

City of Fort Lauderdale

City Hall
100 N. Andrews Avenue
Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301
www.fortlauderdale.gov



Meeting Minutes - DRAFT

Tuesday, December 17, 2013

6:00 PM

City Commission Chambers

City Commission Regular Meeting

FORT LAUDERDALE CITY COMMISSION

JOHN P. "JACK" SEILER Mayor - Commissioner
BRUCE G. ROBERTS Vice Mayor - Commissioner - District I
DEAN J. TRANTALIS Commissioner - District II
BOBBY B. DuBOSE Commissioner - District III
ROMNEY ROGERS Commissioner - District IV

SUSANNE TORRIENTE, Assistant City Manager
JOHN HERBST, City Auditor
JONDA K. JOSEPH, City Clerk
CYNTHIA A. EVERETT, City Attorney

Meeting was called to order at 6:03 by Mayor Seiler.

ATTENDANCE ROLL CALL

Present: 4 - Mayor John P. "Jack" Seiler, Vice-Mayor Bruce G. Roberts, Commissioner Dean J. Trantalis and Commissioner Romney Rogers

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Bobby B. DuBose (arrived momentarily)

Also Present: Assistant City Manager Susanne Torriente; City Auditor, John Herbst; City Clerk, Jonda K. Joseph; City Attorney, Cynthia A. Everett; Sergeant At Arms, Sergeant Mike Siekierski

Vote Roll Call Order for this Meeting

Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

Invocation

Commissioner Rogers

Pledge of Allegiance

Bennett Elementary School Men and Women of Distinction

Other Business

OB MOMENT OF SILENCE IN REMEMBRANCE OF COMMUNITY ACTIVIST BUNNY BRENNERMAN

Approval of MINUTES and Agenda

13-1559 APPROVAL OF MINUTES for October 15, 2013 Conference Meeting, November 5, 2013, Conference Meeting and November 5, 2013 Regular Meeting

Motion made by Commissioner Trantalis and seconded by Vice-Mayor Roberts to approve the noted minutes.

APPROVED

Aye: 4 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

Not Present: 1 – Commissioner DuBose

PRESENTATIONS

PRES-1 13-1643 RECOGNITION OF THE UNITED WAY FOR THEIR OUTSTANDING VOLUNTEER EFFORTS - 22nd ANNUAL UNITED WAY OF BROWARD COUNTY DAY OF CARING EVENT

Mayor Seiler recognized Kathleen Cannon, CEO of United Way of Broward County, for the agency's outstanding volunteer efforts. Cannon provided some information about Mission United, which serves military personnel. She thanked community sponsors and volunteers.

PRES-2 13-1652 RECOGNITION OF CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE - RECIPIENT OF AMERICAN HEART ASSOCIATION'S FIT FRIENDLY GOLD ACHIEVEMENT AWARD

Donna Byrne of the American Heart Association presented the "Fit Friendly Gold Achievement Award" to the Commission. She thanked City officials for promoting fitness and healthy living.

CONSENT AGENDA

Mayor Seiler announced the procedure for consent items.

Motion made by Commissioner Trantalis and seconded by Vice-Mayor Roberts that Consent Agenda Items M-2, CR-1, CR-2, CR-3 and PUR-10 be deleted from the Consent Agenda and considered separately, and that all remaining Consent Agenda items be approved as recommended.

APPROVED

Aye: 4 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

Not Present: 1 – Commissioner DuBose

M-1 13-1594 EVENT AGREEMENTS: 33311 Walk "Love Being a Girl!" Focus on Teen Girls, A Taste of the Mediterranean, A Toyland Event, Fort Lauderdale Rough Water Swim, ALDI Grand Opening

APPROVED

Aye: 4 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

Not Present: 1 – Commissioner DuBose

M-2 13-1593 EVENT AGREEMENTS AND RELATED ROAD CLOSINGS: CFF Cycle for Life: Wheels in Motion for a Cure, Ride with Heart and Farmer's Market at Broward Health

Mayor Seiler opened the floor for public comment.

Vicki Machado, 1650 NW 114 Avenue, Pembroke Pines, said she supports this item. She went on to say that a bill has been introduced to the Florida Legislature that would require labels on genetically-engineered food. Hundreds of Fort Lauderdale residents have signed a petition supporting the bill. She

asked the Commission to consider a resolution supporting this measure.

There was no one else wishing to speak.

Motion made by Vice-Mayor Roberts and seconded by Commissioner Trantalis to approve the item as recommended.

APPROVED

Aye: 4 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

Not Present: 1 – Commissioner DuBose

- M-3 13-1553** INTEROPERABLE PUBLIC SAFETY RADIO COMMUNICATIONS - First Amendment to Interlocal Agreement with Palm Beach County - renewal

APPROVED

Aye: 4 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

Not Present: 1 – Commissioner DuBose

- M-4 13-1554** INTEROPERABLE PUBLIC SAFETY RADIO COMMUNICATIONS - Interlocal Agreement with Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms and Explosives

APPROVED

Aye: 4 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

Not Present: 1 – Commissioner DuBose

- M-5 13-1609** SUNDAY JAZZ BRUNCH 2014 - Sponsored Entity Contract and Rider with SunTrust Banks, Inc.

