it was not currently an active project and it was not a top priority on the Commission Annual Action Plan agenda.~~

~~Chair Kyner asked if the Board wished to send a follow-up communication. Ms. Mammano felt this was unnecessary as it seemed the Commission was clear and the Board should move ahead with the existing ordinance.~~

~~Chair Kyner stated Commissioner Trantalis was holding charrettes for the Sailboat Bend district, with residents discussing what they liked and disliked about historic preservation. Chair Kyner felt there was a lot of confusion about what historic preservation meant and people did not understand the parameters. He said it seemed to people that designation was a "stumbling block that's laid over the ULDR...that they're going to have to jump through a lot of hoops to get something done." People had remarked they were surprised that property owners must appear before the HPB to~~

~~discuss a simple alteration. Chair Kyner recalled staff had suggested giving them some leeway in making some determinations. Chair Kyner said residents could understand historic preservation by reading the guidelines before attempting alterations.~~

~~Chair Kyner stated the Board members must understand the guidelines in order to make the process as comfortable as possible and not adversarial. He looked forward to Board members making suggestions on how to simplify the process when they had their workshop.~~

VI. Good of the City
Workshop

Index

~~Ms. Franco advised she would email prospective dates for a workshop to Board members. In the meantime, she would schedule one on one meetings with new Board members to review the design guidelines and Robert's rules.~~

Note taking space in staff report

~~Ms. Franco informed the Board that she had redesigned the staff report to include additional space for Board members' notes.~~

Criminal Activity in Sailboat Bend

~~Ms. Franco said there had been criminal activity in Sailboat Bend and some residents did not feel that the three foot maximum fence height created sufficient security. These owners had the prerogative to come to the Board requesting additional fence height.~~


Adjournment

~~There being no further business to come before the Board, the meeting was adjourned at 5:50.~~

Next Meeting

~~The Board's next regular meeting was scheduled for March 2, 2015.~~

Chairman,



David Kyner, Chair

Attest:



ProtoType Inc. Recording Secretary

The City of Fort Lauderdale maintains a Website for the Historic Preservation Board Meeting Agendas and Results: <http://ci.ftlaud.fl.us/documents/hpb/hpbagenda.htm>

Any written public comments made 48 hours prior to the meeting regarding items discussed during the proceedings have been attached hereto.