#14-1384

TO: Honorable Mayor & Members of the

Fort Lauderdale City Commission

FROM: Lee R. Feldman, ICMA-CM, City Manager

DATE: November 4, 2014

TITLE: Quasi-Judicial review of Appeal of City Engineer's Denial of Crown Castle

NG East LLC's Right-of-Way Permit Applications in eight (8) locations

Recommendation

It is recommended that the City Commission analyze the record compiled and decide whether to uphold the City Engineer's denial of the right-of-way permit applications submitted by Crown Castle NG East LLC on May 21, 2014 for right-of-way permits to install cabinets and utility poles at the eight (8) locations or set a public meeting to review the record.

Background

On May 21, 2014, the Appellant, Crown Castle NG East LLC, submitted applications to install antennas and ground-mounted cabinets at eight (8) locations mostly within the public rights-of-way of the City of Fort Lauderdale (included as **Exhibits 2-9**). The Appellant is in the business of providing additional capacity to wireless voice and data companies through a Distributed Antenna System (DAS) network. A DAS installation typically consists of a pole-mounted antenna approximately 40' high and an above ground cabinet which varies in height from 4'-6', depending on location. This above ground cabinet is connected to a communications hub through an underground fiber optic network.

On August 18, 2014, a designee of the City Engineer issued a letter formally denying the applications (denial letter included as **Exhibit 10**). Code Sections 25-100.1 provide the regulatory framework for the placement of communications service facilities within the City's rights-of-way (copy of Code Section 25-100.1 included as **Exhibit 19**). The denial letter cited multiple deficiencies in meeting Code Section 25-100.1 of the City Code of Ordinances for each location. It is important to note, denial of any right-of-way permit should be sustained if the Application fails to meet merely one single subsection of Code Section 25-100.1.

Pursuant to Section 25-100.2(a) of the City Code of Ordinances, the Appellant is appealing the City Engineer's decision to the City Commission. An outline of the Procedure for Appeal of Denial of Right-Of-Way Permit is attached as **Exhibit 1**. Copies

11/4/2014 Page 1 of 3

of the September 17, 2014 appeal request letters for each location are included in **Exhibits 11-18**.

City staff has reviewed the Appellant's appeal letters submitted on September 17, 2014 for each location. A response to each appeal with details for each application's denial, and an explanation of the outcome of the review of each exemption and denial for each application is included in **Exhibits 11-18**.

Pursuant to City Code Sec. 25-100.2(a) (copy included as **Exhibit 19**), *Appeal* the Commission shall review the record compiled by the department or city engineer and decision by the department or city engineer and upon review thereof shall initially determine if:

- a. There was a departure from the essential requirements of the law in the proceedings appealed; or
- b. Competent substantial evidence does not exist to support the decision.

Resource Impact

There is no fiscal impact associated with this action.

Strategic Connections

This item is a Press Play Fort Lauderdale Strategic Plan 2018 initiative, included in the **Neighborhood Enhancement Cylinder of Excellence**, specifically advancing

- Goal 5: Be a community of strong, beautiful, and healthy neighborhoods.
- **Objective 2**: Enhance the beauty, aesthetics, and environmental quality of neighborhoods.

This item advances the Fast Forward Fort Lauderdale Vision Plan 2035: **We are Community**

```
Attachments: Exhibit 1 – Procedure For Appeal Of Denial Of Right-Of-Way Permit Exhibit 2 – Permit Application 1 – 13-01 Node 60-1 – 1001 SE 20<sup>th</sup> Street Exhibit 3 – Permit Application 2 – 13-04 Node 61-1 – 1510 NW 7<sup>th</sup> Street Exhibit 4 – Permit Application 3 – 13-05 Node 61-2 – 539 NW 17<sup>th</sup> Avenue Exhibit 5 – Permit Application 4 – 13-06 Node 61-3 – 934 NW 16<sup>th</sup> Avenue Exhibit 6 – Permit Application 5 – 13-07 Node 62-1 – 891 NW 12<sup>th</sup> Street Exhibit 7 – Permit Application 6 – 13-09 Node 62-3 – 1027 NW 10<sup>th</sup> Place Exhibit 8 – Permit Application 7 – 13-11 Node 63-1 – 50 NE 13<sup>th</sup> Street Exhibit 9 – Permit Application 8 – 13-12 Node 63-2 – 421 NW 12<sup>th</sup> Street Exhibit 10 – Right-Of-Way Permit Denial Letter Exhibit 11 – Appeal & Response to Application 1 – 13-01 Node 60-1 Exhibit 12 – Appeal & Response to Application 2 – 13-04 Node 61-1 Exhibit 13 – Appeal & Response to Application 3 – 13-05 Node 61-2 Exhibit 14 – Appeal & Response to Application 4 – 13-06 Node 61-3
```

Exhibit 15 – Appeal & Response to Application 5 – 13-07 Node 62-1 Exhibit 16 – Appeal & Response to Application 6 – 13-09 Node 62-3 Exhibit 17 – Appeal & Response to Application 7 – 13-11 Node 63-1 Exhibit 18 – Appeal & Response to Application 8 – 13-12 Node 63-2 Exhibit 19 – Code of Ordinances Sections 25-100.1 & 25-100.2 Exhibit 20 – Resolution Upholding City Engineer Denial

Exhibit 21 – Resolution To Set *De Novo* Hearing

Prepared By: Alex Scheffer, P.E., Urban Design Engineer

Department Director: Greg Brewton, Sustainable Development Jenni Morejon, Director Designee