APPROVED

Aye: 4 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

Not Present: 1 – Commissioner DuBose

- M-6 13-1589** WORK ORDERS 4, 5, 6, 7 and 8 - MARINE FACILITIES MAINTENANCE - Engineer Control Systems Corporation under annual contract for repair to seawalls, walkways, dolphin piles, fixed and floating docks - \$394,960.12

REMOVED FROM AGENDA

- M-7 13-1483** FIRST AMENDMENT TO WAVE MODERN STREETCAR PARTNERSHIP AGREEMENT - funding mechanism for assessment, due dates and partner to administer assessment process - Broward County, Broward Metropolitan Planning Organization, Downtown Development Authority and South Florida Regional Transportation Authority

APPROVED

Aye: 4 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

Not Present: 1 – Commissioner DuBose

- M-8 13-1600** FORT LAUDERDALE STRIKERS - USE OF LOCKHART AND FORT LAUDERDALE STADIUMS - License Agreement with Miami FC, L.L.C. d/b/a Fort Lauderdale Strikers - January 1, 2014 through December 31, 2014

APPROVED

Aye: 4 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

Not Present: 1 – Commissioner DuBose

CONSENT RESOLUTION

- CR-1 13-1591** ACCEPTING PROPOSAL OF HISTORIC HOSPITALITY GROUP, LLC FOR LEASE OF BRYAN HOMES RIVER HOUSE and authorizing preparation of a form of lease

Mayor Seiler opened the floor for public comment.

Attorney Courtney Crush of Crush Law, representing Stirlings, LLC, noted that her client responded to the City's request for proposals (RFP) to renovate Bryan Homes River House. She introduced members of the Stirlings team. Stirlings was the recommended awardee at the Commission's November 19, 2013, meeting. At that time, staff recommended Stirlings be awarded the bid over Historic Hospitality LLC and Riverfront Cruise because of its program, marketing, business plan, initial investment and revenue to the City. At the time, the City Auditor raised a question about the bid. Stirlings is willing to invest \$3.6 million into this property. They are proposing to not pay rent to the City for the first 20 years of the 25-year lease. Their understanding is that, based on the Auditor's question, staff re-scored the three proposers following the November 19 meeting. Now Stirlings sits in second place by 0.05 points. She wished to point out that \$3.6 million does not equal two scores of 0. Because Stirlings was proposing to not pay rent for the first 20 years of the lease, Procurement determined its financial investment is zero and its rent is zero. Perhaps one is the case, but not both. The remaining rent payments under the lease total \$1.1 million to the City. The proposal before the Commission has a \$1.7 million investment into the property, which is the minimum according to the 2012 engineer's survey, although the RFP suggested more than a minimum. There is then payment to the City of \$27,000 per year for a total of \$675,000 (five years). She believes the City Auditor's question may have been answered overzealously, and Stirlings was not credited for the value of their planned investment. Stirlings' proposal initially was for a bed and breakfast or small hotel. The Applicant spent

more than a year meeting speaking with people to determine the best use for the property and why it did not previously work as a restaurant. The proposal shows that the two, 1903 homes need to be restored, enhanced and preserved. The interior of the building does not function. It was built in 1989, so there is nothing historic about it. Stirlings redrafted its proposal to create a full-service restaurant on the Riverwalk, utilizing the outdoor spaces, with 15 boutique hotel rooms. Prior operators of the restaurant in this building have indicated that the upstairs' rooms never worked. The kitchen is a disaster. Stirlings is proposing to take it down and construct a new one in keeping with the historic architecture that would require a certificate of appropriateness from the Historic Preservation Board. The building would be brought up to code. Stirlings will invest \$3.5 million to accomplish this and a 4 percent rent payment to the City beginning in year 21 and continuing for the remaining five years of the lease and any successive extension of the lease.

Mike Uhre of Hernandez Construction, representing Stirlings, LLC, reviewed the project at length, looked at the engineer's report and visited the site countless times. He does not believe it is in the best interest to remediate the building. He believed the existing historic buildings need to be properly shored, protected and renovated. The restaurant building should be brought down and reconstructed to code, including floor lifts for ADA compliance. It was built in 1989 and does not meet code. He believed the reconstruction is why their bid is substantially higher, but he also believes it is the correct way to proceed with this project.

Former Commissioner John Aurelius, 2864 NE 24 Court, was concerned that the past 20 commissions have been criticized for a lack of due diligence on historical matters. It appears that too many questions remain in this matter. There is a question of whether it should cost \$3.7 million or \$1.6 million. He questioned such a difference between the two proposers. He does not believe the Commission has enough information to make a decision and he questioned staff's thought process. He would like the item deferred and more information provided.

Kristin Kitchen, representing Historic Hospitality Group, referred to Stirlings' investment of \$3.6 million and noted that a \$1 million minimum investment was suggested by the City. After researching the property, Historic Hospitality also determined they would invest \$700,000 more than the minimum. She has been a preservationist for the past 10 years, restoring historic properties in Cincinnati. Tearing part of the property down and rebuilding it is one option. Another viable option is preserving it. Historic Hospitality won this proposal. They have experience, talent and capacity. Money is not always the answer. You can invest \$3.6 million and not get any of it back. Historic Hospitality gave a lot of thought to the Riverwalk. She felt Stirlings projection to generate \$2.6 million in revenue from the restaurant in its first year is unrealistic. Kitchen touched on her experience as a successful bed and breakfast operator. Growth and development is something Historic Hospitality strongly considered. She is ready to bring her capacities to Fort Lauderdale. Exhibit 2 of Commission Agenda Memorandum 13-1591 identifies Historic Hospitality Group as No. 1 in the final ranking, followed by Stirlings LLC and Riverfront Cruise.

Don Patterson, 4664 Waycross Drive, Coconut Creek, said his background is in real estate development. He evaluated this project with Kitchen. He supports her comments. She took a condemned building in Cincinnati and repurposed it into a successful bed and breakfast for the past 10 years. The River House is similar to what has been done in Cincinnati. They do not believe it would require \$3 million. He believes Stirlings has very limited knowledge in the hospitality field. He would like the Commission to evaluate experience. The site has been vacant for three to four years. It does not require an extensive overhaul to become operational. Historic Hospitality's proposal is the right size for this location.

Andrew Ingraham, president of National Association of Black Hotel Owners, Operators and Developers, said the Association looked into placing a restaurant at this site 10 years ago and was unsuccessful. The concept of a bed and breakfast provides a new face plate for downtown Fort Lauderdale and sends a message that Fort Lauderdale is open for business. Historic Hospitality's proposal is the right size for that location. He felt it will attract notoriety. On behalf of the National Association of Black Hotel Owners, Operators and Developers, he urged support of this proposal.

Genia Ellis, representing Riverwalk Trust, said this project and its activation is key to the Riverwalk. The proposers have a plan. Part of the plan is interface with the Riverwalk. She was concerned she has not heard the proposers discuss that part. The property has been used for years to host events, but it has not been clear whether the restaurant would be open to the public or only the bed and breakfast. Riverwalk representatives spoke with two of the three proposers and they asked what Riverwalk Trust would like for the area, which should be considered. How the project fits into the Riverwalk area should be taken into consideration. It needs to be successful.

Crush presented a RFP scoring comparison which is attached to these minutes. It is the City's scoring annotated to show that Stirlings was proposing \$0 in rent, which is not correct. Stirlings is proposing a right size use for the property. They are proposing 15 hotel rooms and a restaurant on the ground floor. With respect to Riverwalk interface, she mentioned the opportunity for events at the site's public restaurant is paramount to its success.

There was no one else wishing to speak.

In response to Mayor Seiler, the City Auditor explained as part of his typical review of agenda items, on November 14 for the November 19 meeting, he raised objections to the scoring process. Staff ultimately agreed that the scoring was incorrect. His objection is that the part that allows for credit to the investment was 20 percent of the initial scoring mechanism, with 5 percent going to the amount related to rent revenue. The investment being made by Stirlings is going to be credited back to them over a period of 20 years. Essentially the City is reimbursing them for the cost of the improvements which makes the net investment zero. He agreed with Crush that there should not be a double counting of zero on rent and investment. A secondary issue was raised tonight, that the investment is being driven by the intended use. He does not believe that is an effective criterion for evaluating the proposal. It does not represent revenue to the City and the use itself, to some degree, is not relevant in evaluating the proposal. Investment for a coffee shop would be significantly less than for a five-star dining establishment, yet it has nothing to do with the property's success for the next 20 years. However, this was the criteria and he did not propose it be changed.

Deputy Director of Finance Kirk Buffington said the evaluation criterion for the initial investment was 25 percent, and for rent proceeds it was 5 percent. The proposals are evaluated in comparison to each other and not stand-alone. Stirlings can be assigned 4 percent in rent proceeds, but it should be noted that one other proposer offered 5 percent of rent proceeds and Historic Hospitality offered 3 percent. He explained how the comparison was made, noting it was agreed the initial investment was zero and rent proceeds were 5 percent. With 1 percent difference between Historic Hospitality and Stirlings, staff rated Historic Hospitality No. 1 as to revenue to the City. In response to Mayor Seiler, Buffington advised that the 4 percent by Stirlings was considered, but it was only 5 percent of the 30 percent total.

Mayor Seiler said it appears all three proposers are qualified. He is concerned that the recommendation at the last meeting went a particular way and then following a question from the City Auditor, the course is now reversed. He wanted to have a clean RFP. It may also be that the Auditor's direction was not followed. The City Auditor said his comments were limited to scoring as it related to

the initial investment. In response to Commissioner DuBose, the City Auditor clarified that staff did modify the scoring at his suggestion, but he is unaware whether other aspects of the scoring were changed. Crush understood that both rent and the initial investment for Stirlings were calculated at zero. She suggested direction of which should be counted as zero. Buffington explained that the term "no credit" is incorrect. This is a ranking. Stirlings was initially ranked No. 1 based on the initial investment of \$3.6 million. Stirlings' rent proceeds were ranked No. 2. When re-evaluating the rankings after the City Auditor's question, Historic Hospitality became No. 1 and Stirlings became No. 2. He confirmed for Commissioner DuBose that there was then a 5 percent weight applied. The detail between the 25 percent and the 5 percent was not done, but it was considered in the re-evaluation. Mayor Seiler said he is inclined to award to the final best offer. He agreed that Stirlings should not have gotten credit for the \$3.6 million. It appears that once that was corrected, detail about the 4 percent was omitted. Even though Buffington is saying the evaluation committee considered that information, it is not in the backup. Buffington admitted that is accurate. A final best offer is an option. He needs to make 100 percent sure this was taken into consideration.

Commissioner Trantalis recommended that the matter be tabled to allow staff to revisit it. Beyond the scoring process, this project should be looked at holistically. Because some of the buildings on the site are not operational, the Himmarshee District has slightly declined. Now there is an opportunity to revitalize it. Each proposer appears to have their own vision. He is not sure who has the most experience in this type of business. He believes Kitchen has the most background because she is currently engaged in this business. He does not believe the Stirlings team has any experience in the hotel business. Clearly Stirlings is planning to build something that is beyond the original scope of the RFP which is great, but he questioned whether that should disqualify the other proposer just because they intend to spend less money. It is his understanding that the RFP mandated an investment of at least \$1 million. Historic Hospitality has agreed to invest \$1.74 million. Stirlings is going to do a much greater project than originally anticipated. Both proposers have come forward with good qualifications. To build a hotel, you should have hotel experience.

Motion made by Commissioner Trantalis and seconded by Commissioner Rogers to defer the item so that staff can revisit it and present a recommendation.

Vice-Mayor Roberts pointed out it appears that one proposer is offering more money to the City than the other over a 25-year period. He questioned whether the information originally used in the process was accurate. The City should look at whether a bed and breakfast versus a hotel would offer more activation for the Riverwalk. He referred to a huge differential in price and the fear of something not getting completed. He was not certain staff has enough information.

Commissioner Rogers raised the idea of having hoteliers and restaurateurs from the community involved in the evaluation. This is really important to the City and the Riverwalk. He does not feel it has been vetted enough. Mayor Seiler believed there would be a conflict of interest. He wanted to award based on the highest and best proposal. In response to Commissioner Rogers, the City Auditor explained he did not evaluate the rent, only the investment. Because the City would be reimbursing the proposer, he views Stirlings' investment as zero. If there is 4 percent gross proceeds on rent, it should be scored appropriately. Commissioner Rogers felt because there are so many unique factors, weighting is important. Thoughts were expressed about what would be the most important factor to weigh. Commissioner Rogers was not comfortable voting at this time. Mayor Seiler did not think anyone is comfortable voting now.

Vice-Mayor Roberts noted another concern is the huge discrepancy between needed improvements. He was unsure how that could be reconciled with a best and final offer. Commissioner Trantalis felt the

difference is one proposer is constructing a new building. Commissioner DuBose felt more answers from Procurement are needed before moving forward.

The Assistant City manager apologized; she had been under the impression that staff was on the same page as the City Auditor. She would feel more comfortable deferring the item because the Commission does not have the information it needs. She would like to meet with the City Auditor and Procurement to look at the entire process and return with a clean recommendation. In response to Vice-Mayor Roberts, the Assistant City Manager agreed to provide clarity on the difference in initial investments.

Kitchen said Stirlings' projection that their restaurant will net \$1.1 million after 20 years may not be realistic. A restaurant does not necessarily stay in business 20 years. It is only projection and speculation. Historic Hospitality, from the day the facility opens, will make percentage payments rather than asking the City to wait 20 years or reimburse Historic Hospitality for their investment. The goal was to make healthy, logical, stable, strong growth development projections. Mayor Seiler said it now appears the process was flawed, and that is what the Commission needs to address. It is unacceptable for the Commission to vote on flawed information or a flawed process. Commissioner DuBose requested that staff answer the questions that were raised this evening in addition to making a recommendation. Mayor Seiler asked that the proposers work with staff.

DEFERRED TO JANUARY 7, 2014

Aye: 5 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

CR-2 13-1473 USE OF WAR MEMORIAL AUDITORIUM - authorizing Parks and Recreation Director or designee to execute license agreements and rescinding Resolution 3831

Commissioner Trantalis referred to the City's work on the pill mill problem that previously existed. He does not want Fort Lauderdale to be considered as a gun hub. He has an uneasy feeling about this item because of a rising number of gun violence cases across the country. It would be unfortunate for Fort Lauderdale to become the epicenter of the gun trade. Residents who live near War Memorial Auditorium are particularly sensitive to this issue. He would like to consider reducing the number of gun shows in the city. There are many other locations where residents can buy guns. The frequency of gun shows is inappropriate in his opinion. Vice-Mayor Roberts did not feel that Fort Lauderdale is the epicenter of gun trade. The City continues to ensure the gun shows are safe. Data shows that gun violence is not a problem in Fort Lauderdale. Mayor Seiler agreed with Vice-Mayor Roberts. The vendor has a very good track record. The limited amount of negative local press on this issue involved blogs that were inaccurate. The City has a very strong presence at the shows. The Police Department has done an outstanding job. These shows have been uneventful for almost 40 years. To penalize a legal local enterprise because of illegal activity that occurred elsewhere is a mistake. He clarified that the City has never cracked down on legal pain medication sales. It did get involved with illegal sales, but that is a totally different thing. Mayor Seiler noted his experience and work in both prescription drug monitoring and the Stand Your Ground Law (self-defense) when he served as a state representative. Commissioner Trantalis said he simply would like the Commission to consider this as a philosophy for the future. When speaking to people on the street, the answer to the question of where to buy a gun in Florida is Fort Lauderdale.

Motion made by Commissioner Trantalis and seconded by Commissioner DuBose to approve the item as recommended.

ADOPTED

Aye: 5 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

CR-3 13-1592 GRANT ACCEPTANCE AND AGREEMENT - CHRONIC HOMELESSNESS HOUSING COLLABORATIVE PROJECT and amend 2014 operating budget by appropriating grant funding in the amount of \$440,117 - Broward County

In response to Commissioner Trantalis, Deputy Director of Parks and Recreation Cate McCaffrey described particulars of the grant funded by the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD). The City is working in partnership with Broward County and other agencies to provide permanent supportive housing for the chronically homeless. The 22 housing units are provided by the City's Housing Authority. She believed the housing is near NW 10 Street. The project is fashioned after 100,000 Homes, a system that is working throughout the country. The recipients eventually maintain themselves. The key to the program is support services. She explained that chronically homeless is defined by HUD. A vulnerability index was created through the 100,000 Homes program. She expects the grant will be funded annually. Support services will be administered in the homes. Broward Partnership for the Homeless will provide case managers whose salaries will be paid for with this grant. It is hoped that the individuals will reside in these homes for the rest of their lives. Some 90 percent of the occupants have remained after a year. It is much less expensive to help these individuals in this way than the current practice of involving police and emergency medical services. This program is part of a much bigger plan that Broward County has for treatment of the chronically homeless. There is a federal goal to end chronic homelessness by 2015, and 100,000 Homes is a program many communities are implementing in an effort to reach this goal. Case managers will help occupants travel to get food. In the beginning, case managers will be closely involved but ultimately the recipients will learn to take care of themselves. It would eventually cost less to assist program recipients. The case manager would be responsible for ensuring that the program is not abused by recipients.

In response to Commissioner DuBose, McCaffrey said the City will not be obligated to continue funding the program if the grant becomes unavailable in the future. If the program loses funding, it will not continue. Commissioner DuBose said he believes this program is a step in the right direction but was curious how recipients would be targeted. He specifically inquired about homeless veterans and those with mental issues. McCaffrey stated that to qualify for the program, applicants must be chronically homeless and have a disability, which could be alcohol abuse, drug dependency or a mental condition. Every year, Broward County conducts a count of homeless persons. This year's count will include a survey that will provide results for the vulnerability index. She elaborated on qualifiers for the index. The reality is that the most vulnerable do not have any benefits, however, having benefits does not disqualify an individual. McCaffrey explained that was conjecture on her part and it is possible that veterans could be deemed among the most vulnerable even though they have benefits. The case managers will be tasked with pursuing benefits for individuals.

In response to Commissioner Rogers, McCaffrey offered to determine how medical services would be provided. She said case managers will ensure that occupants have access to medical care and other assistance services. Some \$92,000 budgeted for operations will cover furnishings for the housing units.

The Assistant City Manager explained that the audit language included in the agreement is outdated. The County Auditor and City Auditor agreed to new language that would cover reporting through the single audit. She asked that the Commission grant authority to the City Manager to edit this language.

Vice Mayor Roberts suggested it be approved subject to Broward County approval. McCaffrey noted that it could be problematic if Broward County does not agree to the revised language prior to the program start date of January 1. The City Auditor offered more explanation on the history of the audit language revision. He did not see any problem with the Commission approving the item and granting the City Manager authority to update that provision if the County is amenable to it.

Motion made by Vice-Mayor Roberts and seconded by Commissioner Rogers to approve the item and authorize the City Manager to modify Article 9, Financial Statements/Management Letters, if Broward County is amenable to the modification.

ADOPTED

Aye: 5 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

CR-4 13-1484 **THIRD-PARTY ASSESSMENT OF C-51 RESERVOIR COSTS - JOINT FUNDING AGREEMENT - Palm Beach County and several utilities**

ADOPTED

Aye: 4 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

Not Present: 1 – Commissioner DuBose

CR-5 13-1493 **REPAIR OR RECONSTRUCT DAMAGED SIDEWALK - AUTHORIZING NOTIFICATION LETTER AND TO ABUTTING PROPERTY OWNER - 2901 Belmar Street**

ADOPTED

Aye: 4 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

Not Present: 1 – Commissioner DuBose

CR-6 13-1548 **SOVEREIGNTY SUBMERGED LANDS EASEMENT - BREAKWATER STRUCTURE AT BILL KEITH PRESERVE - Florida Internal Improvement Trust Fund**

ADOPTED

Aye: 4 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

Not Present: 1 – Commissioner DuBose

CR-7 13-1497 DELEGATING AUTHORITY TO CITY MANAGER TO SETTLE AND RELEASE CERTAIN CODE ENFORCEMENT LIENS AND EXECUTE ADMINISTRATIVE RELEASES OF CERTAIN RECORDED LIENS

ADOPTED

Aye: 4 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

Not Present: 1 – Commissioner DuBose

PURCHASING AGENDA

PUR-1 13-1515 TWO-YEAR CONTRACT FOR TEMPORARY PERSONNEL SERVICES in the amount of \$786,600 from A & Associates, Inc., Albion Staffing Solutions, Inc. and Alpha 1 Staffing/Search Firm, LLC

The item was revised per Commission Agenda Memorandum 13-1515.

APPROVED

Aye: 4 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

Not Present: 1 – Commissioner DuBose

PUR-2 13-1516 ONE-YEAR CONTRACT FOR ANNUAL POINT EXCAVATION "POTHOLING" AND UTILITY DESIGNATION SERVICES in the amount of \$202,750 from F.R. Aleman and Associates, Inc.

REMOVED FROM AGENDA

PUR-3 13-1543 CONTRACT FOR LOHMEYER DEWATERING BUILDING, ELECTRICAL AND CONDUIT REPLACEMENT in the amount of \$170,776 from Florida Bridge Builders, Inc.

APPROVED

Aye: 4 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

Not Present: 1 – Commissioner DuBose

PUR-4 13-1545 PURCHASE OF PROTECTIVE BALLISTIC BODY ARMOR (VESTS AND HELMETS) FOR FIRE-RESCUE DEPARTMENT in the amount of \$83,790 from Federal Eastern International, Inc.

APPROVED

Aye: 4 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

Not Present: 1 – Commissioner DuBose

PUR-5 13-1546 PROPRIETARY PURCHASE - ONE-YEAR CONTRACT FOR BEHAVIORAL ASSESSMENT ADMINISTRATION AND RELATED SERVICES - RECRUITMENT AND STAFF DEVELOPMENT in the amount of \$50,000 from The HarBeck Company, Inc.

REMOVED FROM AGENDA

PUR-6 13-1566 PROPRIETARY PURCHASE - ANNUAL SUPPORT FOR HEWLETT-PACKARD HARDWARE AND SOFTWARE in the amount of \$61,300.64 from Hewlett-Packard Company

APPROVED

Aye: 4 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

Not Present: 1 – Commissioner DuBose

PUR-7 13-1571 ANIMAL CARCASS REMOVAL AND DISPOSAL SERVICES - REJECT SINGLE BID

APPROVED

Aye: 5 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

PUR-8 13-1574 PURCHASE AND INSTALLATION OF EMERGENCY GENERATOR FOR DEPARTMENT OF SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT BUILDING in the amount of \$84,000 from Imperial Electrical, Inc.

APPROVED

Aye: 4 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

Not Present: 1 – Commissioner DuBose

PUR-9 13-1624 TWO-YEAR MAINTENANCE SUPPORT AGREEMENT FOR VISION LIVE ON-PREMISE SUBSCRIPTION SERVICES in the amount of \$27,951 from Vision Internet Providers, Inc.

APPROVED

Aye: 4 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

Not Present: 1 – Commissioner DuBose

PUR-10 13-1630 CONTRACT FOR DECORATIVE FENCING OF STRANAHAN PARK in the amount of \$56,800 from Gold Coast Hurricane Shutters, Inc.

Commissioner Rogers said he would to ensure that this item is expedited and completed in a timely manner.

Motion made by Commissioner Rogers and seconded by Vice-Mayor Roberts to approve the item as recommended.

APPROVED

Aye: 5 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

PUR-11 13-1640 WAIVE MINOR IRREGULARITY IN BIDS FOR SOLID WASTE COLLECTION SERVICES - Republic Services of Florida and Progressive Waste Solutions of FL, Inc.

APPROVED

Aye: 4 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

Not Present: 1 – Commissioner DuBose

RESOLUTIONS

R-1 13-1468 QUASI-JUDICIAL - 3850 FEDERAL PLAT - CASE 12-P-13

Applicant: Coral Ridge Golf Course, Inc.
Location: 3850 North Federal Highway
Zoning: Parks, Recreation and Open Space (current) - Residential Single Family Low Density (RS-4.4) (proposed)
Future Land Use: Park/Open Space (current) - Irregular Residential 1.7 (proposed)

Anyone wishing to speak must be sworn in. Commission will announce any site visits, communications or expert opinions received and make them part of the record.

Members of the Commission announced with whom they had spoken and/or site visits made concerning this matter.

Mayor Seiler opened the floor for public comment.

There being no individuals wishing to speak on this matter, a motion was made by Vice-Mayor Roberts and seconded by Commissioner Trantalis to close the public hearing. Roll call showed: AYES: Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler. NAYS: None.

Vice-Mayor Roberts introduced the resolution, which was read by title only.

ADOPTED

Aye: 5 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

**R-2 13-1607 APPOINTMENT OF CITY BOARD AND COMMITTEE MEMBERS -
vacancy information provided under Conference Item BD-2**

The City Clerk announced the appointees/re-appointees who were the subjects of this resolution:

Beach Redevelopment Board	Ina Lee (Mayor Seiler) Daniel S. Matchette (Mayor Seiler) Melissa Milroy (Vice-Mayor Roberts) Anthony Abbate (Commissioner Rogers)
Cemetery System Board	Vicki Mowrey (Mayor Seiler) Damon R. Adams (Vice-Mayor Roberts) Mark Van Rees (Vice-Mayor Roberts) John Sykes (Commissioner Rogers)
Citizens Committee of Recognition	Courtney Crush (Consensus/Mayor Seiler) Gloria Katz (Consensus/Mayor Seiler)
Code Enforcement Board	Paul Dooley (Consensus/Mayor Seiler) Joan Hinton (Consensus/Mayor Seiler) Chad Thilborger (Consensus/Mayor Seiler) Joshua D. Miron (Consensus/Mayor Seiler)
Community Appearance Board	Ryan Paton (Commissioner Rogers)
Economic Development Advisory Board	Cary Goldberg (Mayor Seiler) John Scherer (Mayor Seiler) Keith Costello (Commissioner Rogers)
General Employees Retirement System	Mark Burnam (Mayor Seiler)
Nuisance Abatement Board	Dale Hoover (Consensus/Mayor Seiler) Donald Karney III (Consensus/Mayor Seiler) Lorraine Saunders (Consensus/Mayor Seiler) Cindy Smith (Consensus/Mayor Seiler) Robert L. Wolfe Jr. (Consensus/Mayor Seiler) Elizabeth "Betty" DiMaio (Consensus/Mayor Seiler)
Sustainability Advisory Board	Alena Alberani (Commissioner Trantalis) Vicki Eckels (Commissioner Trantalis)

Vice-Mayor Roberts introduced the resolution, which was read by title only.

ADOPTED

Aye: 5 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

PUBLIC HEARINGS

PH-1 13-1539 QUASI-JUDICIAL - RESOLUTION - WAIVER OF LIMITATIONS OF UNIFIED LAND DEVELOPMENT REGULATIONS, SECTION 47-19.3(c) for construction of fixed dock - floating dock combination along an existing marginal dock extending a maximum of 31 feet from property line - 1627 SE 7 Street

Applicant: Martin E. and Nicole Hanaka

Anyone wishing to speak must be sworn in. Commission will announce any site visits, communications or expert opinions received and make them part of the record.

Members of the Commission announced with whom they had spoken and/or site visits made concerning this matter.

Mayor Seiler reviewed the procedure for the public hearing and opened the floor for public comment.

Mayor Seiler noted this item was recommended by the Marine Advisory Board.

Tyler Chappell of the Chappell Group, representing the Applicant, described the request. There is an existing marginal dock on the property. The Applicant is requesting to extend into the waterway with a floating dock to have better access for an additional vessel.

There being no other individuals wishing to speak on this matter, a motion was made by Commissioner Trantalis and seconded by Vice-Mayor Roberts to close the public hearing. Roll call showed: AYES: Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler. NAYS: None.

Commissioner Rogers introduced the resolution, which was read by title only.

ADOPTED

Aye: 5 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

PH-2 13-1485 QUASI-JUDICIAL - FIRST READING OF ORDINANCE- VACATION OF 20 FOOT RIGHT-OF-WAY - 424 North Federal Highway - Case 16-P-13

Applicant: Gaddis Capital Corporation

Anyone wishing to speak must be sworn in. Commission will announce any site visits, communications or expert opinions received and make them part of the record.

Members of the Commission announced with whom they had spoken and/or site visits made concerning this matter.

Mayor Seiler opened the floor for public comment.

There being no individuals wishing to speak on this matter, a motion was made by Commissioner Trantalis and seconded by Vice-Mayor Roberts to close the public hearing. Roll call showed: AYES: Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler. NAYS: None.

Commissioner Trantalis introduced the ordinance, which was read by title only.

PASSED FIRST READING

Aye: 5 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

PH-3 13-1523 SECOND READING OF ORDINANCE - LAND USE AMENDMENT - CHANGING DESIGNATION FROM MEDIUM HIGH RESIDENTIAL TO COMMERCIAL - RIVERBEND MARKET PLACE - CASE 13-T-12

Applicant: Gatlin Development Group
Location: Southeast corner of West Broward Boulevard and SW 27 Avenue

Members of the Commission announced with whom they had spoken and/or site visits made concerning this matter.

Commissioner DuBose introduced the ordinance, which was read by title only.

ADOPTED ON SECOND READING

Aye: 5 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

PH-4 13-1552 1) SECOND READING OF ORDINANCE - LAND USE AMENDMENT - CHANGING DESIGNATION FROM PARK-OPEN SPACE TO IRREGULAR RESIDENTIAL(former American Golfers Club golf course) - CASE 12-T-12 AND 2) RESOLUTION - REQUESTING RECERTIFICATION OF THE CITY FUTURE LAND USE PLAN MAP

Applicant: Coral Ridge Golf Course, Inc.
Location: East of North Federal Highway, north of NE 37 Drive and south of Commercial Boulevard

Mayor Seiler opened the floor for public comment.

There being no individuals wishing to speak on this matter, a motion was made by Vice-Mayor Roberts and seconded by Commissioner DuBose to close the public hearing. Roll call showed: AYES: Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler. NAYS: None.

Vice-Mayor Roberts introduced the ordinance, which was read by title only.

ADOPTED ON SECOND READING

Aye: 5 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

Commissioner Rogers introduced the resolution, which was read by title only.

ADOPTED

Aye: 5 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

PH-5 13-1083 MOTION - NEW UPTOWN LINK FORT LAUDERDALE COMMUNITY BUS ROUTE - effective February 1, 2014

Motion made by Vice-Mayor Roberts and seconded by Commissioner Trantalis to defer the item.

DEFERRED

Aye: 5 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

PH-6 13-1562 MOTION - TRANSIT FARE POLICY FOR COMMUNITY BUS SERVICE AND FARE INCREASE FOR THREE ROUTES - Beach, Las Olas and Galt links (deferred from November 19, 2013)

Mayor Seiler opened the floor for public comment.

There being no individuals wishing to speak on this matter, a motion was made by Vice-Mayor Roberts and seconded by Commissioner Trantalis to close the public hearing. Roll call showed: AYES: Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler. NAYS: None.

Motion made by Vice-Mayor Roberts and seconded by Commissioner Rogers to approve the item as recommended.

APPROVED

Aye: 5 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

PH-7 13-1565 MOTION - NEIGHBORHOOD LINK COMMUNITY BUS ROUTE - increase hours of operation

Mayor Seiler opened the floor for public comment.

There being no individuals wishing to speak on this matter, a motion was made by Vice-Mayor Roberts and seconded by Commissioner Trantalis to close the public hearing. Roll call showed: AYES: Vice-

Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler. NAYS: None.

Motion made by Vice-Mayor Roberts and seconded by Commissioner Trantalis to approve the item as recommended.

APPROVED

Aye: 5 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

ORDINANCES

O-1 13-1585 FIRST READING OF ORDINANCE AMENDING CODE OF ORDINANCES, CHAPTER 8, ARTICLE V, DIVISION 3 - BEACH BOATING RESTRICTED AREA - to permit launching and watercraft concession operations at Birch State Park

Vice-Mayor Roberts introduced the ordinance, which was read by title only.

Commissioner Rogers said historically this area has been used by surfers. He is concerned about the use of jet skis in the same area. Assistant City Attorney Bob Dunckel said he believes it is very important to establish the appropriate distance between the launching corridor and where surfing activities are taking place. This has been done. There is a built-in safety margin.

PASSED FIRST READING

Aye: 5 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

O-2 13-1438 QUASI-JUDICIAL - SECOND READING OF ORDINANCE REZONING TO BOULEVARD BUSINESS - Case 7-Z-13

Applicant: Holman Automotive, Inc.
From: Residential Mid Rise Multifamily/Medium High Density District (RMM-25)
Location: 500 SE 14 Court
Future Land Use: South Regional Activity Center

Anyone wishing to speak must be sworn in. Commission will announce any site visits, communications or expert opinions received and make them part of the record.

Members of the Commission announced with whom they had spoken and/or site visits made concerning this matter.

Mayor Seiler opened the floor for public comment.

Attorney Steven Wherry of Greenspoon Marder, representing the Applicant, said since the last meeting, they have revised the declaration of restricted covenants to include tattoo artists as an additional excluded use. He referenced Lynn Christine Waterbury's comments from the previous meeting. He and other Holman Automotive representatives met with Waterbury on December 11, 2013. They discussed the conceptual site plan for the project and, as a result, the Applicant agreed to add an 8-foot wall as a buffer. They also agreed to use LED lighting, add motion detectors and shielding and adjust pole height to minimize impact to her property. Waterbury expressed an interest in removing an oak tree from the property boundary, and they are agreeable to that request. Additionally, the Applicant revised its internal company policy for the overall operations to be safer and lessen impacts to the surrounding community. He provided a copy and read the policy, dated December 12, 2013, which was made a part of the record.

Commissioner Rogers said he received a complaint about staging vehicles in the swale during busy times. It is similar to offloading. He suggested this be done on a Saturday morning, for example, when there is less traffic. Wherry said ideally the relocation of vehicles should occur on the other side of the site. He agreed to make adjustments.

Assistant City Attorney D'Wayne Spence noted that this item is a rezoning. Many of the matters being discussed should be covered at site plan review. He advised the Commission that they can make note of these matters on the record and advise staff to consider them as neighborhood compatibility issues during site plan review, but not as part of the rezoning consideration. Commissioner Rogers felt that concerns about the impact on the neighborhood warrant additional conditions. Spence said such considerations would be for the site plan review. Rezoning should simply involve permitted uses of the property. The Commission should steer away from amending the zoning ordinance to accommodate a particular development. This discussion can take place and staff should take note that these are genuine neighborhood compatibility matters that should be taken into account during the site plan review process. In that the site plan may not reach the Commission level for approval, it is advisable for this discussion to be made a part of the record. A rezoning should not be conditional. The restrictive covenant contains the appropriate proffers. Director of Sustainability and Economic Development Greg Brewton said the site plan will be reviewed by the Development Review Committee. This discussion is helpful to staff as it goes through the process. Staff will make sure these matters are addressed.

Lynn Christine Waterbury, 2132 NE 63 Street, read from a prepared statement, which is attached to these minutes.

In response to Commissioner DuBose, Waterbury said she received a response from Code Enforcement saying they were going to change the assigned inspector and would look into the other items she brought to light, but she has not heard back from them. Brewton said it is currently being investigated. Staff is proceeding with code enforcement as appropriate. There was a case open prior to Ms. Waterbury's inquiry and had to do with landscaping and parking on vacant property. Waterbury said additionally there are many vehicles backed up to the doors on one side of the current dealership, which constitutes a code violation. Commissioner Rogers understood the violations on the west side were rectified. In response to Waterbury's point that the Applicant has been parking on RMM-25, Mayor Seiler said there is an outstanding fine related to that violation, but the property owner was granted an extension in view of the rezoning application. Brewton advised that staff is looking into the code enforcement initiative on the east side of Federal Highway.

In response to Commissioner DuBose, Waterbury explained that the City has a list of its top 10 code violations. She is concerned that two of the Holman's properties may be vacated when the new facility

opens. That could create a similar scenario to Holman's existing vacant property, which has numerous code violations. Brewton clarified staff cited this property on December 12, 2013, and the property owner has 10 days to address the violations.

There being no other individuals wishing to speak on this matter, a motion was made by Commissioner Trantalis and seconded by Vice-Mayor Roberts to close the public hearing. Roll call showed: AYES: Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler. NAYS: None.

Mayor Seiler made the following comments relative to site plan review. He would like to limit test driving to main roads, prohibit employee participation or encouragement of car carrier offloading on streets behind the facility and discourage pedestrians crossing Federal Highway. He would like the Applicant to continue with implementation of the written company policy that Wherry read into the record. He felt Ms. Waterbury's points are correct in terms of traffic, lighting and buffering including the 8-foot wall. Wherry confirmed that the lighting amendment will be done. Mayor Seiler concluded by saying that Applicant must focus on reducing impacts to the neighborhood. He also asked that removal of the oak tree be investigated during the site plan review. Commissioner Rogers reiterated his concern about staging vehicles in the swale during high traffic times.

In response to Commissioner Trantalis, Mayor Seiler advised that the pending code violation before the special magistrate was continued in order for the Applicant to pursue rezoning the property. The special magistrate will decide whether to assess the pending fine.

Vice-Mayor Roberts wanted to make sure that Holman addresses the code violations at the 700 East Sunrise Boulevard site which is a portal to the city. Brewton advised that staff will aggressively follow up on those violations.

Commissioner DuBose introduced the ordinance, which was read by title only.

ADOPTED ON SECOND READING

Aye: 5 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

O-3 13-1454 QUASI JUDICIAL - SECOND READING ORDINANCE REZONING TO RESIDENTIAL SINGLE FAMILY - LOW DENSITY - Case 6-Z-13

Applicant: Coral Ridge Golf Course, Inc.
From: Parks, Recreation and Open Space (P)
Location: 3850 North Federal Highway
Future Land Use: Park Open Space (current); Irregular Residential (pending)

Anyone wishing to speak must be sworn in. Commission will announce any site visits, communications or expert opinions received and make them part of the record.

Members of the Commission announced with whom they had spoken and/or site visits made concerning this matter.

Mayor Seiler opened the floor for public comment.

There being no individuals wishing to speak on this matter, a motion was made by Commissioner Trantalis and seconded by Vice-Mayor Roberts to close the public hearing. Roll call showed: AYES: Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler. NAYS: None.

Vice-Mayor Roberts introduced the resolution, which was read by title only.

ADOPTED ON SECOND READING

Aye: 5 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

O-4 13-1464 SECOND READING OF ORDINANCE AMENDING UNIFIED LAND DEVELOPMENT REGULATIONS, SECTION 47-22.3.C, BANNER SIGNS - GENERAL REGULATIONS

Vice-Mayor Roberts introduced the ordinance, which was read by title only.

ADOPTED ON SECOND READING

Aye: 5 - Vice-Mayor Roberts, Commissioner Trantalis, Commissioner DuBose, Commissioner Rogers and Mayor Seiler

There being no other matters to come before the Commission, the meeting adjourned at 8:44 p.m.

John P. "Jack" Seiler
Mayor

ATTEST:

Jonda K. Joseph
City Clerk